CONTENTS

Editorial

Volume 5, Issue 1 (2013)

This special issue publishes a selection of papers from two conferences. While these two conferences were held on different topics, they shared similarities in that they were both organised by postgraduates as venues for postgraduate and early-career researchers to present their work in relaxed environment. Kaleidoscope is pleased to present the proceedings from these two conferences together as a single volume. The first conference in this issue is a selection of papers from the *Rhizomes V: "Diaspora – Language and Place"* conference held by the School of Languages and Comparative Studies at the University of Queensland in February 2010. The second group of papers is from the RGS-IBG Postgraduate Forum Midterm Conference 2011 entitled *Geographical Futures* hosted by the Durham University Geography Department in April 2011.

The annual *Rhizomes Postgraduate Conference* provides an opportunity for postgraduates and early career researchers to present research, exchange ideas, and build networks in a friendly and relaxed academic environment while engaging in interdisciplinary dialogue. The 2010 conference focused on the elaboration of varied perspectives in the Humanities and Social Sciences in order to explore the connections, continuities, and discontinuities that intersect the concept of Diaspora with language, place, memory, literature, and/or identity. The papers submitted to Kaleidoscope were chosen by the Rhizomes conference committee to present a rich and representative selection of the papers presented at the conference.

The *RGS-IBG Postgraduate Forum Midterm Conference* offers a welcoming, supportive, and affirmative environment for postgraduates to share emerging and ongoing geographical research. The *Geographical Futures* theme was chosen for the by the conference organisers as a purposeful effort to align with Durham University's Institute of Advance Study's annual theme, which was *Futures* for the year 2011-2012. The theme was broadly conceived as encompassing how postgraduates deal with the future or futures in their own work, and included: how to anticipate research impacts, what methodological futures might emerge, how the future is theorised and/or researched, and what is in store for geography as a discipline as suggested by postgraduate research. The papers collected in this issue of Kaleidoscope reflect and address these issues.

The conference organisers would like to acknowledge the conference co-chairs would like to acknowledge the support of the Royal Geographical Society with IBG, the RGS-IBG Postgraduate Forum, and Durham University's Institute of Advanced Study.

Acknowledgements

Editorial Team

Malory's Lancelot: Homosocial and Heterosexual Discourses in the Knightly Ideal of Masculinity

YING-HSIU LU

This paper takes the concept of homosociality developed by Michael Kimmel and Michael Flood and applies it to an analysis of Lancelot's masculinity as represented in Malory's *Le Morte Darthur*.[1]

The Arthurian legends have been a subject of interest in the Western literary tradition since the twelfth century and have had an extraordinary and enduring influence on Western culture.[2] Since Chrétien de Troyes (c. 1135 - 1183), the treatments of knightly martial valour and amorous pursuit have been established as major characteristics of the Arthurian literary legacy. Malory's *Le Morte Darthur* is by far the most comprehensive and unified work in the medieval treatment of the Arthurian subject. The book starts with the Arthurian prehistory, followed by narratives of Arthur's founding of his kingdom, the establishment of the Fellowship of the Round Table, and the Grail quest before concluding with the final tragic destruction of the Arthurian community. Edited and published by William Caxton in 1485, the work transforms the pre-existing Arthurian legends into the form with which twenty-first century readers are familiar.[3]

Le Morte Darthur delineates a highly homosocial community, in which knights are constantly searching for adventure, jousts, and tournaments, always striving to achieve greater glory and

---

[1] See Michael S. Kimmel, "Masculinity as Homophobia: Fear, Shame, and Silence in the Construction of Gender Identity," in *Theorizing Masculinities*, ed. Harry Brod and Michael Kaufman (Thousand Oaks, London: Sage Publications, 1994), 119-41. Michael Flood, "Men, Sex, and Homosociality: How Bonds between Men Shape Their Sexual Relations with Women," *Men and Masculinities* 10, no. 3 (2008): 339-59.

[2] Since the twelfth century, the Western literary tradition witnessed a growing interest in Arthurian tales. Some pseudo-historical Arthurian materials include Geoffrey of Monmouth's *Historic Regum Britanniae* (c. 1130-1136), Wace's *Le Roman de Brut* (c. 1155), five Arthurian romances composed by Chrétien de Troyes (c.1160-1190), Layamon's *Brut* (c. 1225), and the Alliterative *Morte Arthur* (fourteenth century).

[3] Malory placed various Arthurian legends in some coherent order and chronology. In the fifteenth century, England experienced turbulent political division and social unrest. Although politically ambitious (Malory became a knight by 1441 and was elected M. P. for Warwickshire in 1445), Malory was charged with several offenses including rape and theft. His criminal record and imprisonment (1452-1470) are usually linked to the contemporary political strife between the Yorkists and the Lancastrians, which led to the Wars of the Roses. It is believed that he wrote *Le Morte Darthur* in prison roughly between 1468 and 1470. Most of Malory's source materials were in French such as the *Prose Tristan*, the *Suite de Merlin*, the *Prose Lancelot*, the *Mort Artu*, and *La Queste del Saint Graal*. His English sources included the Middle English Alliterative *Morte Arthure*, the Stanzaic *Le Morte Arthur*, and John Hardyng's *Chronicle*.

honour. Exalting this most manly activity, Malory called it 'worship'.[4] In addition, the Pentecostal Oath sworn by Round Table Knights annually at Camelot functions as a guideline for ideal knightly conduct. Positioned at the centre of the Oath is the 'lady clause', which specifies that serving damsels and womankind in distress is a desirable and admirable knightly deed. Malory's *Le Morte Darthur* thus constitutes a significant source of cultural data for a study of knightly masculinity and gender relations.

Recent significant studies on gender and Malory have included: Andrew Lynch's *Gesture and Gender in Malory's Le Morte Darthur*; Dorsey Armstrong's *Gender and the Chivalric Community in Malory's Morte d'Arthur*; Catherine Batt's *Malory and Rape* and *The Place of Women in the Morte Darthur* by Elizabeth Edwards. To date, however, little scholarship has been carried out using the concept of homosociality to illuminate knightly masculinity and gender relations in Malory. This paper will therefore seek to contribute to the field by drawing on the paradoxical elements of homosocial manhood ideology to offer an alternative reading of Lancelot's relationship with Guinevere and the collapse of the Arthurian community.

'Homosociality', as defined by Jean Lipman-Blumen, refers to "the seeking, enjoyment, and/or preference for the company of the same sex." It is distinguished from 'homosexual' as it does not necessarily involve "erotic sexual interaction between members of the same sex."[5] For Eve Sedgwick, the term 'homosocial' refers to "social bonds between persons of the same sex," and it is applied to such activities as 'male bonding', which may be characterized, by "intense homophobia, fear and hatred of homosexuality.[6] For the purpose of this paper, the terms 'homosocial' or 'homosociality' refer to male-male bonding.

Contemporary research on the concept of homosociality shows that its ideology about manhood is paradoxical. Michael Kimmel observes that masculinity is largely a homosocial enactment. He states: "Other men watch us, rank us, grant our acceptance into the realm of manhood. Manhood is demonstrated for other men's approval. It is other men who evaluate the performance." Women, Kimmel says, are a form of male currency contributing to a male's status among other men.[7] Furthermore, Michael Flood notes that homosocial relations take priority over male-female relations, and homosocial obligations are positioned as primary.[8] The paradox within this homosocial manhood ideology is that men are encouraged to pursue male-female amorous relations so that they can enhance their ranking and reputation among other men, while simultaneously, male-female relations are censured and suppressed, as men demand homosocial allegiance to be given primacy over heterosexual bonds.

In *Le Morte Darthur*, the Fellowship of the Round Table is the centre of the Arthurian homosocial realm. It is a secular institution with religious, specifically Christian, elements. In the fellowship, knights are bound by loyalty to King Arthur and friendship and mutual support for each other. In addition, the Round Table symbolizes fraternity and shared endeavour by its shape and embodies the principles of knightly virtue, justice and morality. The Knights of the Round Table are the supreme exemplars of the highest masculine ideal.[9] Among the 150 Round Table knights,

---

[4] P. E. Tucker suggested that 'worship' in Malory could mean 'deeds of valour', but has the connotations of glory and honour. It also implied 'nobility' as the term 'worship' or 'worshipful' never applied to common people. He further linked knightly prowess with 'worship' by stating that in *Le Morte Darthur* "martial prowess is the first quality demanded of a knight" because it brings a knight 'worship'. P. E. Tucker, "Chivalry in the *Morte*," in *Essays on Malory*, ed. J. A. W. Bennett (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1965), 65-67.

[5] Jean Lipman-Blumen, "Toward a Homosocial Theory of Sex Roles: An Explanation of the Sex Segregation of Social Institutions," in *Women and the Workplace*, ed. Martha Blaxall and Barbara Reagan (Chicago, Illinois: The University of Chicago Press, 1976), 16.

[6] See Eve Sedgwick, *Between Men: English Literature and Male Homosocial Desire* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1985), 1.

[7] Kimmel, "Masculinity as Homophobia," 128-9.

[8] Flood, "Men, Sex, and Homosociality," 342-344.

[9] Merlin "made the Round Table in tokenyng of roundenes of the world. For by the Round Table is the world sygnefyed by right, for al the world Crysten and hethen repayren vnto the Round Table. And whan they are chosen to be of the felauship of the Round Table, they thynke hem more blessed and more in worship than yf they had gotten halfe the world. And ye haue sene that they haue loste her faders and her moders and alle her kynne and her wyues and her children for to be of your felauship" (made the Round Table in tokening of roundness of the world, for by the Round Table is the world signified by right, for all the world, Christian and heathen, repairen vnto the

Lancelot is depicted as the best knight, the epitome of martial prowess and true love. He is referred to as 'truest louer' (II. 8), 'the noblest knyght lyuyng' (VI. 3), 'floure of alle knyghtes' (VI. 16), 'the worshipfullest knyght of the world' (VI. 17) and 'floure of all knyghthode' (XI. 1).

Lancelot's ideal knightly masculinity is manifested in his supreme physical appearance, lineage and martial prowess. These attributes are the reasons for his portrayal as Guinevere's lover and make him an object of desire among damsels, thus increasing his 'homosocial currency'. It is equally valid to say that Lancelot's desire to be the best knight, to gain recognition from other fellow knights, impels him to make Guinevere his object of heterosexual desire. In this regard, Lancelot's relation with Guinevere is beneficial to the Arthurian realm. For the honour and love of the queen, Lancelot did many deeds of valour. His martial achievement not only enhances his ranking in the homosocial sphere but also elevates the reputation of the Round Table Fellowship. Although the love between Lancelot and Guinevere is presented as a positive force to the Arthurian realm, it is simultaneously censured since ideological, homosocial manhood demands that Lancelot places his bonds and the obligation he owes to his fellow knights above his allegiance to Guinevere. By saving Guinevere at the time of her crisis when their adultery was exposed and Guinevere was sentenced to the stake, Lancelot was forced to kill many of his fellow knights, thus jeopardizing his bonds with the Round Table Fellowship. The paradoxical nature of the homosocial manhood eventually brings the Round Table Fellowship and the Arthurian community to its downfall.[10]

In this paper, I first examine the representation of Lancelot's masculinity in the categories of physical appearance, lineage, and martial prowess in order to identify what components constitute a culturally idealized knight. In the second section, Lancelot's masculinity is examined in relation to heterosexual and homosocial discourses and the paradoxical nature of the ideology of knightly manhood as embodied by the character of Lancelot.

Lancelot: the Knightly Exemplar

An examination of Lancelot's physical appearance helps to define the cultural construction of the image of an ideal knight.[11] In *Le Morte Darthur*, the representation of Lancelot's physical appearance is characterized by extraordinary physical size. After hours of combat with Lancelot, Sir Turquine observes: "thou arte the byggest man that euer I mette withal, and the beste brethed" (thou art the biggest man that ever I met withal, and the best breathed) (VI: 8). On another occasion, Lancelot, disguised as Sir Kay, rode into a forest and was confronted by four knights led by Sir Sagramore. With but one mighty stroke Lancelot unhorsed Sagramore. Impressed, Sir Sagramore cautioned his fellow knights: "Lo, my felaus, yonder ye may see what a buffet he hath; that knyght is moche bygger than euer was Syre Kay" (Lo, my fellows, yonder ye may see what a buffet he hath; that knight is much bigger than ever was Sir Kay) (VI. 13). In both instances, 'big' is the most dominant feature that characterizes Lancelot's appearance; it also connotes knightly prowess and endurance.

Another notable description of Lancelot's appearance is the wounds and scars he bears on his body. As portrayed, he was once rescued by knights and squires at the city of Corbin at a time when he was driven to mental illness by his relationship with Guinevere. When they looked at Lancelot they immediately thought "he had ben a man of worship" (he had been a

---

Round Table; and when they are chosen to be of the fellowship of the Round Table they think them more blessed and more in worship than if they had gotten half of the world; and ye have seen that they have lost their fathers and their mothers, and all their kin, and their wives and their children, for to be of your fellowship" (XIV. 2). All quotations and references in this paper to Malory are from James W. Spisak, ed., *Caxton's Malory* (Berkeley, California: University of California Press, 1983). Translations are from Jane Cowen ed., *Le Morte D'Arthur* (New York: Penguin, 1969).

[10] It should be noted that this is the conclusion of Malory's text. Other Arthurian materials provide different reasons for the destruction of Arthur's court. *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight*, for example, attributes the downfall of Arthur's kingdom to the moral weakness of excessive pride in Camelot. Thanks to an anonymous reader for this reference.

[11] Sally North observes that physical beauty is a crucial definition of an ideal knight. See Sally North, "The Ideal Knights as Presented in Some French Narratives Poems, c. 1090-1240: An Outline Sketch," in *The Ideal and Practice of Medieval Knighthood: Papers from the First and Second Strawberry Hill Conference*, ed. Christopher Harper and Ruth Harvey (Suffolk: The Boydell, 1986), 122.

man of worship) (XII. 3) because there were so many wounds upon him. Richard Kaeuper suggests "a real man of prowess will bear the marks of other men's weapons on his body for life".[12] The scars and wounds on Lancelot's body are the most evident signifiers of his worthiness and manhood.[13]

Size, brute strength and scars do not, by themselves, make an ideal knight. Lancelot is also a handsome and modest man. Terms such as 'beautiful', 'seemliness' and 'fairness' are used to imply his fine physical appearance in the text. Even amidst the horrors of his mental illness, Lancelot, after being cleaned up and given a scarlet robe, was "the semelyest man in alle the courte, and none so wel made" (the seemliest man in all the court, and none so well made) (XII. 4).

Other indications of Lancelot's appearance can be inferred from a religious man's teachings to Lancelot during his Grail journey. Lancelot was admonished that he ought to thank God more than any other knights living for "He hath yeuen yow beaute, semelynes, and grete strengthe aboue all other knyghtes" (He hath given you beauty, seemliness, and great strength above all other knights) (XIII. 19). The religious man continues,

> He hath yeuen yow fayrenes with semelynes; He hath yeuen the wyt and discrecyon to knowe good from euyll; He hath yeuen the prowess and hardynesse, and gyuen the to werke soo largely that thou hast had at al dayes the better wheresomeuer thow came (XIII: 20).
> (He hath given you fairness with seemliness, He hath given thee wit, discretion to know good from evil, He hath given thee prowess and hardiness, and given thee to work so largely that you hast had at all days the better wheresomever thou came.)

The elevation of the Round Table knights above the common man and of Lancelot as their exemplar demands that seemingly worldly attributes such as fairness, wit, intelligence and physical prowess in him take on the characteristics of divine gifts.

Another notable feature of knightly appearance is armour and arms. These accoutrements are tangible markers of knightly masculinity and identity. All are metonymic signs that enhance knightly valour. Armour connotes hardiness, invulnerability and indestructibility.[14] Swords and lances, being long and hard in shape and quality, carry connotations of sexual virility.[15] Lancelot's physical attributes together with arms and armour create a discursive context in which his knightly image is both valorous and sexual. On the other hand, swords are symbols of phallic power in the political and religious aspects of the work. In the dubbing ceremony, a site that initiates male bonding, King Arthur bestows the sword on a knight and thus confers on him the power to right wrongs. Arthur's sword that he pulled from the stone represents kingship and also suggests that the power to rule is divinely sanctioned. In the religious sphere, Galahad's sword that he retrieved from a red marble slab confirms his status as the Grail knight. It carries religious significance because he uses it to serve God.

---

[12] Richard W. Kaeuper, *Chivalry and Violence in Medieval Europe* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), 151.

[13] *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight* also plays with the notion of the honourable scar. Both the scar Sir Gawain wears on his neck (which he receives from the blow of the Green Knight) and his girdle, a green belt given to him by Bertilak's wife, signify his shame and honour. Thanks to an anonymous reader for this reference.

[14] Although armour functions as a marker of knightly identity and physical prowess, it nevertheless suggests the vulnerability of the body encased inside. Kelly notes that 'the armoured body' both "exaggerates and obscures the lineaments of the male body enclosed within it. Armour both covers the body and draws attention to its function as a cover and the need for a cover." In Book VI, which recounts Lancelot's knightly adventure, Lancelot immediately finds himself exposed to danger when he is not wearing armour. See Kathleen Coyne Kelly, "Malory's Body Chivalric," *Arthuriana*, 6, no. 4 (1996): 54.

[15] Kam Louie, *Theorising Chinese Masculinity* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 28. Louie observes that weapons such as swords are universally used as indicators of penile potency. Dorsey Armstrong also notes that knightly accessories such as armour and shield function as indicators of masculine prowess and masculine identity in *Le Morte Darthur*. See Dorsey Armstrong, *Gender and the Chivalric Community in Malory's Morte d'Arthur* (Gainesville, Florida: University Press of Florida, 2003), 86-88.

Lineage

Knighthood, as represented in *Le Morte Darthur*, is a prestigious order exclusively reserved for the aristocracy. All the knights are of royal blood and their high lineages immediately signify their supremacy in physical appearance and martial prowess. When Young Tor requested Arthur to make him a knight, Arthur immediately found him "passyngly wel vysaged and passyngly wel made of his yeres" (passingly well-visaged and passingly well made of his year) (III. 3). Comparing Tor with his brothers, although they were all raised in a plebian family, Arthur found him surpassing them in physical appearance and thought that Tor did not resemble them at all. Merlin assured Arthur that Tor ought to be a good knight for he was of a king's blood; he then disclosed Tor's real identity as King Pellinore's son. Gareth is another example. When he arrived at Arthur's court, his fine physical appearance was also immediately noted before his identity as son of King Lot was disclosed (VII. 1). Also, some knights arrive in disguise and are subsequently elevated as their noble lineage is gradually revealed to the court.[16]

Portrayed as the best knight, Lancelot's lineage must match, and he is linked to no less than Jesus Christ. Lancelot is said to "come but of the VIII degre from oure Lord Ihesu Cryst" (come but of the eighth degree from our Lord Jesus Christ) (XIII. 7). In addition, his ancestors were kings who established Christian customs in their lands (XV. 4). All of them were in the fellowship of Joseph of Arthimathie, who together with King Evelake, converted the Britons to Christianity.[17] Even though Lancelot is not included in this fellowship due to his spiritual imperfection and adultery with Guinevere, he nevertheless comes from this highest noble lineage.[18]

Martial Prowess

Lancelot's status as Arthur's 'first and best knight' is established in Book VI, which recounts his knight-errantry in detail. It is said that after the war with the Romans, he surpassed all other knights "in al turnementys and iustes and dedes of armes, both for lyf and deth […] and at no tyme he was neuer ouercome, but yf it were by treson or enchauntement" (in all tournaments and jousts and deeds of arms, both for life and death, […] and at no time he was never overcome but if it were by treason or enchantment) (VI. 1).

Knight-errantry, however puissant, can cause social disruption in the community without proper regulation. The annual Pentecostal Oath pledged at Camelot thus functions as a set of guidelines for conduct within the homosocial Fellowship of the Round Table. The knights are sworn to observe:

> Neuer to doo outragyousyte nor mordre, and alweyes to flee treason. Also by no meane to be cruel, but to gyue mercy vnto hym that asketh mercy, vpon payn of forfeiture of their worship and lordship of Kyng Arthur foreuermore, and alweyes to doo ladyes, damoysels, and gentylwymmen socour vpon pane of dethe. Also that no man take noo batails in a wrongful quarrel for noo lawe, ne for noo worldes goodes. (III. 15).
> (Never to do outrageously nor murder, and always to flee treason; also, by no mean to be cruel, but to give mercy unto him that asketh mercy, upon pain of forfeiture of their worship and lordship of King Arthur for evermore; and always to do ladies, damosels, and gentlewomen succour, upon pain of death. Also, that no man take no battles in a wrongful quarrel for no law, ne for no world's goods).

Based on the text of the pledge, loyalty to King Arthur is an essential knightly quality. A good knight is further defined as an altruistic and righteous man whose actions are motivated solely by just and worthy causes; he should always bring succour to the distressed, especially womankind. Females are represented as vulnerable and helpless.19 Dorsey Armstrong points out that acts of

---

[16] Thanks to an anonymous reader for this point.

[17] Joseph of Arimathie is said to be the knight who brought the crucified Christ down from the Cross. See XIII. 10.

[18] North also notes that 'good birth' is an integral part of the picture of the perfect knight. See North, "The Ideal Knights," 122.

[19] It should be noted that there are other representations of females in the text such as Morgan le Fay; she is portrayed as a powerful woman and a sorceress who often poses a threat to Round Table knights.

service to ladies "help identify knights as legitimate participants in the Round Table community".[20] Women are thus a means for the enactment and validation of knightly masculinity. Although the Pentecostal Oath specifies that courteous service to ladies is an ideal knightly act, it does not provide knights with a guideline to follow when there is conflict between their heterosexual and homosocial allegiance. I shall discuss this tension and conflict between heterosexual and homosocial allegiances in the context of knightly masculine discourse in the second section of this paper.

The annual Pentecostal feast also functions as a bonding ceremony for knights. In *Le Morte Darthur*, it is a convention that at the celebration feast a protagonist knight, the focus of a particular book, is bestowed with honour and glory after other knights recount his righteous deeds of arms. As portrayed in Book VI, Lancelot performed many deeds of arms for womankind and fellow knights in need while undertaking adventures in the wilderness. After he returned to Camelot, his exploits were publicly reported at the Pentecostal feast by other knights such as Sir Gaheris, Sir Kay and Sir Meliot. All of them were rescued by Lancelot during his adventure and had witnessed his righteous deeds. Through this homosocial enactment, Lancelot's manhood is validated and confirmed.

The representation of Lancelot's martial prowess and valour is particularly distinguished by his great strength, his ability to fight many adversaries at the same time, or to fight for a long duration of time. His extraordinary strength is manifested in the mighty sword strokes he delivered. In his martial encounter against two giants, Lancelot "put his sheld afore hym and put the stroke aweye of the one gyaunt, and with his swerd he clafe his hede asondre" (put his shield afore him and put the stroke away of the one giant, and with his sword he clave his head asunder) (VI. 11). Then he ran after the other giant and with great might Lancelot "smote hym on the sholder and clafe hym to the nauel" (smote him on the shoulder, and clave him to the navel) (VI. 11). His strength was so remarkable that even giants were not his match. In another example, when Sir Kay was pursued and attacked by four knights, Lancelot displayed similar strength and fearlessness to defend him. Despite Lancelot being outnumbered, he defeated the four knights in succession. All were so amazed at his brute strength that one of them exclaimed: "he is a man of myght, for I dare lay my hede it is Syre Launcelot" (he is a man of might, for I dare lay my head it is Sir Launcelot) (VI. 13).

Other representations of Lancelot's martial competence highlight endurance or perseverance as desirable attributes of knightly masculinity. He once championed King Bagdemagus in a tournament against the King of Northgalis and his party. Lancelot at first "smote doune with one spere fyue knyghtes, and of foure of hem he brake their backs" (smote down with one spear five knights, and of four of them he brake their backs) (VI. 7). Then, after striking down the King of Northgalis, he encountered three more knights and easily unhorsed them. By the end of the tournament Lancelot defeated twenty-eight more knights until no one dared joust more. The joust and tournament are other homosocial realms where knights enact and prove their manhood. In line with Kimmel's theory that masculinity is largely a homosocial enactment, Lancelot's demonstration of martial competence in front of other knights confirms and validates his knightly manhood.

In Book VI particularly, Lancelot is portrayed as a ladies' champion. Knights such as Sir Peris de Forest Savage and Sir Pedivere are depicted as destroyers or abusers of damsels and their brutality against womankind is set in direct contrast to Lancelot's dutifulness and courtesy to ladies. Once, when he heard of Sir Peris de Forest Savage's misdemeanours against damsels, Lancelot furiously remarked: "[I]s he a theef and a knyght and a rauyssher of wymmen? He doth shame vnto the ordre of knyghthode and contrary vnto his othe" (Is he a thief and a knight and a ravisher of women? He doth shame unto the order of knighthood, and contrary unto his oath) (VI. 10). Not long afterwards, Lancelot encountered Sir Peris de Forest Savage, and out of rage he struck him on the helmet and split his head and neck to the throat. In the same book, when Lancelot saw a knight (Sir Pedivere) chasing his wife and about to murder her, he immediately came to the lady's rescue and rebuked Pedivere: "knyght, fy for shame; why wolt thou slee this lady? Thou dost shame vnto the and alle knyghtes" (knight, fie for shame, why wilt thou slay this lady? Thou dost shame unto thee and all knights) (VI. 17). In both examples, the homosocial element of the knightly manhood ideology is evident. Lancelot's remarks clearly place the reputation of the male social group in a position of more importance than the suffering of the ladies.

---

[20] Armstrong, *Gender and the Chivalric Community*, 17.

Knightly Masculinity in Heterosexual and Homosocial discourses

As stated earlier, Lancelot's supreme physical appearance, lineage and martial prowess make him a knightly exemplar and allow his portrayal as Guinevere's lover and an object of amorous interest for damsels. Depicted as a desirable man in many ladies' eyes, they are constantly in pursuit of him, either for his affections or body. Lancelot's 'worship', his reputation as the best knight, signifies his attractiveness. Terence McCarthy suggests that:

> In the courtly tradition it is a knight's courage, worship, and prowess that are the masculine equivalents of a lady's beauty. […]Knights fall in love with ladies for their beauty, a lady chooses a man according to his deeds. […] A fine record in arms makes a man attractive. […] It is clear that Lancelot's extraordinary prowess is the basis of his sex appeal.[]

Once in a forest, Lancelot fell asleep under a tree; Morgan le Fay and three other queens happened to pass nearby. As soon as they looked at him they knew it was Lancelot. Immediately each wanted him for her own (VI. 3). They abducted Lancelot by means of enchantment and kept him in a prison. The following morning, he was given the option either to choose one of them as paramour or to die in the prison. They said to him:

> [W]e vnderstande your worthynes, that thou arte the noblest knyght lyuyng, and as we knowe wel ther can no lady haue thy loue but one, and that is Quene Gweneuer, and now thow shalt lose her foreuer, and she the, and therfore the behoueth now to chese one of vs four (VI: 3).
> (We understand your worthiness, that thou art the noblest knight living, and as we know well there can no lady have thy love but one, and that is Queen Guenever, and now thou shalt lose her for ever, and she thee, and therefore thee behoveth now to choose one of us four).

But Lancelot refused to take any one of them as a lover, declaring he would rather die in prison with 'worship'. In another example, Hellawes, the sorceress, the Lady of the Castle Nygramous, confessed her sickening craving for Lancelot's body. She claimed that:

> I haue loued the this seuen yere, but there may no woman haue thy loue but Quene Gweneuer. But sythen I maye not reioyce the to haue thy body on lyue, I had kepte no more ioye in this world but to haue thy body dede. Thenne wold I haue baumed hit and serued hit, and soo haue kepte it my lyfe dayes, and dayly I shold haue clypped the and kyssed the in despyte of Quene Gweneuer (VI: 15).
> (I have loved thee this seven year, but there may no woman have thy love but Queen Guenever. But sithen I may not rejoice thee to have thy body alive, I had kept no more joy in this world but to have thy body dead. Then would I have balmed it and served it, and so have kept it my life days, and daily I should have clipped thee, and kissed thee, in despite of Queen Guenever).

However, Lancelot refused her and departed, leaving her to die of sorrow. In both cases, sexual seductions are presented as tests of honour for Lancelot, whose views on knighthood and heterosexuality are as follows:

> [B]ut for to be a wedded man, I thynke hit not, for thenne I must couche with her, and leue armes and turnementys, batayls, and aduentures. And as for to say for to take my plesaunce with peramours, that wylle I refuse, in pryncypal for drede of God. For knyghtes that ben auouturous or lecherous shal not be happy ne fortunate vnto the werrys, for outher they shalle be ouercome with a symplyer knyghte than they be hemself, outher els they shal by vnhap and her cursydnes slee better men than they ben hemself, and soo who that vseth peramours shalle be vnhappy, and all thyng is vnhappy that is aboute hem [] (VI: 10).
> ([B]ut for to be a wedded man, I think it not; for then I must couch with her, and leave arms and tournaments, battles, and adventures; and as for to say for to take my pleasance with

---

[21] Terence McCarthy, *An Introduction to Malory* (Suffolk: D. S. Brewer, 1991), 54. However, McCarthy fails to note that Lancelot was depicted as a physically attractive man in the text. Please refer to the section, 'Physical Appearance'.

[22] Lancelot's remarks were a response to a lady's criticism on his bachelorhood and suspicion of his intimate relationship with Guinevere.

> paramours, that will I refuse in principle for dread of God; for knights that be adventurous or lecherous shall not be happy ne fortunate unto the wars, for either they shall be overcome with a simpler knight than they be themselves, other else they shall by unhap and their cursedness slay better men than they be themselves. And so who that useth paramours shall be unhappy, and all thing is unhappy that is about them.)

Lancelot's remarks articulate a conflict between heterosexual desires and homosocial allegiance. This constitutes a discourse on sexual morality that regards females and sex as a hindrance to knight-errantry (a highly homosocial activity). Although love and sex within marriage is celebrated as ideal such as in the cases of Sir Gareth (VII. 22-35) and Sir Pelleas (IV. 22-23), Dorsey Armstrong notes that both of them "largely disappear from the progression of the larger narrative after their marriages," and "when they do appear again, it is usually as helpless, imprisoned, or vulnerable".[23] Armstrong further suggests that a knight's married status indicates the end of his knightly career.[24] Lancelot's bachelor status thus signifies his mobility and allows him to advance himself in the homosocial realm through knight-errantry.[25] To further resolve this inherent conflict between heterosexual attraction and homosocial allegiance, 'love of paramours' is censured. Such love implies mere pleasure taking, a sexual relation outside marriage.[26] Lancelot is thus presented as a sexually conservative man who is fully dedicated to the knightly profession.[27] He clearly understood the danger of being an adulterer.[28]

In Lancelot's portrayal as Guinevere's lover, Lancelot's love for Guinevere in Book VI, has been seen as idealized and distant.[29] This 'courtly love' inspires Lancelot to perform chivalric deeds to bring succour to distressed fellow knights and womankind so that he can win 'worship' and thus grow in Guinevere's regard.[30] In this sense, the love between Lancelot and Guinevere is a source of support for the social order of the Arthurian realm. It also contributes to the bonding of the Round Table knights and enhances the reputation of the Fellowship.[31]

As discussed earlier, despite being seduced or pursued by damsels, Lancelot never falls in love with any other female than the queen. Depicted as a true lover, the representation of Lancelot's masculinity is characterized by devotion and faithfulness. Sworn to be the queen's knight, Lancelot

---

[23] Armstrong, *Gender and the Chivalric Community*, 103.

[24] Ibid.

[25] In Chrétien de Troyes' *Erec et Enide*, Erec was criticized by other knights because he completely neglected his social duty of knight-errantry after he married Enide. Also, in *The Knight with the Lion*, another romance by Chrétien, after Yvain wedded Laudine, he was prompted by Gawain to leave his wife to pursue adventures and engage in jousts and tournaments if he was to maintain his reputation.

[26] Tucker, "Chivalry in the *Morte*," 78.

[27] Although represented as a sexually conservative man, Lancelot is nonetheless (sexually) competent. He was once tricked into sleeping with Elaine, King Pelles' daughter; as a result of this sexual union, Lancelot fathered Galahad, the future Grail knight (XI. 2-3). Sexual virility is generally linked to manhood ideology. David Gilmore observes that in most societies, to be a man one must impregnate women. See David Gilmore, *Manhood in the Making: Cultural Concepts of Masculinity* (New Haven, Connecticut and London: Yale University Press, 1990), 223.

[28] Other examples of medieval adulterers are Cligés and Fénice in Chrétien de Troyes' *Cligés*. In *Cligés*, the adultery between Iseult and Tristan is also mentioned. See Neil Cartlidge, *Medieval Marriage: Literary Approaches, 1100-1300* (Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 1997), 45. Thanks to an anonymous reader for this reference.

[29] Janet Jesmok, "A Knyght Wyveles: The Young Lancelot in Malory's *Morte Darthur*," *Modern Language Quarterly*, 42 (1981): 315-330.

[30] I use the term 'courtly love' to emphasize its aspect as a force which inspires knights to perform valorous deeds of arms for their ladies. For an in-depth study of the definitions of 'courtly love', see F. X. Newman, ed., *The Meaning of Courtly Love* (New York: State University of New York Press, 1968); David Burnley, *Courtliness and Literature in Medieval England* (London and New York: Longman, 1998); C. S. Lewis, *The Allegory of Love* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1958).

[31] Edwards observes that "Guinevere's role is not to uphold the court, but to uphold the 'homosocial' bonds between men who uphold the court," and "love of the lady animates homosocial bonds." See Elizabeth Edwards, "The Place of Women in The *Morte Darthur*," in *A Companion to Malory*, ed. Elizabeth Archibald and A. S. G. Edwards (Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 1996), 45-46.

would always risk his own life in order to safeguard Guinevere's honour.[32] In the episode of the 'Poison Apple', at a banquet held by Guinevere, Sir Pinel was poisoned and murdered – a tragedy caused by the feud between the House of Lot and House of Pellinor. As the hostess of the feast, Guinevere was suspected of the murder and was charged with treason by Sir Mador. None of the knights would defend her for fear of being suspected as her accomplice.[33] On the day of the trial, Lancelot appeared in disguise and volunteered to fight for the Queen. Propelled by the urge to redeem Guinevere's honour, Lancelot displayed extraordinary martial valour and defeated Sir Mador. It was only after Sir Mador withdrew his charge against Guinevere that Lancelot would spare his life (XVIII. 1-7). In the 'Knight of the Cart' episode, Lancelot is consistently depicted as a dutiful lover who placed Guinevere's honour above his own personal dignity and life. To save Guinevere from the treacherous Meliagrance, he did not hesitate to ride in a cart used to deliver prisoners.[34] Later, he came forward to champion Guinevere and fought gallantly when Meliagrance charged her with adultery.[35]

Although the bond between Lancelot and Guinevere is characterized by 'courtly love' in Book VI, it gradually evolved into a sexual relationship. Their adultery is implied as early as in the narrative of Lancelot's Grail quest. He failed to achieve the Grail because "he had loued a quene vnmesurably and oute of mesure longe" (he had loved a queen unmeasurably and out of measure long) (XIII. 20). Also, after Lancelot returned to the court from his Grail quest, it is explicated that he "beganne to resorte vnto Quene Gueneuer ageyne" (began to resort unto Queen Guenever again) (XVIII. 1). When Lancelot valiantly rescued Guinevere from Sir Mador and Meliagrance's charges of treason, their carnal relation had already been established.[36] Like their 'courtly love', the sexual love between Lancelot and Guinevere is also a supportive force in the Arthurian homosocial realm.[37] As noted earlier, impelled by his bonds to the queen, Lancelot proves Guinevere's innocence by defeating Sir Mador and Meliagrance in combats. In so doing, he restores not only the queen's honour but also King Arthur's dignity and the harmony within the Round Table Fellowship. No matter how constructive and nourishing it is, however, their sexual love is also destructive. By loving Guinevere adulterously, Lancelot betrays King Arthur. Furthermore, the exposure of their illicit relationship directly insults Arthur's honour and disrupts the unity of the Round Table Fellowship. How it leads to the downfall of the Arthurian community will be examined in the following section.

---

[32] When Lancelot was made a knight, just before the dubbing ceremony he found his sword missing. However, Guinevere found it, presented it to him, and saved him from shame. Lancelot then pledged to Guinevere that he would from then on be her knight and fight for her whether for right or wrong causes. See XVIII. 7.

[33] Sir Bors finally agreed to champion the queen for Lancelot's sake but only after King Arthur's request.

[34] It was a convention established in Chrètien de Troyes' romance '*Knight of the Cart*' that riding in such a cart is shameful as it was used to transport prisoners. In Malory, when Lancelot rode in the cart and approached Maliagrance's castle, a lady exclaimed in front of Guinevere: "where rydeth in a charyot a goodly armed knyghte; I suppose he rydeth vnto hanging" (where rideth in a chariot a goodly armed knight; I suppose he rideth unto hanging). After the Queen identified the knight as Lancelot and saw his wounded horse following slowly behind the chariot, she reproached the lady: "Hit was fowle mouthed […] and euylle lykened, soo for to lyken the moost noble knyght of the world vnto suche a shameful dethe" (It was foul mouthed […] and evil likened, so for to liken the most noble knight of the world unto such a shameful death) (XIX. 4).

[35] Meliagrance was depicted as a wicked knight who abducted Guinevere in Lancelot's absence. When Lancelot came to rescue the queen he turned coward and pleaded for forgiveness. Later, he charged the queen with adultery because he found blood stains in her bed. He believed that the queen had slept with one of the wounded knights whose wounds she had attended to in her chamber. In fact, Guinevere committed adultery with Lancelot who, in an attempt to enter her room, hurt his hands from breaking the bars in the window (XIX. 1-9).

[36] The episode 'Knight of the Cart' especially confirms Lancelot as an adulterer. See note 35 above.

[37] Edwards suggests that "adultery is transgressive," but "the socially beneficial effects of that adultery are barely repressed, and sometimes openly acknowledged." See Edwards, "The Place of Women," 47.

Knightly Masculinity in Homosocial Discourse

In contrast to the positive portrayal of the Lancelot-Guinevere romance as heterosexual relationship, when considered in the light of homosociality in the work, the relationship between Lancelot and Guinevere could have a different reading. Guinevere, as Arthur's Queen, is the highest-ranking lady in the Arthurian community.[38] As the narrative progresses, rumours about their affair are constantly circulated. It seems that their affair was known by most members of the Arthurian community except King Arthur. As Michael Kimmel observes, in a homosocial community, women are a kind of currency that men use to improve their ranking on the masculine social scale. In this regard, Lancelot's homosocial desire, his desire to improve his ranking in the Round Table Fellowship, impels him to make Guinevere an object of his heterosexual desire. By being identified as Guinevere's lover, Lancelot enhances his social status and asserts his supremacy over other men in the Arthurian realm.

That Arthur could have been completely ignorant about Guinevere's illicit relationship with Lancelot is doubtful. Lancelot and Guinevere's affair was often spoken of by others or presented as an open secret before it was exposed by Sir Mordred and Sir Agravaine in Book XX.[39] As Gayle Rubin notes, women are often used by men as exchangeable property in order to cement the bonds of men with men and it is men who benefit from such exchanges, it is likely that Arthur intentionally ignored the rumours in order to secure Lancelot's loyalty to him as long as the adultery remained unexposed publicly.[40] In this regard, Guinevere was transacted to Lancelot as a means through which the bonds between Arthur and Lancelot were firmly cemented. Both of them benefit from the exchange of Guinevere: Arthur was able to keep Lancelot's service, and through Lancelot's righteous and valorous deeds Arthur's eminence and that of the Round Table Fellowship was exalted. Lancelot, at his end of the bargain, was able to establish superior status by being identified as the queen's lover.[41]

As discussed earlier, Lancelot is presented as a faithful and dutiful lover to Guinevere. The love between them, whether it is platonic or adulterous, is a supportive force in the Arthurian realm. Impelled by his allegiance to the queen, Lancelot risked his life many times to safeguard Guinevere's honour. However, in the discourse of homosociality, as masculinity is largely a homosocial enactment, only by fighting for Guinevere in her time of crisis could Lancelot secure and maintain his manhood. In this sense, Lancelot's saving of Guinevere, as portrayed in the 'Poisoned Apple' and 'Knight of the Cart' episodes, is as much motivated by his urge to prove his manhood in the homosocial sphere as by his sworn allegiance or bonds to the queen. This homosocial enactment of masculinity is especially clearly explicated in the episodes in which Lancelot's adultery with the queen is made public. Motivated by personal hatred of Guinevere and Lancelot, Sir Agravain and Sir Mordred exposed their illicit relationship to King Arthur, and Arthur sentenced Guinevere to the stake (XX. 1-4). At this critical moment, Sir Bors strongly advised Lancelot to rescue her. He said:

> Also I wyll counceyll yow, my lord Syr Launcelot, that and my lady Quene Gueneuer be in
> distresse, in soo moche as she is in payne for your sake, that ye knyghtly rescowe her. And

---

[38] In Malory's work, Guinevere is also labelled as "a destroyer of good knyghtes" (XVIII. 5). Her literary reputation as a troublemaker is also found in Marie de France's *Lanval* and its later Middle English redaction by Thomas Chestre, *Sir Launfal*. Thanks to an anonymous reader for the references.

[39] Refer to Morgan le Fay's and Hellawes' remarks to Lancelot about his relationship with Guinevere in the section, 'Heterosexual Relationships' (see p. 12). Another example is found in IX. 40-44 in which Morgan le Fay devised a shield with images of a king, a queen and a knight who was standing above them with his feet on the king's and the queen's heads. The images suggested the adultery between Lancelot and Guinevere, and Morgan meant to use it to humiliate both of them, and Arthur, in public. Arthur appeared to be confused when he first saw the shield, but soon became angry when a lady (one of Morgan le Fay's damsels) told him that the shield was made for him and symbolized his shame (for being cuckolded).

[40] Gayle Rubin, "The Traffic in Women: Notes on the 'Political Economy' of Sex," in *The Second Wave: A Reader in Feminist Theory*, ed. Linda Nicholson (New York, London: Routledge, 1997), 36-37.

[41] Armstrong has offered a similar reading of Guinevere's trafficking between Arthur and Lancelot: "Lancelot receives the love of a lady, while Arthur receives the loyalty of the greatest knight of the world." Armstrong, *Gender and the Chivalric Community*, 193.

ye dyd otherwayes, al the world wylle speke of yow shame to the worldes ende, in so moche as ye were taken with her, whether ye dyd ryghte or wrong. It is now your parte to holde with the queen that she be not slayne and put to a mescheuous dethe, for and she soo dye, the shame shalle be yours. (XX: 6)

(Also I will counsel you my lord, Sir Launcelot, that and my lady, Queen Guenever, be in distress, insomuch as she is in pain for your sake, that ye knightly rescue her; and ye did otherwise, all the world will speak of you shame to the world's end. Insomuch as ye were taken with her, whether ye did right or wrong, it is now your part to hold with the queen, that she be not slain and put to a mischievous death, for and she so die the shame shall be yours).

Sir Bors' remarks articulate directly the centrality of homosociality in the discourse of knightly masculinity. Lancelot would be shamed in the eyes of other men if he did not rescue the queen from the stake. He was also obliged to save Guinevere as the Pentecostal Oath, the homosocial code of conduct ordained to be observed by all Round Table knights, specifies that providing succour to womankind in distress was an essential knightly duty. Lancelot took Bors' advice, but in his saving of the queen, he kills many knights, including Sir Gareth whose bond with him was particularly strong.[42] As a result, Lancelot was banished from the court and many of his kinsmen chose to leave the Round Table Fellowship to follow him. On the other hand, the exposure of the scandal also brings the destructive nature of the sexual love between Lancelot and Guinevere to the foreground. When it is unexposed, their adultery is tolerated and accepted as a positive force in the Arthurian community. But when it is made public, it threatens King Arthur's honour and disrupts the unity of the Round Table Fellowship.

The paradoxical nature of homosociality is that by his valorous rescue of Guinevere, Lancelot places his responsibilities to the queen and the issue of defending Guinevere's honour above his obligations to his brothers in the Fellowship. Michael Flood observes that male-male relations take priority over male-female relations and homosocial obligations are positioned as primary. To save Guinevere, Lancelot uses his knightly force against his own fellows. He not only violates the Pentecostal Oath but also jeopardizes his and his kinsmen's homosocial ties with the Fellowship. The destruction of the Fellowship and Arthur's death ensued as subsequent tragic results. Homosociality itself brings the Arthurian community and the Round Table Fellowship to its end.43

Conclusion

At Lancelot's saintly death, Sir Ector's cried out in grief and mourning:

[T]hou Sir Launcelot, there thou lyest, that thou were neuer matched of erthely knyghtes hande. And thou were the curtest knyght that euer bare shelde; and thou were the truest frende to thy louar that euer bestrade hors; and thou were the trewest louer of a synful man that euer loued woman; and thou were the kyndest man that euer strake wyth swerde; and thou were the godelyest persone that euer cam emonge prees of knyghtes; and thou was the mekest man and the ientyllest that euer ete in halle emonge ladyes; and thou were the sternest knyght to thy mortal foo that euer put spere in the reeste (XXI. 13).

(Thou Sir Launcelot, there thou liest, that thou were never matched of earthly knight's hand. And thou were the courteous knight that ever bare shield. And thou were the truest friend to thy lover that ever bestrad horse. And thou were the truest lover of a sinful man that ever

---

[42] Gareth was knighted by Lancelot and among all other knights, he loved Lancelot the best. It was Gareth's death which finally prompted Gawain to turn against Lancelot and thus caused the split of the Round Table Fellowship (XX. 8-10).

[43] The downfall of the Arthurian community reinforces the insignificance of women in the male homosocial realm. In addition to the case of Lancelot and Guinevere, the feud between Gawain and Lamorak is another example. As recounted, Lamorak's father, Pellinor, killed King Lot. To avenge his father (King Lot), Gawain murdered Pellinor. The dispute between the two houses escalated when Lamorak fatefully fell in love with Margause, Lot's widowed wife. To safeguard their honour, Lot's sons plotted a scheme and killed their mother while she was in bed with Lamorak (X. 24). It is noteworthy that although Arthur was distressed by Margause' tragic end he did not punish any of Lot's sons for their crime. Although the relationship between Margause and her sons is not a heterosexual but a heterosocial one, her tragic death nevertheless articulates the supremacy of the male-male bond over the male-female tie and highlights the insignificance of women in the male homosocial world.

loved woman. And thou were the kindest man that ever struck with sword. And thou were the goodliest person that ever came among press of knight. And thou was the meekest man and the gentlest that ever ate in hall among ladies. And thou were the sternest knight to thy mortal foe that ever put spear in the rest).

Sir Ector's elegy for Lancelot reveals a solemn grief on the passing of the knight exemplar. It encapsulates the image of an idealized knight who is physically valorous, courteous, generous, noble, righteous and faithful in love. Expressed at the end of *Le Morte Darthur*, it can be read as a lamentation on the paradoxical nature of the ideology of knightly manhood as represented in the work. Even Lancelot, the best knight, could not resolve such a paradox and falls within the system as a victim. It is equally valid to say that no knight could live up to such a knightly masculine ideal that within itself creates dilemma and conflict. The homosocial system of the Arthurian community allows Lancelot to achieve the height of his knightly profession, yet it also brings its best product and, unfortunately, itself to destruction.

Bibliography

Armstrong, Dorsey. *Gender and the Chivalric Community in Malory's Morte d'Arthur*. Gainesville, Florida: University Press of Florida, 2003.

Batt, Catherine. "Malory and Rape." *Arthuriana* 7, no. 3 (1997): 78-99.

Burnley, David. *Courtliness and Literature in Medieval England*. London and New York: Longman, 1998.

Cartlidge, Neil. *Medieval Marriage: Literary Approaches, 1100-1300*. Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 1997.

Cowen, Janet, ed. *Le Morte D'Arthur*. 2 vols. New York: Penguin, 1969.

Edwards, Elizabeth. "The Place of Women in the *Morte Darthur*." In *A Companion to Malory*, edited by Elizabeth Archibald and A. S. G. Edwards, 37-54. Arthurian Studies 37. Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 1996.

Flood, Michael. "Men, Sex, and Homosociality: How Bonds between Men Shape Their Sexual Relations with Women." *Men and Masculinities* 10, no. 3 (2008): 339-59.

Gilmore, David. *Manhood in the Making: Cultural Concepts of Masculinity*. New Haven, Connecticut and London: Yale University Press, 1990.

Jesmok, Janet. "'A Knyght Wyveles' The Young Lancelot in Malory's *Morte Darthur*." *Modern Language Quarterly* 42 (1981): 315-30.

Kaeuper, Richard W. *Chivalry and Violence in Medieval Europe*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1999. Reprint, 2006.

Kelly, Kathleen Coyne. "Malory's Body Chivalric." *Arthuriana* 6, no. 4 (1996): 52-71.

Kimmel, Michael S. "Masculinity as Homophobia: Fear, Shame, and Silence in the Construction of Gender Identity." In *Theorizing Masculinities*, edited by Harry Brod and Michael Kaufman, 119-41. Thousand Oaks, London, New Delhi: Sage, 1994.

Lewis, C. S. *The Allegory of Love*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1958.

Lipman-Blumen, Jean. "Toward a Homosocial Theory of Sex Roles: An Explanation of the Sex Segregation of Social Institutions." In *Women and the Workplace: The Implications of Occupational Segregation*, edited by Martha Blaxall and Barbara Reagan, 15-32. Chicago, Illinois and London: The University of Chicago Press, 1976.

Louie, Kam. *Theorising Chinese Masculinity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.

Lynch, Andrew. "Gesture and Gender in Malory's Le Morte Darthur." In *Arthurian Romance and Gender/Masculin/Feminin dans le roman arthurien médiéval/Geschlechterrollen in mittelalterlichen Artusroman*, edited by Friedrich Wolfzettel, 285-95. Amsterdam and Atlanta, Georgia: Rodopi, 1995.

McCarthy, Terence. *An Introduction to Malory*. Arthurian Studies 20. New York and Suffolk: D. S. Brewer, 1988. Reprint, 1991.

Newman, F. X., ed. *The Meaning of Courtly Love*. New York: State University of New York Press, 1968.

North, Sally. "The Ideal Knights as Presented in Some French Narratives Poems, c. 1090-1240: An Outline Sketch." In *The Ideal and Practice of Medieval Knighthood: Papers from the First and Second Strawberry Hill Conference*, edited by Christopher Harper and Ruth Harvey, 111-132. Suffolk: The Boydell, 1986.

Rubin, Gayle. "The Traffic in Women: Notes on the 'Political Economy' Of Sex." In *The Second Wave: A Reader in Feminist Theory*, edited by Linda Nicholson, 27-62. New York and London: Routledge, 1997.

Sedgwick, Eve Kosofsky. *Between Men: English Literature and Male Homosocial Desire*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1985.

Spisak, James W. ed. *Caxton's Malory*. Berkeley, California: University of California Press, 1983.

Tucker, P.E. "Chivalry in the *Morte*." In *Essays on Malory*, edited by J. A. W. Bennett, 63-103. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1965.

Ying-hsiu Lu
University of Queensland
Yinghsiu.lu@uqconnect.edu.au

A Comparative Study of Gong'an dialect: An Introduction

HONG CAI

This paper is part of an ongoing project on the Gong'an dialect (hereafter: GAD). Based on data collected from the field in September-October 2009, it aims to present some of the phonological, lexical and syntactical features of GAD in comparison to the Modern Standard Chinese or Mandarin Chinese (MC) and the neighbouring Changsha dialect (hereafter: CSD).[1] Section 2 offers some background information about the concept of dialect, Chinese dialects, previous studies on GAD, the data used in the project, the motivation and justification for this study, and the aims of this paper. Section 3 presents some of the phonological, lexical and syntactical features of GAD from a comparative perspective. Section 4 concludes this paper and provides some possible future routes of enquiry into the GAD.

Background and aims of this paper

Linguistically, a dialect has an individual phonological, lexical and syntactical system that can qualify it as a separate linguistic entity when contrasted with a dialect or language from a generically different language family. However, political, historical, sociological, geographical, and cultural factors have always played a crucial role in the formation or recognition of a dialect. The concept of dialect adopted in this paper is broader than what is linguistically defined. The term 'dialect' could refer to an entity as large as a 'generic dialect group', e.g. Xiang dialect, and as small as a 'diapoint', e.g. Gong'an dialect.[2] However, the use of 'dialect' in this paper does not entail any rejection of the concept of 'Sinitic languages' (cf. Chappell 1992, 2001a; Chappell, Li and Peyraube 2007).

Although nowadays the term 'Chinese' is often loosely equated with the Modern Standard Chinese, officially codified as *putonghua* 'common speech' in mainland China, also recognized as *guoyu* 'national language' in Taiwan and Hongkong, and *huayu* 'Chinese language' in Singapore (cf. Norman 1988, 1; Chen 2008, 200), it actually refers to a large number of generically related but not necessarily mutually intelligible dialects and the lingua franca of China (cf. Chen 1999). Despite the controversy over the classification of Chinese dialects, there are ten generally recognized dialect groups, namely, Mandarin, Jin, Wu, Xiang, Gan, Kejia (Hakka), Yue (Cantonese), Min, Hui, Pinghua, leaving some dialects or dialect groups unclassified (cf. Wurm et al. 1987; Chappell 2001, 6-18; Cao 2008). The above groups of dialects are broadly classified into four categories: Northern Chinese (Mandarin, Jin), Central Chinese (Xiang, Gan, Hui, Wu) and Southern Chinese (Yue, Hakka, Pinghua) and Southeastern Chinese (Min) according to grammatical attributes and geographic distribution (cf. Hillary 2001b).[3]

---

[1] The Changsha dialect belongs to the Xiang group (cf. footnote 3). It is spoken by the natives in the capital city of Hunan province.

[2] For similar usage of the concept of dialect, see also Zhang (2000).

[3] This taxonomy is however under dispute, particularly with regard to the classification of Jin. Some scholars simply refer to the Mandarin group as Northern Chinese dialects and all the other

Like many other standard languages in the world, *putonghua* "is not the native language of any real set of individuals", as can be seen from the definition provided by the government of the People's Republic of China in 1956 (Chen 2007, 146)[4]:

> *Putonghua* is the standard form of Modern Chinese with the Beijing phonological system as its norm of pronunciation, and Northern dialects as its base dialect, and looking to exemplary modern works in *baihuawen* for its grammatical norms.

Spoken by more than 660 million people and distributed over 26 provinces and autonomous regions, *Mandarin* (also known as *Northern Chinese*, *Northern group* and *Northern dialects*) is by far the largest group of Chinese dialects (cf. Wurm et al. 1987; Hou 2002, 4; Chen 2008, 198). Standing out from other Chinese dialect groups in its relatively high degree of mutual intelligibility, the Mandarin Supergroup itself is composed of eight groups, viz. *Beijing Mandarin*, *Dongbei (Northeastern) Mandarin*, *Jiao-liao Mandarin*, *Ji-lu Mandarin*, *Zhongyuan (Central Plains) Mandarin*, *Lan-yin Mandarin*, *Xinan (Southwestern) Mandarin*, and *Jianghuai Mandarin*.

As evidenced by the surviving scripts on oracle bone and shell dating back more than three millennia, the Chinese language as part of Han Chinese civilization was originally centred in the Yellow River areas and was gradually spread by Chinese speaking migrants outward particularly southwards crossing the Changjiang (also known as "Yangtze River") (cf Norman 1988, 4-5; Chen 1999, 1; Chappell 2001, 7). Consequently, the Chinese language went into contact with the languages spoken by indigenous peoples and eventually dispersed into an assortment of mutually unintelligible varieties today (cf. W. S-Y. Wang 1990, Zhou and You 2006, 7-8). Despite the fact that the diversity of Chinese dialects has been recorded by Yang Xiong 扬雄 (53 BC – 18 AD) more than two millennia ago, fascinating questions like the path of evolvement of the Chinese dialects remain largely unanswered due to the lack of historical audio evidence concerning Chinese dialects right up to modern times and the fact that any live dialects and languages are inevitably undergoing changes for a variety of reasons.

While abundant studies on dialects such as Wu, Xiang, Min and Yue have revealed various features characteristic of these dialects, relatively less research has been reported regarding dialects under the big umbrella of "Mandarin". In particular, questions such as 'what dialects have contributed and have been contributing to the formation of the Modern Standard Chinese' and 'how did the Modern Standard Chinese assimilate other dialects' urgently deserve more scholarly attention, given the fact that under the nationwide promotion of the nine-year compulsory education, the Modern Standard Chinese, and the powerful influence of mass media, other dialects both within and outside of the Mandarin Supergroup are moving rapidly towards *putonghua* in terms of phonological, lexical and syntactical features.

As investigating all the dialects subsumed under the category of "Mandarin" is far beyond one researcher's ability, the researcher has chosen to focus predominantly on one member of the Southwestern Mandarin, i.e. the GAD. By far the largest group of the Mandarin Supergroup with respect to geographical coverage and population, Southwestern Mandarin is spoken by approximately 200 million people and spread over 517 prefectural units in mainland China (cf. Wurm et al. 1987; Hou 2002, 31).[5] While considered as the most uniform dialect in the Mandarin Supergroup by phonological criteria (cf. Yuan 1983 [1960], 24; X. Huang 1986, 262; Wurm et al. 1987; L. Li 1997, 249), Southwestern Mandarin is relatively understudied (cf. Hou 2002, 9).

---

dialects as Southern Chinese dialects (cf. Hashimoto 1986). Norman (1988) is perhaps one of the very first Chinese classifications based on grammatical criteria. His three Chinese dialect groups are as follows: Northern Group (Mandarin group), Central group (Xiang, Gan, Wu), and Southern group (Hakka, Yue, Min). More dialect groups are recognized in the last two decades.

[4] *baihuawen* refers to 'vernacular literary literature' (Chen 2007, 145).

[5] The criteria used in Wurm et al. (1987) to group Southwestern Mandarin is "the dialects in which yang-ping is derived from Mandarin Chinese ru tone; the dialects in which ru, yin-ping and qu tones are derived from Mandarin Chinese ru tone; and the dialects that share similar tone values of yin-ping, yang-ping, shang and qu tones with those commonly found in Southwestern Mandarin, i.e. Chengdu, Kunming and Guiyang."

An introduction to Gong'an and its language situation

Situated in the southern bank of Changjiang in Hubei Province and bounded on the south by Hunan Province,[6] Gong'an plays a strategic role in linking the northern and southern banks of Changjiang and the two provinces. According to archaeological discovery of the Wangjia Gang Neolithic age site in 1978, the history of inhabitation of Gong'an stretches as far back as four thousand years (cf. Yang 1992, 1). As a prefectural level unit, Gong'an has been continuously administrated by Jingzhou[7] for more than two thousand years.[8]

Changjiang winds through Jingzhou, which adjoins Changde and Yueyang of Hunan on the south. Gong'an, located to the south of Changjiang, is bordered to the north by Jingzhou district and Jingzhou municipality, to the northeast by Shashi district, to the east by Jiangling, to the southeast by Shishou, to the north-west by Songzi, and to the south by Anxiang and Lixian (two counties of Hunan).

The documented history of Gong'an can be traced back to the Western Han dynasty (202 BC - 9 AD). It was initially established as Chanling Xian 屏陵县 'Chanling county'[9] under the jurisdiction of Jingzhou which was one of the birth places of the culture of Chu Guo 楚国 'Chu State' in the Spring and Autumn Period (770 BC - 476 BC) and Warring State Period (476 BC - 220 BC). The language spoken in Chu Guo was Chu Yu 楚语 'Chu language' that was strikingly different from other languages or dialects at that time according to *Fang Yan* and other historical literature (cf. W. Zhang 1999; Cen 2008, 25-27; L. Wang 2007, 17-24).

The strategic location of Chanling was utilized by Liu Bei [10] who encamped there in 209 AD and led to the name change of Chanling into Gong'an 公安.[11] According to *Gong'an County Annals* (W. Wang et al. 1937[1874], 81), it used to administer neighbouring areas that are now under the jurisdiction of Hunan Province. This may provide some additional, if not direct, clues to the linguistic connection between Gong'an and its Hunan neighbours. By the end of 2004, Gong'an, was comprised of fourteen towns and two townships including 431 villages, held an area of 2,257.5 km2 and a population of 1.03 million.[12]

The language situation in Gong'an

The language spoken in Gong'an area by virtually all inhabitants is Gong'an Hua 'Gong'an dialect' which is also used as a lingua franca among natives and migrants. Given its rich natural

---

[6] Hubei and its southern neighbour Hunan were named after their original location in relation to Dongting Hu 'Dongting Lake': Hubei, literal meaning, 'Lake North'; and Hunan, 'Lake South'.

[7] The "zhou" in *Jingzhou* originally referred to 'state' which was approximately equal to 'province' nowadays. The geographical breath of Jingzhou in the Han Dynasty allegedly covered the present Hubei and Hunan provinces. In the documented history of China, the administrative rank of Jingzhou varied from state, district to city. Since 1996 it has been ranked as *Jingzhou Shi* 'Jingzhou City' which has jurisdiction over two districts, three county-level cities and three counties including Gong'an (cf. http://www.xzqh.org/quhua/42hb/index.htm).

[8] Zhou and You (2006) suggest that dialect classification has a close connection with administrative divisions ascribed to the characteristics of Chinese culture.

[9] Gong'an was ranked as a county in the Year 12 of Han Gaozu (195 BC) according to Gong'an County Annals (cf. W. Wang et al. 1937[1874], 77).

[10] Liu Bei was *Zuo Jiangjun* 'a general of the Left' (He was respectfully called *Zuo Gong* 左公 which can be rendered in English as 'Lord Zuo') which was an early title granted by Emperor Xian (cf. Luo and Roberts 2005, 1579). It is said that when people wrote letters to Liu Bei they always asked "Zuo Gong an fou? 左公安否? (Is Lord Zuo safe/well or not?)". As Liu Bei was very busy, in response he usually briefly wrote "Gong'an 公安 (Lord is safe/well)". "Gong'an" therefore became the catchword of this area and eventually replaced Chanling as the official name of this area. Liu Bei later on became the founding emperor (221–223) of Shu Han during the Three Kingdoms era.

[11] Gong'an was changed into Jiang'an during Jin (265 – 420), Liu Song (420 – 479) and Southern Qi (479-502) dynasties but was changed back to Gong'an thereafter (cf. W. Wang et al. 1937[1874]).

[12] See the official website for more details: http://www.xzqh.org/quhua/42hb/1022ga.htm

resources and other socio-political advantages, Gong'an has attracted a large number of migrants from the neighbouring provinces such as Hunan and Jiangxi. Some villages, for instance, Xinhua, Xingou, Guandong, Lianhua, etc. are almost exclusively inhabited by Hunan migrants who moved to Gong'an mainly between the 1950s to 1970s. As the migration was driven primarily by economic reasons, GAD is considered more prestigious than their own dialects. The majority of the younger generations of Hunan migrants do not speak their parents' or grandparents' dialects outside of their communities.

As the stipulated medium of instruction by the Chinese government (cf. Chen 1999, 25-27), (not so "standard") *putonghua* is now used to a large extent in the schools in Gong'an, particularly the language classes. The real use of *putonghua* out of classrooms however is much more limited. Neither teachers nor students like to speak *putonghua* after class as it sounds "awkward" and "showy" and creates boundaries between the speaker and the listener(s).

Nonetheless, as a dialect spoken at the junction of North and South, GAD is likely to be influenced by both Northern dialects (especially the standard Mandarin) and the Southern dialects (e.g. Xiang and Gan). Recent inter-dialectal studies have revealed that modern southern dialects such as Min, Wu and Xiang are increasingly absorbing linguistic elements from the Mandarin group (cf. Chen 1999, 51). It has also been observed that Southwestern Mandarin possesses similar grammatical features to the Xiang group especially the New Xiang dialect (cf. Huang 1987, 36; Wu 1999; Luo and Wu 2006). However, as an individual dialect, it does have some idiosyncratic characteristics to be discussed next, which differentiate it from the other dialects or languages. A closer look at the linguistic features of GAD will help explain the role it plays in the process of conveying the dominant Northern dialects to the neighbouring dialects such as Xiang which affect GAD as well.

Previous studies on GAD and the aims of this paper

There are only a few studies on GAD so far. The first scientific linguistic survey on GAD was conducted by Wu Zongji in 1936, which provides a concise phonological description of GAD. The results were published in *Report of Hubei Dialectal Survey* (cf. Chao 1972[1948]). The significance of the dialectal surveys headed by Chao have been discussed at great length in the literature, and will not be repeated here. The limitation of this pioneering survey with regard to GAD lies primarily in the reliability of the data as both the informants involved were from a village in southwest of Gong'an and had been studying and living in Wuchang (the capital city of Hubei) for a long period when the survey was carried out. Furthermore, it is likely that some changes in the dialect have occurred after more than half a century.

A relatively recent survey on GAD was conducted in the 1980s by Yang Lan, who wrote a short monograph entitled *Gong'an Dialect Study* 公安方言研究 (1992). Based on the data collected from the field in 1983, Yang further divides GAD into four parts, i.e. the Northern, the Western, the Central and the Southern according to the tone features. The monograph heavily concentrates on phonological and lexical issues, and dedicates a chapter to grammatical description.

Most recently, Zhu (2005) published a paper dealing with three grammatical phenomena of GAD, namely, the sentential particle *lai*来 and *pa*把 (*ba*把 in *putonghua*) construction' with tʰa occurring in the sentence-final position, and the adjectives in the form of "V+ ən^{13}tsʅ 人子".

In summary, previous studies have partially presented some aspects of GAD, but a more comprehensive study on the dialect, particularly the grammar of the dialect is still lacking. The research project on which this paper is based was therefore designed to help fill this gap in current knowledge. In particular this paper aims to provide an up-to-date description of the phonological, lexical and syntactical features of GAD on the basis of the data collected from the field. In the following section, the data used in this paper is briefly described. In doing so, I attempt to provide direction and concrete language material from the Changjiang area for further studies which could not be performed previously due to a lack of linguistic materials (cf. Mei 2000[1988], 156).

Data used in this paper

The GAD data used in this paper mainly comes from fieldwork that was conducted to collect both oral and written data for the project in September-October 2009.[13] The data collection methods involved included acceptability judgment, spontaneous speeches, and corpus compilation. The judgment elicitation was carried out in the form of a questionnaire. The corpus is composed of data from spontaneous speech and a selection of sources which include a book entitled *A Collection of Gong'an Ballads*, a pamphlet entitled *An Introduction to Shuoguzi*, and online stories and ballads written down in GAD in two local forums.[14]

Twelve informants representing different age groups (from 1932 to 1960) were selected to participate in acceptability judgment and spontaneous speeches. All of them are from the current county town and its suburban areas. Strict criteria were applied in selecting informants. To be specific, when identifying potential candidates, a number of variables have been considered. These include age, education, occupation, gender, birthplace, the longest time period that they have been out of Gong'an, parents' language, and the language or dialect used at home.[15]

Phonological, lexical, and syntactical features of GAD

A preliminary comparison of the oral and the written data obtained for this project has suggested that there existed a difference between literary and colloquial readings in GAD. For example, when the final [u] preceded by Dental-alveolars initials, i.e. [t], [tʰ], [l], [ts], [tsʰ], [s], the majority of the words have a literary form and a colloquial form, for example, tu^{24} (读'read') vs. tou^{24}, su^{45} (苏'a surname') vs. sou^{45}. The exceptions include su^{45} (书'book') and 出tsʰu^{24} 'come out' which has only one reading. Further research is required to find out the phonological stratification in GAD. However, as there is a lack of systematic literary data and a systematic study on the phonological features of GAD, the study of these is beyond the scope of this thesis. The introductory information in this section is mainly concerned with the colloquial forms. The features of initials, finals and tones are presented below with comparison to MC and the Changsha Dialect (hereafter: CSD).

Initials

There are 20 initial consonants in Gong'an dialect including the zero form. The special features of initials in GAD compared with MC include but are not limited to the following:

1. There is no retroflex in GAD. For example, zh[tʂ], ch[tʂʰ], sh[ʂ] in MC are pronounced as [ts], [tsʰ], [s] in GAD respectively. For instance, both 'zhī 只' and 'zī 资' are tsɿ^{45}; both 'chǎo 吵' and 'cǎo 草' are tsʰau^{21}; both 'shì 是' and 'shì 四' are sɿ^{34}. [ɻ] is omitted if it occurs with the following finals and thus appears as zero form : [ɤ] (e.g. ɤ^{24}热), [ɯ] (e.g. ɯ^{24}日), [ɑu] (e.g. ɑu^{13}饶), [əu] (e.g. əu^{13}柔), [an] (e.g. an^{21}染), [ən] (e.g. ən^{13}人), [ɑŋ] (e.g. ɑŋ^{34}让), and [uan] (e.g. uan^{21}软); [ɻ] is omitted before [uən] and [uŋ], and the head vowel [u] is replaced with [y] (e.g. yən^{13}云，yuŋ^{13}荣); [ɻ] is pronounced as [l] before final [u] (e.g. lu^{13}如)[16];
2. n[n] and l[l] are not distinguished but merged into [l] in GAD, for example, both 'ni你' and 'li里' are pronounced as [li^{21}];
3. The nasalization of [m] in GAD is much weaker in comparison to [m] in MC;

---

[14] One forum is on "The Web of Life in Gong'an" at: http://www.gashw.com/bbs/dispbbs.asp?boardID=2&ID=67&page=1 (posts dated from 24 July 2007 to 9 April 2010); the other is at: http://0716-gongan.5d6d.com/thread-235-1-1.html (posts dated on 15 May 2008 and 28 May 2008)

[15] The informant background checklist used for the project was extracted from Yue-Hashimoto (1993, 263-264) and slightly modified according to the requirement of this research.

[16] Feature (i) is also found in most dialects in Xiang and Gan dialect group (cf. J. Huang 1987, 36-37).

4. [v] appears in the zero initial position when the final is [u], for example: vu²¹武, vu²¹五, vu²⁴屋 and vu¹³吴;

5. [ŋ] and [ɲ] only appear in a few words. For instance, ŋmA is the colloquial term for 'mother' in GAD and can be rendered into Chinese characters 姆妈[17], and ɲnA is the respectful form of second-person pronoun in GAD, i.e., the corresponding form of 'nin您' in MC. [ɲ] also immediately precedes adjectives to emphasize the degree conveyed by the adjectives meaning 'so, very', for example, ɲti⁴⁵ka⁴⁵ 'very little' and ɲkuei⁴⁵ 'very expensive'. It is postulated that [ɲ] is a weakened form of恁which appears frequently in Early Vernacular Chinese. 恁 has two uses which correspond to the uses of [ɲ] in GAD. The two uses of 恁 has two different pronunciations: when it is used as a respectful form of the second-person pronoun it is pronounced as [nin]; and when it is used as an adverb meaning 'so, very, like this, in that way; how, why, it is pronounced as [nən].

Some scholars include ng[ŋ] in the MC inventory of consonantal initials (e.g. Lin and Geng 2004, 23 & 27). However, ng[ŋ] usually occurs in colloquial forms or in some dialects such as Xiang, Yue and Hakka (cf. Chao 1968, 20; Qian 2001, 131). In this paper, ng[ŋ] is treated as a consonantal feature in dialects or an individual variant that is possibly influenced by a dialect.[18] Following Qian (2001, 90-91) and Li and Thompson (1981, 3, 5), this paper recognizes 24 initial consonants in MC including the zero form in Table 1 below.[19]

According to Wu (1999, 33-34), there are 20 initials in Changsha dialects. The similarities and differences between GAD and Changsha dialect in terms of initials are presented in Table 2 below. The two tables show that GAD is actually closer in terms of initials to Changsha dialect, which is a member of the Xiang group than to MC, which is generally considered as a representative for Mandarin.

---

[17] Nowadays, most young people in Gong'an use mandarinized form mAmA 妈妈 instead of ŋmA 姆妈.

[18] In Xiang dialect, there is initial ng[ŋ], e.g., as in [ŋA] 咬 'bite' and [ŋau] 袄 'short Chinese-style coat'.

[19] Table is made with reference to Chao (1972[1948], 1366), Li and Thompson (1981, 5), Yang (1992, 6) and IPA 2005.

Table 1. IPA chart for GAD initials, with comparison to Pinyin in *putonghua*												

	Bilabials		Labiodentals		Dental-alveolars		Retroflexes		Palatals		Velars	
	GAD	Pinyin	GAD	Pinyin	GAD	Pinyin	GAD	Pinyin	GAD	Pinyin	GAD	Pinyin
Unaspirated stops	[p]	b[p]			[t]	d[t]					[k]	g[k]
Aspirated stops	[pʰ]	p[pʰ]			[tʰ]	t[tʰ]					[kʰ]	k[kʰ]
Nasals	[m]	m[m]				n[n]						
	[ŋ]								[ɲ]			
Unaspirated affricates					[ts]	z[ts]		zh[tʂ]	[tɕ]	j[tɕ]		
Aspirated affricates					[tsʰ]	c[tsʰ]		ch[tʂʰ]	[tɕʰ]	q[tɕʰ]		
Fricatives			[f]	f[f]	[s]	s[s]		sh[ʂ]	[ɕ]	x[ɕ]	[x]	h[x]
			[v]									
Approximants					[l]	l[l]						
								r[ɻ]				

Table 2. Comparison of the GAD and CSD initials					
GAD	CSD	GAD	CSD	GAD	CSD
[p]	[p]	[k]	[k]	[ts]	[ts]
[pʰ]	[pʰ]	[kʰ]	[kʰ]	[tsʰ]	[tsʰ]
[m]	[m]	[x]	[x]	[s]	[s]
[f]	[f]	[tɕ]	[tɕ]		z
		[tɕʰ]	[tɕʰ]	[v]	
		[ɕ]	[ɕ]		
[t]	[t]	[l]	[l]		
[tʰ]	[tʰ]		[ȵ]		
			[ŋ]		

Finals

There are 34 finals recognized in this paper. The IPA chart for GAD finals is made in contrast to *putonghua* Pinyin (see Table 3) and the CSD (see Table 4) regardless of controversy over the clustering methods of vowels. The finals identified here are consistent with Yang (1992, 6) but slightly differ from Chao (1972[1948]) in that [ɯ] are added to the inventory and some IPA transcriptions of the initials are different. [20] Compared to *putonghua*, GAD shows a range of distinguishing features in terms of finals, for example (see also Yang 1992, 6-7):

---

[20] Yang (1992, 6) lists two [an]s in the initial inventory which is probably a typographical error and the second [au] should be [ən] as later (pp. 122-124, 127-129) she describes both [an] and [ən] in the homophony syllabary.

1. There are no ing [iŋ], eng [əŋ] and ueng [uəŋ].[21] The ing [iŋ] in MC is invariably merged into [in] in GAD (e.g. both *líng*零and *lín*林 are pronounced as [lin] in GAD). The combinations of bilabials and labio-dentals with eng [əŋ] in MC are merged into [uŋ] (e.g. *buŋ³⁴蹦*, *pʰuŋ⁴⁵碰*, *muŋ⁴⁵梦*); the others are pronounced as [ən] (e.g. *tsʰən¹³程*, *tʰən²¹等*); ueng[uəŋ] is merged into [uŋ] (e.g. *uŋ⁴⁵嗡*);

2. There is a lack of r-suffixation in GAD;

3. The [uo] in MC are all pronounced as [o] in GAD (e.g. *to²¹朵*, *tʰo⁴⁵拖*);

4. Without the presence of any initial, e[ɤ] in MC is pronounced as [o] in GAD (e.g. *o²⁴恶*). And after the initials [m], [k], [kʰ] and [x], e[ɤ] is also pronounced as [o] (e.g. *mo²¹么*, *ko⁴⁵哥*, *kʰo²¹可*and *xo⁴⁵喝*);

Some of the words with [iɛ] finals in MC are pronounced as the same in GAD, for example, *piɛ²¹瘪*, *pʰiɛ²⁴撇*, *miɛ³⁴灭*, *ɕiɛ²¹写*, *iɛ¹³爷*, *liɛ²⁴列*, *tɕʰiɛ前[22] ; but some of the palatals have been changed into [ai] or [yɛ], for example, *xai¹³鞋*, *xai²¹蟹*, *kai³⁴械*, *kai⁴⁵街*, *tɕʰyɛ¹³茄*, etc.

---

[21] It should be borne in mind that here I only present the phonetic system of GAD spoken in the prefecture town area and the phonetic features described here do not represent all the possible variants of GAD, for example, there is [iŋ] (e.g. *miŋ³⁴面* 'noodle' and *tɕʰiŋ¹³钱* 'money') in the Gong'an dialect spoken in Yangchang, which is a small town of Gong'an and is about 4 km away from the prefecture town.

[22] It appears only in phrase *tɕʰiɛ²⁴ uu²⁴* * 前日 'the day before yesterday'.

Table 3. IPA chart for GAD finals, with comparison to *putonghua* Pinyin. [23]							
GAD	Pinyin	G*AD*	[Pi]ny*in*	GA[D]	Pin*yin*	[G]AD	*Pin[yi]*n
		[i]]	i*[i]*	[i]u]	u*[u]*	[y]	ü[y]
[A]	a[A]	[iA]	ia[iA]	[uA]	ua[uA]		
[o]	o[o]	[io]			uo[uo]		
[ɣ]	e[ɣ]						
[ɹ]	ï [ɹ] [ɭ]						
[ɯ]	ê[ɛ]	[iɛ]	ie[iɛ]			[yɛ]	üe[yɛ]
	er[Ô]						
[ai]	ai[ai]			[uai]	uai[uai]		
[ei]	ei[ei]			[uei]	ui[uei]		
[ɑu]	ao[ɑu]	[iɑu]	iao[iɑu]				
[əu]	ou[ou]	[iəu]	iou[iou]				
[an]	an[an]	[iɛn]	ian[iæn]	[uan]	uan[uan]	[yɛn]	üan[yæn]
[ən]	en[ən]	[in]	in[in]	[uən]	un[uən]	[yn]	ün[yn]
[ɑŋ]	ang[ɑŋ]	[iɑŋ]	iang[iɑŋ]	[uɑŋ]	uang[uɑŋ]		
	eng[əŋ]		ing[iŋ]	[uŋ]	ueng[uəŋ]		
					ong[uŋ]	[iuŋ]	iong[yŋ]

Table 4 Comparison of the GAD and CSD finals							
GAD	CSD	GAD	CSD	GAD	CSD	GAD	CSD
		[i]	[i]	[u]	[u]	[y]	[y]
[A]	[a]	[iA]	[ia]	[uA]	[ua]		[ya]
[o]	[o]	[io]	[io]				
[ɤ]	[ɤ]						
	[uɤ]						
[ɿ]	[ɿ]						
[ɯ]		[iɛ]	[iɛ]			[yɛ]	[yɛ]
[ai]	[ai]			[uai]	[uai]		[iɛ̃]
	[yai]						[yɛ̃]
[ei]	[ei]			[uei]	[uei]		[ø̃]
				[yei]			[õ]
[ɑu]	[ɑu]	[iɑu]	[iɑu]				
[əu]	[əu]	[iəu]	[iəu]				
[an]	[an]	[iɛn]	[ian]	[uan]	[uan]		[yan]
[ən]	[ən]	[in]	[in]	[uən]	[uən]	[yn]	[yn]
[ɑŋ]		[iɑŋ]		[uɑŋ]		[yɛn]	
		[iuŋ]		[uŋ]	[m̩]		[n̩]

Table 3 and 4 have illustrated that GAD is closer to *putonghua* than to CSD in respect of finals.

Tones

According to Chao (1972[1948], 1365-1385), there are six tones in GAD, namely Yinping, Yangping, Shangsheng, Yinqu, Yangqu and Ru. Yang (1992), however, does not divide the Qu tone into Yin and Yang and thus only recognizes five tones. Our data is consistent with the description in Yang (1992).[24] Therefore, this thesis also outlines five tones in the GAD spoken in the central area excluding the neutral tone (see Table 2.7 below). It is interesting that out of the five tones, four are rising tones in GAD.

---

[24] However, it does not exclude the possibility that there was a distinction in the Qu tone in earlier GAD.

Tones	Yinping	Yangping	Shangsheng	Yinqu	Yangqu	Ru
Pitch	45	13	21	34	33	24
Graph			ꞔ	ɜ	ⵏ	ā
Examples	鸡	急	几	记	近	去
	tɕi⁴⁵	tɕi¹³	Tɕi²¹	tɕi³⁴Ā	tɕin³³	kʰɯ²⁴

Table 5. Tones in GAD

The Ru tone in GAD is not stable in the central area and is disappearing specially among young educated native speakers (cf. Yang 1992, 42-47). This phenomenon conforms to the fact that Ru tone in other Mandarin dialects is declining or it has been transformed into other tones (cf. Qian 2009 [2000]).

Tones	Yinping	Yangping	Shangsheng	Yinqu	Yangqu	Ru
Pitch	33	13	41	45	21	24
Graph	ⵏ				ꞔ	ā
Examples	高	年	捆	要	饿	不
	kau³³	ȵiɛ̃¹³	kʰuən⁴¹	iau⁴⁵	ŋo²¹	pu²⁴

Table 6. Tones in CSD

Tones	Yinping	Yangping	Shangsheng	Qusheng	
Pitch	55	35	214	51	
Graph	˥	ꞔ	̌		
Examples	鸡	急	几	记	

Table 7 Tones in *putonghua*[25]

Lexical features

The lexical features of GAD are unsurprisingly of hybrid nature as GAD is spoken in the transitional area of the Northern dialects and the Southern dialects. Like many other SWM dialects, MC has heavily influenced GAD in terms of vocabulary. Fortunately, some ancient linguistic elements found in *Chǔ Cí*[26] have survived in some dialects of Jingzhou (see also Q. S. Wang 1993).[27] Compared to MC, GAD has but is by no means limited to the following distinctive lexical features:

---

[25] Details about the phonetic features related to the comparison of GAD phonetics and Middle Chinese, some of the combination rules of the initials and finals, neutral tone and tone sandhi can be found in (1948[1972, 1367-1383]) and Yang (1992, 7-16).

[26] *Chǔ Cí* 楚辞 'Songs of Chu' is an anthology of poetry most of which is attributed to Qū Yuán屈原, the great poet and minister to the King from the Southern Chu during the Warring State Period.

1. It has a higher proportion of monosyllabic words. For instance, the majority of the verbs in GAD are monosyllabic whereas in MC they are generally disyllabic. Consider the following examples: ɕio^{13}学 'study' (xué xí 学习 in MC), tɕ^{h}in^{45}清 'arrange, count' (zhěng lǐ 整理, in MC) and xuA^{34} 化 'melt, dissolve' (róng huà 融化 in MC).

2. According to the north-south division proposed by Hashimoto (1976, 1986), there is a decline of monosyllabism in the Northern dialects due to Altaic influence whereas a relatively higher proportion of monosyllabism is observed in Southern dialects that can be attributed to the language contact with Tai and Austro-Asiatic languages in the south. Although as a dialect classified in the Northern group, GAD resembles the southern dialects in monosyllabism. This phenomenon is also observed in CSD (cf. Wu 1999).

3. There is a wider use of the suffix -tsɿ for nouns or noun phrases, for example, li^{13} tsɿ 梨子 'pear', ts^{h}A^{34} tsɿ 擦子 'eraser', lɑu^{21} ɕy^{21} tsɿ 老鼠子 'mouse' (cf. Yang 1992, 152-153). Sometimes two 'tsɿ's occur one noun, for example, ai^{13} t^{h}əu tsɿ^{21} tsɿ 碍头子子 'gravel', ɕyɛ^{24} tsɿ^{21} tsɿ 雪籽子 'snow grains', sA^{45} tsɿ^{21} tsɿ 沙子子 'sand grains'. The first **'tsɿ'** still reserves the full tone and to some extent the lexical meanings (e.g. seed, child); the second (also the last) 'tsɿ' is a diminutive suffix. In the case of MC, the first tsɿ has been already grammaticalized into the diminutive suffix *zi* 子, e.g., *shā zi* 沙子 'sand grain', *shí zi* 石子 'gravel'. -tsɿ can be used as normalizer, similar to the normalizer 'zi' in MC, for instance, *kA^{24}* 夹 'clip (v.)' vs. *kA^{24} tsɿ* 夹子 'clip (n)'. In addition to that, -tsɿ can be used to as a suffix for a noun to distinguish meanings, for example, mi^{21} 米 "rice" vs. mi^{21} tsɿ 米子 'rice puff'. Some special uses of 'tsɿ' are also found in CSD (cf. Wu 1999).

4. The suffix -tsɿ is so widely used in GAD that in some cases it no longer possesses much lexical or grammatical meaning as the suffix -zi does in MC and some other dialects. For instance, in tɕi^{45}A^{45} tsɿ 鸡伢子 'chick(s)' (cf: tɕi^{45} tsɿ 鸡子 'chicken') and tsu^{45} A^{45} tsɿ 猪伢子 'piglet(s)' (cf. tsu^{45} tsɿ 猪子 'pigs'), it is the second morpheme A^{45}伢 'young poult, pub, cub' that plays the distinctive semantic role. -tsɿ does not only form nouns; it also occurs as a part of an adjective suffix (see (iii) below).

5. A special use of suffix -ən^{13}tsɿ for monosyllabic adjectives is observed, e.g, tsau^{45} ən^{13}tsɿ 躁人子 'irritating' and saŋ^{45} ən^{13}tsɿ 伤人子 'too greasy' (cf. Zhu 2005, 254-256).

6. While the verb reduplication signifying the delimitative aspect in MC (cf. Li and Thompson 1981, 232-237; Xiao and McEnery 2004, 149-159) is lacking in GAD, there is a rich inventory of reduplicative patterns in GAD which includes reduplicated measure words, nouns, onomatopoeic words and verbs. Some of the reduplicated forms are further combined with suffixes such as -tsɿ or -sən. The reduplicated measure words in GAD take suffix -tsɿ and function as object, for example, li^{13} tsi pu^{34} mai^{45} ɕin^{45} ɕin tsɿ, tsɿ^{21} mai^{45} tai^{45} tai tsɿ 梨子不卖斤斤子，只卖袋袋子 'These pears are only sold by bags not by kilos.' The reduplication of nouns taking a suffix -tsɿ generally yields a meaning of 'smallness', 'vividness' and/or 'in large quantity', for example, p^{h}in^{13} p^{h}in tsɿ瓶瓶子 'bottles' and p^{h}uŋ^{13} p^{h}uŋ tsɿ 棚棚子 'shed'[28]. The cognate of the suffix -sən following reduplicated onomatopoeic words is

---

[27] For example tsuo^{24} 濯 'wash' which can be traced back to Qu Yuan's famous poem *Yú Fǔ* (渔父 'The Fisherman', collected in *Chǔ Cí*), as in "沧浪之水清兮，可以濯吾缨；沧浪之水浊兮，可以濯吾足。" (cāng làng zhī shuǐ qīng xī, kě yǐ zhuó wú yīng; cāng làng zhī shuǐ zhuó xī, kě yǐ zhuó wú zú. "When the river water's clear, I can wash my tassels here. Muddied, for such use unmet, here I still can wash my feet."—the English translation comes from http://www.chinapage.com/poem/quyuan/quyuan-e.html#Lament，accessed on 2 March 2010), is still in use in daily conversation in GAD and possibly other dialects in Jingzhou area. The current use of tsuo^{24}濯 in GAD is arguably in line with that in the poem which preferably refers to washing something casually and lightly in streams or rivers whereas when expressing washing something at home or in containers the more general word 'ɕi' 洗 'wash' is likely to be chosen in modern GAD.

[28] We disagree with Yang (1992, 153) on the generalization that the reduplicated nouns with suffix -tsɿ can not be used as singular form as we can easily find counter examples such as i^{24} ko^{34} p^{h}uŋ^{13} p^{h}uŋ tsɿ 一个棚棚子 'one shed'.

probably 'sheng声' (pronounced as shēng in MC and sən⁴⁵ in GAD) which means 'sound'. The combination of reduplicated onomatopoeic words or verbs with -sən normally function as predicates and compliments in syntax describing the ongoing action or the result of an event, for example, $tʰei^{21}$ $tsʅ$ $tsʅ^{24}$ san^{13} san $sən$腿子直颤颤声 'Legs being shaking non-stop'.

7. The gender markers for some male and female animals follow the nouns, for example, $tɕi^{45}$ <u>$kong^{45}$</u> 鸡公 'rooster', $tɕi^{45}$ <u>mo^{21}</u> 鸡母 'hen'[29]; but precede some others, e.g. <u>$kong^{45}$</u> $kʰou^{13}$ $tsʅ$ 公狗子 'male dog', <u>mo^{21}</u> tsu^{45}母猪 'female pig'; and in some cases both versions are available, for example, iA^{24} <u>$kong^{45}$</u> 鸭公 'male duck' vs. $kong^{45}$ iA^{24} $tsʅ$ 公鸭子 'male duck', and iA^{24} mo^{21}鸭母 'female duck' vs. mo^{21} iA^{24} $tsʅ$母鸭 'female duck'.[30]

8. The perplexing mixture of gender markers in GAD is also directly related to the hybrid nature of GAD. It is well known that there is a prominent syntactic difference in gender markers between the Northern and the Southern Chinese dialects (cf. Hashimoto 1986). In Northern Chinese dialects, gender markers immediately precede animal terms as prefix, but closely follow the animal terms in Southern Chinese dialects as suffix. The intermediate position of GAD is well exemplified by the mixed system for gender markers on animate terms (not limited to animal terms) in GAD. Recent studies (e.g., Wu Y. J. 2004) on the dialects in the central part of China have shown that there are a variety of dialects exhibiting an intermediate position between the North and the South with respect to grammatical features.

9. When emphasizing the degree of adjectives, the second syllable is prolonged and followed by the modal particle tA²¹哒, for instance, $xɤ^{34}$ $tɕʰy{:}^{45}$ tA^{21}黑区哒 'very dark or black'; $pɤ^{13}$ $tɕi{:}n^{45}$ tA^{21}白净哒 'very white'.

Syntactical features

In contrast to MC and CSD, GAD exhibits some idiosyncratic syntactical features (cf. Zʰᵘ 2005). There are *sᵒᵐe salⁱᵉⁿt sʸⁿ*tactic properties in *GAD thᵃᵗ haᵛᵉ* not been studied in detail before. For example, the passive marker in GAD is not bei but tʰau.[31] Furthermore, GAD has a considerably more complex aspectual system. It is estimated that there are more than ten durative aspect markers in GAD whereas in *putonghua* the aspect marker -*zhe* plays an essential, if not exclusive, role in indicating durativity; and in CSD, there are four corresponding forms of durative aspect markers. Table 8 and 9 below exhibit the durative aspect markers in *putonghua* and GAD and CSD respectively according to their syntactic and semantic features.

---

[29] 'Rooster' can also be expressed as $ɕiuŋ^{13}tɕi^{45}$雄鸡 with the gender marker '$ɕiuŋ^{13}$' 雄 in the front but corresponding form for 'hen' is not available in GAD.

[30] For a concise discussion of the animal gender markers in Chinese dialects from the historical point of view, see Wu (2004, 159-166) and Luo (2006, 378-384).

[31] Young educated Gong'an natives now tend to use 'bei' as well.

Table 8 Durative aspect markers in *putonghua* and GAD		
Putonghua	**GAD**	
Zhe	təu^{21}tsai^{34}	
	tɕʰi^{21}tsai^{34}	
zhe (-le)	tA^{21}	
Zhe	təu^{21}	
zhe (zài)	tsai^{34}	
zhe (-le)	təu^{21}	
	tɕʰi^{21}	
V+zhe+V+zhe	V + təu^{21} + V + təu^{21}	
	V + tsu^{21} + V + tsu^{21}	
zhe (-le)	tA^{21}	
	t⊗^{24}iəu^{21}	
V + zhe	V + təu^{21}	
	V + tɕʰi^{21}	

Table 9 Durative aspect markers in *putonghua* and CSD[32]		
Putonghua	**CSD**	
zhe/le	ta^{21}	
Zhe	t⊗^{24}	
Zhe	tɕʰi^{41}	
zhe	tau^{45}	

The data obtained has shown that the aspectual system of GAD is somewhat a hybrid of the Northern dialects and the Southern dialects (in particular, the Xiang and Gan group). For instance, the syntactic rules and semantic functions of tA^{21} in GAD are very similar to those of the aspect marker 'le' in *putonghua* but it is closer to the aspect marker ta^{21} in CSD in terms of phonetic resemblance. Further studies are required to reveal the similarities and differences of the aspectual system in GAD with comparison to CSD and *putonghua*.

Concluding remarks

In this paper, a brief introduction to GAD has been provided with regard to its geographic and relevant historical background, the data used in the project and linguistic features of GAD contrasted with *putonghua* and its neighbouring Changsha dialect. The above analysis of the phonological, lexical and syntactical features has shown that all these aspects and, in particular, the syntactical aspect of GAD deserves to be studied in depth in order to reveal the connections between GAD and the Mandarin Supergroup and the neighbouring Xiang dialect.

---

[32] This table is made with reference to Wu (1999, 54-99).

Bibliography

Cao, Zhiyun. (ed.) 2008. *Linguistic Atlas of Chinese Dialects*. Beijing: the Commercial Press.

Cen, Qixiang. 2008. *Yuyanxueshi gaiyao*. Beijing: Shijie tushu chuban gongsi.

Chao Yuen-Ren, Ting Sheng-Shu, Yang Shi-Feng, Wu Tsung-Chi and Tung T'ung-ho). 1948. *Hubei fangyan diaocha baogao (Report on a Survery of the Dialects of Hupeh)*, Reprinted in 1972, Special issue, Institute of History and Philology. Taipei: Tai lian guo feng chu ban she.

Chappell, Hillary. 1992. Towards a typology of aspect in Sinitic languages. *Zhongguo Jingnei Yuyan ji Yuyanxue: Hanyu Fangyan [Chinese Languages and Linguistics: Chinese dialects]*, 1, 67–106. Taipei: Academia Sinica.

Chappell, Hillary. (ed.). 2001a. *Sinitic grammar: synchronic and diachronic perspectives*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Chappell, Hillary 2001b. Synchrony and diachrony of Sinitic languages: A brief history of Chinese dialects. In: H. Chappell (ed.), *Sinitic grammar: synchronic and diachronic perspectives*, 3 – 28. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Chappell, Hilary, Li Ming and Alain Peyraube. 2007. Chinese linguistics and typology: the state of the art. *Linguistic Typology* 11.1. 187-211.

Chen, Ping. 1999. *Modern Chinese*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Chen, Ping. 2007. China. In *Language and national identity in Asia*, ed. Andrew Simpson, 141-167. New York : Oxford University Press.

Chen, Ping. 2008. Languages in a modernizing China. In *The Cambridge Companion to Modern Chinese Culture*, ed. Kam Louie, 198-217. Cambridge Collections Online. DOI:10.1017/CCOL9780521863223.010 (accessed 2 April 2010). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Hashimoto, Mantaro (1976). Language diffusion on the Asian continent: Problems of typological diversity in Sino-Tibetan. *Computational Analyses of Asian and African Languages* 3: 49 – 65.

Hashimoto, Mantaro. (1986). The Altaicization of Northern Chinese. In John McCoy & Timothy Light (eds.), *Contributions to Sino-Tibetan Studies*, 76 – 97. Leiden: Brill.

Hou, Jingyi. 2002. *Xiandai hanyu fangyan gailun*, (1st ed.). Shanghai: Shanghai jiao yu chu ban she.

Huang, Jinghu. 1987. *Han Yu Fang Yan Xue*. Xiamen: Xiamen University Press.

Huang, Xuezhen. 1986. Xinan guanhua de fenqu(gao). *Fang yan*, 4, 262-272.

Li, Lan. 1997. Liushinianlai Xinanguanhua de diaocha yu yanjiu. *Fangyan*. 4, 249-257.

Li, Charles N. and Thompson, Sandra A. 1981. *Mandarin Chinese: a functional reference grammar*. California: University of California Press.

Lin, Tao. and Geng, Zhensheng. 2004. *Yinyunxue gaiyao*. Beijing: Shangwu yinshuguan.

Luo Xiru and Wu Yongcun. 2006. Cong cihui kan xiangyu yu xinanguanhua de guanxi. *Chuanshan Journal*, 61 (3):99 - 100.

Luo, Ziqun. 2006. Jigong vs. Gongji: Course of Different Word Order Expressing Animal Gender in Southern-northern Chinese Dialects. *Fangyan*, 4, 378-384.

Mei, Zulin. 2000[1988]. The origin and function of Mandarin *zhe* 着，Wu *tsi* 仔，Southern Min *ti* 著 and their cognates in Chinese dialects. *Mei Zulin Yuyanxue lunwenji* (pp155-187). Beijing: Shangwu yinshuguan.

Norman, Jerry. 1988. *Chinese*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Qian, Nairong. (ed.). 2001. *Xiandai hanyu* (revised version). Nanjing: Jiangsu jiaoyu chubanshe.

Qian, Zengyi. 2009. Guanhuafangyan diaocha duihanyushiyanjiu de yiyi. *Hanyu fangyan yanjiu de fangfa yu shijian*. Shangwu yinshuguan. Beijing: Shangwu yinshuguan.

Wang, Li. 2007. Zhong Guo Yuyanxue Shi. Shanghai: Fudan University Press.

Wang, Qunsheng. 1993. 'Chu Ci' zhong Jingsha fangyanci lilüe. Journal of Wuhan University (Social Science), 112-113.

Wang, William. S-Y. 1990. Theoretical issues in studying Chinese dialects. *Journal of the Chinese Language Teachers Association*. 1, 1-34.

Wang, W. et al. (1874, reprinted in 1937). *Gong'an xianzhi* (Gong'an County annual). Taiwan: Chengwen chubanshe youxiangongsi yinhang.

Wu, Yunji. 1999. *The development of aspectual systems in the Chinese-Xiang dialects*, Paris: Ecole des hautes études en sciences sociales.

Wu, Yunji. 2004. Further Study on the Gender Markers of Animal Terms in the Hunan Dialects. In Social Science Institute *Essay Collections for the 50-year Anniversary of Zhongguo Yuwen*, 159-166. Beijing: Commercial Press.

Wurm, Stephen. A. and Rong Li, eds. 1987. *Language atlas of China*. Hong Kong: Longman.

Xiao, Richard. and McEnery, Tony. 2004. *Aspect in Mandarin Chinese: a corpus-based study*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.

Yang, Lan. 1992. *Gong'an fangyan yanjiu*. Shanghai: Hanyu dacidian chubanshe.

Yuan, Jiahua. 1983 [1960]. *Han yu fang yan gai yao* (2nd ed.) (An Outline of the Chinese Dialects). Beijing: Wenzi gaige chuban she.

Zhang, Min. 2000. Syntactic Change in South-eastern Mandarin: How Does Geographical Distribution Reveal a History of Diffusion? In *Yu yan bian hua yu Han yu fang yan: Li Fang-gui xian sheng ji nian lun wen ji,* ed. Bangxin Ding and Aiqin Yu, 197-242. Taibei: Zhong yang yan jiu yuan yu yan xue yan jiu suo chou bei chu ; Seattle: University of Washington.

Zhang, Weiran. 1999. The Evolution of the Chu dialect and the dialectal region of Hubei Province in history. *Fudan Journal (Social Science)*, (2), 109-142.

Zhou, Zhenhe and You, Rujie. 2006. *Fang yan yu Zhongguo wen hua 2nd edition*. Shanghai: Shanghai renmin chubanshe.

Zhu, Guanming. 2005. Hubei Gong'an fangyan de jige yufaxianxiang. *Fangyan* 3: 253-257.

Hong Cai
University of Queensland
h.cai1@uq.edu.au

Institute *of* Advanced Study

Durham University

British Literary Diaspora in the Mediterranean: The (Re)Creation of the 'Sunny South'

EDUARDO MOYÀ ANTÓN

The Balearic Islands are becoming more and more popular as a quiet resort in winter and spring on account of their mild and equable climate, their moderate rainfall, their attractive scenery, their comfortable accommodation, and their good order and administration.
Baedeker's Spain and Portugal (1913)

Each year a massive multinational force invades the islands in search of a piece of this multifaceted paradise. The total population of the isles does not amount to a million, but many times that number are involved in a round-the-clock airlift and disembarkation of sun- and fun-seeking from Easter to October.
Lonely Planet: Spain (2005)

Nowadays the notion of 'diaspora' is a complicated and difficult concept that often implies violence, separation, and pain.[1] This article, however, deals with a diaspora that has to do more with leisure, reunion and pleasure. If we take the term to mean "the dispersal of human migratory populations from their homelands",[2] we can then refer to a particular British diaspora in the 1920s and 1930s to the Mediterranean rim. This migratory movement, although different in terms of social class and compared to others, shares some constitutive traits with broader diasporas: firstly, there is a clear movement towards a new space, the Mediterranean, that needs (re)definition on behalf of the diasporic community; secondly, we observe manifold tools deployed in constructing a new identity. These tools *work to define what the new land is and what the land they left behind signifies.*[3]

When we speak of diaspora, we generally witness a sense of longing for the original home and to some extent a recreation of it in the new adopted space. However, regarding the British expatriates in this article, this is not the case. The idea of home and its representation are frequently rejected. Subsequently, the new identity is only fulfilled when the sense of detachment is complete. According to Freud, the wish to escape is the expression of a discontent signified in 'home'. Indeed, "a great part of the pleasure of travel lies in […] dissatisfaction with home and family".[4] Such dissatisfaction is exemplified in Robert Graves' comment in the last pages of *Goodbye to All That*

---

[1] See James Clifford "Diasporas," *Cultural Anthropology* 9, no. 3 (1994): 302-338; Barbara Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, "Spaces of Dispersal," *Cultural Anthropology* 9, no. 3 (1994): 339-344; and Stuart Hall, "Cultural Identity and Diaspora," in *Theorizing Diaspora*, edited by Jana Evans Braziel and Anita Mannur, 233-246. Malden, MA: Blackwell, 2006.

[2] Lana Evans Braziel, *Diaspora: An Introduction* (Malden, MA: Blackwell, 2008), 12.

[3] See Smadar Lavie and Ted Swedenburg, eds., *Displacement, Diaspora, and Geographies of Identity* (Durham NC: Duke University Press, 1996).

[4] J. Strachey, *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud* (London: Hogarth, 1955), vol. xviii, 246.

(1929): "I went abroad, resolved never to make England my home again." [5] Similarly, Gerald Durrell enquires about his homeland through the voice of his brother Lawrence:

> 'Why do we stand this bloody climate?' [Lawrence] asked suddenly, making a gesture towards the rain distorted window. 'Look, at it! And if it comes to that, look at us!...Margo swollen up like a plate of scarlet porridge…Leslie wandering around with fourteen fathoms of cotton wool in each ear…Gerry sounds as if he's had a cleft palate from birth…And look at you: you are looking more decrepit and hag-ridden everyday. [6]

Graves' and Durrell's cases are not the only ones. According to the seminal work *Abroad: British Literary Travelling between the Wars* (1980), we can speak of an established "British Literary Diaspora":

> [T]he great flight of writers from England in the 20s and 30s which deposited Gerald Brennan in Spain and Robert Graves in Majorca; Norman Douglas in Capri, Naples and Florence; and Lawrence Durrell in Corfu; […] Somerset Maugham and Katherine Mansfield on the Riviera. [7]

But what did these places represent? How did these travellers help shape a contemporary discourse regarding the image of the Mediterranean? Despite sharing similar mechanisms of representation, when we observe the two depictions at the beginning of this article, we soon notice that the islands of Baedeker's (1913) have little in common with those of the Lonely Planet (2005). Why is this so? In this article, I understand the identity of a place as a discursive construction subjected to contextual forces such as time, national relationships or prejudice, leading in many cases to stereotype. In the following pages I analyse the texts of a number of well-educated British travel writers, particularly in the interwar period, who chose the Mediterranean as a place to live, following the ideal of the exotic South with all its implications. By South I understand, like Pemble in his study, the exoticist idea that British Victorians and Edwardians had of the Mediterranean.[8] I am especially interested in the traveller's depiction of southern scenery as means of a textual (re)creation of old and new tropes. Using travel theory, and acknowledging the encountering with the other as essential to the processes of representation, I will show how images generate interpretations and perpetuate identities. In the first section of this article, I examine what ideas and images sustained the concept *South* for British writers and artists in the 19th century. This will help us understand why different British writers chose it as a destination in the course of the 20th century, adopting it as a land of "sun, sea, mountains, spring-water, shady trees, no politics, and a few civilized luxuries such as electric light […]"[9]. In the last section, I will indicate the reasons and devices that explain the shift from the idle, classical and pastoral Mediterranean of the Victorians to the festive, non-sleeping, great "vacationland festival"[10] of contemporary "Medland"[11].

The South: The 19th century creation of an exotic fantasy

As a starting point, I consider the British image of the Mediterranean/South to be a textual and cultural construct grounded in reflections of a glorious past and fine weather. Given that "a new space cannot be born (produced) unless it accentuates differences",[12] I understand that a new space arises in opposition to another space, in this case Britain. Thus, the Mediterranean becomes a

---

[5] Robert Graves, *Goodbye to All That* (London: Penguin Modern Classics, 1957), 278.

[6] Gerald Durrell. *My Family and Other Animals* (London: Penguin Books, 1956), 8.

[7] Paul Fussell, *Abroad: British Literary Travelling between the Wars* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1980), 11.

[8] See John Pemble, *The Mediterranean Passion: Victorians and Edwardians in the South* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1987).

[9] Robert Graves, *Majorca Observed* (London: Cassell, 1965), 7.

[10] Henri Lefebvre, *The Production of Space* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1991), 58.

[11] See Christopher Mulvey, "Travel Literature: the "Medland" Trope in the British Holiday Brochure," *Journal of Popular Culture* 29, no. 4 (Spring 1996): 99-115.

[12] Lefebvre, *The Production of Space*, 52.

new 'differential space' for British travellers and readers once it appears in the 19th century as one of the most popular travel destinations.[13]

Let us begin with some fundamental dividing and defining factors. First, the industrial and technological progress of the North that contrasts with the rural backwardness of the South at a time when the "English verdure, English culture, English comfort"[14] of *Emma* vanishes in Britain with the coming of modernity. In the course of the 19th and beginning of the 20th century, a red brick metropolitan scene opposes an idle southern landscape, embodiment of a classical setting, tinted with oriental and biblical features.[15] Second is the fact that many travellers with a public school and later an 'Oxbridge' education[16] had absorbed "the Hellenistic influence of schools, museums and intellectual discussion".[17] Considering these two factors, critic Robert Aldrich comments that the journey outside the library "into 'the real world' […] formed a symbolic regression from 'civilisation' to the natural state of mankind".[18] Moreover, in some travellers' accounts, the authors do not seem to abandon this 'library' in their journeys at all.

Such is the case of Margaret D'Este, who travels to the Balearic Islands. The reader finds depictions of the islanders that vary from the bloodthirsty Moor to the traditional "quaint figures, such as one dimly remembers having met with in bygone days on nursery plates".[19] The islands appear as spaces of fantasy, illusions of the mind shaped only by remarks made from afar. Such visions and exotic names "lingered in our memories like some familiar echo".[20] Similarly, W. H. Mallock describes Cyprus in *Enchanted Island* (1889) following a series of chapters with the most suggestive names: "A Voyage to Dreamland"[21] or "A Day of Views and Visions".[22] In this last chapter, "Nicosia was exactly like a picture of Damascus – Damascus, the city old in the days of Abraham".[23] In addition, poet and critic John Addington Symonds seems to wander hand in hand with the classical poets and mythological figures that constitute an organic trait of the landscape of Syracuse:

> Even among the wavelets of the Faro we remember Homer, scanning the shore if haply somewhere yet may linger the wild fig-tree which saved Ulysses from the whirlpool of Charybdis.[24]

Many travellers and writers of this era appear to rely on classical and Hellenic representations[25] and exotic oriental *milieux*[26] when presenting their images of the Mediterranean. Their travel accounts draw on the old sources (Horace, Ovid, Homer), images by the Romantics (Byron, Keats, Shelley), and Orientalist discourses responding to an escapist and exotic fashion of the time (as in the case of travellers such as Lady Montague, Washington Irving or Sir Richard Burton, amongst others).

---

[13] Pemble, *The Mediterranean Passion*, 2.

[14] Jane Austen, *Emma* (New York: Norton, 1972), 246.

[15] Martin, J. Wiener, *English Culture and the Decline of the Industrial Spirit 1850-1980* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1980).

[16] See Fussell, *Abroad: British Literary Travelling between the Wars*; Pemble, *The Mediterranean Passion. Victorians and Edwardians in the South*; Wiener, *English Culture and the Decline of the Industrial Spirit 1850-1980*.

[17] Robert Aldrich, *The Seduction of the Mediterranean: Writing, Art, and Homosexual Fantasy* (London: Routledge, 1993), 166.

[18] Ibid., 167.

[19] Margaret D'Este, *With a Camera in Majorca* (New York & London: G.P. Putnam's and Sons: 1907), 129.

[20] Ibid., 2.

[21] William Hurrell Mallock, *The Enchanted Island* (London: Richard Bentley & Son, 1889), 25.

[22] Ibid., 84.

[23] Ibid., 86.

[24] John Addington Symonds, *Sketches and Studies in Italy and Greece* (London: John Murray, 1910), 320.

[25] See G.W. Clarke, *Rediscovering Hellenism: The Hellenic Inheritance and the English Imagination* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989).

[26] See Katica Kulavkova, "The Mediterranean Chronotopos and its *Differentia Specifica*," in *Representations of the "Other/s" in the Mediterranean World and their Impact on the Region*, ed. Nedret Kuran-Burcoglu and Susan Gilson Miller, 41-53 (Istanbul: Isis Press, 2004).

Weather, together with the aforementioned 'fantasy of time', is another constitutive and differential factor to take into account. The oriental "unfading glamour"[27] of the Mediterranean is enhanced by the importance given to the weather, taking the powerful sun as its ultimate expression. Consequently, fresh food is as freely available as in the garden of the Hesperides. Elements like the orange[28] or the olive tree[29] incarnate the qualities of everything that is southern. These products are fruit of the combination of an old "agricultural neatness and industry"[30] and a "luxuriant climate".[31] As a result, at the end of the 19th century these two factors appear to present the formula that credits the South and its landscape as "the sunny south".[32]

The power of this idea is worth developing. It creates a pattern of established southern features that validate the authority of places for British readers and future travellers. The travel narrative of Mary Stuart Boyd is one example. She refers to the Balearic Islands, "whose gracious climate rendered the wearing of clothes a superfluity"[33], as '*The Fortunate Isles*'. Winter, she states, appears "like the most perfect of perfect summer days at home".[34] The contrast between England and the Balearics is constant: "[what] [to] us was a glorious summer day. To the Majorcans it was already winter".[35] The strong connotation of "land of sunshine and smiles"[36] as a Balearic feature plays such a relevant role that if an attribute deviates from this idea it is considered automatically not Mediterranean, but northern. Such is the case of Sóller or Minorca. In Sóller, "[t]he morning had been wet […] with an insinuating moisture reminiscent of the Scottish Highlands".[37] The case of Minorca is conspicuous from the beginning.[38] The identification of British markers begins at the entry of the Port of Mahon: "the trim fortifications recalled certain of our own naval and military

---

[27] William A.M. Dodd, *Three Weeks in Majorca* (London: Chapman and Hall, 1863), 24.

[28] See Charles Toll Bidwell, *The Balearic Islands* (London: Sampson Low, Marston, Searle and Rivington, 1876), and J.W. Clayton, *The Sunny South: An Autumn in Spain and Majorca* (London: Hurst and Blacket Publishers, 1869).

[29] See John K.C. Carr, *Descriptive Travels in the Southern and Eastern Parts of Spain and the Balearic Islands, in the Year 1809* (London: Sherwood, Neely and Jones, 1811); Dodd, *Three Weeks in Majorca*; and Clayton, *The Sunny South: An Autumn in Spain and Majorca.*

[30] Carr, *Descriptive Travels in the Southern and Eastern Parts of Spain and the Balearic Islands, in the Year 1809*, 351.

[31] Clayton, *The Sunny South,* 216.

[32] Charles W. Wood, *Letters from Majorca* (London: Richard Bentley & Son, 1888), 355. J.W. Clayton appears to be the first British traveller in the Balearics to have coined the formula in the title of his travel account *The Sunny South: An Autumn in Spain and Majorca* in 1869. This paradise of "agreeable and relaxing weather" seems especially favourable since much of the travelling is undertaken during the cold season in Britain. Richard Ford, *A Handbook for Travellers in Spain.* 7th ed. Vol. II., (London: John Murray, 1890), 549). Contradictorily as it may seem at first glance, many travellers discourage future visitors from travelling in the summer season. Those thinking of doing so are warned against malaria: E. G Bartholomew, "Seven Months in the Balearic Islands" in *Illustrated Travels*, ed. H.W. Bates, (London: 1869), 266-315; Richard Ford, *A Handbook for Travellers in Spain*); cholera: Clayton, *The Sunny South*; and Charles Toll Bidwell, *The Balearic Islands*; or just unhealthy climate: Bidwell, *The Balearic Islands*.

[33] Mary Stuart Boyd, *The Fortunate Isles: Life and Travel in Majorca, Minorca and Iviza* (London: Methuen and Co., 1911), 11.

[34] Ibid., 137.

[35] Ibid., 52. The treatment of [fine] weather as a commodity for the travel industry differs considerably from the agricultural and utilitarian perspective of the Balearic inhabitant who understands it as a determining factor in his labour: "In returning his greeting the Man added a remark on the beauty of the weather, which indeed to us seemed perfect. 'No. This weather is not good. It is bad,' the old man said severely. 'It is rain that is needed. The country suffers. No, señor. This weather is bad, not good.'" Ibid., 157.

[36] Ibid., 333.

[37] Ibid., 89. In 1907, the traveller Margaret D'Este recalls the same Scottish landscape in the same region when weather does not match their expectations: "For two days the rain held off, grudgingly; but on the third we awoke to find the whole valley enveloped in a dense Scotch mist." Margaret D'Este, *With a Camera in Majorca* (New York & London: G.P. Putnam's and Sons: 1907), 92.

[38] In the eyes of many travellers, Minorca had been bastardized from its essence after nearly a hundred years of British presence on the island as a result of the Treaty of Utrecht in 1713.

stations, notably Portsmouth".[39] Accompanying the British features, the traveller mentions a "sky [...] darkly overcast".[40] She continues: "We reached our rooms to find hail tapping with ice-tipped fingers at the window panes, to see lightning flashing, and to hear the rattle of thunder". The "wind [...] increasing"[41] and a "gale [...] waxing stronger"[42] enhance an image of Mahon closer to stereotypes of England than to those of the South. In a rather similar way, J.E. Crawford Flitch in his *Mediterranean Moods* (1911) discredits Minorca for not being "southern-looking" enough. In his eyes, it seems that "it had got shuffled out of its proper place in an archipelago of the Atlantic and happened upon the Mediterranean by accident".[43] The physiognomy of the island is described as "frankly and grotesquely British".[44]

Accounts such as the above mentioned suggest that the idea of the Sunny South originates and develops from the travel writers of the 19th and early 20th century. As we have seen, this inflexible category excludes any space deviating from a distinctive set of established markers (sun, oriental or classical traits, colourful and fruitful landscapes, and picturesque sea scenes) even though it may constitute a part of the South in other aspects (historically or geographically). The idea of South as a strong discursive construct will be passed onto a literary and travelling population after World War I, ready to adopt the old images and exploit them further.

The Interwar Consolidation of the Sunny South: Everything that makes home not home

Many are the writers, poets or artists who, in the 1920s and 1930s, followed the established tropes and left their homes in England to participate in — and establish — the Sunny South. Osbert Sitwell, who established himself in Italy, expressed this generation's impatience for departure. In the poem "Adventure" we read: "As an arrow speeds through the air / Our ship parted the clinging waters. / Then, out of the ocean / Blossomed a distant land".[45] That distant land was in many cases part of the South. William Somerset Maugham, who settled in the Riviera, notes in *The Land of the Blessed Virgin* (1905): "In London now, as I write, the rain of an English April pours down; the sky is leaden and cold, the houses in front of me are almost terrible in their monotonous greyness".[46] As a contrast, he presents a quintessentially sunny scenario: "I think of Andalusia. My mind is suddenly ablaze with its sunshine, with its opulent colour, luminous and soft; I think of the cities, the white cities bathed in light".[47] In February 1929, "London was lifeless and numb"[48] recalls Evelyn Waugh in *Labels: A Mediterranean Journey* (1930). Waugh's packing of Spengler's *Decline of the West* before embarking on the cruise liner is also rather symptomatic. In a similar way, Gerald Durrell recalls the moving of his family from England to Corfu in 1935: "July [in England] had been blown out like a candle by a biting wind that ushered in leaden August sky". He recalls that "[i]t was the sort of weather calculated to try anyone's endurance".[49] However, the description of their arrival to the island in the same chapter finishes in a contrasting manner: "Spiro [the chauffeur] was pointing at a gentle curve of hillside that rose from the glittering sea … The cypress-trees undulated gently in the breeze, as if they were busily painting the sky a still brighter blue for our arrival".[50]

A vast number of British expatriates reinforce this representation of the landscape as legitimately different to the northern space. The strengthening of this idea is based on climate and on fantasised projections of classical and exotic scenery. After World War I we notice a development

---

[39] Boyd, *The Fortunate Isles*, 184.

[40] Ibid., 188.

[41] Ibid., 190.

[42] Boyd, *The Fortunate Isles*, 192.

[43] John Ernest Crawford Flitch, *Mediterranean Moods: Footnotes of Travel in the Islands of Mallorca, Menorca, Ibiza and Sardinia* (London: Grant Richards Ltd, 1911), 140.

[44] Ibid., 140.

[45] Osbert Sitwel, *Argonaut and Juggernaut* (London: Chatto & Windus, 1919), 9.

[46] William Somerset Maugham, *The Land of the Blessed Virgin: Sketches and Impressions in Andalusia* (Whitefish, MT: Kessinger Publishing, 2007), 1.

[47] Maugham, *The Land of the Blessed Virgin*, 1-2.

[48] Evelyn Waugh, *When the Going Was Good* (London: Penguin Books, 1946), 11.

[49] Gerald Durrell, *My Family and Other Animals* (London: Penguin Books, 1956), 7.

[50] Ibid., 26.

in the representation.[51] Many authors load the new landscape with values and connotations attacking the idea of England as home. In the poem "England Reclaimed", Sitwell describes rural scenery which seems to be disappearing: "Now watch these phantoms / How they tremble into being".[52] In the title and in the contents of his travel book *Winters of Content* (1932) the reader is to assume that happiness, at least in winter, is to be found in the South.

However, it is in the lines of the poignant D.H. Lawrence and Norman Douglas that a new concept of the South is consolidated[53]: an ideological space in which the rejection of home and its values is most flagrant. As a result, the southern landscape, or rather, the Mediterranean space, gains a new understanding as a *representational space* in the eyes of the British society at the time. A restless D.H. Lawrence appoints the Mediterranean islands[54] to be the new (old) space unpolluted by civilization: "Where then? ...Sardinia, which is like nowhere. Sardinia, which has no history, no date, no race, no offering. Let it be Sardinia…It lies outside the circuit of civilization".[55] The (re)created space, "overlays physical space, making symbolic use of its objects".[56] Hence, the result is a figurative world "onto which all identification and interpretation, all dissatisfaction and desire, all nostalgia and idealism seeking expression [can] be projected". [57]

Norman Douglas, representative of the British literary diaspora, made Capri his new home. His travel novel *South Wind* (1917) epitomizes in fiction all the postures and approaches of the British expatriate in the South. This novelist pays attention to the physical effects of the warm Mediterranean landscape and climate upon northern temperament in a southern island called Nepenthe. On the one hand, the novel's structural carelessness can be seen as a revolt against the machine of deterministic cause-effect, symbolized by a rejection of clock time and abandonment to the accidents of the present moment, the here and now. On the other hand, the use of devices in his descriptions of the island reminds us of those observed above by travellers stating clearly the contrast between the two latitudes. One of these devices is colour and its intensity: "There are no half-tones in this landscape. […] They are true colours. […] That is why I cannot endure England for long. The country is full of half-tones".[58] His characters present dissatisfaction in a neat direct way: "And how would England compare with the tingling realism of Nepenthe? Rather parochial, rather dun; grey-in-grey".[59]

The 'parochial' and the 'grey-in-grey' of Douglas's depiction of England can be read not only as material, but also as spiritual and physical. The new space, the South, gains certain attributes in opposition to a rejected — and somewhat oppressive — home. As a result, the new home becomes a liberating space: "How incredible, how senseless, that existence of your former self, before this blessed transmigration of your soul and body to the South".[60] In this case, the new space South

---

[51] What the Great War generated was not a renewed national and reaffirmed identity but a feeling of immense futility and chaos, anxiety, desolation, uncertainty, lack of aspiration, an 'I don't like it here' feeling and a complete sense of isolation from the previous generations. See Paul Fussell, *Abroad*; Samuel Hynes, *Auden Generation: Literature and Politics in England in the 1930s.* (London: Bodley Head, 1976); Eric Hobsbawm, *Age of Extremes: The Short Twentieth Century, 1914-1991* (London: Abacus, 1995).

[52] Osbert Sitwell, *England Reclaimed: A Book of Eclogues* (London: Duckworth, 1927), 15.

[53] The concept of the land possessing attributes lacking in the space of origin can be seen as highly influenced by the ideas exposed in the accounts of Edwardian travellers such as J.E. Crawford Flitch, W.H. Hudson or H.M. Tomlinson. Critic Philip Dodd states that "[t]he Edwardian traveller tended to search out […] uncultivated terrain, and to draw from the landscape values against which the place he had left, and to which he wrote, was to be judged." Philip Dodd, ed., *The Art of Travel: Essays on Travel Writing* (London: Frank Cass, 1982), 126. John Alcorn develops this idea in his study *The Nature Novel from Hardy to Lawrence* (London: Macmillan Press, 1977).

[54] Lawrence Durrell's book, *Reflections on a Marine Venus* was described by the author as an exercise to study the anatomy of islomania. Lawrence Durrell, *Reflections on a Marine Venus: A Companion to the Landscape of Rhodes* (London: Faber and Faber Ltd., 1953), 6.

[55] David Herbert Lawrence, *Sea and Sardinia* (London: Penguin Books, 1981), 3.

[56] Lefebvre, *The Production of Space*, 39.

[57] Henri Baudet, *Paradise on Earth: Some Thoughts on European Images of Non-European Man*, trans. Elizabeth Wentholt (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1965), 55.

[58] Norman Douglas, *South Wind* (London: Indypublish, 2002), 39.

[59] Ibid., 304.

[60] John Ernest Crawford Flitch, *A Little Journey in Spain: Notes of a Goya Pilgrimage* (Grant Richards: London, 1914), 21.

becomes an escape from the physical, mechanical and spiritual constraints of British modern life.[61] Furthermore, it represents a key to (moral, intellectual, and sexual) liberation, to individual fulfilment and to action. In words of Samuel Hynes, England signifies:

> [The] past of parents and the Old Men – destructive and repressive, and secure in its own rules. The alternative to that world is the life that Auden and his generation saw around and ahead of them – a life that was free, but emptied of values, requiring action and specifically sexual action, as the price of maturity: in short, adult life in the post-war world.[62]

Again, taking 'difference' as a defining point, the *representational space* South is understood as a constitutive element of a dual "space of power".[63] Such space is twofold in character: on the one hand, "the masculine principal, military, authoritarian, juridical and dominant" [64] which represents the rejected home, the patriarchal North. In contrast, we find the feminine South, "which, not denied, is integrated, thrust down into the 'abyss' of the earth"[65] and which connotes a space that is "penetrable, susceptible, passive, submissive, imploding, collapsing in upon itself." [66] Incorporating these gender ideologies together with the old tropes of the Sunny South and the exotic classical/oriental scenario, the representation of the Mediterranean develops in the 1920s and 1930s into a new concept of southern space. This new representation, however, still follows closely Said's notion of a place born from the relationship of power and domination between the Occident and the Orient, or, in this case, the South.[67] Furthermore, the formative process deploys similar tools to those described in psychoanalysis as *transferences*, where hidden unconscious wishes reproduce ideal fantasies or childhood scenarios in adult lives.[68] To make such transference possible, the traveller performs the practices of metonymy, metaphor and personification. From the fantasy to the fulfilment of the dream; from the heat of the sun to the heat of the flesh; from the sensual vision to the sensual land, the British expatriate legitimizes the South as a space free from the tensions of a rigid home, perpetuating the southern space as exotic and erotic. Recalling eroticism in Sardinia as opposed to England, D.H. Lawrence describes:

> The defiant, splendid split between sexes, each absolutely determined to defend his side, her side from assault. So the meeting has a certain wild, salty savour, each the deadly unknown to the other. […] Give me the old, salty way of love.[69]

Eroticism is also perceived in Flitch's account of a town in Ibiza when he states: "the place was warm with breathing human emotion, life burning at the fever-point". He concludes adding that "[certainly] the chief business of Sta. Eulalia is loving".[70]

Accepting the concept seen above where a space is positioned in relation to other according to relations of power, and broadening the gender ideology which traditionally confines a masculine role to that of the conqueror of a new (feminine) land, we perceive the rise of new textual voices and protagonists. Because of the legitimation of the new space as an open sensual zone, roles traditionally restrained from action in the space of origin (women, homosexuals, proletarians) seem to emancipate in the new scene, adopting an active role traditionally assumed to be "masculine".[71]

---

[61] See Wiener, *English Culture and the Decline of the Industrial Spirit 1850-1980.*

[62] Samuel Hynes, *Auden Generation: Literature and Politics in England in the 1930s* (London: Bodley Head, 1976), 51.

[63] Lefebvre, *The Production of Space*, 244.

[64] Ibid., 245.

[65] Ibid., 245.

[66] Kathleen M. Kirby, *Indifferent Boundaries: Spatial Concepts of Human Subjectivity* (New York: The Guildford Press, 1996), 137.

[67] Edward Said, *Orientalism* (London: Penguin Books, 2003), 3.

[68] See Dennis Porter, *Haunted Journeys: Desire and Transgression in European Travel Writing* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1991).

[69] Lawrence, *Sea and Sardinia*, 67.

[70] Flitch, *Mediterranean Moods*, 173.

[71] In some cases embracing various labels simultaneously. That is the case of some resorts in the Mediterranean that have become extremely popular in the Northern proletarian imaginary such

Critic Robert Aldrich supports this statement asserting that: "the image of a homoerotic Mediterranean […] is the major motif in the writings and art of homosexual European men from the time of the Enlightenment until the 1950s".[72] Another example of the appearance of new protagonists is found in Francis Caron. In his book *Majorca: the Diary of a Painter* (1939), Caron provides a rather colourful scene of the untroubled life of the cosmopolitan women on the island:

I know a lot of married women who are always worrying their husbands because they want to be petted and fussed over, and distracting their husbands from the serious business of making money. Of course, their husbands jump at the chance if their wives say that they want to go for a little trip alone. Women like that often decide to go to Majorca. They like the idea of a warm climate combined with the famous Spanish temperament, which they think must be highly developed within the limit of so small an island.[73]

Similarly, Waugh recalls the fantasies of widows cruising in the Mediterranean: "their eyes stray to the advertisements of shipping companies and find there just that assembly of phrases — half poetic, half aphrodisiac". According to the author, such phrases "can produce a state of mild unreality and glamour. 'Mystery, History, Leisure, Pleasure'".[74]

In a stereotypical space where the exotic and the erotic appear together, where fantasies can be fulfilled, where the "Englishman [makes] a god out of idleness",[75] the traveller and the tourist try to reify their personal paradise. The interwar period has shown us how the old tropes of the Romantics and Victorians created a pleasurable and exciting milieu for travel writers and expatriates in general. As we shall see, the end of the 20th century confirms how these labels can be turned into profitable commodities.

From the South (space of contemplation) to the Sunny South (space of action) to the 'Medland' (space of consumption)

In Aspects of the Novel (1927) E.M. Forster remarked, "If God could tell the story of the universe, the universe would become fictitious".[76] The Mediterranean has been created and recreated discursively throughout its history. However, which depiction shall better capture the essence of the islands? Do the Durrells, the Graves or the Lawrences excel in portraying the Mediterranean? Why is the Mediterranean of contemporary brochures an extension of the modern home-space and "determinedly not the Mediterranean of Henry James, E.M. Forster, Ezra Pound, or Lawrence Durrell"?[77] Simply because they are [re]constructions strictly produced within the constraints of a specific time and context, and what is more, to the exigencies of the observer who names the space. Lefebvre's argument in *The Production of Space* (1974) is that space is a social product, or a complex social construction (based on values and the social production of meanings).[78] The power of the representation affects spatial practices and perceptions of readers. Hence, the *representer* shapes the *represented* and vice versa creating a game of productive relations.[79]

We saw how in the 19th century industrialisation in Britain made it possible to perceive the Mediterranean as a technologically backward and primitive space. Furthermore, industrialisation created the concept of leisure.[80] With the improvement and democratization of transport, especially

---

as of Majorca, known in the 80s as the '*Putzfrau Insel*' (the cleaning lady island) (http://www.expatica.com), (http://www.telegraph.co.uk).

[72] Aldrich, *The Seduction of the Mediterranean*, x.

[73] Francis Caron, *Majorca: The Diary of a Painter* (London: Cassell and Co., 1939), 84.

[74] Waugh, *When the Going Was Good*, 18.

[75] Ibid., 32.

[76] E. M. Forster, *Aspects of the Novel: And Related Writings*, ed. Oliver Stallybrass (London: Arnold, 1974), 39.

[77] Mulvey, "Travel Literature: the 'Medland' Trope in the British Holiday Brochure", 99-115.

[78] See Lefebvre, *The Production of Space*.

[79] See Walter Lippmann, *Public Opinion* (New York: Harcourt, Brace and Company, 1922); Henri Daniel Pageaux, "De la imaginería cultural al imaginario," *Compendio de literatura comparada*, ed. Pierre Brunel and Yves Chevrel, 101-131 (Madrid: Siglo Veintiuno editores, 1994); Paul Ricoeur, *Du texte a l'action: Essais d'Herméneutique II* (Paris: Paris Seuil, 1986).

[80] See Jost Krippendorf, *The Holiday Makers. Understanding the Impact of Leisure and Travel* (Oxford: Heinemann, 1987).

in the second half of the 20th century, the spaces repeatedly represented as pleasurable appear affordable: "This touristic system accompanies and is tied with the world system of multinational capitalism, which has created much of the infrastructure […] on which tourism depends".[81]

The prone-to-erotic and exotic representations of the Mediterranean in the 1880s and 1890s, together with rapid programmatic schedules of mass tourism, created a tendency to focus on the practice of leisure rather than on the space — which became secondary or non-existent. [82] In words of cultural critic Christopher Mulvey: "The major elements of the genre —sun, sea, sand, sex — are being linked in a central metaphor which restates the formula that hot climate equals sexuality in a world designed to realize opportunity and promise".[83] For that matter, "[there] is no scenery, only the scene". [84] The representation of a space is not dependent on its assumed essential characteristics (traditionally those of landscape, people and customs that fill that space) but on the activity that it promotes. As a result, we have several spots devoted to certain activities and certain consumers: "Ibiza is famous for its image — loud, brash, outrageous and undeniably fun".[85] The island of Mykonos presents micro-spaces classified exclusively for one sector of the market:

> "Super Paradise" is the island's premier all gay nude beach with cruising day and night. There is another nude gay beach on Panorama Beach. Nude sunbathing is permitted on Elia Beach, which is popular with gays. [86]

Mallorca, on the other hand, is introduced as the capital of transgression and a renowned destination for stag and hen parties: "guaranteed sun, glorious sandy blue flag beaches, 24/7 bars and clubs lining the beach, go-karting, paintballing and so on." The brochure labels and instructs the future tourist: "Think about Magaluf and Palmanova and a big weekender!"[87]

The modern images of the Mediterranean as 'leisure space' have homogenized the space, now known in tourist brochure literature as the 'Medland'. One of its essential traits is not only that "no beach, or hotel, or pool has anything distinctively Greek or Spanish"[88] but also that the area spreads and absorbs new spaces traditionally understood as non-Mediterranean (i.e. The Canary Islands, Algarve etc.). Such spaces, subjected to the game of the market, use the imposed identities in two ways: firstly, the inhabitants assume the identity and those "stereotypes that [they] feel at ease with and [do] not necessarily find offensive".[89] Furthermore, in many cases, the assumed identities are deployed to make a profit (reinforcing the imposed identity). Secondly, when the specific time and context change — say the Balearics[90] at the turn of the 21st century— these

---

[81] Jonathan D. Culler, *Framing the Sign, Criticism and Its Institutions* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1988), 166.

[82] In many cases, spontaneous contact with the local *milieu* and experience is unattainable due to time, space and economic factors.

[83] Mulvey, "Travel Literature: the 'Medland' Trope in the British Holiday Brochure", 109.

[84] Ibid., 114.

[85] http://www.throb.co.uk/ibiza/

[86] http://www.mantrav.co.uk/gay-holidays-mykonos.php

[87] http://www.iknow-majorca.co.uk/

[88] Mulvey, "Travel Literature: the 'Medland' Trope in the British Holiday Brochure", 114.

[89] Ibid., 4.

[90] With the coming of the 21st century an urgent need has been felt in the Balearics - as well as in the Mediterranean rim - to promote alternative and sustainable forms of tourism. P. Bifani, "Desarrollo sostenible: concepto y práctica cinco años después de Río; implicaciones para las relaciones norte-sur en el Mediterráneo," *Papers de Medi Ambient* no. 5 (1999): 14-32; H. A. Mooney, "Lessons from Mediterranean climate regions," *Biodiversity*, ed. E. O. Wilson, 157-165. (Washington DC: National Academy Press, 1988); Cristian Ruiz Altaba and Lina Ponsell, "Tourism and Biodiversity: the Balearic experience" (paper presented at Calpe 2000: Linking the Fragments of Paradise. An International Conference on Environmental Conservation in Small Territories, John Mackintosh Hall, Gibraltar, September 28 – October 1, 2000). http://www.ukotcf.org/pdf/calpe/calpe001-015.pdf

identities can become negotiable[91] and this is where *nation branding* comes into play, generating a conscious auto-creation of identity. [92]

The recent tendency to present the Mediterranean as a new space (sustainable, natural, non-seasonal, polyvalent, and sophisticated) enjoys the support of local administrations and alternative tourist markets. Some destinations are witnessing the resurgence of old marketing formulas. [93] Despite this, many spaces in the Mediterranean still enjoy or suffer the imposed and assumed labels created and recreated during the last century. In this article I have explained the discursive elements that sustain the 'Sunny South' as a consistent and continuous textual (re)creation. We can now consider, not without a certain dose of irony, that places like Magaluf, Corfu, Capri, Mallorca, Ibiza, Santorini or Mykonos were born in the darkness of the libraries of Oxford and Cambridge. Arguably the minds of the travellers and expatriates shaped these spaces with light and passion; that the bodies of the tourists did the rest is a fact.

Bibliography

Austen, Jane. *Emma*. New York: Norton, 1972.

Alcorn, John. *The Nature Novel from Hardy to Lawrence.* London: Macmillan Press, 1977.

Aldrich, Robert. *The Seduction of the Mediterranean: Writing, Art, and Homosexual Fantasy*. London: Routledge, 1993.

Baedeker, Karl. *Baedeker's Spain and Portugal*. London: Karl Baedeker Publisher, 1913.

Barke, Michael. "'Inside' and 'Outside' Writings on Spain: Their Relationship to Spanish Tourism." In *Literature and Tourism*, edited by Hans C. Andersen, 81-103. Newcastle: University of Northumbria, 2004.

Barrell, John. "The Public Prospect and the Private View." In *Landscape, Natural Beauty and the Arts*, edited by Salim Kemal and Ivan Gaskell, 81-101. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.

Bartholomew, E. G. "Seven Months in the Balearic Islands." In *Illustrated Travels*, edited by H.W. Bates, London: 1869.

Baudet, Henri. *Paradise on Earth: Some Thoughts on European Images of Non-   European Man*, translated by Elizabeth Wentholt. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1965.

Bidwell, Charles Toll. *The Balearic Islands*. London: Sampson Low, Marston, Searle and Rivington, 1876.

Bifani, P. "Desarrollo sostenible: concepto y práctica cinco años después de Río;   implicaciones para las relaciones norte-sur en el Mediterráneo." *Papers de Medi Ambient* no.5 (1999): 14-32.

Boyd, Mary Stuart. *The Fortunate Isles: Life and Travel in Majorca, Minorca and Iviza,* London: Methuen and Co., 1911.

Clarke, G.W. *Rediscovering Hellenism: The Hellenic Inheritance and the English Imagination*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989.

Clayton, J. W. *The Sunny South: An Autumn in Spain and Majorca.* London: Hurst and Blacket Publishers, 1869.

Clifford, James. "Diasporas." *Cultural Anthropology* 9, no. 3 (1994): 302-338.

Caron, Francis. *Majorca: The Diary of a Painter.* London: Cassell and Co., 1939.

Carr, John K. C. *Descriptive Travels in the Southern and Eastern Parts of Spain and the Balearic Islands, in the Year 1809.* London: Sherwood, Neely and Jones, 1811.

---

[91] See Arne Naess, *Ecology, Community and Lifestyle* (Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press, 1989)

[92] See Manfred Pfister and Ralf Hertel, *Performing National Identity: Anglo-Italian Cultural Transactions.* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2008); Keith Dinnie, *Nation Branding: Concepts, Issues, Practice,* (Amsterdam: Elsevier, 2008).

[93] A cruise company advertises the product using the classic timeless scenario: "Time travel through the Mediterranean. Walk in the footsteps of pharaohs and prophets one day, cheer on the ghosts of gladiators the next. Whether sailing the ancient waters of the Aegean or visiting stored ports along the Black Sea, this is a journey of great adventure. Venice. Athens. Rhodes. Mykonos and Limassol. Yalta and Istanbul. And Santorini, home of the fabled lost Atlantis." (http://www.cruiseweb.com)

Chamberlin, Frederick. *The Balearics and their Peoples*. London: Dodd, Mead & Co., 1927.

Culler, Jonathan D. *Framing the Sign*: *Criticism and Its Institutions*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1988.

D'Este, Margaret. *With a Camera in Majorca.* New York & London: G.P. Putnam's and Sons: 1907.

Dinnie, Keith. *Nation Branding: Concepts, Issues, Practice.* Amsterdam: Elsevier, 2008.

Dodd, Philip, ed. *The Art of Travel: Essays on Travel Writing.* London: Frank Cass, 1982.

Dodd, William A.M. *Three Weeks in Majorca*. London: Chapman and Hall, 1863.

Douglas, Norman. *South Wind*. London: Indypublish, 2002.

Durrell, Gerald. *My Family and Other Animals*. London: Penguin Books, 1956.

Durrell, Lawrence. *Spirit of Place: Letters and Essays on Travel*. London: Faber and Faber Ltd., 1969.

 ---*Reflections on a Marine Venus: A Companion to the Landscape of Rhodes*. London: Faber and Faber Ltd., 1953.

Evans Braziel, Jana. *Diaspora: An Introduction.* Malden, MA: Blackwell, 2008.

Fabregas, Lluís. *Estampas de "El Terreno"*. Palma de Mallorca: Edicions Cort, 1974.

Flitch, John Ernest Crawford. *A Little Journey in Spain: Notes of a Goya Pilgrimage.* Grant Richards: London, 1914.

--- *Mediterranean Moods: Footnotes of Travel in the Islands of Mallorca, Menorca, Ibiza and Sardinia.* London: Grant Richards Ltd, 1911.

 Ford, Richard. *A Handbook for Travellers in Spain.* 7th ed. Vol. II., London: John Murray, 1890.

Forster, E. M. *Aspects of the Novel: and Related Writings*. Edited by Oliver Stallybrass. London: Arnold, 1974.

Fussell, Paul. *Abroad: British Literary Travelling between the Wars.* New York: Oxford University Press, 1980.

Graves, Robert. *Goodbye to All That*. London: Penguin Modern Classics, 1957.

---. *Majorca Observed*. London: Cassell, 1965.

Given, Michael. "'Father of His Landscape': Lawrence Durrell's Creation of Landscape and Character in Cyprus." *Deus Loci: The Lawrence Durrell Journal,* vol. 5 (1997) 55-65.

Hall, Stuart. "Cultural Identity and Diaspora." In *Theorizing Diaspora*, edited by Jana Evans Braziel and Anita Mannur, 233-246. Malden, MA: Blackwell, 2006.

Hobsbawm, Eric. *Age of Extremes: the Short Twentieth Century, 1914-1991*. London: Abacus, 1995.

Hynes, Samuel. *Auden Generation: Literature and Politics in England in the 1930s.* London: Bodley Head, 1976.

Kirby, Kathleen M. *Indifferent Boundaries: Spatial Concepts of Human Subjectivity*. New York: The Guildford Press, 1996.

Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, Barbara. "Spaces of Dispersal." *Cultural Anthropology* 9, no. 3 (1994): 339-344.

Krippendorf, Jost. *The Holiday Makers. Understanding the Impact of Leisure and Travel*. Oxford: Heinemann, 1987.

Kulavkova, Katica. "The Mediterranean Chronotopos and its *Differentia Specifica*." In *Representations of the "Other/s" in the Mediterranean World and their Impact on the Region*, edited by Nedret Kuran-Burcoglu and Susan Gilson Miller, 41-53. Istanbul: Isis Press, 2004.

Lavie, Smadar, and Ted Swedenburg, eds. *Displacement, Diaspora, and Geographies of Identity.* Durham NC: Duke University Press, 1996.

Lawrence, David Herbert. *Sea and Sardinia.* London: Penguin Books (1921) 1981.

Lawrence, David Herbert. *Phoenix: The Posthumous Papers of D.H. Lawrence*, edited by Edward D. MacDonald, New York: 1936.

Lefebvre, Henri. *The Production of Space*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1991.

Leith, Sam. "British take their place in the sun as Germans quit Majorca," http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/1464949/British-take-their-place-in-the-sun-as-	Germans-quit-Majorca.html(accessed January 15, 2010).

Lippmann, Walter. *Public Opinion*. New York: Harcourt, Brace and Company, 1922.

Mallock, William Hurrell. *The Enchanted Island*. London: Richard Bentley & Son, 1889.

Maugham, William Somerset. *The Land of the Blessed Virgin. Sketches and Impressions in Andalusia.* Whitefish, MT: Kessinger Publishing, 2007.

--- *The Writer's Point of View*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1951.

Mooney, H. A. "Lessons from Mediterranean climate regions." In *Biodiversity*, edited by	E.	O. Wilson, 157-165. Washington, DC: National Academy Press, 1988.

Mulvey, Christopher. "Travel Literature: the "Medland" Trope in the British Holiday Brochure," *Journal of Popular Culture* 29, no. 4 (Spring 1996): 99-115.

Naess, Arne. *Ecology, Community and Lifestyle.* Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press, 1989.

Pageaux, Henri Daniel. "De la imaginería cultural al imaginario." In *Compendio de literatura comparada*, edited by Pierre Brunel and Yves Chevrel, 101-131. Madrid : Siglo Veintiuno editores: 1994.

Parietti Coll, Antonio. "Turismo. El problema mes gran i mes urgent per Mallorca." In *La Nostra Terra* (Septembre, 1930).

Pemble, John. *The Mediterranean Passion: Victorians and Edwardians in the South.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1987.

Pfister, Manfred, and Ralf Hertel. *Performing National Identity: Anglo-Italian Cultural Transactions.* Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2008.

Porter, Dennis. *Haunted Journeys: Desire and Transgression in European Travel Writing.* New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1991.

Ricoeur, Paul. *Du texte a l'action : Essais d'Hermeneutique II.* Paris: Paris Seuil, 1986.

Ruiz Altaba, Cristian, and Lina Ponsell. "Tourism and Biodiversity: the Balearic Experience." Paper presented at Calpe 2000: Linking the Fragments of Paradise. An international conference on environmental conservation in small territories, John Mackintosh Hall, Gibraltar, September 28 – October 1, 2000. http://www.ukotcf.org/pdf/calpe/calpe001-015.pdf

Sants Oliver, Miquel dels. *Desde la terraza (paginas veraniegas).* Palma: Amengual y Muntaner, 1890.

Said, Edward. *Orientalism.* London: Penguin Books, 2003.

Simonis, Damien, Sarah Andrews, Anthony Ham, Susan Forsyth, John Noble, Miles Roddis and Daniel Sclechter. *Lonely Planet: Spain.* Footscray, Victoria: Lonely Planet Publications, 2005.

Sitwell, Osbert. *Argonaut and Juggernaut.* London: Chatto & Windus, 1919.

---. *England Reclaimed: A Book of Eclogues.* London: Duckworth, 1927.

---. *Winters of Content: More Discursions on Travel, Art, and Life.* London: Duckworth, 1932.

Strachey J. *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud.* London: The Hogarth Press and the Institute of Psychoanalysis, Hogarth, Vol. XVIII (1920-1922): 1-283. 1955.

Symonds, John Addington. *Sketches and Studies in Italy and Greece.* London: John Murray, 1910.

Todorov, Tzvetan. *Nous et les Outres : La réflexion française sur la diversité humaine* Paris : Éditions du Seuil, 1989.

"Trouble in Paradise." *Expatica.com. News and Information for the International Community.* http://www.expatica.com/de/lifestyle_leisure/lifestyle/trouble-in-paradise-9697.html?ppager=1 (accessed January 15, 2010)

Whale, John. "Romantics, Explorers and Picturesque Travellers." In *The Politics of the Picturesque. Literature, Landscape and Aesthetics since 1770*, edited by Stephen Copley and Peter Garside, 75-95. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994.

Waxman, Percy. *What Price Mallorca: With a Glance at Menorca, Ibiza, Formentera and Cabrera.* Farrar & Rinehart: New York, 1933.

Waugh, Evelyn. *When the Going Was Good.* London: Penguin Books, 1946.

Wiener, J. Martin. *English Culture and the Decline of the Industrial Spirit 1850-1980.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1980.

Wood, Charles W. *Letters from Majorca.* London: Richard Bentley & Son, 1888. "HotDeals on Mediterranean Cruises". *The cruiseweb.com* http://www.cruiseweb.com/MEDITERRANEAN.HTM (accessed January 15, 2010).

Eduardo Moyà Antón
University of Queensland
e.moyaanton@uq.edu.au

Institute *of* Advanced Study

Durham University

IBERIANISM: José Saramago's search for his own 'Golden Fleece' upon an allegorical 'Stone Raft'

GABRIELA GARCÉZ PEREIRA

Iberianism

Iberianism has been defined as the desire for Portuguese unification with Spain.[1] As long as Portugal and Spain have shared the same geographical location, the concept that both nations should be united as one has existed.[2] At 86 years of age, Portuguese author and Nobel Prize winner José Saramago has become the voice of contemporary Iberianism. Seemingly paradoxically, Saramago's universe is one of ideas, beliefs and affirmations that does not see a clash of his ideals with those of others in regards to his sense of national identity and patriotic pride. He affirms that he is firstly Portuguese, then Iberian, and afterwards, if he feels like it, European. Although the Nobel laureate says that he cannot be anything other than Portuguese and thus chooses to write only in his mother tongue, he emphasises that his sense of belonging has evolved to encompass the Iberian Peninsula.[3] In the opening paragraphs of his 1986 novel, '*A Jangada de Pedra*' or 'The Stone Raft', Saramago begins a tale which establishes many of the central discourses regarding Iberianism in the 21st century, whilst also painting an allegory of what *could be* if Portugal and Spain united as one nation. Saramago's literary works and many prophetic outbursts invariably create a noticeable uproar of striking and at times hostile reaction from the Portuguese public. However, the author himself seems to have become a symptom rather than the trigger of the Iberianist movement both within the Iberian Peninsula and worldwide. Thus, in the age of the European Union and of the rapidly evolving national identities of the Spanish and Portuguese nations, it is important to analyse the evolutionary journey within this seminal novel, together with its Iberianist allegories, via the composition of its narrative and the various paradigms involved in the construction of the text.

---

[1] M.Á. Bastenier. *Esp-ugal o Portu-paña*. El País. 4 October 2006 http://www.elpais.com/articulo/internacional/Esp-ugal/Portu-pana/elpepiint/20061004.

[2] Miguel Mora. *Iberia, capital Lisboa*. El País. http://elpais.com/articulo/internacional/Iberia/capital/Lisboa/elpepuint/20070722elpepiint_1/Tes

[3] Marcio Resendes Júnior. *José Saramago em Discurso Directo.* Diário de Notícias. 7 June 2003.http://dn.sapo.pt/especiais/interior.aspx?content_id=1007434&especial=Jos%C3%A9%20Saramago&seccao=GENTE."Em primeiro lugar sou português. Depois sou ibérico... e depois se me apetecer, serei Europeu... Não posso ser outra coisa senão português. Não posso escrever em outra língua se não a portuguesa. Mas digamos que o meu sentido de pertencer a algo se ampliou. Passou a ser a peninsula ibérica. ...Eu diria que é outra forma de respirar."

Imagology

Comparatist Marius-François Guyard highlighted in works such as his 'La littérature comparée' that literary sources were not merely a record of the representation of a nationality, but a melting pot of polarising ideas that construct a nationality.[4] Thus, Iberianism as a concept of social identity and perception has also been a construct of society and literary texts over the centuries. Within the Iberian Peninsula the national identities of its respective nations have long suffered a multi-faceted identity crisis, rooted in exaggerated stereotypes, internal upheaval, external exploration, social myths and nationalistic politics. Generally, perceptions of who we and others are have been related to one's respective nation or region of birth. Whether well founded or not, these control and define our actions and are rooted in our ancestral origins.

National characterisation and identity are therefore reliant on different types of discourse, such as factual reporting and lyrical poetry.[5] These discourses and modalities, combined with national stereotypes and disseminated by distinct types of texts, can be powerful in defining the character of a nation, as they focus on propagating long held ideas and beliefs, rather than with reporting facts.[6] In the opening lines of 'The Stone Raft':

> When Joana Carda scratched the ground with the elm branch all the dogs of Cerbère began to bark, throwing the inhabitants into panic and terror, because from time immemorial it was believed that, when these canine animals that had always been silent started barking, the entire universe was nearing its end. No one remembers any longer the origin of this deep-rooted superstition or firm conviction[...]. Were someone to ask Joana Carda what had possessed her to scratch the ground with an elm branch, more the gesture of a moonstruck adolescent than of a mature woman, if she had not thought of the consequences of an act which seemed meaningless, and those, remember, are the most dangerous acts of all, perhaps she might reply, I don't know what came over me, the branch was lying on the ground, I picked it up and drew a line. [...] Did you know it was an elm branch, I know very little about trees, they told me afterwards that wych-elm is the same as wych-hazel, botanically known as ulmus, none of them having supernatural powers, even by changing their names, but in this case, I'm sure that a matchstick would have produced the same effect, Why do you say that, What must be, must be, is very powerful and cannot be resisted, I've heard it said a thousand times by older people, Do you believe in fate, I believe in what has to be.[7]

We believe, because our parents believed and so on. But perceptions can often be based upon uneducated and narrow sources of information.

Imagology is not interested in the narrative, or what is said in the text – but why it was said and its impact. European cultures have a "long, continuous and voluminous" [textual record which] "demonstrates unambiguously that national characters are a matter of common-place and hearsay rather than empirical observation or statements of objective fact".[8] It looks at the forces, which surround the creation of the text – how authors are influenced by their previous readings and knowledge of the topic. Identity, place and perception are pivotal concepts within 'The Stone Raft'. Imagology [functions] primarily on literary representations, and furnishes continuous proof that it is in the field of imaginary and poetical literature that national stereotypes are first and foremost effectively formulated, perpetuated and disseminated.[9] When speaking of Spain and Portugal, characters José Anaiço and Pedro Orce debate with each other the meaning of one's land and identity:

---

[4] Joep Leerssen. "The Rhetoric of National Character: A programmatic survey." Porter Institute for Poetics and Semiotics. *Poetics Today*. 21: 2 (Summer 2000), 269.

[5] Joep Leerssen. "The Rhetoric of National Character: A programmatic survey." Porter Institute for Poetics and Semiotics. *Poetics Today*. 21: 2 (Summer 2000), 281.

[6] Leerssen. "The Rhetoric of National Character: A programmatic survey," 282.

[7] José Saramago, *The Stone Raft* (London: The Harvill Press, 2000), 1-2.

[8] Joep Leerssen, "Imagology: History and Method." *Studia Imagologica.* (Rodopi Publisher, 2007). 13: 26.

[9] Leerssen, "Imagology: History and Method," 26-27.

> If we carry on like this we'll find ourselves in Spain, in your native country. My native land is Andalucía, Country and land are one and the same thing, no they're not, we may not know our own country but we always know our own land, Have you ever been to Galicia, no, I've never been to Galicia, Galicia is the land of others.[10]

Their banter reinforces the importance and fine lines which define national and cultural identity not only to the Iberian mind, but also regionally and locally.

Within 'The Stone Raft' the nation trope is continuously restructured and reinforced to juxtapose Iberia with other nations; thus, historical contextualisation is also necessary. "Literary texts cannot be interpreted in timeless, aesthetic never-never-land.[11]" Perceptions of identity are rooted in texts and ongoing cultural norms and beliefs. They remain long after the historical context has passed and are re-accessed over time. Both the characters within the novel and its readers are faced with assessing their own preconceived beliefs and perspectives of self via the historical and cultural beliefs promoted in the novel. In the process of attempting to restructure their own nations, the Portuguese and Spanish governments of 'The Stone Raft', utilise past historical events and turning points as a point of reference for the separation of the Iberian Peninsula from Europe and their sudden *unification* upon a single piece of land. Other than 'The Stone Raft', poignant Iberianist themed literature includes Padre Antonio Vieira's *History of the Future* and *the Prophesies of Bandarra* together with Fernando Pessoa's *Mensagem.*[12]

Saramago reinforces this idea of perception and identity in his novel by outlining that no matter what regional identity an individual may possess; their national identity may remain the same:

> there is an obvious exaggeration in the term fellow countryman, but it is understandable at a time like this in Europe, a Portuguese from Minho and one from Alentejo feel nostalgia for the same fatherland, even though five hundred kilometres separated one from the other.[13]

Iberianism carried upon a 'Stone Raft'

'The Stone Raft's' simple opening, not only questions the importance of long held beliefs, which may or not be founded in truth, but also the ongoing importance of place and 'what has to be'- otherwise known as fate. The concept of fate impinges greatly upon how the characters perceive themselves and how they react to the sudden and simultaneous separation from Europe and unification of two neighbour nations. Saramago seemingly lyrically, sculpts Iberian unification as a natural, inevitable and foretold event. Contrary to some public opinion, with this novel and by his subsequent intermittent public declarations and prophecies, José Saramago has become a conduit rather than a catalyst for contemporary Iberianist discourse.

In 'The Stone Raft', Saramago takes us to a world which mirrors our own, where we find that the Iberian Peninsula breaks off from the European Continent and floats aimlessly into the Atlantic Ocean. The process begins with a simple crack in the Earth's crust and evolves into a physical split from the European Continent which is crafted in such a manner as to imply that the Iberian Peninsula will only separate from Europe when it "had matured and its time had come.[14]"

The results of this geographical separation also have political, social and diplomatic reverberations, which are felt throughout nations worldwide. Saramago crafts this reaction as though in a Greek tragedy; as the reactions of both Iberian governments and those across Europe are minutely counterpoised with the characters of the novel and thus for society as a whole. With "a pause, a great gust of air could be felt rushing though the air, like the first deep breathing of someone awakening"[15], and separation finally occurs. Here, in Saramago's mind, Iberianism arrives upon the shores of the Iberian Peninsula, and, embracing its people, it carries them away from Europe and its past into an unknown future. Saramago creates a tale of what could be. Within the narrative the leaders of foreign nations begin to confront the new geographical reality of the Iberian

---

[10] Saramago, *The Stone Raft*, 139.
[11] Leerssen, "Imagology: History and Method," 13: 28.
[12] Saramago, *The Stone Raft*, 236.
[13] Ibid, 245.
[14] Ibid, 22.
[15] Ibid, 32.

Peninsula. The British Prime Minister refers to it as "unquestionably an island, although by no means as solid as our own, of course.[16]"

Saramago does not linger on the purely historic nostalgia of the past, but infuses his narrative with fable, myth, fate and the interlaced dreams of iconic Iberianists such as Miguel de Unamuno and Fernando Pessoa, with what he believes to be, humanity as a whole. He uses the mundane and the magical to shape signs which herald the onset of a new Iberian world. Saramago is perhaps himself; the 'invisible axe' he refers to, as he creates upon paper that which he believes should occur in real life.

Whilst Iberian nations, their neighbours, and others from around the world are forced to confront this previously implausible situation, the narrative evolves and draws together a group of five strangers from across the far-flung corners of Portugal and Spain. The journey upon which they embark is contextualised as a fantastical voyage upon a literal and figurative 'Stone Raft'. According to the character Maria Guavaira:

> I did nothing except unpick an old sock, one of those socks people use to keep their money in, but the sock I unpicked would have given only a handful of wool, whilst the amount of wool here is what you would get from sheering a hundred sheep, not to say a thousand, and how is one to explain such a thing. For days, two thousand starlings kept following me, said José Anaiço, I threw a stone into the sea that weighed almost as much as me and it landed way in the distance, Joaquim Sassa added, aware that he was exaggerating, and Pedro Orce simply said, The earth is trembling and has trembled.[17]

Thereafter in the opening of the narrative we see Joana Carda scratching the ground with an elm branch, the earth split and the silent dogs of Cerbère began to bark.

Like all good narrative craftsmen Saramago sculpts and weaves layered impossibility and solid reality into an improbable story. By sewing it together with well known tales from other texts, anecdotes, fables and legends known to Portuguese and Iberian people alike, he reinforces and substantiates his own version of the Iberian legend. 'The Stone Raft' shouts out from the page with vignettes of Saramago's own imaginary island of Iberia. On the eve of taking to the road in search of Pedro Orce, José Anaiço tells Joaquim Sassa a short tale – as a preface to their predicament.

> Once upon a time, our King, Dom João the Second, known as The Perfect King and in my opinion the perfect wit, made a certain nobleman a gift of an imaginary island, now tell me, do you know of any other nation where such a thing could happen, And the nobleman, what did the nobleman do, he set out to look for it, now what I'd like to know is how you can find an imaginary island, That's something I can't tell you, but this other island, the Iberian one, which was a peninsula but not any longer, I find just as amusing, as if it had set out to sea in search of imaginary men.[18]

Saramago does not deny the chaotic impact of Iberian detachment from Europe, saying, "each of them gravitated to their native soil, […] even if it meant breaking up families and other relationships"[19], but rather, allows the gurgle and bubble of voices from other nations to remain as an underlying current which runs through the story, creating an 'us versus them' sensation which further serves to reinforce Iberian identity. 'The Stone Raft' is a satirical novel that presents a parable of national identity and the bonds that unite individual people and nations.

Saramago also reinforces the similarities between human beings throughout the text by showing that despite expressing surprise with different words[20], the sentiment that triggers the verbal reaction is commonly shared. Each of five travellers, "share discomfort as they share everything else"[21] says Pedro Orce. Saramago reinforces the unity between human emotion, expression and identity, and questions the importance of belonging, mutual acceptance and the meaning of what it

---

[16] Ibid, 37.
[17] Saramago, *The Stone Raft*, 146.
[18] Ibid, 48.
[19] Ibid, 23.
[20] Ibid, 74.
[21] Saramago, *The Stone Raft*, 203.

is to be not only Portuguese, Spanish and European respectively, but moreover, to be part of the collective human community.

> If one thinks about it, there is no beginning for things and persons, everything that began one day has begun before, the history of this sheet of paper,[...]in order to be true and complete would have to date back to the origins of the world,[...]we could ask whether those first origins were not simply points of transition, sliding ramps.[22]

On the way to Granada, the travellers are followed by a canopy of notably Portuguese starlings, and as they struggle with the intricacies of map reading, the topography and obscure, hidden villages, they ponder over "how vexing it is for someone to check out their birthplace on a map only to find a blank space, this has created the most serious problems in trying to establish personal and national identities.[23]" Further on, the narrative comments on the racial disparagement between different peoples, nations and cultures. "But it is true that there are differences between one world and another, everybody knows that on Mars the inhabitants are green, whilst here on earth they are every colour except green".[24]

He also shines a stark light upon long-held prejudices and beliefs in order to present his startling alternate reality upon 'The Stone Raft'. "Don't tell us the Algarve is also breaking away, it had to come sooner or later, they've always thought of themselves as being a separate kingdom.[25]" He plays upon age-old antagonisms and regional loyalties, which seem to pale in insignificance in comparison to the Iberian nation.

As suggested, Saramago delves into the ever present and potent national memories of Portugal's once glorious maritime past, whose themes of bravery, courage, confronting the unknown, exploration and conquest are given a rebirth in order to stimulate Portuguese sentiments of nationhood and sculpt them into an Iberian mould. Upon meeting José Orce in Orce, Joaquim Sassa and José Anaiço, announce, "we are Portuguese, a futile statement, one need only to hear them speak to know at once where they come from.[26]" Saramago uses a quotation by Spanish author and Iberianist Miguel de Unamuno to describe Portugal's Atlantic coast, "Fix your eyes where the lonely sun set in the immense sea, all the peoples with the sea to the west do the same, this race is swarthy, there is no other difference, and it has sailed the seas.[27]" Saramago interlaces this literary idea with his tale, by using a radio announcer: "Lyrical, ecstatic, the Spanish announcer declaims, Look at the Portuguese, all along their golden beaches, once but no longer the prow of Europe, for we have withdrawn from the European quayside to sail once more the Atlantic waves.[28]"

Saramago defends the Iberianist cause by uniting Portugal and Spain into a single nation. This two-fold fable consistently and loudly cries out against European unification, in favour of his Iberian union.[29] The pilgrims, each of them on their own journey of self-discovery, penance and enlightenment, pass through ancient and historic Portuguese towns such as that of Aracena, and the importance of cities such as Venice in relation to it is juxtaposed. Cities, which are of assumed historical importance to Portugal and Spain, are set against those that are considered of historical importance to Europe and civilisation. Saramago questions their relationship to each other. The interconnectedness of each of the character's journeys and that of humanity is reinforced by the shared experience of the geographical separation of the Peninsula.[30] According to Saramago, the chaos and confusion of people on the Peninsula after its separation from the European mainland inspires disdain in his European counterparts. He creates an 'us versus them' scenario and indirectly argues against unification with Europe.[31]

---

[22] Ibid, 35-36.
[23] Ibid, 52.
[24] Ibid, 52.
[25] Ibid, 74.
[26] Ibid, 62.
[27] Ibid, 71.
[28] Ibid, 71.
[29] Ibid, 31.
[30] Saramago, *The Stone Raft*, 57.
[31] Ibid, 80.

Cultural and historical confrontations abound throughout the narrative. Poignantly, the importance of Spain and Portugal's shared and often turbulent history, and their sporadic animosity, is summarised in the character of the Portuguese elementary school teacher; José Anaiço, who says, "[...] without forgetting that he is in a country with a different geography and history... how could he explain to children that the Battle of Aljubarrota was a victory when they are usually taught to forget that it was a resounding defeat[32]." The narrative seemingly overcomes historical and social prejudices by counter-pointing a common future and relates a story, which is humane in its mutual respect and recognition of its central characters – no matter, their Iberian background.

The characters themselves are the first to question the possibility of such a Peninsular unification occurring, but Saramago's skill is his ability to turn narrative improbability into an intangible possibility, and, moreover, into a parable. Subtly, the magical stone to which Sassa refers to above, might simply be a small word or deed on the part of a single individual to turn the tide of public opinion.

In the closing scenes of the narrative, one tempestuous seaside morning Pedro Orce takes his fellow companions to a stone ship, which he had previously come across at the beginning of his travels. In the storm, it has changed shape, is more rock than ship. Saramago conjures this semi-mystical, semi-concrete edifice based upon a Christian story, from the ether and centres it as metaphorical ballast for Iberianism. Even when faced with a religious myth, Orce says pragmatically, "things depend upon what one accepts or refutes[33]." In Saramago's world, all is possible, all is probable, the narrative is suffused with 'stone rafts', in a myriad of forms each of which bring new opportunities and options to the peoples of the Iberian Peninsula – and for Saramago, the promise of a brighter future.

At the end of the novel, both the futures of the cast and the Peninsula itself remain in darkness and unknown; at the mercy of the waves upon which the mammoth stone raft rides and the hands of the politicians that control their respective societies. A new world with a new state of being is formed. Saramago creates in this epic adventure an Iberian island nation that awakens on the global horizon to impose itself on the world stage.

The themes which can be surmised from the narrative of such a tale are diverse and interminable; from identity and perception, to the similarities and differences between human beings; from human concerns and influences, to national and cultural stereotypes, myths and allegories - as personal to each reader, as each 'event' is surreal to the characters in the novel. It is these very questions of place, identity, perception, social conformity and awareness, which Saramago seems to reinforce.

In 1986, on the eve of Portugal and Spain's respective ascension to the European Community, the man, whom writer and literary critic Harold Bloom called "the most gifted novelist alive in the world today[...]one of the last titans of an expiring literary genre"[34] by publishing this novel seemed to ask, 'why'. In the novel he argues that, "there are various degrees in which people can belong to a country which is naturally and administratively theirs, as history has shown time and time again[35]." Time becomes a repeated motif within the narrative of 'The Stone Raft'. It appears like a shadow and reinforces the concept that all occurs – *given* time, *with* time and *due to* time. Saramago uses references to other Iberianist literary greats such as author Fernando Pessoa to support his ideas. The character Pedro Orce reflects upon the name of Pessoa's great alter ego, Ricardo Reis, written in a book. "That's one of the effects of time, to blot out everything"[36] and "time is all that man needs, the rest is nothing but illusion[37]."

Although actors in literary texts are often characterised, both in their appearance and in their narrative role, according to conventions and indeed stereotypes regarding their national background[38], the characters in the novel are notable not by their strong characterisation as being

---

[32] Ibid, 202.
[33] Ibid, 161.
[34] Christopher Rollason. *On the Stone Raft: Harold Bloom in Catalonia and Portugal.* Harold Bloom, *'El futur de la imaginació'*, Barcelona: Anagrama/Empúries, May 2002. http://www.seikilos.com.ar/Bloom.pdf.
[35] Saramago, *The Stone Raft*, 81.
[36] Ibid, 86.
[37] Ibid, 78.
[38] Joep Leerssen, "The Rhetoric of National Character: A programmatic survey," 268.

from Portugal, Spain or from any other nation, but rather by their banality. Saramago's choice of stylisation of his characters is notable in that it reflects the plurality both of their appearance and natures (even language does not seem to impede their communication with each other) and reinforces the similarities[39] between the Portuguese, Spanish and humanity as a whole.

Saramago paints a caricature of the mechanisms that control social perception and human nature, and outlines the idea that humans do not see reality, but rather they are influenced by their own perceptions and preconceptions[40], such as the case of the Portuguese versus the Spanish, and the Galician's versus the Portuguese[41]. The novel warns of the dangers of emotions inherent in the creation of an 'Iberia'. It hints that patriotism can be misdirected and used ineffectively, in this instance, according to Saramago, in relation to the Spanish and Portuguese via the conversations which the travellers in the novel have with people they meet along their journey on the Peninsula. Saramago allows the reader to glimpse his comprehension of the thoughts of the Iberian people and their dreams of job, home and hearth, which "must not be allowed to hinder the future[42]."

The idea that nations possess similarities is in direct conflict with stereotypes of nations, individuals and pre-established identities. National characterisation is shaped in the interplay between auto-image - what we think of ourselves and hetero-image - what others think of us.[43] Thus, in the same way that literature can reflect "cultural, national and ethnic identity", novels such as 'The Stone Raft', can also reflect and shape "the awareness of entire societies.[44]"

Saramago subjects Pedro Orce and his fellow travellers to the concept of manifest destiny and fate, infusing some Portuguese folk tales and *fado* music - "no one escapes his fate"[45] - and makes unification, no matter the reason or 'coincidence'[46], more probable. Saramago and his characters set their united and inescapable future in the hands of fate. "What has to be, has to be, and that carries a lot of weight which you can't resist, Do you believe in fate, I believe in what must be"[47] – thereby creating an inescapable if not distant new world of Iberia.

The power of the written word is intrinsic to both the narrative and the nuanced beliefs of Saramago himself. A man and author who understands the power of the written word cannot help but choose his words carefully and with the sole target of clearly making his meaning felt.[48] Not only in words, such as 'fate, destiny and Iberianism, but also in his need to explain the power and nuance of works in the narrative itself. 'The Stone Raft' can be said to be a carefully sculpted allegory intended to persuade and convince, with language that has its own meaning – or with language which we give meaning to.

Saramago's 'The Stone Raft' becomes a vessel for unifying forces and identities and a platform upon which individuals can work together to resolve their common problems – as the premise lies in the "freedom"[49] and ability to do so. The novel plays on memory and nostalgia, stressing that "You can learn, forget and learn everything anew, when forced by necessity.[50]" In the context of this novel and of 'Iberianism' within the Iberian Peninsula, Saramago seemingly nudges at the possibility of forgetting old fears and prejudices and a new and unified beginning for Portugal and Spain.

In the novel, Saramago alludes to time and duty, both strong forces on the evolution of Iberianism within the Iberian Peninsula. Its popularity and structure has changed with the passage of time and political and social upheaval. Saramago optimistically and discretely announces that "all

---

[39] Saramago, *The Stone Raft*, 94.
[40] Ibid, 108.
[41] Ibid, 173.
[42] Ibid, 111.
[43] Leerssen, "Imagology: History and Method," 13: 27.
[44] Leerssen, "The Rhetoric of National Character: A programmatic survey," 268.
[45] Ibid, 89.
[46] Ibid, 97.
[47] Ibid, 109.
[48] Saramago, *The Stone Raft*, 188.
[49] Ibid, 196.
[50] Ibid, 172.

they need is a little time ... time is all that man needs, the rest is nothing but illusion" and further on the filial duty of a son to his parents – hinting at the patriotic duty of a citizen to the motherland.[51]

Conclusion

Just like Jason and his Argonauts, Iberianism can be seen to be José Saramago's own Golden Fleece. Both journeys are allegorically and grandiosely rooted in literature and common lore – but for Saramago it has been more so about the journey of his two favourite nations Portugal and Spain. The Iberian Peninsula possesses a millennia of intertwined history and cultures, and as the five travellers relate their histories and travel together throughout the Peninsula[52], their interconnectedness is recognisable both to themselves and to the Iberian people as a whole.

Saramago repeatedly takes up the thread of the passage of time, memory and perception. "As the centuries pass, if they continue to pass, Europe will no longer remember a time when she was great and sailed the seas.[53]" He satirises the paternalistic view of Europe towards Iberia, together with what he considers a negation of Iberian identity, by sarcastically rejecting the condescending view held by European people[54] and condemning those that deny either their own nationalist independence to opt for a continued partnership as part of the European Community Nations.[55]

Much like in the closing chapters of the narrative, theories abound as to the causes of the separation and movement of the Iberian Peninsula and its seemingly directionless voyage into the Atlantic. It transforms into a ship of journeys within a journey. "Journeys succeed each other and accumulate like generations, between the grandson you were and the grandfather you will be, what father will you have been. Therefore a journey, however futile, is necessary.[56]" Saramago draws a gridline on a map of Iberianism, a plotting outline for the future.

As 'The Stone Raft' floats off into the ocean in the direction of the Americas, Saramago's 1986 Iberianism according to himself, is prophetically coming of age and evolving to a more global level. Just as 'The Stone Raft' in the closing lines of the novel heads toward the New World of the Americas, so too does Saramago himself equally concede the significant importance of the coming together of all Luso and Hispanic speakers worldwide and of Ibero-Americanism.[57] In a world of globalisation, it has become imperative that we understand how and why we believe and perceive what we believe, even if it is only one facet of our human character. Novels such as 'The Stone Raft' become texts, which establish a train of thought and that, stimulate (as it did at the time and still does today) social reactions, political debate, critical commentary and a much-needed introspective look at both self, place, and the society in which we live.

Postscript

Within months of this article being written, the highly acclaimed and controversial José de Sousa Saramago, patriotic Portuguese, staunch communist, outspoken freedom fighter, loving humanist, author and dreamer sadly, passed away on Friday, the 18th of June, 2010 in his home on the island of Lanzarote in the Canary Islands, Spain. He was 87 years old. His many works remain as a tribute to him, his vision for society and as a reminder for us all to question and open our eyes to the world around us and to ourselves. Much like in his stories he leaves us with the question, 'What if?'

---

[51] Ibid, 78.
[52] Ibid, 217.
[53] Ibid, 125.
[54] Ibid, 127.
[55] Ibid, 129.
[56] José Saramago, *The Stone Raft*, 200.
[57] José Saramago, *O outro lado da lua* speech. I Encontro Internacional Becas Lider, 2007.

Bibliography

Bastenier, M.Á. *Esp-ugal o Portu-paña*. El País. 4 October 2006.
http://www.elpais.com/articulo/internacional/Esp-ugal/Portu-pana/elpepiint/
20061004 (accessed July 17, 2009).
Bloom, Harold. *Genius: A Mosaic of One Hundred Exemplary Creative Minds*. New York,
2003.
Leerssen, Joep. Imagology: History and Method. *Studia Imagologica.* (Rodopi Publisher*,* 2007). 13:
17-32.
Leerssen, Joep. The Rhetoric of National Character: A programmatic survey. *Poetics Today*. 21:2
(Summer 2000). Porter Institute for Poetics and Semiotics: 267-292.Mora, Miguel. *Iberia,
capital Lisboa*. El País. 22 July 2007.
http://elpais.com/articulo/internacional/Iberia/capital/Lisboa/elpepuint/20070722elpepiin
t_1/Tes (accessed September 16, 2009).
Resendes Júnior, Marcio. *José Saramago em Discurso Directo.* Diário de Notícias. 7 June
2003.http://dn.sapo.pt/especiais/interior.aspx?content_id=1007434&especial=Jos%C3%
A9%20Saramago&seccao=GENTE (accessed April 13, 2009).
Rollason, Christopher. *On the Stone Raft: Harold Bloom in Catalonia and Portugal.* HaroldBloom, *'El
futur de la imaginació'*, Barcelona: Anagrama/Empúries, May 2002.
http://www.seikilos.com.ar/Bloom.pdf (accessed February 3, 2009).
Saramago, José. *O outro lado da lua, speech sobre a identidade ibero-america*. Fundação
José Saramago. I Encontro Internacional Becas Lider, Cartagenas das Índias, Colômbia. 2007.
http://www.josesaramago.org/images/O_outro_lado_da_lua.pdf (accessed September 19,
2009).
Saramago, José. *The Stone Raft*, London: The Harvill Press, 2000.

Gabriela Garcéz Pereira
University of Queensland
pureblanc@hotmail.com

Institute *of*
Advanced
Study

Durham
University

Ethnicity, language, and finding 'the other' in Ma Yuan's Fabrication (Xugou 虚构)

WILL GATHERER

The Mainland Chinese author Ma Yuan was born in the North-Eastern province of Liaoning in 1953. Like many of his generation who grew up during China's turbulent Cultural Revolution, Ma Yuan was sent out to work amongst China's vast peasant population as part of a policy implemented in the late 1960s known as the "Down to the Countryside Movement". This policy created a significant urban to rural diaspora as a method of 're-educating' privileged urban youth by sending them to rural parts of the country and at the same time repopulating areas that had been ravaged by famine. Upon returning to his home province he began his formal education, and after graduating from Liaoning University in 1983, he moved to Lhasa.

In the semi-mythologised narrative of Ma Yuan's life, his move to Tibet is often presented as the trigger that caused him to start writing. In his six years living in Tibet, Ma Yuan wrote a sizable body of work mostly consisting of short stories, novellas, and experimental works of fiction including such pieces as *The Goddess of Lhasa River* (*Lasahe de Nüshen*), *The Allure of the Gantise Mountains* (*Gangdisi de Youhuo*), *Vagrant Spirit* (*You Shen*), and *Fabrication* (*Xugou*). Much is made of the fact that when Ma Yuan left Tibet in 1989 his writing career seemed to come to an abrupt halt. Indeed, the time frame of Ma Yuan's rapid rise to notoriety and his sudden withdrawal from writing corresponds with both his arrival to and departure from Tibet, and also the wider expansion and contraction of the thriving 1980s literary scene in China. After 1989 Ma Yuan did not publish any further works of fiction and instead turned his hand to working within television, writing dramas and even attempting to start up his own advertising agency. Today he is a professor of comparative literature at Tongji University in Shanghai and has recently published work on literary theory and history[1].

In reading Ma Yuan's works of fiction therefore we are looking back to a relatively short period of modern Chinese literature in the 1980s that has become renowned for producing a vast body of important work by authors such as Ma Jian, Han Shaogong and Nobel-prize winner Gao Xingjian to name but a few. This era of 'cultural fever' was a fertile environment for writers of poetry and fiction to come to terms with the concepts of modernity and identity in a China that was heading into an era of unprecedented cultural change and economic development. This period was in sharp contrast to the environment of the Cultural Revolution in which these authors grew up. During this time cultural

---

[1] See for example Ma Yuan. *Xugou zhi dao.* Liaoning: Chunfeng Wenyi Chubanshe, 2001 or Ma Yuan. *Yuedu Dashi.* Shanghai: Shanghai Wenyi Chubanshe, 2002.

output of any kind was curtailed and controlled, literature in particular being encouraged to exist only as a tool for social benefit.

A manifesto for the propagandist literature of the 1950s and 60s would be Mao Zedong's "Yan'an Talks on Literature and Art"[2], a series of guidelines first presented at a meeting in 1942 in which the roles of art and literature were prescribed in order to 'serve the people'. Out of the shadow of the Cultural Revolution's period of literary output that was typified by political dogma and ruthlessly structured socialist realism, the cultural fever of the 1980s saw the floodgates of literary expression opened. Some works of this time have now been grouped into a school of literature that concerned itself with the pursuit of an authentic identity or essential 'Chineseness'. 'Root-seeking literature' as it is now known was an attempt to come to terms with modernity by seeking the roots of culture and identity. Many of the authors who fell into the 'root-seeking school' would write about non-Han Chinese minority groups or in remote parts of China away from the intellectual heartland of the major eastern seaboard metropolises, often drawing upon their experiences as 'rusticated youth'.

Ma Yuan therefore, as a Han Chinese writer living in Tibet and writing work that is predominantly set in Tibet and ostensibly 'about' Tibet, falls partially within this group of writers who had travelled into culturally unfamiliar territory and were attempting to navigate China's linguistic, ethnic and cultural boundaries. The journeys of such authors would echo the endeavours of previous more conventional and politically restricted Maoist authors who followed the blueprints of the Yan'an Talks. Whilst this previous tradition however was more of a rallying cry for modernity and industrialization set against a backdrop of China's primitive and poorly educated minority groups, 'root-seeking literature' attempted (not always successfully) to provide a view of the non-Han world that was intriguing, mysticised, exotic and displaying a Daoist oneness with its environment, a far cry from the lumbering industrialized behemoth that China was beginning to produce in its major cities within the Han Chinese heartland. It was also at this time that Avant-Garde fiction was gaining momentum and this is most often the 'school' of literature that Ma Yuan is said to belong to. This movement was fiercely individualistic and experimental and refused to adhere to any social responsibility or idealism. Its main features were self-expression and experimentation in both theme and style. Through his works in this period Ma Yuan is considered China's first writer of metafiction[3], creating texts that played with the idea of their own fictionality and illuminated their own narrative structure. A discussion of Ma Yuan's work therefore is against a backdrop not only of literary exploration but also of cultural exploration, of internal diaspora to China's physical and cultural extremities.

The focus of my paper will be on one of Ma Yuan's most famous works, *Fabrication,* which charts the journey of a Han Chinese writer called Ma Yuan who surreptitiously infiltrates the Tibetan leper colony of Machu village. Essentially the protagonist infiltrates this environment purely out of curiosity in an attempt to experience life amongst an isolated group of people. During his stay in the leper colony the protagonist makes connections with three of its inhabitants: an unnamed female leper, an old man of Han Chinese decent and a 'Lopa'[4] craftsman. These three characters and the encounters the protagonist has with them represent the three key narrative arcs of the piece.

Firstly the unnamed female leper takes Ma Yuan into her home when he falls seriously ill. The protagonist after being nurtured back to health then engages in a sexual relationship with the leper woman, which is heavily tinged with a sense of the absurd and grotesque. This passage of events is both grotesque and comical, for while the protagonist becomes extremely anxious after drinking tea from a cup that she uses, worried that he may have caught leprosy, after he has sex with her he says to himself:

---

[2] For an English translation of the Yan'an Talks see McDougall, Bonnie. *Mao Zedong's "Talks at the Yan'an conference on literature and art" :a translation of the 1943 text with commentary*. Ann Arbor: Center for Chinese Studies, University of Michigan, 1980.

[3] Chinese literary theorist Zeng Jun in "Jie "xushixing"." *Gansu Journal of Social Sciences*, no. 2 (2005): p. 10. identifies the core elements of metafiction within a Chinese context as a text which openly displays 'self reflexivity' (自反性 zifanxing), 'fictionality' (虚构性 xugouxing) and 'formal instability' (形式的不稳定性 xingshi de buwendingxing).

[4] Lopas are an ethnic minority group predominantly found in India and the southern mountain regions of Tibet.

> She was already asleep, her whole body relaxed, her swelling breasts and her thighs pressed against me. I loved them. I didn't care that her nipples were rotting. I knew that all her fingers and toes were half rotted away. She was a warm, beautiful woman and that is more important than anything.[5]

This bizarre and slightly disturbing love story is made even more surreal by the fact that the woman is considerably more liberal than the protagonist in terms of attitudes to sex and even mentions that his sexual prowess was disappointing. Ma Yuan in creating this improbable and somewhat grotesque[6] love affair is leading the protagonist's sense of masculinity and desire in an uncomfortable direction, a direction that confronts the reader's willingness to associate with and trust the text's narrator.

The second character, the Lopa, is an intriguing character who spends his time carving religious icons out of stone. Whilst he moves about the community freely in his acts of religious devotion, he and the other Lopas are ostracized as the other lepers refuse to mix with them creating substrata of 'others' within a group of people already perceived as being 'others'. Not being able to speak Tibetan, the protagonist and the Lopa do not have a single dialogue, which is in sharp contrast to the dialogue heavy narrative with the other two 'characters' in the piece. Eventually though a rapport is awkwardly established with this character who offers him one of his carvings as a gift. Ma Yuan seems to identify this character as a kind of interlocutor with the religious landscape of Tibet, however their encounters are fleeting and hampered by the fact that he admits within the narrative that he knows nothing about Buddhism, which, combined with the language barrier, presents a thwarted opportunity for spiritual understanding of a landscape the narrator is earnestly trying to make sense of.

The final character, that of the old Han Chinese man is perhaps the most complex of all of Ma Yuan's encounters. Like the female leper and the Lopa we never find out the character's name. Instead we are presented with a series of blurry images of this character who, although not a leper, has somehow found himself living in this isolated community. None of the other villagers talks to this character to the point where everyone assumes that he is mute; and his only companion is an old female dog. We find out that he keeps an old army helmet from the defeated Guomindang (GMD) army under his bed and the narrator speculates that this character was a senior GMD army figure who fled to the leper colony upon the communist party's victory and rise to power in 1949. This character can be identified as the story's antagonist and Ma Yuan quickly becomes determined to uncover the truth behind why this man of murky history is living here amongst a colony of lepers. Ultimately though as we are dragged to the brink of discovering something tangible about this character he commits suicide after shooting his dog. Again we are given another disturbing vision into this world as it is revealed that this character held a grotesque relationship with his dog involving physical abuse and perverse sexual acts.

Whilst the lives of these inhabitants are complicated enough, our understanding of them is severely compromised by the structure of the narrative itself, which feels fragmented and incomplete. Indeed the experimental structure of the piece is a crucial element to the work's effectiveness. The piece starts with a self-aggrandising monologue in which the author introduces himself as the protagonist of the ensuing story, it's opening paragraph being:

> I am that Han-Chinese guy called Ma Yuan, I write fiction. I like to write in a style which is free and unrestrained. My stories more or less all are somewhat sensationalized. I tell these stories in Chinese. It's claimed that Chinese has the hardest writing system to reconcile with the language itself of any language in the world. I gain much self-satisfaction then from the

---

[5] Ma, Yuan. *Xugou*. Wuhan: Changjiang Wenyi Chubanshe, 1993. 401 (author's translation).

[6] This element of the grotesque coincides with other authors in China around the late 80s and throughout the 90s whom often used visceral depictions of sex, violence and disease in their work, see McDougall, Bonnie "Literary Decorum or Carnivalistic Grotesque: Literature in the People's Republic of China after 50 years" *The China Quarterly*, No. 159, Sep 1999 pp. 723-732.

fact that I write in Chinese. None of the great world literary figures can compete with me on this, I am unique.7

We begin the piece right from the outset therefore assuming there is no boundary between the author and the protagonist, which lends a layer of credibility to the narrative. However the second chapter seamlessly switches the narration from the point of view of the protagonist, to the story's antagonist, the unnamed old Han Chinese man. Only when a gun is drawn, and the protagonist is the one staring down its cold barrel, are we aware that the narrative has shifted, and that we have just spent the last chapter looking into this world through someone else's eyes, the eyes of a character whom we will later be compelled to find grotesque and abhorrent. Furthermore our visions of the three characters mentioned previously are at best blurry and we are often given contradictory accounts of events. As an example the old Han Chinese man seems to shape-shift from an agile tormentor with a strong command of language, to a frail, mute old man as in the following line:

> He was old and feeble to look at, but his stride was more vigorous than mine. We went on talking as we climbed. We walked and rested, walked and rested, and finally we reached the place he wanted to reach. He left me waiting a minute. Suddenly he transformed from a pathetic old hunchback into a vicious, agile killer.[8]

Likewise the reader is expected to believe that the female leper is both hideously deformed with parts of her anatomy almost completely rotted away, and at the same time sexually attractive. This overlapping of layers of text, some complimentary to each other, some contradictory, coupled with a strong sense of narrative unreliability is a key characteristic of Ma Yuan's writing style in general but is at its most stark however in Fabrication. To add a final layer of uncertainty to an already convoluted story of oblique vignettes, we find an interjection by the author before the piece ends in which he states "Dear readers, before I end this tragic story I must tell you that the following ending is completely made up"[9]

Whilst Ma Yuan the protagonist/narrator is still running around the leper colony trying to make sense of his surroundings, Ma Yuan the author/narrator now interrupts the narrative to claim that he is now tacking on a fabricated ending for fear that people would believe that he has actually contracted leprosy which in a cruel twist of irony may see him actually sent to Machu village. However in claiming that the piece's ending is fabricated he gives a further layer of verisimilitude to all that proceeds it, in that if by saying that only the ending is false, the rest of this absurd story might be true. Furthermore according to this interjection Ma Yuan, again this is Ma Yuan the author/narrator not the protagonist, is writing this from hospital having been forcibly isolated for leprosy. Not only then are we left seriously questioning the reliability of the narrator's judgment and accurate perception of his surroundings, we are also left in an uncertain position due to the text's self reflexive admission of its own fictionality.

Now that I have attempted at least to provide a synopsis of *Fabrication*, one important initial point is that the piece feels dense and oblique and one which incorporates many of characteristics of metafiction such as self reflexivity, narrative uncertainty and an awareness of the text's own fictionality. Indeed the piece feels deliberately unconventional and at times feels designed to thwart readers' expectations wherever possible. An instant challenge to the reader of this work, and of Ma Yuan in general, is that how can we derive meaning from a piece of text that seems to contradict itself? How do we understand the intentions of an author who seems to sabotage his own narrative? The answer, I believe, can be neatly summed up in an interview with Ma Yuan himself in which a translator of his work questioned the author about the meaning of his works, to which he replied:

---

[7] Ma, Yuan. *Xugou.* Wuhan: Changjiang Wenyi Chubanshe, 1993. 364 (author's translation).
[8] Ma, Yuan. *Xugou.* Wuhan: Changjiang Wenyi Chubanshe, 1993. 368 (author's translation).
[9] Ma, Yuan. *Xugou.* Wuhan: Changjiang Wenyi Chubanshe, 1993. 409 (author's translation).

> Suppose you were sitting here in my room, and the sun were behind you out that window, like it is now, shining into the room. But suppose here inside the room the sunlight were on the wall behind you, where you'd expect the shadow to be. My stories are like that[10]

This analogy of light and shadow I believe is a very interesting one and conveys a strong sense of a subversion of a logical order, of a shift in focus. Ma Yuan, in creating texts typified by narrative uncertainty and self-confessed fictionality, is challenging the conventional perceptions and readings of a text. In contrast to the recent literary conventions of the time within China that had favoured socialist realism, narrative certainty, clear plot lines and moralistic structures of praise and blame, the reader is presented with a text that is unstable, uncertain and openly plays with the idea of its own fictionality. By introducing an element of narrative uncertainty and self-reflexivity each aspect of the text can become questionable. The reader is empowered to question and interpret the text, and even embark on the same pursuit of the truth as that of the protagonist within the story itself. In essence even a conventional portrayal of the 'other' within this meta-fictional framework would be unreliable and potentially subversive, let alone a text that is provocative and layered with often highly confronting imagery.

Given this metafictional framework let us turn our attention then to a reading of *Fabrication* with particular focus on the concepts of language, identity, culture and ethnicity. The leper colony of Machu village is an isolated but ethnically mixed group of people who operate outside of the structures of normal society but who nevertheless adhere to social norms based on ethnic and linguistic divisions. In this complex environment events are mediated by a narrator who is the antithesis of the well-informed traveller chronicling his observations due to his self confessed lack of linguistic and cultural understanding. His only way of engaging with his surroundings is in Mandarin Chinese, which in this environment leaves him in a position of weakness in terms of providing an accurate account of events. As the narrator comments as he tries in vain to find a villager to talk to: "How could I succeed without knowing their language?"[11]

This, I believe, is a very important line in *Fabrication*. Whilst on the one hand it is posed as a challenge to our protagonist designed to heighten the reader's curiosity to see if he can 'succeed' in his quest, on the other hand it is a comment on the piece as a whole. It is saying that in this context standard Mandarin Chinese is able to comprehend these surroundings; does this cultural environment exist outside of the limits of the Chinese language and therefore the scope of understanding to the Chinese reader? In a country that has at stages in its near history attempted to standardise and unify language and to smooth out pockets of unique and individual cultures, the idea that carefully delineated cultural and linguistic boundaries could be fragile or inaccurate is, and still remains, highly challenging.

Indeed the theme of language is also explored in the character of the old Han Chinese man. He has become a self imposed mute for thirty years; all of a sudden Ma Yuan's presence unlocks his ability to communicate and removes his ability to suppress the identity of his past life. In this remote environment then, Ma Yuan's presence unlocks a window into a brutal period of history in China. In *Fabrication* China's turbulent history and its relationship with Tibet have remained isolated and mute. However when an inquisitive mind starts asking questions about its presence, its violence and depravity is suddenly reignited. Language therefore comes with the burden of history and identity and in this instance leads to conflict and tension not mutual understanding.

Ultimately one of the most interesting aspects of *Fabrication,* in relation to the understanding of the 'other', is that the concepts of identity, culture and ethnicity are subservient to the subjectivity of individual experience and the cultural, social and linguistic framework in which that individual operates. The quest to either understand the other, or to ostracise the other is then internalized into the struggle the protagonist has with the unknown and the text's ability to present itself as anything other than a fabrication. In Ma Yuan's world an observer of a different culture, of a group of 'others', may only come away with fragments of understanding, of distorted images, of half-truths. Ma Yuan therefore creates an environment where everything becomes questionable. His work, along with

---

[10] Batt, Herbert, and Ma Yuan. "Going beyond Reason: An Interview with Ma Yuan" *Manoa* (University of Hawaii Press) Vol. 7, no. 2 (1995). 172.

[11] Ma, Yuan. *Xugou*. Wuhan: Changjiang Wenyi Chubanshe, 1993. 380 (author's translation).

other writers of avant-garde or metafiction, injected into a Chinese context a destabilising and self-empowering desire to question the structures of literary convention and self-representation:

> ..Avant-Garde fiction deliberately denies the reader any clue to a 'correct' interpretation. Part of its charm, especially for Chinese readers, lies in the play between the titillating possibility of intentional significance and the lack of reliable guidance as to a 'real' meaning…this literature serves as a corrosive, attacking the hard crust of the dominant culture.[12]

In the context of *Fabrication* therefore, the concepts of identity, culture and the 'other' in China are being corroded. Ma Yuan populates worlds that feel fearful, dangerous and impenetrable but places them within China's physical and cultural borders, albeit at its fringes. Ma Yuan is questioning China's ability to know itself and to speak for those within its borders that may be considered others such as Tibetans, Lopas or Muslim Hui minority peoples. Although this work was written some 25 years ago, its relevance is still startlingly sharp and current. Ma Yuan's unique and at times confronting works still have an electrifying danger to them, their corrosive qualities can still be used to peel away at the fabric of our perceptions of the self and the other.

Bibliography

Batt, Herbert, and Ma Yuan. "Going beyond Reason: An Interview with Ma Yuan." *Manoa* (University of Hawai'i Press) Vol. 7, no. 2 (1995): 170-172.

Ma, Yuan. *Xugou.* Wuhan: Changjiang Wenyi Chubanshe, 1993.

Ma, Yuan. *Xugou zhi dao.* Liaoning: Chunfeng Wenyi Chubanshe, 2001.

Ma, Yuan. *Yuedu Dashi.* Shanghai: Shanghai Wenyi Chubanshe, 2002.

Zhao, Henry. "Ma Yuan the Chinese Fabricator." *World Literature Today* (University of Oklahoma) 69, no. 2 (1995): 312-316.

Zhao, Henry. *The lost boat : avant-garde fiction from China.* London: Wellsweep, 1993.

Zhao, Henry. "The rise of metafiction in China." *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London* LV, no. 1 (1992): 90-99.

Will Gatherer
University of Queensland
S4217382@student.uq.edu.au

Institute *of*
Advanced
Study

Durham
University

---

[12] Zhao, Henry. *The lost boat: avant-garde fiction from China.* London: Wellsweep, 1993.

Translation and the invention of writing: The case of Southern Min alphabet in Taiwan

HUI-CHEN LEE

When Taiwan opened for evangelism in 1865, the English Presbyterian Mission sent a Scottish medical missionary named James Maxwell (1836-1921) to preach the Word of God in the south of Taiwan.[1] In 1871, the Canadian Presbyterian Mission began to work in the north of Taiwan[2]. The two Presbyterian Missions were unified into One Presbyterian Church of Taiwan in 1912[3]. Therefore up until 1945, when Taiwan came out of the Japanese rule and returned to the Nationalist government, Taiwan could be seen as "a Presbyterian island, happily free from any sectarian rivalry".[4] It has to be pointed out that use of the Romanized script was basically promoted by the English Presbyterian Mission and took place mainly in southern Taiwan.

Min is the abbreviation for the province of Fujian on the southeast coast of China and opposite to Taiwan. Southern Min refers to the dialect spoken in Fujian. Chinese immigrants from southern Fujian began to settle in the second half of the seventeenth century after Taiwan came under Manchu rule. Nowadays, Southern Min is called Taiwanese and is used by 73% of the population in Taiwan.[5] During the nineteenth century, Taiwan was known to the West as Formosa and Southern Min as Amoy, which is the traditional English transliteration of Xiamen in Southern Min.[6]

Reasons for the invention of the Romanization scheme

There are two major reasons for the attempts of missionaries to use an alphabet to transcribe the Amoy speech. The first of these is the difficulty is learning Chinese characters and its limited use among the illiterate. As with missionaries working in other dialect-speaking areas in China, the clergymen who first evangelised in Fujian and Taiwan swiftly came to realise two things. The spoken language of people in their mission stations differed enough from northern Mandarin to be unintelligible. Also classical Chinese, an old but still functional writing system then, was of little use in conveying the written form of the living daily speech of potential converts.

Moreover, the discrepancy between forms of written Chinese was compounded by the inability of the majority of the masses to understand Chinese characters. In a letter dated 8th

---

[1] Edward Band, Working His Purpose out - The History of the English Presbyterian Mission, 1847-1947 (London: The Presbyterian Church of England, 1947), 56.

[2] Ibid., 91.

[3] Ibid., 91.

[4] Ibid., 147.

[5] Taiwan Yearbook 2007, (Taipei: the Government Information Office, 2007), p 29.

[6] Henning Klöter, Written Taiwanese (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2005), 3.

January, 1881, Rev. Thomas Barclay (1849-1935), who evangelized in Taiwan for sixty years, wrote that, "Among our present church members, I know of no woman, with perhaps one or two exceptions, who can read Chinese characters, and almost certainly, not more than 10 per cent of the male members can read it".[7] In addition, mastering the characters was a difficult job, involving years of hard work. In contrast, the Roman letters might prove to be a short cut in developing literacy among church members.

The second reason for missionaries to use a transcription alphabet involves the presence of characterless morphemes in Southern Min. Southern Min, as with some other Chinese dialects, is characterized by a linguistic phenomenon called *youyin wuzi*, 'morphemes with sound but without characters'.[8] Rev. Carstairs Douglas, who was based in Xiamen and compiled a Southern Min dictionary, discovered that, "There are a very large number of the words for which we have not been able to find the corresponding character at all, perhaps a quarter or a third of the whole".[9] His findings were confirmed by the results of subsequent linguistic research.[10]

Another feature concerning characterless morphemes is that the more colloquial the vocabulary item is, the more likely it would be to have no character representation. As evangelization targeted the illiterate masses that used mostly the spoken colloquial dialect, the difficulty in finding a corresponding character, which everybody could agree upon, would complicate the already daunting task of learning the character itself. Missionaries were consequently driven to devise a Romanization, which aimed exclusively at daily speech and was free from controversy over proper character representation. It would serve an evangelical mission best to employ a medium of expression that was comprehensible to people and a written form that was easy for them to acquire.

Construction of the Romanization scheme

To transform an ideographic language into an alphabetic one, the first task that missionaries had to tackle was the construction of a scheme. According to Pitcher and Klöter,[11] the clergymen achieved this aim by choosing seventeen of the Roman letters. In terms of consonants, eleven monographs were selected and five diagraphs (ch, kh, ph, th, ng) and one trigraph (chh) were created, thus forming a total of seventeen letters (b, ch, chh g, h, j, k, kh, l, m, n, ng, p, ph, s, t, th). There are six vowels in Southern Min and the clergymen represented them with a, e, i, u, o, o. In the case of nasalized vowels, a superscript 'n' was placed to the right-hand top of the vowel.

Another significant component of the scheme is the representation of tones. Southern Min is generally considered to have seven tones, for which missionaries employed five diacritical marks. A chart regarding the tone scheme is provided below.

---

[7] Band, Working His Purpose out - The History of the English Presbyterian Mission, 1847-1947, 112.

[8] Robert Cheng, "Taiwanese Morphemes in Search of Chinese Characters." Journal of Chinese Linguistics 6 (1978): 336.

[9] Carstairs Douglas, Chinese-English Dictionary of the Vernacular or Spoken Language of Amoy, with the Principal Variations of the Chang-chew and Chin-chew Dialects (London: Trubner & Co, 1873), viii.

[10] See Cheng, "Taiwanese Morphemes in Search of Chinese Characters", 306-314; Hsu, Chi-tun. Taiyu wenzihua de fangxiang (Taipei: Zili Wanbao Wenhua Chubanshe, 1992); Mao-ching Huang, Tai-wan ji-du zhang-lao jiao-hui tai-ping-jing ma-ya-ge ji-nian jiao-hui jiu-shi-nian-shi (Tainan, Taiwan: Thai-ping-keng Maxwell Memorial Church, 1988), 69.

[11] Pitcher, Philip. In and About Amoy: Some Historical and Other Facts Connected with One of the First Open Ports in China. (Shanghai and Foochow: The Methodist Publishing House in China, 1912), 202; Klöter, Written Taiwanese, 99.

Table 1	The tone representations in Southern Min							
Tone number	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	
Tone range	high flat	high to low	low	middle short	low rising	middle flat	high short	
Tone mark		<´> acute accent	<`> grave accent		<ˆ> circumflex	<¯> macron	<'> vertical stroke	

For the two tones without marks, namely the first and fourth tones, distinction is made by means of the stop endings: -p, -t, -k and -h. The sounds without tone marks but with the stop endings belong to the fourth category, while those with neither the tone mark nor the stop endings are the first tone.[12]

It is worthwhile to note that the scheme varied with different users in its initial stage. According to Klöter, some missionaries, in the dictionaries they compiled, occasionally put forward differing transcriptions, some of which "were short-lived and others of which gained acceptance and replaced earlier solutions".[13] The whole system was standardized towards the end of the nineteenth century.

Relatively speaking, the Romanized script was easier to acquire than the Chinese character. If one managed to become familiar with the concept of the scheme, one could read and write the script in a short time. Church members applied the Romanization to virtually every aspect of their life, ranging from noting daily things in diaries, modes of correspondence, to research purposes. Through this comprehensive application, the phonetic writing became "the lingua franca in the Christian community".[14]

The use of the Roman alphabet by the church for vernacular translation was generally known as *jiaohui luomazi* 'church Romanized script.' However in late nineteenth century and early twentieth century Taiwan, it was termed *Peh-oe-ji* (POJ) 'Vernacular Script', emphasizing its primary purpose of expressing the spoken language as opposed to the written classical Chinese.

Promotion of the Romanized script in Taiwan

Promotion of the Romanized script commenced in Taiwan in the early 1870s was mainly conducted through six methods – initial efforts by Maxwell, education, running the printing press, running newspapers, dictionary compilation, and Bible translation.

Initial efforts by Dr. Maxwell

The introduction and initiation of the Romanized script to Taiwan was made by the pioneering missionary, Dr James Maxwell, whose first evangelistic attempt failed due to enormous hostility displayed by the locals. Shortly after this setback, Maxwell made a trip to the inner hills of the Pepo natives, 'natives of the plains', in the east of Taiwanfu (today's Tainan) with William Pickering (1840–1907).[15] Pickering was an English national working for the Chinese Imperial Maritime Customs

---

[12] Cheng, "Taiwanese Morphemes in Search of Chinese Characters", 31.

[13] Klöter, Written Taiwanese, 112.

[14] Miao-chuan Chang, Kaiqi xinyan – Taiwan fucheng jiahuibao yu zhanglau jiaohui de jidutu jiayu (Tainan: Renguang Chubanshe, 2005), 182-269.

[15] Before Chinese immigration commenced in the seventeenth century, Taiwan was largely a land of indigenous inhabitants. Despite their diverse languages and cultures, they were mainly classified into two types based on the degree of acculturation to which they were subjected to --- (1) natives of the plains, who were dwelling in the plains and greatly assimilated to the Chinese way of life, and (2) natives of the mountains, who inhabited the mountains and were isolated from the outside influence.

Service at Taiwanfu as a tide-waiter. In this trip, Maxwell found the simple aborigines "more amenable to the Gospel than the conceited Chinese had proved to be".[16]

Maxwell made two significant discoveries from this trip. Firstly, he found most of the natives were proficient in Southern Min. By this time, Pepo aborigines in the south of Taiwan had already been assimilated into Southern Min-speaking culture to the point of virtually losing their native Austro-Asiatic language and speaking the language of the Chinese immigrants.[17] For Maxwell, this meant that the language he learned for working with Southern Min speakers could be of great use in Christianizing the natives. Secondly, Maxwell was inspired by their continuing use of the roman script handed down from the Dutch rule (1624-1661).[18] As the indigenous language was lacking a writing system, the Dutch missionaries had utilized the alphabet to create an orthography. Maxwell decided to take advantage of the transcription that the Pepo people had been familiar with and in the meantime happened to be promoted by the missionaries in Xiamen.

In December 1868, Maxwell managed to return to Taiwanfu to continue his missionary work, a significant portion of which was to promote the Romanized script. In the chapel of Taiwanfu, Maxwell and his wife taught the Romanization on Sunday service.[19] After a chapel was completed in April 1870 by the Pepo aborigines in Bak-sa, about twenty-seven miles to the east of Taiwanfu, Maxwell and his wife were enthusiastically engaged in teaching the Romanized script to the Pepo natives in Bak-sa. Mrs. Maxwell was recorded to have given lessons six hours a day and her native students would have taken a great deal more if she could have afforded the time.[20] The intensive instructions greatly and swiftly raised the Pepo's proficiency in the Romanization scheme. The evidence was illustrated by Dr. Matthew Dickson, who arrived in Taiwan in February 1871 to take over the medical work of Dr. Maxwell. He made a tour of Pepo constituencies and was amazed to find that "a dozen boys from ten to fourteen years of age …read the Romanized colloquial with ease, …And all this is the result of three months' teaching".[21] Maxwell's efforts to popularize the Romanized colloquial laid the foundation for the subsequent endeavours to take the phonetic writing development to another level. Starting from the 1880s, the English Presbyterian Mission employed systematic approaches to promote the use of the alphabetic writing.

Education

The most systematic way to instruct the Romanized script was the education provided in mission schools of all levels that were set up by the English Presbyterian Church, including the Sunday school (1869), the Theological College (1880), the Boys' Middle School (1885), the Girls' School (1887), and the blind school (1891).[22] Those who wished to be admitted to the mission schools were required to read and write the Romanized script to a certain level, and the standard was even higher for preachers-to-be in the Theological College.[23]

Along with Chinese, the Romanized script was taught not only as a language course in the mission schools but also as a medium of instruction to train students to think and write in their

---

[16]William Pickering, Pioneering In Formosa: Recollections of Adventures Among Mandarins, Wreckers & Head-hunting Savages. (London: Hurst and Blackett, 1898), 116. According to Pickering, the warm reception he and Maxwell received was the fond memory the Pepo natives had still retained of the Dutch in the seventeenth century. Maxwell and Pickering were considered the 'red-haired relations' of the Dutch. See Pickering, 117.

[17] Huang, Tai-wan ji-du zhang-lao jiao-hui tai-ping-jing ma-ya-ge ji-nian jiao-hui jiu-shi-nian-shi, 64.

[18] Ibid., 69.

[19] Huang, Tai-wan ji-du zhang-lao jiao-hui tai-ping-jing ma-ya-ge ji-nian jiao-hui jiu-shi-nian-shi, 109.

[20] James Maxwell, The Messenger and Missionary Record, August, 1870, 186.

[21] Matthew Dickson, The Messenger and Missionary Record, March, 1872, 66.

[22] Miao-chuan Chang, Kaiqi xinyan – Taiwan fucheng jiahuibao yu zhanglau jiaohui de jidutu jiayu, 182-269.

[23] Chao-wen Wang, "Luomazi yu wenminghua -- Taiwan wenhua xiehui shidai de baihuazi yundong" (paper presented at the International Conference on Taiwanese Romanization, National Museum of Taiwanese Literature, (Tainan, Taiwan, October 9-10, 2004).

mother tongue. Romanized textbooks were made for most subjects taught, including math, science, medicine, and the Chinese classics.[24] To transform such classics as Sishu (the Four Books) and Sanzijing (the Three Character Classic) into vernacular texts, missionaries utilized three methods - (a) phonetic transliteration, (b) exposition and (c) commentary.[25] Different pronunciations were involved in the translation. Literary pronunciation was required when literature was read aloud, while colloquial speech was used when explanation of the literary texts and ecclesiastical commentary on the Chinese texts were given.[26]

Students were tested on the Romanized script to ensure their progress and a higher standard was set for the Theological College. In the Preachers' Examination, the examinees were required to submit a preaching thesis in Romanized writing.[27] The criteria for marking the Romanized thesis, besides the test-taker's biblical knowledge, would also include their proficiency in the Romanized script as well as the correct use of tones.[28]

Running the printing press

As the promotion of literacy and the provision of literature are an integral part of the evangelization program of most Protestant missionaries, the early stage of the Presbyterian evangelization in Taiwan also involved the establishment of a printing press to encourage the use of the Romanized script and popularize the Romanized writing.[29] In 1881, a printing press was sent to Formosa as a gift from Maxwell to print Romanized literature. During his first furlough in Scotland between 1881 and 1884, Barclay spent some time at a Glasgow printing factory to learn about the press. On returning to Taiwan, Barclay set up the press.[30] The first publication made from the press was issued on 24th May, 1884. The printing press was known as the Tainan Mission Press. The printing press played a significant role in promoting the literacy of the script by publishing Romanized literature. In 1913, Rev. William Campbell (1841-1921) proudly noted "our Tainan Mission Press has turned out 700,357 pages, chiefly in the dialect or brogue of South Formosa."[31]

Running newspapers – the Taiwan Prefectural City Church News

A publication in the native language of church members is crucial for a reading church. With the operation of the mission press, the first edition of the Presbyterian newsletter called the Taiwan Church News (hereafter TCN) was released in July 1885.[32] Being the first newspaper of its kind in Taiwan and probably the oldest church newspaper in the Far East,[33] TCN was meant to popularize the Romanized script. This foremost mission was made clear by Barclay in the first edition that TCN

---

[24] For details of the Romanized textbooks, one can refer to the bibliographic data made by Iûⁿ Ún-giân (楊允言). Iûⁿ Ún-giân. Baihuazi shumu, 2002, http://203.64.42.21/iug/Ungian/Soannteng/subok/poj.htm/. So far I have found it the most comprehensive bibliography on Romanized literature published in Fujian and Taiwan. The data contain 706 entries that fall into the categories of textbooks, dictionaries, literary works, translations, religious tracts, audio books, periodicals and miscellaneous.

[25] Changan Xu, "Minnan baihuazi fanyi guji de shijian," in Minnan baihuazi, ed. Changan Xu and Leyi Li (Beijing: Yuwen Chubanshe, 1992), 37-40.

[26] Ibid.

[27] Miao-chuan, Kaiqi xinyan – Taiwan fucheng jiahuibao yu zhanglau jiaohui de jidutu jiayu, 190.

[28] Ibid.

[29] G.H.G. Hewitt. "Reflections on the Early History of the R.T.S," in International Review of Missions, 39, (1950), 88-93.

[30] Band, Working His Purpose out - The History of the English Presbyterian Mission, 1847-1947, 112.

[31] William Campbell, Sketches from Formosa (London: Marshall Brothers, 1915), 362.

[32] Band, Working His Purpose out - The History of the English Presbyterian Mission, 1847-1947, 112.

[33] Ibid., 112.

was meant to encourage "the converted, those listening to the Word, men and women, old and young, literate or illiterate to hasten to learn the vernacular script."[34]

Missionaries who created a writing system for the community they worked with often provided "a means to develop and grow through intellectual pursuits."[35] This intellectual pursuit had been achieved by taking a broader approach beyond Christianity that "knowledge and science were called in to the aid of religion."[36] TCN demonstrated this feature in its diverse contents, which Huang classifies into twelve categories.[37] The diverse contents serve as an importer of such western civilization as medicine and public health, new knowledge and literacy promotion through the phonetic writing education.[38] Besides promoting the reading proficiency in the Romanized script, TCN was also the platform for Romanized writing. The literature in TCN is exemplified in genres of fiction, poetry, drama, prose, and translations of western literature. Most of the writers were versed in the Chinese character but chose the alphabetic form to express down-to-earth Taiwanese colloquialism, which might have been difficult if not impossible to express in the character.[39]

Compiling dictionaries to standardize the spelling

Another significant approach to establishing an alphabetic orthography was to compile dictionaries. The following is a brief chart presenting the publications of the major missionary-compiled Southern Min dictionaries before the mid-twentieth century.[40]

---

[34] Thomas Barclay, Tai-oan-hu-sia^n Kau-hoe-po, June, 1885.

[35] Jean Delistle, 19-20.

[36] Walter Medhurst, China: Its State and Prospects (London: J. Snow, 1838), 249.

[37] They are (1) religion, (2) moral exhortation, (3) the current news at home and abroad, (4) geography, (5) scientific knowledge, (6) biography, (7) feature story, (8) travel story, (9) church news, (10) correspondence, (11) aborigine and (12) discussions on writing and speech. Chia-hui Huang, "Baihuaziziliaozhong de taiyu wenxue yanjiu", MA thesis, National Tainan Teachers College, Tainan, 2000.

[38] Chen, "Taiyu baihuazi shuxiezhong de wenmingguan --- yi taiwan fucheng jiaohuibao (1885-1942)

[39] Chia-hui Huang, "Baihuazi ziliaozhong de taiyu wenxue yanjiu." MA thesis, (National Tainan

Teachers College, Tainan, 2000),127.

[40] The chart draws on the dictionary section of the bibliographic data by Iû^n.

Table 2
Major missionary-compiled Southern Min dictionaries during the nineteenth and the mid-twentieth centuries

Walter Medhurst (1832) *Dictionary of the Hok-keen Dialect of the Chinese Language: According to the Reading and Colloquial Idioms*
Elihu Doty (1853) *Anglo-Chinese Manual with Romanized Colloquial in the Amoy Dialect* (1853)
Carstairs Douglas (1873) *Chinese-English Dictionary of the Vernacular or Spoken Language of Amoy, with the Principal Variations of the Chang-chew and Chin-chew Dialects*
John MacGowan (1883) *English and Chinese Dictionary of the Amoy Dialects*
George MacKay (1893) *Chinese Romanized Dictionary of the Formosan Vernacular*
John Van Nest Talmage (1894) *E-mng im e Ji-tian* [A dictionary of Amoy]
William Campbell (1913) *E-mng-im Sin Ji-tian* [*A Dictionary of the Amoy Vernacular Spoken throughout the Prefectures of Chin-chiu, Chiang-chiu and Formosa*]
Thomas Barclay (1923) Supplement to Dictionary of the Vernacular or Spoken Language of Amoy

There are a number of features associated with the above list. Firstly, the chart indicates publication of a Romanized dictionary at an interval of nearly one decade. Secondly, the dictionaries were largely updated versions of the previous ones. For instance, Doty's *Manuel* was one of the bases for Douglas' dictionary and Barclay's *Supplement* enlarged Douglas' version with new terms due to the growth of the language during the half-century since the publication of the latter.[41] Thirdly, most of the dictionaries were arranged in alphabetical order, with the exception of MacKay's, which was made according to the Chinese stroke order. Last, all of the reference books included the use of Chinese characters except for Douglas' character-free dictionary.

The dictionaries were meant to serve several purposes for church members and the promotion of Romanized script. Firstly, it helped both Chinese Christians and western missionaries to learn the Chinese character and read the Romanized Bible. Secondly, the dictionary was a significant tool with which to standardize the norms for spelling for a unified Romanized script. Thirdly, the dictionary served to unify the diverse accents of Southern Min in Romanized texts. Absence of agreement as to how a particular accent should be adopted might create confusion for readers and users. To address this issue, missionaries selected the Amoy accent over other regional

---

[41] Douglas, Chinese-English Dictionary of the Vernacular or Spoken Language
of Amoy, with the Principal Variations of the Chang-chew and Chin-chew Dialects, viii; Thomas Barclay, Supplement to Dictionary of the Vernacular or Spoken Language of Amoy (Shanghai: The Commercial Press, 1923), i.

varieties of Southern Min to be the standard transcription. Even though the prescriptive policy of making one variety dominant over others is considered to have led to a discrepancy between the actual pronunciations in different stations and those that were transcribed in the Bible,[42] the implementation of such a measure seemed to be of great necessity for unifying a phonetically based orthography.

Translating the Bible

Bible translation is the most important literature in which the Romanized script was applied. In fact, it was for this purpose that the missionaries conceived the Romanization scheme. However, the end benefited the growth of the means. The first complete Romanized Southern Min Bible was published in 1884 and this was a collaboration among the Protestant missionaries based in Xiamen and Tainan. The complete revised version was undertaken by Thomas Barclay and ran off the press in 1933. With the widespread circulation of the biblical texts made possible by the British and Foreign Bible Society, the Romanized script acquired greater validity as an orthography.

The Romanized script and the conversion in Taiwan

With the above-mentioned approaches in place, the Romanized script gained popularity and better reception. As Barclay states in a letter dated 8th January 1881, "nearly half the members (excluding those for whom age and poor eyesight make it impossible) can read [the Romanized script]; also many non-members".[43] As time went on to the nineteenth century, the influence became more obvious and the close relationship between Romanization proficiency and the spread of Christianity is clearly illustrated in the following chart.[44]

Table 3				
The size of Christian population and the Romanization literacy in 1914 Taiwan				
	Population	Population of Christians	Number of Christians literate in Romanized script	Number of Christians literate in the Chinese character
North	1,110,994	4,789	963	429
South	2,102,223	21,002	5,342	974
Total	3,213,217	25,791	6,305	1403

According to the chart, in 1914 the number of Christians in northern Taiwan was 4800, roughly making up 0.2 percent of the 1.1 million population in that area. In the south, there were approximately 21,000 Christians, accounting for one percent of the total 2.1 million population in that district. In comparison with the north, southern Taiwan had fewer Christians who could read the Chinese character but five times as many who were able to understand the Romanized script. The size of the Christian population in the south was five times as large as that in the north. The scale of conversion in proportion to the literacy in the Romanized script implies that the phonetic writing facilitated the dissemination of Christianity in early twentieth-century Taiwan.

All in all, the use of the phonetic script was brought to its peak in the latter half of the nineteenth century and the first half of the twentieth century. The Romanization, as Klöter analyzes

---

[42] For this discussion, see Iok-tek Ong, Taiwanhua jianzuo, trans. Kuo-yan Huang (Taipei: Qianwei Chubanshe, 2000), 6; Ann Heylen, "Missionary linguistics on Taiwan. Romanizing Taiwanese: Codification and standardization of dictionaries in Southern Min (1837-1923)," in Authentic Chinese Christianity: Preludes to Its Developments (Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries), ed, Wei-ying Ku and Koan De Ridder (Tainan: Kailang zazhi, 2008), 161-2.

[43] Band, Working His Purpose out - The History of the English Presbyterian Mission, 112.

[44] Lien-ming Cheng, ed., Tai-wan ji-du zhang-lao jiao-hui bai-nien-shi (Taipei: Presbyterian Church of Formosa Centenary Publication Committee, 1965), 409.

in his monograph *Taiwanese*, was used as an independent script in various church publications without appended Chinese characters and thus "had all the qualities of a full-fledged orthography".[45]

The Romanized script versus the Chinese character

Despite the fact that the missionaries' massive endeavours to popularize the Romanized script had produced good results, the success of the phonetic script was to a great degree dependent on pressures from the Chinese character. The orthographical background tended to dictate the extent to which receptors would accept a new script. There remained a big challenge to put the Romanized script on par with the Chinese character, as the former was regarded as a low language and the latter a high language.

The basic function of all phonetic schemes in relation to the Chinese character is classified into four categories: auxiliary, supplementary, alternative and superseding.[46] If these categories are drawn on to examine the attitudes of the missionaries towards the role of the Romanized vernacular in relation to the character, one will find that missionaries were divided in their opinions.

The Auxiliary Role

Rev. Walter Medhurst (1796-1857), who was stationed in Malacca and working among the Chinese from Fujian in the early nineteenth century, demonstrated his emphasis on the literary sound rather than the colloquial pronunciation in the dictionary he compiled. Of the total 10,500 entries, only about a tenth of them (1,500) are colloquial forms and, furthermore, almost all example phrases are quoted from Classical Chinese sources.[47] Medhurst was affected by the predominant views of Chinese scholars on the lofty status of literary language and the negligible importance of the colloquial form. This attitude is well illustrated at the conclusion of the preface. In the words of Medhurst, his expectations for this dictionary were that "May the present feeble undertaking be rendered eminently serviceable in the promotion of Chinese literature".[48] This dictionary is far from a colloquial dictionary but is regarded as one "recognizing the importance of the written character in Chinese society".[49]

The Superseding Role

The preference of Medhurst towards the literary readings, which are highly associated with the Chinese character, was not shared by subsequent Protestant missionaries working in Xiamen. They identified themselves more with the uniqueness of Southern Min from the Chinese character. Among them, Carstairs Douglas claimed that such terms as "dialect" or "colloquial" could not convey the distinctive character of Southern Min.[50] In the preface to his dictionary, Douglas offered a number of reasons which prompted him to produce a dictionary free from use of any Chinese character. Besides the difficulties in finding corresponding characters and in printing the Chinese character back in Glasgow, where the dictionary was printed, an important motivator was Douglas' assertion that Amoy was "an independent language, which is able to stand alone without the help of the written character".[51]

---

[45] Klöter, Written Taiwanese, 94.

[46] Ping Chen, Modern Chinese: History and Sociolinguistics (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999), p 167-168.

[47] Klöter, Written Taiwanese, 120.

[48] Medhurst, xi.

[49] Ann Heylen, "The Historical Meaning of Taiwan Romanisation," in Taiwan luomazi quingnian xuezhe xueshu yantaohui luwenji, ed Khin-huann Li (Tainan: Kailang zazhi, 2008), 12-24.

[50] Douglas, Chinese-English Dictionary of the Vernacular or Spoken Language of Amoy, with the Principal Variations of the Chang-chew and Chin-chew Dialects, viii.

[51] Ibid.

The Alternative Role

The radical view of Douglas towards the complete independence of Southern Min from the Chinese character met with different extents of resonance among his fellow colleagues in Taiwan. Barclay, who Band credited with developing the publication of Christian literature in the Romanized script to a remarkable degree,[52] is the most acknowledged figure in promotion of the Romanized script in Taiwan. Greatly resembling Douglas, Barclay showed immense zeal in the alphabetic writing as the following statement reveals:

> Soon after arrival in Formosa I became firmly convinced of three things, and more than fifty years experience has strengthened my conviction. The first was that if you are to have a healthy, living Church it is necessary that all the members, men and women, read the Scriptures for themselves; second, that this end can never be attained by the use of the Chinese character; third, that it can be attained by the use of the alphabetic script, the Romanized Vernacular. I also thought that to describe this Romanized Vernacular as a system suited to women and children and uneducated persons, while scholars like myself used the character, was to condemn it as a failure from the outset. Accordingly I resolved to do what I could by way of personal example by using it instead of the Chinese character. During all my term of service only on one occasion used the character Bible in the pulpit, and that once I regret. I knew of course that this was done at the risk of losing one's reputation as a scholar, but that was a small matter compared with the hoped-for result.[53]

In spite of his adherence to the Romanized script, Barclay was not so radical as to call for its complete break with the Chinese character. He did not reject the Chinese script but suggested prioritizing the two scripts in the order of learning. On the first edition of the *Taiwan Prefectural City Church News*, Barclay states:

> Never think that one understands Confucius words and therefore sees no need to learn this type of word [vernacular script]. Neither should one take it lightly and see it as a read for children. The two scripts have their own uses. Nonetheless, as it [vernacular script] is easier to learn and understand, people should learn it first. If you go on to learn the Confucius word, it will be good.[54]

For Barclay, the Romanized system was another powerful alternative to the Chinese writing system in developing literacy. He recognized the significance of the Chinese character in Taiwan's culture, and this recognition was illustrated in his subsequent efforts to equip Douglas' character-free dictionary with Chinese characters. Nevertheless, in the same way Barclay wished equal importance to be accorded to the alphabetic writing, which was relatively easier to master than the character for the illiterate. He substantiated the advantage of the alphabetic system over the logographic system in developing literacy by citing a young man named Saw Sa, who was hired as the printer of the mission press and had managed to read Romanized in three days and three nights.[55] From an evangelistic perspective, Barclay reckoned that the alphabetic script facilitated the literacy of church members and thus benefited far better in producing a Bible-reading Church.

William Campbell, Barclay's colleague in Tainan and also a key figure in establishing the *Taiwan Church News*, was even more unwilling to go with Douglas' view. Unlike Barclay, who acknowledged the use of the Romanized script in learning the character but demonstrated little interest in making it happen, Campbell was keener to strengthen the correlation of the two writing systems. In the preface to the dictionary he compiled, he presented his aim for the reference book and his opinions on the attempts to substitute the Romanized script for the Chinese character as follows.

---

[52] Band, Working His Purpose out - The History of the English Presbyterian Mission 112.
[53] Edward Band, (1936), Barclay of Formosa (Tokyo: Christian Literature Society, 1936), 67.
[54] Barclay, Tai-oan-hu-sia^n Kau-hoe-po, June, 1885.
[55] Band, Barclay of Formosa, 69.

> Following the trend of recent events in China, it will thus be seen that no sympathy is shown here for the action of those missionary brethren who push forward Roman letters with the avowed intention of thrusting Chinese methods of writing and printing into the scrap-heap. No: seeing that native periodicals are now increased by the hundred, so the humble contribution here with submitted also comes forward, not as a Supplanter, but as a cheap convenient little Handbook for helping those who use it to a fuller and more accurate knowledge of the written language of China.[56]

Campbell frowned on the intention to wipe out the character as he discovered use of the character had never subsided despite promotion of the Romanized script and probably never would. He resembled Medhurst in intending his dictionary to serve as an aid in acquiring the Chinese character.

Conclusion

The Romanized script came into being both as a response of missionaries to the low literacy of the people in the Chinese character and as the result of the belief that using a language to which potential converts were more receptive assisted in facilitating a more powerful impact on them. To popularize this script, the missionaries were enthusiastically engaged in the versatile capacity of teachers, translators, lexicographers, writers, editors, and printers. The choice of the Romanized script over the Chinese character resulted in the texts based on the western alphabet but designed for a readership of the logographic script background.

The challenge from the Chinese character was addressed differently among the missionaries. The role that the Romanized script was expected to play ranged from Medhurst's auxiliary one of facilitating the learning and use of characters, to Douglas' superseding one of forcing the character into disuse in representing Southern Min. Most missionaries, however, were in the middle of the two extremes, wishing the Romanized script to be an independent writing system that could meanwhile serve as an alternative to the Chinese character.

Bibliography

Band, Edward. *Barclay of Formosa*. Tokyo: Christian Literature Society, 1936.

Band, Edward. *Working His Purpose out- The History of the English Presbyterian Mission, 1847-1947*. London: The Presbyterian Church of England, 1947.

Barclay, Thomas. *Supplement to Dictionary of the Vernacular or Spoken Language of Amoy*. Shanghai: The Commercial Press, 1923.

Campbell, William. *A Dictionary of the Amoy Vernacular Spoken throughout the Prefectures of Chin-chiu, Chiang-chiu and Formosa*. Tainan, Taiwan: Tainan Mission Press, 1913.

Campbell, William. *Sketches from Formosa*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1915.

Chang, Miao-chuan. *Kaiqi xinyan – Taiwan fucheng jiahuibao yu zhanglau jiaohui de jidutu jiayu*. Tainan: Renguang Chubanshe, 2005.

Chen, Mu-chen. "*Taiyu baihuazi shuxiezhong de wenmingguan --- yi taiwan fucheng jiaohuibao (1885-1942) wei zhongxin*." MA thesis, Cheng Kung University, Tainan, 2006.

Cheng, Lien-ming, ed. *Tai-wan ji-du zhang-lao jiao-hui bai-nien-shi*. Taipei: Presbyterian Church of Formosa Centenary Publication Committee, 1965.

Cheng, Robert. "Taiwanese Morphemes in Search of Chinese Characters." *Journal of Chinese Linguistics* 6 (1978): 306-314.

Cheng, Robert. *Cong guoyu kan taiyu de fayin*. Taipei: Xuesheng Chubanshe, 1987.

---

[56] William Campbell, A Dictionary of the Amoy Vernacular Spoken throughout the Prefectures of Chin-chiu, Chiang-chiu and Formosa (Tainan: Tainan Mission Press, 1913), iii.

Delistle, Jean. "Translators and the Invention of Alphabets." In *Translators throughout History*, Edited by Jean Delistle and Judith Woodsworth, 7-24. Amsterdam & Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 1995.

Douglas, Carstairs. *Chinese-English Dictionary of the Vernacular or Spoken Language of Amoy, with the Principal Variations of the Chang-chew and Chin-chew Dialects*. London: Trubner & Co, 1873.

Hewitt, G. H. G. "Reflections on the Early History of the R.T.S," *International Review of Missions, 39*, (1950): 88-93.

Heylen, Ann. "Missionary linguistics on Taiwan. Romanizing Taiwanese: Codification and standardization of dictionaries in Southern Min (1837-1923)." In *Authentic Chinese Christianity: Preludes to Its Developments (Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries)*, edited by Wei-ying Ku and Koan De Ridder, 135-174. Tainan: Kailang zazhi, 2008.

Heylen, Ann. "The Historical Meaning of Taiwan Romanisation." In *Taiwan luomazi quingnian xuezhe xueshu yantaohui luwenji*, edited by Khin-huann Li, 12-24. Tainan, Taiwan: Kailang zazhi, 2008.

Hsu, Chi-tun. *Taiyu wenzihua de fangxiang*. Taipei: Zili Wanbao Wenhua Chubanshe, 1992.

Huang, Chia-hui. "Baihuazi ziliaozhong de taiyu wenxue yanjiu." MA thesis, National Tainan Teachers College, Tainan, 2000.

Huang, Mao-ching. *Tai-wan ji-du zhang-lao jiao-hui tai-ping-jing ma-ya-ge ji-nian jiao-hui jiu-shi-nian-shi*. Tainan, Taiwan: Thai-ping-keng Maxwell Memorial Church, 1988.

Huang, Shuanfan. *Yuyan, shehui yu zuqun yishi*. Taipei: Wenhe Chubanshe, 1993. Iûⁿ Ún-giân. *Baihuazi shumu*, 2002, http://203.64.42.21/iug/Ungian/Soannteng/subok/poj.htm/.

Johnson, Jas. *China and Formosa: The Story of the Mission of the Presbyterian Church of England* New York: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1898.

Klöter, Henning. *Written Taiwanese*. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2005.

Maxwell, James. *The Messenger and Missionary Record,* London: James Nisbet and Co. August, 1870.

Medhurst, Walter. *Dictionary of the Hok-keen Dialect of the Chinese Language, According to the Reading and Colloquial Idioms*. Batavia, 1832.

Medhurst,Walter. *China: Its State and Prospects*. London: J. Snow, 1838.

Ong, Iok-tek. *Taiwanhua jianzuo*. Translated by Kuo-yan Huang. Taipei: Qianwei Chubanshe, 2000.

Pickering, William. *Pioneering In Formosa: Recollections of Adventures Among Mandarins, Wreckers & Head-hunting Savages*. London: Hurst and Blackett, 1898.

Pitcher, Philip. *In and About Amoy: Some Historical and Other Facts Connected with One of the First Open Ports in China*. Shanghai and Foochow: The Methodist Publishing House in China, 1912.

Taiwan Yearbook 2007, (Taipei: the Government Information Office, 2007), p 29

Wang, Chao-wen. *Luomazi yu wenminghua -- Taiwan wenhua xiehui shidai de baihuazi yundong.* Paper presented at the International Conference on Taiwanese Romanization, National Museum of Taiwanese Literature, Tainan, Taiwan, (October 2004): 9-10.

Xu, Changan. "Minnan baihuazi fanyi guji de shijian." In *Minnan baihuazi*, edited by Changan Xu and Leyi Li, 37-40. Beijing: Yuwen Chubanshe, 1992.

Hui-chen Lee
Leehuidin@yahoo.com.tw

Institute *of* Advanced Study

Durham University

Writing Is Thinking, And Learning To Think Need Not Be Boring: Creative Writing In EFL

DAVID BRADEN

English as a Foreign Language (EFL) writing students referenced by this paper have studied English for at least six years prior to attending my classes and are in their second or third year of university in Taiwan. As this paper examines creativity and logic among these students, it is necessary to acknowledge the difference between Western and Chinese logical systems. Nisbett points out that Aristotle's syllogism would have been antithetical to Chinese thinkers, for whom the interconnectedness of all things was paramount.[1]

Western, Aristotelian, logical analysis decontextualizes and disconnects discreet bits of meaning from the surrounding field in an incessant search for contradictions. This principal of non-contradiction is a foundation of Western propositional logic. Syllogisms, an example of Western and Aristotelian logic, are still much in use. Along with their derivative enthymemes, syllogisms were a part of every Western college writing class I took or taught. A syllogism, however, can be true or false. Syllogisms decontextualize meaning.

This may be both useful and rational, but it is not reasonable, in the comfortable, everyday sense of the word. In Chinese thought, past and present, the purpose of thinking is to be reasonable, not rational. The Chinese/East Asian logical tradition is dialectic, seeking (unlike Hegelian dialectics) to embrace, transcend, and integrate contradictions. In this tradition "there is no necessary incompatibility between the belief that A is the case and the belief that not-A is the case."[2] One must not suppose, however, that a Western approach to logic is altogether absent from the Chinese epistemological tradition.

> Chinese coordinative thinking was not primitive thinking in the sense that it was an alogical or pre-logical chaos in which anything could be a cause of anything else, and where men's ideas were guided by pure fancies of one or another medicine-man. It was a picture of an extremely and precisely ordered universe, in which things fitted, so exactly that one could not insert a hair between them[3]

Needham points out further that, "by a prodigious effort of philosophical insight and imagination," the Neo-Confucians were able to align human ethics within a pattern of nature without the intercession of a personal moral god to run the show.[4] Chinese thinkers of the Sung, Neo-Confucian period were able to attain, "primarily by insight, a position analogous to Whitehead,

---

[1] Richard E. Nisbett, The Geography of Thought: How Asians and Westerners Think Differently – and Why (New York: Free Press, 2004), 27.

[2] Ibid.

[3] Joseph Needham, *Science and Civilization in China* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), 2: 286

[4] Ibid., 453.

without having passed through the stages corresponding to Newton and Galileo."[5] Needham concludes that the Chinese worldview and logical systems that derive from, and underlie it, amount to a philosophy of organism, a system of thought which modern science has since embraced.[6]

For the purpose of this paper, it is only necessary to note that while native Chinese speakers may have inherited a logical system that differs from that of the West, they may profitably benefit from instruction in syllogisms and the Western logical system that the English language embraces.

> Asians are surely right in their belief that the world is a complicated place and it may be right to approach everyday life with this stance. In science, though, you get closer to the truth more quickly by riding roughshod over complexity than by welcoming onboard every conceivably relevant factor.[7]

Innovation and Creativity in East Asia

A common perception of education in Taiwan is that students lack creativity. Over the past 16 years, I have read many articles and editorials in local newspapers warning of the need for innovation and creativity (terms used synonymously, in my experience, by academics at local universities) as an economic necessity. Innovation and creativity have also become an educational theme in other Asian countries. This perceived need for change is not a result of Western critical analysis and is not limited to Taiwan. It has been identified as an Asian problem since the 1990's during the Asian Values debate. Prime Minister Goh Chok Tong injected an emphasis on thinking and creativity in Singapore after this.[8]

I do not think the Taiwanese lack creativity in any way. My students are as creative as students anywhere. What they lack is logical thinking skills. This is not due to a lack of creativity, but to an educational deficiency in the apprehension and training of logical thinking processes. A clarification, if not separation, between what is popularly called creativity or imagination, and logic is necessary if progress towards true innovation, which requires the application of logical thinking skills to creativity, is to be made possible.

Creativity is a natural inheritance of humanity. It may be encouraged or discouraged in one culture or another. It is never absent, but is popularly conceived of as an alchemical process, which one either has or doesn't have. This has long been the case. Fowler, in his delightful *Dictionary of Modern English Usage*, first published in 1926, notes its popularity and calls "creativity" a "luscious, round, meaningless word."[9]

Logic is equally inherent but its use must be taught. Such training, often referred to as "critical thinking," holds an honored and assumed presence in Western educational systems. It is constantly encouraged and reinforced.[10] My sixteen years of teaching experience in Taiwanese universities and high schools has convinced me that this is not the case in Taiwan. A separation of creativity from logic and a continuation of training in logical thought processes can be addressed to good effect in a college level EFL writing class.

Research Methodology

This study is based on action research. In social sciences, researchers who hold specific perspectives try to "create social change" and at the same time "contribute to the advancement of knowledge" by applying action research.[11] In action research, the researchers themselves incorporate their own experience and professional expertise into the research design. They are part of the observed phenomenon.

The primary purpose of any language is communication. There is, however, a substantive difference between spoken and written communication. In spoken communication the speaker may

---

[5] Ibid., 543.

[6] Ibid., 582.

[7] Nisbett, *The Geography of Thought*, 209.

[8] Ong Ai Choo, *Infusing Thinking Into Curriculum Content* (Singapore: National Institute of Education, Nanyang Technological University, 2000).

[9] H. W. Fowler, *A dictionary of Modern English Usage*, ed. Ernest Gowers (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1965), 114.

[10] John E. McPeck, *Teaching Critical Thinking* (London: Routledge, 1990), 16.

[11] W. Lawrence Neuman, *Social Research Method* (New York: Pearson Education, 2006), 28.

instantly judge the efficacy of his communication on the listener or audience and, through gesture, re-phrasal, or physical representation, make himself understood. In written communication, this is not the case. The writer has only the words on a page to convey the sense of his communication. He must consider the purpose of his communication, the needs of his recipient/audience, and the organization and clarity of his message.

People think very quickly, thus while these same elements of the thought process are certainly present in spoken communication, we are not often aware of them. In spoken communication, we are still people; we are still thinking, but we remain largely oblivious to the detailed process of our thoughts.[12]

Writing is Thinking

Effective writing, then, requires an investigation of the writer's thought process and practice at getting that process on paper in a rational, organized, and communicable form. This process is independent of language. Whatever language is used, the difficulty remains the same. The invisible and silent reader must always be central in the writer's mind and the writer must organize and present his thoughts according to that reader's needs and the purpose of the writer's communication. The job of a writing instructor, simply put, is to help people get their thoughts on paper in an organized and readable form.

Our minds are given to large leaps and easy generalizations. "I went to the store and bought eggs" (But I didn't get the brown kind I wanted, and the clerk undercharged me by mistake, and I saw a boy fall off his bicycle on the way home.) "It was a beautiful day. The sun was shining and the sky was blue" (I thought it was a beautiful day because I was happy for reasons I'm not telling, and the sky is almost never really blue, but who cares?) If the foregoing were a written description, the indicated parenthetical lack of clarification would be crucial, and a writing instructor would have to work hard to get his students to understand the necessity of including the omitted information.

If there is no necessity for our written communication, there is no point in writing anything. The basis for successful communication in writing is the writer's attention to the details of his own thought process, his purpose for writing, and his constant awareness of the reader, his audience. Argument, expository prose, evaluation, comparison, and, narrative: all are based on this simple foundation of Writer, Purpose and Audience.

These three precepts together require a sense of responsibility on the part of the writer. The writing instructor must impart this sense of responsibility. If students have no purpose, or are given a purpose about which they care nothing at all, they are unlikely to acquire a sense of responsibility about their work.

The responsibility of the writer to communicate his purpose clearly to his audience has real consequences, not only in the practical conveyance of his communication, but also in his perceived stature within his community, or among his peers, classmates, and colleagues.

The Western Educational Model in EFL

The study of English Writing at the college level generally falls into two separate but related areas. The first may be defined as Basic Writing skills, the second as Basic Organizational skills. The Basic Writing skills are as follows: General prose (taught universally from Junior High through High School -- includes expository writing and simple, chain of events narration), Description (includes more complex narration), Evaluation (includes comparison), and Argument.

Writing at the college level usually begins with Description and moves progressively forwards towards Argument. This is, I must stress, a Western system. It is a linear progression, a separation of skills that is by nature, inimical to my Taiwanese students as it separates parts from the whole. As a pedagogical style, it is field independent, and my Taiwanese students, like most East Asians, are field dependent.[13]

The Basic Organizational skills are: Grammar (includes sentence structure), Paragraph division, and Format (margins, font, footnotes, etc).[14] Basic English Writing skills are, essentially,

---

[12] Stephen W. Littlejohn and Karen A. Foss, *Theories of Human Communication* (Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Publishing, 2007), 27.

[13] Nisbett, *The Geography of Thought*, 96.

[14] Joseph M. Moxley, ed., *Creative Writing in America: Theory and Pedagogy* (Urbana, IL: National Council of Teachers of English, 1989).

exercises in thinking and may be taught in any language and applied to any other, provided that EFL instructors are aware that their students' native language may, in some cases, embrace a very different underlying logical and syntactical structure. A writing teacher must begin with where his students are, not with where they should be, or where a given educational system assumes or expects them to be. This is certainly the case in Taiwan. A writing instructor teaching English in Taiwan must exercise patience. His students may have an adequate grasp of vocabulary and grammar, as indicated by standardized tests, and yet be unable to put together a logically coherent sentence, let alone a paragraph or essay, in English.

Once their own Chinese/East Asian logical framework has been acknowledged and accepted, however, a writing instructor can explain and guide his students forward into the more linear, Aristotelian, structure that the English language and its native speakers assume as easily as the ability to breathe. Unfortunately, every Western EFL teacher I have met in Taiwan also assumes that the Western logical system is the only logical system, a belief that may cause a good deal of frustration in a Taiwanese classroom.

Basic writing skills may thus be understood and practiced by EFL students whose Basic Organizational skills in the target language are limited. Where Basic Organizational skills are severely limited or non-existent, the progress of instruction in Basic Writing skills from Description to Argument becomes impossible. It is therefore necessary in EFL classes to teach both areas conjointly.

EFL and Creative Writing: A Teacher's Experience

A separation of logic and creativity is necessary. To create is to form out of nothing, a process that assumes a degree of imagination. My students habitually refer to imagination when discussing processes that I would call simple logic, inductive or deductive reasoning. This response has been a constant over 16 years of teaching EFL in Taiwan.

When I taught English Literature, I was driven to distraction by my students' inability to infer or interpret meaning in a text. If my questions could not be answered by reference to specific passages in the text, the students could not answer them. When asked why the question was incomprehensible, students would mention either imagination or creativity. It became clear that my students had confounded attention to detail and logical thought processes with creativity. I achieved progress when I began teaching them to write their own questions. I would then grade the questions and use the best ones on tests.

In writing classes, the problem turned out to be more difficult to address. I would get essays that began with sentences like, "Taichung is a big city. There are many things to do." I began to understand that "original" and "interesting" were words my students equated with the magical process of creativity. Moreover, as we were all trapped within Taiwan's paradigm of expository prose, there was, aside from grammar, no comprehension of the writer's responsibility to a reader, no compulsion to give coherent reasons or examples, and sadly, every indication that I, their teacher, must be wrong. Universal practice and instruction in Taiwan did not support my views. As Chao-ming Chen (陳超明), a professor of English at National Chengchi University (NCCU) says of English writing results in Taiwan's 2009 College entrance exam, "Describing a picture is much more difficult because students have to use logic and analysis. Our high school graduates lack analytical skills. They lack training."[15] I did not find an answer until I gave up on the Western progression of writing instruction I was schooled in, and decided to teach Description as part of a story writing exercise in all my writing classes. When I began to teach students to write stories for children, I also uncovered a possible reason for their confusion about logical thought processes and creativity.

Logic and Creativity: An Inquiry into Confusion

Children think as logically as adults do, but are less constrained in what they think about. The rules that govern reality in a Children's story must be logical and consistent. The reality itself may be imagined. In five different stories, there may be five different realities with five different sets of rules. The thinking process required to discover the rules inherent to these different realities remains constant. As example, let us imagine a child's picture storybook.

---

[15] Cited from Flora Wang, "Teachers lament poor scores in English," *Taipei Times*, March 15, 2009.

In the picture is a farmyard with cows, horses, sheep and pigs. Two of the cows are talking. If, in this story, the pigs or other animals can't talk, the child is likely to demand a reason. Let us further imagine two trees in the picture. Even given a Taoist cosmos, most children will not be troubled if the trees can't talk. They will recognize that the trees belong to, if not a higher, at least a different order of life. As the story progresses, they will work out the rules and expect them to be coherent. So it is that by practice and delighted immersion in one imaginary world after another, children learn to think and reason. They may remain unaware of the logical processes they are involved in, but they are involved all the same.

As reminder that Chinese logical relativism must be an accepted condition of EFL writing instruction in Taiwan, and in reference to the "Taoist cosmos" mentioned above, I should like to cite an inquiry I conducted in several of my classes about the farmyard example above. I have since found occasion to annoy several older, native Chinese speakers and teachers with questions about the same example. The results are so consistently ambivalent as to merit attention.

When asked about logical connections between speaking and non-speaking plants and animals in the farmyard, native Chinese speakers will be more interested in relationships than in a hierarchy of existence. They will not be overly concerned if the grass can talk and the cow can't. I have encountered no shock or horror if talking cows are allowed to eat talking grass. The grass will doubtless understand its nature relative to cows, and surely the author knows the regenerative power of grass. My questions are answered with rolling eyes and ambivalent shrugs. A native speaking Chinese reader will accept a broader range of rules and adapt to changing logical structures quite effortlessly.

Story Writing, Description, and the "Child Mind"

An adequate understanding of Description for EFL students may take a semester to achieve, but it is a worthwhile beginning. More advanced rhetorical skills may be introduced, explicitly or implicitly, as students work at Description.

Because necessity engenders responsibility, and responsibility in writing requires the writer's attention to purpose and audience, it is useful to teach Description as a component of a story writing exercise. In a story, necessity and purpose are built in from the start. The student is telling the story he or she wants to tell. Its desired effect on the reader will depend on its logical development and the amount of descriptive detail it contains.

Distinguishing imagination from logic becomes effortless because it is an activity in which the student has become actively engaged. Denotation and connotation become equally distinct as the student struggles to achieve his purpose. The EFL writing instructor may now, by reference to student texts, point out the logical thought processes involved. The whole panoply of Western critical thinking may be brought to bear as students read other students' stories and rewrite their own.

The missing step for the EFL writing student, the examination of her own thought processes after elementary school, may now be addressed. To move forward from the elementary school child's unconscious ability to follow and insist on the logical coherency of different realities in different stories, however, we must take our EFL writing student back to that delighted immersion in the written word that she once enjoyed.

Li Zhi, (a Confucian scholar) writing in the 14th century, called this unselfconscious immersion, the "Child Mind." Li Zhi's essay, "On the Child Mind" was written in opposition to the Neo-Confucian literary paradigm and instruction of his day.

> The child-mind is the genuine mind; and if having the child-mind is taken as not being all right, then having a genuine mind is also taken as not being all right. Free of all falseness and entirely genuine, the child-mind is the original mind of one's very first thought. Loss of the child-mind means loss of the genuine mind, and a loss of the genuine mind means loss of the genuine person. One who is a person and not genuine will never again have beginnings.[16]

I write here against a different paradigm on a smaller scale, but our concerns and the results of the type of instruction we decry are quite similar. Li Zhi (see J. Ivanhoe below) concerns himself with moral insight. I would argue that insight of any kind requires deduction – logical thought processes.

---

[16] The translation is from Stephen Owen, *An Anthology of Chinese Literature* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1997), 808.

East Asia is an integral part of a world economy driven by Western consumption and must, by its own admission, stress innovation to compete. Taiwanese law, democracy, and higher academic practices are all based on Western models. However different the Taiwanese versions of these models may be, East Asian relativistic and dialectical thinking is obviously adaptive. It can adapt itself to Western logical systems as well. The child mind is the foundation of logic. It is the enemy of hypocrisy and lies.

> For Li Zhi, the child's mind was the source of all true moral insight. [...] One did not need to be highly "educated"- a process that Li Zhi thought usually resulted in twisting people into money and prestige-grubbing phonies and hypocrites. [...] the reading of literature can prove to be misdirected and counterproductive when one pursues such studies in order to realize more mundane forms of profit. In the case of Neo-Confucians, this criticism [of Li Zhi's] often was linked to success in the Imperial Examinations and the acquisition of highly coveted official appointments.[17]

If critical thinking is to become an integral part of this educational system, the child-mind must be given pedagogic encouragement. The confusion between imagination and logic, the disinterest in connotations and inability to infer meaning from a text so evident in Taiwanese EFL classrooms spring from a common cause, a lack of attention to the child-mind.

This institutionalized neglect begins after elementary school and continues through college. It is not a conscious wrongdoing, but an absence, a lack that can be redressed in the Taiwanese EFL Writing classroom. The EFL writing instructor must be mindful of where her students' difficulties began. It is therefore wise to begin story-writing assignments in a spirit of play. Once fully engaged in their creations, EFL students may be brought to full self-conscious awareness of the logical processes they have unwittingly engaged in. This engagement will begin with the student and be, as Li Zhi insists, entirely genuine.

How to Teach a Story: Freedom, Structure, and Different Story Types

It is important to encourage playfulness at the start but equally important to provide a structure. I have experimented with three story types: a children's story, a prequel to a story or one act play read in class, and a free story. Each of these can be structured, but the free story is the most difficult for EFL students, and I have had little success with it. Nevertheless, it may be structured as follows:

1. An introduction of expository prose telling the reader where he is in time and space and introducing one or more people.
2. A detailed description of the person or people that includes whatever action they are engaged in.
3. The introduction of a situation involving conflict, either in nature or between people.
4. Continuation and intensification of the conflict.
5. Chronicle of changes resulting from the continuing conflict.
6. An ending that presents the main character or characters with a dilemma, a question with no easy answer.

There are a number of reasons for ending the free story with a question. It sets up an assignment in analysis and argument, avoids tacked-on endings of the "then he woke up," variety, and it forces a theme on the student writer without requiring the burden of an answer. Finally, it relaxes tension in the classroom by making the assignment something like a weekly TV show, an episode. This is a great help to students who find that they have engaged themselves in writing a novel and not a short story.

A prequel to a story read in class follows the same basic structure as the free story and may also end in a question. The advantage is that the students know who the characters are and feel more comfortable as a result. They may also find it easier to end with the required question as they

---

[17] Philip J. Ivanhoe, "Literature and Ethics in the Chinese Confucian Tradition," in *Moral Cultivation, Essays on the Development of Character and Virtue*, ed., Brad K. Wilburn (Lanham: Lexington, 2007), 36.

know already what most of us do not. They know the future, and as the child-mind is our desired starting point here, that is a liberating effect.

A children's story is more fun to teach and of equal utility to the prequel in an EFL writing class. It would be a clear winner if not for one problem. My students have read and used Walt Disney's Fairy Tales too often. Many of them have learned to equate "creativity" with changing a well-known Disney story. The problem with Disney fairytales is that they are too well known. Mixing one with another and/or adding new elements does not require sufficient thought or responsibility on the part of the writer, as the reader can be depended on to know the major characters and plot elements in advance. It is best to teach a children's story based on the universal characteristics (excluding the Fairy Tale) of such stories.

The parts are as follows:

1. One or more Children: I generally encourage Taiwanese children as my students know more about being Taiwanese than being American or British.
2. A key: This may be a precipitating event involving a rabbit, a dog, a game of hide and seek, or a more representational key, a loose brick, a flower, or a coin. It may also, of course, be a real key.
3. A gateway: This can be anything from a hole in the ground to a tornado or a painting on the wall.
4. Another world filled with characters that may be strange in one way or another but are based on people the writer knows.
5. A quest: There must be some kind of conflict between variations of good and evil going on in the other world, and the child visitor(s) must get swept up in the struggle.
6. If the story is written for younger children, facts and information that a child will find of interest should be included.
7. The story must end with a return to this world and the child must have learned something about life in general.

As in all the story exercises, description, attention to detail and logical development within the world of the story must be adhered to. The business of teaching logical development is somewhat easier in a children's story as here, there is a "real" imaginary world and the Taiwanese EFL student writer must determine its rules, always mindful of the child reader tugging at a sleeve and asking, "Why?"

Introducing Argument and Syllogism in a Story Assignment

While the primary purpose of teaching a story in an EFL writing class is to instill a sense of responsibility to the reader and simple logical development, higher logical structures may also be introduced. If in a student's story, Sally loves Bill because he is strong and handsome, one may ask the writer if Sally loves all strong, handsome men. We have now introduced an enthymeme and a syllogism.

The syllogism would be:

1. (Major Premise) Sally loves all strong, handsome men.
2. (Minor Premise) Bill is strong and handsome.
3. (Conclusion) Sally loves Bill.

The enthymeme, based here on the conclusion and minor premise, is: "Sally loves Bill because he is strong and handsome." It is unlikely that this is what the writer really meant to say, so it is worthwhile to point out that, as a matter of responsibility to the reader, better reasons for Sally to love Billy are necessary.

If the teacher has time and inclination, she may decide to introduce enthymemes and syllogisms to the class, perhaps collecting examples from different papers.

Classifying these processes and distinguishing one from another with rhetorical terms is an additional benefit, but the EFL teacher must use judgment about how and when to apply this more academic framework to her students' work. Academic rigor, particularly as we are applying a Western version, may also kill delight if applied without care and attention to class development.

Argument and Evaluation

An interesting form of evaluation-based argument may also be applied to a story writing exercise. Carried forward into an argumentative paper, this form of argument is also more attractive to Taiwanese students than one based on syllogisms because it is more inclusive and balanced.

Normally, in an evaluation, purpose and audience determine criteria. So, in a standard evaluation of cars, the teacher must first point out that the purpose of a sports car is different from that of a family car. Having established that difference and chosen one or the other, the teacher can then move on to a set of criteria based on reasonable customer expectations and needs. Criteria for a sports car might be acceleration, maximum speed, comfort and handling, available extras, price, and prestige. If a similar set of criteria is set for family cars, and the writer's careful and qualified judgment is applied to the top brands in each instance of their respective criteria, it may then be possible to make a reasonable comparison between the best sports car and the best family car. The writer might conclude that X Family car is better at being a family car than X sports car is at being a sports car. In a student story, criteria may be derived from desired results.

If, in a student story, Sally must choose between John and Bill but loves them both equally and is on the verge of emotional and mental collapse as a result, we may use evaluation to rescue her. Our student writer may make a list of desirable outcomes for Sally's romantic involvement with any young man. This list can then be condensed into a set of criteria.

Perhaps our student has listed tall, strong, and big eyes, as desirable traits. We may list these in the "Looks" criteria. If fashion is as important to the writer as height or strength, it may be included under "Looks". If it deserves its own separate place in the list of the criteria, the writer must decide this. The writer must also decide on Sally's purpose. If it is marriage and not just romance, her criteria may change. Let's say that our student writer arrives at the following criteria for Sally: Looks, Intelligence, Humor, Earning Potential, and Social Skills. John and Bill may now be evaluated by these criteria. Sally may decide that neither of these young men is suitable for marriage but that as a companion one is better than the other. She may decide that one of the young men is most suitable in all respects but one, which happens to be her most important criteria. Any number of possibilities is possible.

It may be desirable at this point to move away from stories and into academic writing. The argument styles may be taught using question examples from student papers. Once the class has understood the strategy, the teacher may ask students to find issues from the world around them and bring them to class.

Conclusion and Policy Suggestions

A common perception of education in Taiwan, as in other Asian countries, is that students lack creativity and that innovation, as an economic necessity, suffers as a result. A college level EFL writing class can effectively address a lack in Western logical and critical thinking skills. However, to be truly effective, such training should begin earlier.

The child-mind, as it exists in Taiwan's elementary school system is replete with creativity, curiosity, and pedagogic practice in the classroom. The next step, training in inference as a reading skill and logic as a writing skill should begin in the fifth and sixth grades and continue into college. Li Zhi's "genuine mind" needs to grow. It needs practice and encouragement to sustain itself. There is no divide between Li-Zhi's original mind and the critical mind. Without training, there can be no critical minds; without critical minds, innovation is impossible.

Bibliography

Chen, F. Chen, Clyde A. Warden, and Huo-tsan Chang. "Motivators That Don't Motivate: The Case of Chinese Efl Learners and the Influence of Culture on Motivation." *Tesol Quarterly* 39, no. 4 (2005): 609-33.

Choo, Ong Ai. *Infusing Thinking into Curriculum Content*. Singapore: National Institute of Education, Nanyang Technological University, 2000.

Fowler, H. W. *A Dictionary of Modern English Usage*. Edited by Ernest Gowers. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1965.

Ivanhoe, Philip J. "Literature and Ethics in the Chinese Confucian Tradition." In *Moral Cultivation, Essays on the Development of Character and Virtue*, edited by Brad K. Wilburn, 29-48. Lanham: Lexington, 2007.

Littlejohn, Stephen W., and Karen A. Foss. *Theories of Human Communication*. 9 ed. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Publishing, 2007.

McPeck, John E. *Teaching Critical Thinking*. London: Routledge, 1990.

Moxley, Joseph M., ed. *Creative Writing in America: Theory and Pedagogy*. Urbana, IL: National Council of Teachers of English, 1989.

Needham, Joseph. *Science and Civilization in China*. Vol. 2. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985.

Neuman, W. Lawrence. *Social Research Methods*. 6 ed. New York: Pearson Education, 2006.

Nisbett, Richard E. *The Geography of Thought: How Asians and Westerners Think Differently - and Why*. New York: Free Press, 2004.

Owen, Stephen. *An Anthology of Chinese Literature*. New York: W. W. Norton, 1997.

Wang, Flora. "Teachers Lament Poor Scores in English." *Taipei Times*, March 15 2009, 2.

David Braden
University of Queensland
s4217382@student.uq.edu.au

Institute *of* Advanced Study

Durham University

Iconic Transformations in Dostoevsky's Post-Siberian Works

KATALIN GAAL

> "The Prince says the world will be saved by beauty!"
> Dostoevsky, *The Idiot*.

In his 2008 study *Language, Faith, and Fiction,*[1] Rowan Williams draws attention to the recent upsurge of interest in the role of art, aesthetics and beauty in Dostoevsky's work,[2] and more especially to its engagement with the tradition of Orthodox iconography. Suggesting that "there is more to be said about the part played by icons in the mature works,"[3] he examines their significance in *The Adolescent* and especially *The Devils* as a reminder of humanity's seemingly lost spiritual dimension[4] and a symbol of "brokenness healed and plurality reconciled."[5] The themes of idealised beauty and redemption, which characterise so much of iconography, are central to the works of Dostoevsky's mature art.

My research focus reflects the Orthodox Christian understanding of iconic beauty, according to which it is an intrinsic part of iconic representational and spiritual transformation. Essentially spiritual, transformative beauty transcends the physical dimension, deriving from the beauty of holiness as the contemplator of iconic beauty as transformed through encountering divinity. This theological belief is underpinned by the Byzantine doctrine that the search for spiritual perfection equates to a striving for the beauty of God. A key question for Dostoevsky's post-Siberian works is the extent to which iconic beauty meets with a response, and is therefore able to transform or transfigure sinfulness. Transformation is an essential and universal characteristic of the spiritual experience, resulting in the transcendence of pain, suffering and ego. The beauty transmitted through iconic representations is a means for effecting this transformation, hence its importance in Orthodox theology.

As an Orthodox believer and artist, Dostoevsky is heir to a centuries-old religious aesthetic tradition. From its beginnings, spiritual beauty has been of particular importance to the liturgical and theological tradition of the Russian Orthodox Church. Prince Vladimir's decision to adopt the

---

[1] Rowan Williams, *Dostoevsky: Language, Faith and Fiction* (Waco: Baylor University Press, 2008).

[2] One recent example is the 2010 conference of the International Dostoevsky Society *Dostoevsky: Philosophical Mind, Writer's Eye* which emphasises the role of art, aesthetics and beauty in Dostoevsky's writing.

[3] Rowan Williams, *Dostoevsky: Language, Faith and Fiction* (Waco: Baylor University Press, 2008), 190.

[4] In Susanne Fusso, "Maidens in Childbirth: the Sistine Madonna in Dostoevskii's Devils," *Slavic Review* 54, no. 2 (1995): 261-275, Fusso elaborates on the role of the Sistine Madonna's role in *The Devils*

[5] Rowan Williams. *Dostoevsky: Language, Faith and Fiction* (Waco: Baylor University Press, 2008), 201.

Orthodox faith was directly based on the response of his ambassadors to the beauty of an act of worship conducted in a language they could not understand:

> We went on to Greece, and the Greeks led us to the edifice where they worship their God, and we knew not whether we were in heaven or on earth. For on Earth there is no such splendor or such beauty and we are at a loss to describe it. We only know that God dwells there among men, and their service is fairer than the ceremonies of other nations. For we cannot forget that beauty.[6]

Many scholars have noted the aesthetic nature of the spiritual experience that has been a defining feature of Russian Orthodoxy and Dostoevsky's preoccupation with the relationship between faith and beauty. An examination of the interconnection between these themes must therefore begin with an investigation of their sources in the Russian Orthodox tradition.

Historians of religious ideas in Russia have generally recognised the ideal of beauty as a feature of national consciousness, even in the most austere of physical conditions. In a fifteenth century letter written to Grand Duke Basil the Blind, the Council of Florence invokes the beauty of the faith:

> It is right that you should rejoice with all the people in the true Orthodox faith, which shines throughout the world. The grace of God is upon us as a shining mantle, and the churches of God are as flowers, as the stars of the sky, as the gleaming rays of the sun, magnificently adorned, and resounding with holy songs.[7]

This aesthetic dimension of Russian religious thought is an aspect of Orthodoxy's Byzantine heritage which can be traced to the role of Byzantium as heir to both the Christian traditions of the Eastern Church and the pagan traditions of ancient Greece, and its aspiration to reconcile the ideals of Hellenism with Christian theology. The Byzantine Empire was a synthesis of Greek, Roman, Islamic and European influences which made a profound impact on Russia's cultural development. As Hooker[8] suggests, Russian culture may be considered a continuation of Byzantine cultural practices, certainly in its theological and aesthetic manifestations. The idea of Christian beauty is expounded in the *Philokalia*, essentially a guide to training the mind and heart to be worthy of God and cultivating the love of beauty and goodness. Eventually translated into Russian, it has become part of the Russian Church's literary and cultural heritage.[9]

Scholars of the Russian Church have repeatedly drawn attention to the importance of the liturgy as an expression of the spiritual order that imparts religious beauty. It is the Orthodox path to God made explicit in the prayer "sanctify those who love the beauty of Thy house"."[10] The liturgical heritage of Byzantium and consequently Russia assigns a central place to the spiritual experience of beauty. Ware[11] and Schmemann[12] (1977) highlight that for centuries the beauty of the liturgy was the main source of knowledge, inspiration and spiritual guidance for clergy and laity alike. In the absence of seminaries and theological academies, it was often the hymns and liturgical practices of the Church that took their place, and this explains the emphasis on the sacramental rather than the theological aspects of Orthodoxy.

A dominant feature of Orthodox worship is a profound respect for sacred objects, which are believed to enable the Spirit to dwell in the human soul. In liturgical practice beauty prepares the

---

[6] Georgii Petrovich Fedotov, *The Russian Religious Mind* (New York: Harper, 1960), 1: 372.

[7] Nikolay Aleksandrovich Arseniev, *Russian Piety*, trans. Asheleigh Moorhouse (London: The Faith Press, 1964), 86.

[8] Richard Hooker, "The Byzantine Empire." *World Civilizations* (Washington: Washington State University, 1999), http://www.wsu.edu/~dee/MA/BYZ.HTM.

[9] For further information, see E. Kadloubovsky and G.E. H. Palmer, eds., *Early Fathers from the Philokalia* (London: Faber and Faber, 1954).

[10] Paul Marshall Allan, *Vladimir Soloviev, Russian Mystic* (Blauvelt, New York: Steiner Books, 1978), 275.

[11] Timothy Ware, *The Orthodox Church* (London: Penguin Books, 1997).

[12] Alexander Schmemann, [ed.], *Ultimate Questions: an Anthology of Modern Russian Religious Thought* (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1977).

soul through its appeal to the five senses. Visually, iconography is the most significant feature, while incense proclaims the coming of the Kingdom through the sense of smell. Bread and wine are tasted and the consecrated Gospels, the cross and icons are kissed with reverence, while music is the final element in the evocation of beauty. It is also essential to recognise that the aesthetic component of the Russian liturgy exists not to evoke pleasure in beauty for its own sake, but has a definite theological purpose, which cannot be overemphasised as it underlines the whole meaning of faith and worship in the Orthodox tradition. Icons preserved from all periods of Russian art bear witness to an enduring ideal of spiritual beauty which is purified of human characteristics, creating feelings of holiness and profound reverence.[13] However, there are spiritual dangers inherent in the strong association between the religious and aesthetic experience of Russian piety. Religious feeling may become superficial and focused on the forms of liturgical worship, giving rise to excessive and rigid forms of ritualism. Properly understood, liturgical beauty is a gateway to the spiritual world, a means of preparing the soul for meeting with God. At once an aesthetic and spiritual realisation of divine truth, the art of the icon is not merely the product of artistic taste, but the manifestation of belief and a symbol of eternity: physical objects become the means by which to perceive the supernatural.

Holy images have a special function in revealing the spiritual dimension and bringing beauty and understanding to physical reality. Icons, like the sign of the cross, holy water, the Scriptures, chants, church ornaments, vestments, incense and lighted candles symbolise God's presence; they combine theology and art, their aesthetic purity evoking the image of humans capable of existing beyond the earthly dimension. This interior, spiritual and purifying beauty of the icon is its most important revelation, symbolising holiness and transfiguration. From a theological perspective, icons aim to assist the contemplator in perceiving the iconic dimension in others. Through icons, Orthodox worshippers obtain a vision of the spiritual world in which each human becomes an icon of God, symbolised by the practice of the priest bowing in front of the worshipper to salute the image of God in all human beings.[14] Understanding the spiritual history of Orthodox Russia is therefore crucial to our understanding of the historical and cultural context in which Dostoevsky's artistic expression emerged.

Among those Dostoevsky scholars who have examined the iconographical dimension of the writer's fiction, arguably the most prolific is Robert Louis Jackson. His particular interest in the role of icons in Dostoevsky's works spans four decades, from his seminal work *Dostoevsky's Quest for Form: a Study of His Philosophy of Art*,[15] to his recently edited publication *A New Word on the Brothers Karamazov.*[16] In *Dostoevsky's Quest for Form*,[17] Jackson outlines his thesis that the author's search for the ideal ultimately found expression in the context of iconic[18] representation and characterisation, following the transformation that took place in Dostoevsky's psyche in light of his prison experience. His former interest in the aesthetic ideal metamorphosed into an intense focus on the religious and moral existence of humankind, developing into the belief that iconic rather than aesthetic beauty is the ultimate redeemer of humanity. This "identification of the aesthetic ideal with

---

[13] For an extensive explication of the elements of Orthodox worship see Timothy Ware, *The Orthodox Church* (London: Penguin Books, 1997).

[14] This gesture is elucidated in Timothy Ware, *The Orthodox Way* (New York: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1986) and echoed by Father Zosima, when he bows down in front of Dmitry Karamazov as a sign of respect for his suffering.

0[15] Robert Louis Jackson, *Dostoevsky's Quest for Form: a Study of His Philosophy of Art* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1966).

[16] Robert Louis Jackson, ed., A *New Word on the Brothers Karamazov* (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 2004).

[17] Robert Louis Jackson, *Dostoevsky's Quest for Form: a Study of His Philosophy of Art* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1966).

[18] It is important to distinguish between contemporary understandings and interpretations of the term 'iconic' and its use in the context of the Orthodox tradition, and consequently this dissertation. While in contemporary cultural practice objects of social and historic significance are frequently referred to as 'iconic', in the religious context the term is more strictly defined and understood to mean the physical manifestation of the Divine; a theological function analogous to that of the Gospels.

the religious ideal, of ideal form or beauty with the image of Christ"[19] was to remain the central focus of the writer's artistic outlook throughout his life.

Dostoevsky's creative vision was deeply influenced by the icons of his childhood. His parents attached great significance to holy images and upheld the tradition of seeking their guidance. For instance, when they succeeded in purchasing an estate, his parents immediately gave thanks to the icon of the Iversky Madonna; and, years later, when they learned that a building on the estate had burnt down, they visited the same icon for spiritual comfort. Dostoevsky's brother Andrei had vivid recollections: "I remember that my parents fell on their knees before the icons in the living room and then left to pray to the Iversky Madonna."[20] The young writer was viewed by others as anti-social, a mystic who constantly read books about religion. One young officer, Savelyev, Dostoevsky's contemporary in the Academy of Engineers, recalled: "he was very religious, and zealously performed all the obligations of the Orthodox Christian faith."[21]

As Kjetsaa[22] and Frank[23] suggest, around 1840 Dostoevsky became interested in the ideas of utopian socialist philosophy. His Christian beliefs became increasingly socially oriented under the influence of French socialists. While re-assessing his beliefs, Dostoevsky became acquainted with Belinsky and the Petrashevsky circle, and it is doubtful whether any of these new associates shared his views on the spiritual significance of icons. On the other hand, it seems clear that the socialist teachings he absorbed had a profound effect on his literary works of this period. Certainly, his first novel *Poor Folk* was concerned with the impact of poverty on people, but the works which followed it were largely preoccupied with the metaphysical dimension of the human psyche.

Dostoevsky's arrest and sentence to penal servitude in Siberia provided him with the opportunity to re-examine his values and beliefs and to transform his horrifying experiences into enduring works of art. Although some scholars, notably Nancy Ruttenburg in *Dostoevsky's Democracy*[24], question the influence of the Siberian experience on Dostoevsky's crystallisation of faith in the post-Siberian works, it is generally accepted that the transformation that took place in his psyche following his prison experience resulted in a corresponding shift in artistic output. During his exile, he found himself empathising with other convicts, as he became convinced that even the worst criminal retained some aspect of his divine heritage. In this harsh environment, he was strengthened in his unshakable belief that people preserved their original birthright of spiritual beauty, regardless of the depths of sin and misery to which they had sunk. Artistically, this was a transforming period for the author, as he absorbed the various shades and colours of the human personality and their interconnection with the spiritual ideal. The most important record of this period is *The House of the Dead*, in which Dostoevsky describes his four years of exile and the tragic reality of convict existence. In this and later works, he becomes intensely focused on spiritual freedom and healing as aspects of iconic beauty. Just as the coming of spring raises the convicts' spirits, so too treating them with kindness and respect would assist in their spiritual rehabilitation.

Following his release from prison, Dostoevsky's creative vision was gradually transformed. In his letters and diaries he expressed his belief that human life is essentially worthless without the spiritual ideal made manifest through icons. In "Mr.- bov and the Problem of Art," a response to Dobrolyubov's famous treatise, he elaborated on his commitment to art and beauty:

> Art is just such a necessity for man as eating and drinking. The necessity for beauty and for
> the creative work which incarnates beauty is inseparable from man, and perhaps without it
> he would not wish to live in the world. Man thirsts for beauty; he discovers and accepts

---

[19] Robert Louis Jackson, *Dostoevsky's Quest for Form: a Study of His Philosophy of Art* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1966) 37.

[20] Fyodor Mikhailovich Dostoevsky, "Pisma 4," in *Dostoevsky: The Seeds of Revolt 1821-1849*, Frank Joseph, 51 (London: Robson Books, 1977a).

[21] Fyodor Mikhailovich Dostoevsky, "Pisma 4," in *Dostoevsky: The Seeds of Revolt 1821-1849*, Frank Joseph, 78 (London: Robson Books. 1977b).

[22] Geir Kjetsaa, *Fyodor Dostoyevsky, A Writer's Life* (New York: Viking, 1987).

[23] Joseph Frank, *Dostoevsky: The Seeds of Revolt 1821-1849* (London: Robson Books, 1977).

[24] In Nancy Ruttenbug, *Dostoevsky's Democracy* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2008). Ruttenburg maintains that during the Siberian period, Dostoevsky was far more influenced by the plight of simple Russians than the Orthodox faith, exemplified by his work *Notes from the House of the Dead*.

> beauty without any conditions, just as it is, only because it is beauty, and he worships before it with awe, without questioning what it is useful for … .[25]

During this period, the writer concentrated on explorations of the human psyche in the context of Orthodox piety, the essence of his fiction centring on the belief that humans are made in God's image so that each individual must strive to attain His likeness through righteous living. As an expression of this ideal, the iconic image assumed a particular importance in his conception of humanity and the Russian people.[26] In his letters and diary entries, Dostoevsky elaborated on the importance of the image of iconic beauty in the creative process, claiming that such an image of a particular idea or character was the germ of the story itself. Indeed, in a letter to Maikov in 1867, Dostoevsky reflected that a character would often appear to him as a complete image in a flash of inspiration, referring in particular to the evolution of Stavrogin as "the final image of the Prince."[27] From this it follows that literary expression was profoundly influenced by visual imagery and symbolism, and that for Dostoevsky, the iconic image as a representation of the spiritual ideal and the role of literature in depicting the human condition became firmly intertwined. He considered spiritual beauty an essential component of art, but was equally convinced of the necessity for spiritual freedom to be an integral part of artistic truth.

Dostoevsky's understanding of the Christ figure was significantly shaped by his Siberian experiences and renewed interest in aesthetic theology. His focus is increasingly on the depiction and manifestation of spiritual beauty through his characters, a reflection of his conviction that humanity was created in God's image, and that each individual is of absolute and infinite value. Consequently, those fictional characters that violate God's divine spirit undergo a process of spiritual and mental disintegration, while those who display spiritual beauty and goodness afford us a glimpse of the future state of humankind.[28] Through his characters, Dostoevsky frequently contrasts spiritual beauty with ugliness: for instance, Stavrogin's egotism is compared with Dasha's selflessness so that they become images depicting the interplay of light and shadow. Literary conception and visual composition therefore become complementary in Dostoevsky's artistic expression, both revealing some aspect of the spiritual ideal.

The notebooks for Dostoevsky's works are important sources of insight into the refining process of his art. *The Notebooks for Crime and Punishment*, for instance, outline the development of Sonya's character, culminating in the pure iconic stature she assumes in the final version of the novel. In earlier redactions she is shown to be far more complex and capricious; however, as Wasiolek points out, Dostoevsky "purged her of contradictory and complicating traits … and wanted her to represent that unconditional love to which Raskolnikov was drawn."[29] In the final draft, Sonya's inner and outer beauty balance Raskolnikov's darkness, and her love and selflessness save him from spiritual death. In *The Notebooks for The Brothers Karamazov*, where Dostoevsky's notion of spiritual beauty is linked to the moral well-being of society, he argued that true beauty is interior rather than exterior, a philosophy entirely consistent with Orthodox teachings.

There are a number of parallels between the Orthodox Christian conception of spiritual reality and Dostoevsky's own articulation of it. His dismissive attitude to traditional realism echoes the fundamental theological and aesthetic principles of the Byzantine iconic image which emphasise the depiction of 'sacred realism' as a means of conveying essential truths. Three-dimensional space is seen to be illusory, in the same way that Dostoevsky viewed contemporary literary realism as false and replaced it with spiritual realism. Indeed, the icon rejects the illusion of realism for the representation of spiritual reality. There is no depiction of natural light or shadow in the iconic image, only inner or divine light symbolised by the spiritual radiance of gold. Just as Orthodox iconography opposes spiritual, dematerialized beauty to false idealisation, Dostoevsky believed in the moral truth

---

[25] Fyodor Mikhailovich Dostoevsky, "G. - bov i Vopros ob Iskusstve," 1861. *Comparative Literature* 13, no. 2 (Spring 1961): 121.

[26] For further discussion see Robert Louis Jackson, *The Art of Dostoevsky: Deliriums and Nocturnes* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1981).

[27] Fyodor Mikhailovich Dostoevsky, "The Final Image of the Prince," in *The Notebooks for The Possessed*, (ed.) Edward Wasiolek, 179 (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1968).

[28] See Joseph Frank, *Dostoevsky: The Seeds of Revolt 1821-1849* (London: Robson Books, 1977).

[29] Edward Wasiolek, ed., *The Notebooks for Crime and Punishment* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1967), 7.

of his own form of realism. At the same time, it is important to differentiate between Dostoevsky's narrative style, with its unique combination of fantasy and theology, and the techniques of icon painters who were following strict theological teachings without incorporating imaginative elements or artistic fantasy.[30] Yet for both, transcendent reality is the only true reality. The search for spiritual restoration and the true self in the midst of disintegration and chaos is the predominant theme in Dostoevsky's mature works, expressed through his idiosyncratic form of 'fantastic' or spiritual realism.

Among Dostoevsky's icon-like characters we may distinguish between those who are able to create transformation by evoking a spiritual response to their unconditional love and those who are not. While the inner beauty represented by each iconic character consists of the same moral and transformative essence, its effectiveness and end result is expressed with significant differences in the post-Siberian works. The characters have been selected on the basis of their representation of the transformational aspects of iconic beauty as the most significant bearers of the spiritual ideal in the narrative: "Dostoevsky's novels speak of a person's spiritual need for beauty […] against the prevailing utilitarianism."[31]

The transformative potentiality of Dostoevsky's iconic characters is of crucial significance to the conceptualisation of iconic beauty in the works examined in this study. By representing ideal humanity through these iconic figures, Dostoevsky endows each character with the potential to transform those whom they encounter. The writer created icons of beauty through his characterisation and narrative in order to project an idealised vision of humanity's spiritual potential; by exemplifying ideal humanity, these characters are endowed with the capacity to facilitate spiritual change or transformation. Equally important is the extent to which the icon-like characters receive the necessary response that enables transformation and ultimately determines the work's final resolution. As we shall see, Sonya parallels Alyosha's positive social ideal in her ability to create a triumphant outcome. Her meek, kind and gentle persona creates a template of iconic beauty on which Dostoevsky's icon-like characters are modelled in the post-Siberian period. However, while Sonya's active positive love is mirrored by Alyosha, Myshkin, Dasha and the Gentle Creature project a more defeatist demeanour in the face of the general lack of response to their extension of compassionate love.

Dostoevsky's notebooks reveal that the author conducted a great deal of mental experimentation until the final versions of his characters emerged. For instance, in earlier drafts, Sonya's character is morally ambiguous and less clearly defined as a symbol of absolute purity. It also took several drafts before the idea of Myshkin as the symbol of a 'perfectly good man' emerged, which suggests that Dostoevsky's conception of iconic beauty also developed as he matured as a writer, in step with the refinement of his religious philosophy. The culmination of the author's artistic and spiritual growth is *The Brothers Karamazov*, where the character of Alyosha Karamazov, the symbol of the positive social ideal, captures the author's mature understanding of the active compassion and transformation that is necessary for iconic beauty to create lasting change in the world. Perhaps contrary to expectations, gender is not a differentiating factor in establishing the effectiveness of the icon-like characters. Males and females are equally portrayed as successful or unsuccessful in creating transformation. Rather, it is the response they receive to their offer of spiritual love that determines their effectiveness.

Of further interest is the way in which *Crime and Punishment* alongside *The Brothers Karamazov* may be considered open-ended, as the possibility of a sequel is suggested; while *The Idiot*, *The Devils* and *The Gentle Creature* are finite works with little that might imply the continuation of the narrative after its conclusion. The Bakhtinian concept of unfinalisability is also relevant to our understanding of the similarities and differences between the iconic characters, as it is a crucial component of spiritual potential. Both Sonya and Alyosha facilitate the process of transformation, which is ultimately open-ended, infinite and continuous, leading to a constant state of renewal, regeneration and becoming. A constant state of becoming and unfinalisability is generated through

---

[30] See Leonide Ouspensky and Vladimir Lossky, *The Meaning of Icons* (Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1982).

[31] Derek Offord, "Nineteenth-century Thought and Literature," in *The Routledge Companion to Russian Literature*, ed. Neil Cornwell, 134 (London: New York: Routledge, 2001).

the essential freedom of humans, a state of being that characterises icons.[32] On the other hand, Myshkin, Dasha and the Gentle Creature cannot engender this receptive state, nor do they receive the necessary response that might enable transformation to take place, and therefore the works become fixed and finalised and conclude by evoking death, spiritual defeat and entropy.

Sonya is the first incarnation of iconic beauty in Dostoevsky's post-Siberian works, and through her Dostoevsky realises the full embodiment of iconic beauty. She represents its transforming power in planting the seeds of spiritual change in Raskolnikov. Her steady compassion, purity and mercy mirror the nature of God, thereby enabling Raskolnikov to develop an understanding of godliness. In *The Annihilation of Inertia: Dostoevsky and Metaphysics,*[33] Knapp discusses Sonya's embodiment of the resurrection of the spirit through selfless love and sacrifice, highlighting her association with the figures of Mary Magdalene and Mary the sister of Lazarus. Alongside Alyosha, she represents the effectiveness of iconic beauty in the world in being an agent of change. Her active love, compassion and sacrificial humility[34] foster transformation, as is evident in the Epilogue, where Raskolnikov arguably comes to realise the spiritual potential of his selfhood through theosis or transformation, and where he is reunited with Sonya as they return to a "state of innocence."[35] Zubeck also discusses the significance of Sonya's "benevolent presence,"[36] which enables Raskolnikov to aspire to an iconic ideal.

Although Myshkin is the quintessential manifestation of iconic beauty in Dostoevsky's post-Siberian works, his brief sojourn among the sinful characters of contemporary St. Petersburg seemingly ends in failure, paralleling Christ's earthly stay. Yet, one might argue that in the same way that Jesus' spiritual beauty remains untarnished by his crucifixion, Myshkin's embodiment of iconic beauty successfully symbolises the iconic ideal, regardless of his ineffectualness, by "holding up to other characters an image of the best in themselves and a hint of a higher reality in which time shall be no more."[37] Both Christ and Myshkin plant the seed of transformation in the world and take upon themselves human suffering. Like Sonya, Myshkin is a literary depiction of unambiguous beauty and purity, faced with a world of pride, self-interest and vengeance, a world he is ultimately unable to overcome or transform.

Dasha in *The Devils* also represents the failure of spiritual beauty when it meets with no response. Her steady devotion to and love for Stavrogin cannot arrest his disintegration and self-destruction, though he is aware of her potential to transform his life and attracted to her kind and gentle nature. However, unlike Raskolnikov, he turns away from her pure beauty and chooses instead the path of implosion, as Father Tikhon observes in *The Notebooks for The Possessed*: "you lack a sense of the beautiful. This lack of beauty is going to kill you; you won't be able to stand it."[38] Similarly, the crippled Maria Lebyadkina, another iconic figure in her meekness and religiosity, encounters abuse, neglect, suffering and ultimately murder, although her icon-like beauty remains untarnished even in death.

The nameless heroine of *The Gentle Creature* fails to renew or transform her own life or that of the narrator, yet she remains a symbol of the hope of transcendence and transformation beyond death. Whether her tragic death will prove to be the catalyst for the narrator's subsequent

---

[32] In his essay Paul Contino, "The Brothers Karamazov: Alyosha and Grushenka," in *Finding a Common Thread: Reading Great Texts from Homer to O'Connor*, (eds.) Roberts Roberts and Scott Moore, (Scranton, PA: University of Scranton Press No – St Augustine's Press, South Bend, 2012), Paul Contino points to the relevance of unfinalisability to our understanding of the function of icons.

[33] Liza Knapp, *The Annihilation of Inertia: Dostoevsky and Metaphysics* (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1996).

[34] See Edward Wasiolek, (ed.), *The Notebooks for Crime and Punishment* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1967).

[35] Liza Knapp, *The Annihilation of Inertia: Dostoevsky and Metaphysics* (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1996), 63.

[36] Jacqueline A. Zubeck, "Bakhtin's Ethics and an Iconographic Standard in Crime and Punishment," in *Bakhtin: Ethics and Mechanics*, ed. Valerie Z Nollan, 49 (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 2004).

[37] Malcolm Jones, "Dostoevskii and Religion," in *The Cambridge Companion to Dostoevskii*, (ed.) William J. Leatherbarrow, 165 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002).

[38] Edward Wasiolek, (ed.), *The Notebooks for The Possessed*, trans. Victor Terras. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1968), 344. This pivotal statement appears in the notebooks but curiously not the novel itself.

transformation remains unknown, in keeping with the Bakhtinian concept of unfinalisability. Yet the iconic image that accompanies her on her final journey is a symbol of spiritual liberation, signalling her transcendence of pain and suffering as she becomes 'finalised' through encountering God's love.

In his final work, Dostoevsky transfused what he considered to be the essential ingredients of iconic beauty into Alyosha Karamazov, creating a powerful figure that not only plants the seeds of transformation but also resonates with Russian depictions of iconography,[39] as he meets with a spiritual response from other characters. Lindsay Sargent Berg (2003) argues that Alyosha is the culmination of Dostoevsky's conceptualisation of the successful Christ figure in contrast with Myshkin's passive defeatism, and reflects the development of Dostoevsky's theology as it becomes "less apocalyptic and more focused on the possibility of gradual transformation [and fellowship]."[40] Although the planned sequels to *The Brothers Karamazov* might have depicted a different hero changed by encountering spiritual challenges, in the novel as it stands Alyosha is capable of great goodness, which he is able to translate into active love in and for the world. As Wasiolek[41] suggests, he is the embodiment and continuation of Father Zosima's spiritual teachings, his character based on the saintly prototype that characterises Dostoevsky's icon-like characters.

Among the themes emerging from this paper is the significance of iconic beauty for the development of plot and characterisation in Dostoevsky's post-Siberian novels, as well as the role of ideal beauty in representing the spiritual archetype. It is clear that icons are present in Dostoevsky's works not only as physical reminders of the religious world, but in the form of the abstract symbolism of characterisation and setting, thereby highlighting the relevance and importance of iconic beauty to a more complete understanding and appreciation of Dostoevsky's writings and their religious-aesthetic framework.

Bibliography

Allan, Paul Marshall. *Vladimir Soloviev, Russian Mystic*. Blauvelt, New York: Steiner Books, 1978.

Arseniev, Nikolay Aleksandrovich. *Russian Piety*. Translated by Asheleigh Moorhouse. London: The Faith Press, 1964.

Berg, Lindsay Sargent. *The Tarnished Halo: Dostoevsky's Christ Figures and the Problem of Moral Authority*. Ann Arbor, MI: UMI Dissertation Services, 2003.

Contino, Paul. "The Brothers Karamazov: Alyosha and Grushenka," In *Finding a Common Thread: Reading Great Texts from Homer to O'Connor*, eds. Roberts Roberts and Scott Moore. Scranton, PA: University of Scranton Press, 2010. QUERY found on internet only St Augustine's Press 2012 as first edition (South Bend)

Dostoevsky, Fyodor Mikhailovich. *The Brothers Karamazov*. (1880). Translated by David McDuff. London: Penguin Books, 1993

Dostoevsky, Fyodor Mikhailovich. *Crime and Punishment*. (1866). Translated by David McDuff. London: Penguin Books, 1991.

Dostoevsky, Fyodor Mikhailovich *The Devils.* (1872). Translated by David Magarshack. London: Penguin Books, 1971.

Dostoevsky, Fyodor Mikhailovich. "G. - bov i Vopros ob Iskusstve" (1861), quoted in *Comparative Literature* 13, no. 2 (Spring 1961): 121.

Dostoevsky, Fyodor Mikhailovich. *A Gentle Creature and Other Stories*. [A Gentle Creature] (1876) Translated by Alan Myers. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995.

Dostoevsky, Fyodor Mikhailovich. *The Idiot*. (1869). Translated by Alan Myers. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992.

---

[39] Refer to Andrew Wachtel, "Dostoevsky's *The Idiot*: The Novel as Photograph," *History of Photography* 26, no. 3 (Autumn 2002): 214.

[40] Linsday Sargent Berg, *The Tarnished Halo: Dostoevsky's Christ Figures and the Problem of Moral Authority (*Ann Arbor, MI: UMI Dissertation Services, 2003), iii.

[41] Edward Wasiolek ed. *The Notebooks for The Brothers Karamazov*, trans. Edward Wasiolek. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1971).

Dostoevsky, Fyodor Mikhailovich. "The Final Image of the Prince" (1870), quoted in *The Notebooks for The Possessed*, edited by Edward Wasiolek. Translated by Victor Terras. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1968.

Dostoevsky, Fyodor Mikhailovich. *The House of the Dead*. (1862). Translated by David McDuff. London: Penguin Books, 1985.

Dostoevsky, Fyodor Mikhailovich. "Pisma 4" (1837), quoted in *Dostoevsky: The Seeds of Revolt 1821-1849*, Joseph Frank. (London: Robson Books, 1977).

----. "Pisma 4" (1838), quoted in *Dostoevsky: The Seeds of Revolt 1821-1849*, Joseph Frank, London: Robson Books, 1977).

Fedotov, Georgii Petrovich. *The Russian Religious Mind*. Vol. 1, New York: Harper, 1960.

Frank, Joseph. *Dostoevsky: The Seeds of Revolt 1821-1849*. London: Robson Books, 1977

Fusso, Susanne. "Maidens in Childbirth: the Sistine Madonna in Dostoevskii's Devils." *Slavic Review* 54, no. 2 (1995): 261-275.

Hooker, Richard. "The Byzantine Empire." *World Civilizations*. Washington: Washington State University, 1999, http://www.wsu.edu/~dee/MA/BYZ.HTM.

Jackson, Robert Louis. *The Art of Dostoevsky: Deliriums and Nocturnes*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1981.

Jackson, Robert Louis. *Dostoevsky's Quest for Form: a Study of His Philosophy of Art*. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1966.

Jackson, Robert Louis. ed., *A New Word on the Brothers Karamazov*. Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 2004.

Jones, Malcolm. "Dostoevskii and Religion," In *The Cambridge Companion to Dostoevskii*, edited by William J. Leatherbarrow. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.

Kadloubovsky, E., and Palmer, G.E. H. Palmer eds. *Early Fathers from the Philokalia*. London: Faber and Faber, 1954.

Kjetsaa, Geir. *Fyodor Dostoyevsky, A Writer's Life*. New York: Viking, 1987.

Knapp, Liza. *The Annihilation of Inertia: Dostoevsky and Metaphysics*. Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1996.

Offord, Derek. "Nineteenth-century Thought and Literature." In *The Routledge Companion to Russian Literature*, edited by Neil Cornwell, London; New York: Routledge, 2001.

Ouspensky, Leonide, and Vladimir Lossky, *The Meaning of Icons*. Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1982.

Ruttenbug, Nancy. *Dostoevsky's Democracy.* Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2008.

Schmemann, Alexander, [ed.], *Ultimate Questions: an Anthology of Modern Russian Religious Thought*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1977.

Wachtel, Andrew. "Dostoevsky's *The Idiot*: The Novel as Photograph." *History of Photography* 26, no. 3 (Autumn 2002): 214.

Ware, Timothy. *The Orthodox Church*. London: Penguin Books, 1997.

Ware, Timothy. *The Orthodox Way*. New York: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1986.

Wasiolek, Edward, trans. and ed. *The Notebooks for The Brothers Karamazov.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1971.

Wasiolek, Edward, trans. and ed. *The Notebooks for Crime and Punishment*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1967.

Wasiolek, Edward, ed. *The Notebooks for The Possessed*. Translated by Victor Terras. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1968.

Williams, Rowan. *Dostoevsky: Language, Faith and Fiction*. Waco: Baylor University Press, 2008.

Zubeck, Jacqueline A. "Bakhtin's Ethics and an Iconographic Standard in Crime and Punishment." In *Bakhtin: Ethics and Mechanics*, edited by Valerie Z Nollan. Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 2004.

Katilin Gaal
University of Queensland
s006221@student.uq.edu.au

Institute *of*
Advanced
Study

Durham
University

Filipino Diaspora in Australia and the "Language Question"

SHIRLITA ESPINOSA

A three-stage survey of ethnic newspapers in Australia, *Content Analysis of Australian non-English Language Newspapers*, by Rogelia Pe-Pua and Michael Morrissey (1996, 1995, 1994) aimed "[to] provide the Commonwealth of Australia with information about eligible newspapers and to facilitate a more sensitive, professional approach by media planners (1996: 2)." Possibly hundreds of newspapers in fourteen foreign languages were analysed (1996: 2). The first impulse for a researcher working on migrant print material culture is to search out in the contents whether Filipino ethnic newspapers are included in a significantly funded project such as this.[1] Realizing that no Filipino ethnic newspaper was included in the study raised two basic questions. First, did their exclusion mean Filipino migrants in Australia only publish in the English language since their arrival? Secondly, why did this massive multicultural project focus on "non-English language newspapers" alone?

This question leads to an even more political issue of hierarchising the migrant other: that if a minority group chooses to articulate itself in English – orally and/or in their written material culture – does it mean "reading" them comes easily? It may be straightforward to see, from an administrative point of view, how English-language migrant groups can be rendered "legible" compared to the Chinese, Arab, Vietnamese, and other groups that do not use the Roman alphabet. This makes them visually "illegible" to the majority, and Filipino-Australians occupy an even more liminal space than others because they are neither unreadable nor dominant. They are neither part of the "normative" citizenry at large nor are they given priority as "alien". As a group of immigrants categorically lumped together by virtue of language-use with "American-Australians" (who do not need an *ethnic* newspaper celebrating whiteness) and "Jewish-Australians" (who are economically and culturally embedded within the structure), Philippine-born migrants in the diaspora are affected by late capitalist and sexualised conditions of labour movement that render them not only liminal but invisible.[2] The Filipino woman in Australia is a character that has become a standardised symbol of the transgressive female, crossing racial, national, geographical, and class boundaries through marriage. Caricatures of the "mail-order bride" such as Rose Porteus, Vivian Solon Alvarez, Cynthia, a character in "Priscilla Queen of the Desert" movie, and dozens upon dozens of dead wives and mothers have not really left the Australian imagination. This discourse of the sexualised Filipina is definitive of the diaspora, and its discussion requires a separate paper.

---

[1] Pe-Pua is a Philippine-born academic whose early career started at the University of the Philippines and is now with the University of New South Wales so I expect that Filipino-Australian newspapers would be included.

[2] The reference to Jewish-Australians is in the context of the group's successful English-language only newspapers in Australia such as *Australian Jewish Times* and *Australian Jewish News* in Sydney and Melbourne, respectively. Also, like the case of the Philippines, Jewish-Australians are characterized by the absence of a lingua franca other than English. There is no attempt to simplify the case of Jewish migration to Australia in opposition to the Filipino migration. For further discussion, see Braham (1989).

This paper will attempt to describe the practices and choices that define Filipino-Australian community newspapers; in particular, it will historicise the use of the English language primarily, and Filipino secondarily, as an enduring legacy of American colonial education in the Philippines. Highlighting the case of New South Wales' Filipino newspapers, *Bayanihan News* in particular, English functions as the virtual *lingua franca* among ethnic Filipinos in Australia instead of the official national language, Filipino. Rather than seeing this phenomenon as the community's integrative action towards an acceptably Australian minority group in the process of slow but serious adaptation, I argue that what is at play here are the vestiges of their colonial past and the unabashed elitism of English that goes along with it. As a result, the subsequent emasculation of a national language in the Philippines is transported overseas as a kind of dilution of their ethnic identity. The virtual castration of the authority of a national language in favour of English as the language of the imperialists is even more effective and felt within the context of Filipino migration in Anglo-Celtic Australia since migration could only further highlight the many clefts in Philippine society. First and foremost of these divisions is class, to which the choice of language is very much a part of connecting the case of Filipino-Australian newspapers' use of English in the quest for "multicultural" Australia. This is evidenced by the ethnic media project by Pe-Pua and Morrissey and this paper will argue that while Filipinos are a piece of fabric in the quilt of Australia's official policy on immigration and race relations. The usage of English – an applauded trait of adaptability often cited as sign of a "model minority" – works ironically towards their liminalisation in that they are neither within the white society in general nor within the "ethnic"-Australian society in particular; thus, furthering their invisibility from both sides of the spectrum.[3]

In this paper I shall historicise the use of English in Philippine political and social milieus. I shall also use other methods such as content analysis of Filipino ethnic newspapers and interviews with the publishers, editors and other practitioners in the community conducted from 2009 to 2010.

Problems of Language in the Philippines: Multilingual and Imperial

It is fitting to start this discussion on the problems of language in the Philippines by mentioning that there are more than one hundred Philippine languages all over the scattered 7,000 islands. The Austronesian or Malayo-Polynesian varieties can number up to 300 if variations among these languages are considered (Gonzalez 1980). For example, Tagalog - spoken in Manila and the provinces surrounding it such as Cavite, Laguna, Batangas, Quezon, Bataan, Rizal and also in places as far as Central Luzon, the island of Mindoro and Palawan – is a major language but all these areas have a dialect of Tagalog specific to each place. People from these areas generally understand one another but they do have distinct differences in intonation and vocabulary. Today, it is possible for one person to know, on average, four languages – one's native language, the lingua franca in the greater region, Tagalog, infamous for being the contested national language, and English. While such effusion of linguistic variety is exciting, it can also be a source of problem that have ramifications in language policy, ethnic relations, national education programs, development planning, and others that are part of postcolonial nation-building (Hau and Tinio 2003; Gonzales 1980, 1991). In a nation-state that is just over a hundred years old, the presence of ethno-linguistic divisions caused considerable strain in the process of nation-building. The notion of a single vernacular as a "natural" agent of ethnic identification is a much-documented aspect of literatures on nationalism as an ideology (Anderson 1990; Barbour and Carmichael 2000; May 2001). However, saddled by the weight of colonisation under Spain and the United States, not to mention the linguistic diversity in what is now the Philippine republic, the question of one singular, identifying vernacular is out of the question.

The learning of a second-language was imposed upon the Philippine natives upon the arrival of Spanish conquistadores. Evangelization in the islands in the 16th century did not prove to be easy. For the Catholic priests, the "savages", "pagans" and "animist" inhabitants were unruly and nomadic, and more importantly, they spoke a variety of languages (Rafael 1988). Therefore, Castilian priests were compelled to study the vernacular languages in the archipelago now mapped as the Philippines. The long process of learning the language started by syllabicating languages into Latin script thereby bypassing the native way of writing which would later be eroded in time.

---

3 For a more detailed discussion of Australian multiculturalism and race relations, see Ghassan Hage (2002, 1998) and Stephen Castles (1989, 1992, 1999).

Francisco Blancas de San Jose published *Arte y reglas de las lengua tagala* in 1610 with the help of Tomas Pinpin, a native printer (Rafael 1988). It was a book of grammar and vocabulary, and became the foundation of the early writings of prayers, rituals and Christian doctrines that would in turn convert the people of the islands (except Mindanao) into Christians. Unlike in Latin America where European settlers arrived and formed colonies, the Philippines were too isolated geographically and therefore were not a priority. These reasons forced missionaries to learn the major vernacular languages instead of imposing Castilian as in Latin America. This almost eradicated the vernacular languages and in hindsight, was a positive outcome, which resulted in them not speaking Spanish despite 350 years of domination. Although a persistent theory still hovers that the Spaniards did not teach the natives their language in order to contain them, to keep them ignorant and outside the margins of power (Constantino 1975), recent literature on the subject points to the simple fact that the missionaries could not do it even if they had wanted to (Rafael 1988).

The arrival of English in the country coincided with the bitter history of losing the Filipino-American war that started in 1899 after they declared their first republic. The Philippines were then bought for 20 million dollars from Spain along with Guam and Puerto Rico at the Treaty of Paris. Together with the systematic introduction of the machineries of civil government, William Taft, the governor-general, instituted public instruction of English to Filipino children; something that Spanish colonisation did not accomplish with its exclusive *beaterios* and *seminarios* (Rafael 1988). Hundreds of American teachers arrived by boat in 1901 to facilitate instruction; they were called "Thomasites" because they arrived on the USS Thomas (Racelis and Ick 2001). Despite the very sudden and crushing effect of colonial institutions and their conduits on the socio-political and cultural lives of the natives, parents and school children thought it better to follow what the Americans offered due to the social mobility it promised for the long-oppressed peasantry in feudalistic Philippines. English then was more than a foreign language that one learned under the "benevolent" and yet fear-inducing white authority; it had become a path to economic salvation.[4] American pacification was so thorough that after a short forty-year gap between the Filipino-American War and World War II, English spread rapidly and overwhelmed Hispanic influences.[5] Although the Americans did not officially move towards any restrictive use of vernacular languages, the colonial project was so pervasive that *not* to speak English was to be at the bottom of the social ladder: provincial, uneducated, crude, native, illiterate, poor, *de baja clase*. For one century now, in the Philippines, one does not want to be caught without English. In a manner of speaking, it is their web; they are all caught in it.

English as a tool of power ensuring social mobility has become more evident than ever in post-war Philippines. Without Spanish strongly contending in the hierarchy of languages, the English language can now wage its battle against Filipino; or rather, Filipino wages its losing battle against the English language. In 1939, coinciding with efforts of native bureaucrats for independence from US occupation, a campaign to finally delegate a national language *representative* of the emerging Filipino identity was won by Manuel L. Quezon's declaration of Tagalog as *wikang pambansa*.[6] Twenty years later, Tagalog was renamed 'Pilipino' to satisfy the need for a language that would unify despite much diversity in the country (Gonzalez 1980). Right after its declaration, persistent protests against this were loudly waged by Ilocanos, Cebuanos and other major-language speakers. It has not abated until now, cropping up every time an opportunity comes. Non-Tagalogs speakers perceive

---

[4] "Benevolent assimilation" was the official colonial policy of the US government under William McKinley in order to subdue the populace who still waged their guerrilla wars in the countryside all over the country. It also was extended to include economic, social, health, and education systems that were introduced.

[5] This assertion however must be qualified since Filipino culture then and now remains very much Hispanic in its influences. Although Spanish-speakers have dwindled in numbers and classes in schools have been officially dropped, many languages in the Philippines – including Tagalog and Visaya – have kept Spanish loan words. Also, postcolonial theorists, especially the writer Nick Joaquin, believe that Filipino today is a hybrid and cannot be undone.

[6] *Wikang pambansa* can be translated as "national language". In the absence of one language at a time of rebuilding the country and nationalizing after a clearly delineated "postcolonial" period, the leaders of the country had to nominate one that would represent the people and the nation-state.

that the being represented by a language they did not learn as a first language is unacceptable, especially when Visayas islands and Mindanao do not speak Tagalog as lingua franca. Such resistance is difficult to ignore because of the boycott of Tagalog/Filipino. In Cebu one would not want to be heard speaking Tagalog. This same group of critics would rather have English as the country's official language rather than Tagalog/Filipino. Fifty years after Quezon's declaration, the 1987 Constitution of the Republic, Filipino had to be reinstated as the *national* language. Additions from all other vernaculars as well as English, Spanish, Chinese, Hindi, Arabic, and other languages would also be accepted. For the sceptics, if the government admits it is not a complete, well-rounded language – then why privilege it?

For Teresita Maceda (2003), ethnic/linguistic hostilities against Filipino as a national language are more than an issue of linguistics and language planning for educational purposes. In fact, they are an imagined war waged by an elite few colonialists who think within the logic of colonialism. The colonialists prefer English because it is an evolving language when in fact all languages are in the process of limitless change. The elite who distinguish themselves by the language they speak, which betrays their expensive education, lineage, among other indicators of wealth, defend English against Filipino through everyday practice. In the Philippines today, government officials, military officers, judges, teachers, job seekers, journalists, advertisers, all articulate their discourses and interests in English; but when expressing themselves strongly, then they have the vernacular to depend on.

While the politics of language compounded by ethnic allegiances continued to plague the Phillipines, Filipino experienced a boost and a reinvigoration during the 1960s through early 1980s during anti-Marcos activism. Students and academics from universities found it useful to articulate anti-fascist ideology and do mass-organising using Filipino. Through the example of the Community Party of the Philippines and the National Democratic Front, using Filipino in its treatises and publications, the use of this language in schools, television, radio, newspapers, among others became a statement not only against fascism but an expression of anti-status quo resistance in any form (Atienza 1992; Maceda 2003). Since many mass-based organisations' activists and cultural workers did not speak Filipino as a first language, the policy to standardise socialist/leftist literature in the national language showed that a vernacular language could launch a national movement, something that critics of Filipino language believed was not possible. In 1992, the *Komisyon ng Wikang Filipino* was founded to make sure that language policy-making was geared towards the promise that despite choosing Tagalog as the structural basis of Filipino, it will become a richer modern language with a truly national representation.[7]

While the debates on the national language have not abated, the world around has continued to change and with it, the Philippines and its role in world as a postcolonial nation-state. In a globalised world where people from the South find themselves selling labour in the service sectors of first world countries, Filipinos – as endlessly reiterated by its cash-strapped government – are convinced that their English language skills would get them better jobs than other non-English speaking, formerly-colonised peoples.[8] While it may be true, it is also believable that English provides less leverage in the context of subcontracted economies where professionals are valued only by their capacity to speak English more than anything else.[9] With the diaspora of Filipinos to

---

[7] The Commission on the Filipino Language under the auspices of the Office of the President is still operating today, sponsoring literary contests, publishing materials related to language and language policies, among other project. The foremost criticism targeting the commission is its inefficacious in fulfilling its role to develop Filipino.

[8] Walden Bello (2004, 1994), Filipino activist and academic, has written extensively on the Global South's critical view of the existing capitalist economy. For his articles, speeches and interviews see http://waldenbello.org/content/blogcategory/16/31/.

[9] To exemplify this point, subcontracted call centres in the Philippines are powered by a mixture of privately and publicly educated university graduates who are all hired for their ability to speak English. As fodder for First World economies, they sleep during the day and work at night to negate time-space difference between the two hemispheres; they also receive a tiny portion of what their equivalents receive in the North. On the other hand, Filipina domestic helpers in Hong Kong, Singapore and Malaysia are paid higher than their counterparts from Bangladesh, Sri Lanka, Vietnam and Thailand because of their so-called "advantage" of knowing some English. However, it must be pointed out that many who work as servants in these destination countries are actually college graduates, if not some years at tertiary education. It is easy to see how English, taught from

every corner of the world to support a failed neoliberal economy back home, they find themselves stranded in alien cultures while at the same time trying to survive by re-creating a version of the old country in their communities through cultural organisations, food festivals, print materials, among others. The Filipino ethnic newspapers, among other manifestations of adaptation via material culture, are a way to memorialise this re-creation of the old country and at the same time a diary of celebrating the "Australian life" they think they have acquired through photographs, news and essays in the new homeland. It is not surprising to see that in one issue of one of these newspapers, "community news" are comprised of photographs of baptismal ceremonies, weddings, birthdays, sporting events, anniversaries, graduations, and other family events. If ethnic newspapers are a celebration of things "Filipino" – a general recognition of a national character that binds all of the Philippine-born migrants in Australia - then why not use the national language instead of English?

Migrant Print Culture in Australia

A one-time Federal rule in foreign-language press in Australia was the requirement of writing a quarter of its content in English (Birsa-Skofic 1989). This move was most likely an act to ensure some form of tangible integration towards the host society through ethnic media. However, the notion of integration through ethnic media was long preceded by foreign-language publications by and for migrant communities in Australia. The German of *Die Deutsche Post fuer die Australischen Kolonien* published in Adelaide, South Australia in 1848 was the first non-English migrant newspaper in Australia (Gilson and Zubryszcki 1967). Like *L'Italo-Australino* of Francesco Sceusa, published in 1885, it was not published in English and he was mindful to write beautifully to emphasise patriotism. Since an essential aspect of ethnic newspapers was their capacity to mediate between mainstream white Australia and the members of the diaspora, ethnic publications later on needed to accommodate Australia's increasingly multicultural and multiracial society. This official ideology absorbs the different, the other, into the manifold and has a clause that the different, the other, must make some effort to meet white Australia halfway. Slowly converting ethnic media readership into English is one of the ways. Ethnic newspapers, while avenues of multiculturalism, can also be used as a tool for the slow and silent erasure of ethnic differences. Unlike old German and Italian newspapers written in their beloved national languages, and unlike today when Vietnamese and Chinese newspapers still written in their own languages, Filipino-Australian newspapers *then* and *now* publish in English.

The steady arrival of Filipinos in Australia is fairly recent compared with Italians, Germans, Greeks and other groups although the history of Filipino presence in Australia dates back to the late nineteenth century when they were called "Manilamen". Young, male, and unmarried Filipinos were mostly associated with the pearling industry in Darwin in the Northern Territory (Ileto and Sullivan 1993). Official Australian policy put a stop to the immigration of Filipinos to Australia for several decades. Subsequently, the growth of the immigrant group started in the 1970s at a time when Australia had liberalised its immigration policies to non-white peoples. The Filipino-Australian publications began shortly after that. The very first recognisable Filipino-Australian publication in the form of a newsletter was *Bagumbayan*.[10] *Bagumbayan* first appeared in 1977 under the leadership of Larry Rivera. It was a sincere attempt by the young community to gather together an editorial staff that could do a professional job; some of these journalists were Jaime Pimentel, Oscar Landicho and Joe Umali.[11] In 1980, the first tabloid Filipino ethnic newspaper in Australia was issued: *The Philippine Balita.* Under the editorship of Jaime Pimentel who worked with the Fairfax group, this tabloid garnered the attention of the growing Filipino diaspora in Sydney while the community was still in its early stages of organising, in the western suburbs of Sydney.[12] According

primary to college, is instrumental in contributing and perpetuating the unjust division of labour among nations.

[10] *Bagumbayan* is literally translated as "new town". *Bayan* can also mean people, masses, home, country, and nation. In the context of diaspora in Australia, it means "new home", referring to the country of destination. Also, in the Filipino history of spaces, *Bagumbayan* means a special place as it is the name of the place where national hero Jose Rizal was executed by Spanish colonial guards.

[11] Jaime Pimentel, email message to author, 16 March 2010.

[12] Jaime Pimentel, interview with the author, Burwood, Sydney, 06 March 2010.

to its editor at the time, the newspaper was a symbol of accomplishment for the community and Filipinos were truly proud of *Balita.* Many publications have appeared since *Bagumbayan* and *Balita;* some stayed for a long time and some for a few years. In New South Wales, some titles that saw publication and enjoyed the readership of the Filipino community were *Sandigan, The Philippine Community News, The Philippine Herald Newspaper/Magazine, The Philippine Voice, The Filipino Observer, The Pilipino Herald,* and *Filipin-Oz.*[13] Today, there are three existing tabloids and one newsletter in greater Sydney and possibly in the entire New South Wales: *Philippine Community Herald* published by Evelyn Zaragosa, *Bayanihan News* published by Domingo Perdon, *newsPinoy* by Titus Filio and *Philippine Tribune* by Dino Crescini. The early ethnic newspapers were bilingual; however, bilingual here does not mean an equal share in terms of using English and Filipino. Very often the newspapers deliver the "hard" items such as headline news, editorial, opinion columns and feature articles in English. Filipino is relegated to routine sections in the entertainment pages.[14] With the one exception of *Pilipino Herald* that heavily prints news from the Philippines, the Filipino-Australian tabloids have been unabashedly articulating their identity and positioning their ethnicity in English. This is not to say that this should not have been the case; indeed, English has been historically, ideologically and socio-politically present in the nation's colonial past and it is only to be expected for the Filipino Diaspora to perpetuate this. The ease with which Filipino-Australians have expressed themselves in English, proved by their print production, contrast starkly with the case of the Chinese and the Vietnamese publications. According to Professor Tuan Ngoc Nguyen, the sections of all the Vietnamese newspapers in Australia are published in Vietnamese.[15] What is apparent in the Filipino-Australian case is the absence of the need to write in a national language in order to demonstrate national sentiments. Even in the beginning of their practice of ethnic journalism, this diasporic group freely voiced their longing for home in English. Despite the presence of over a hundred languages, several regional languages, and one national language, Filipino-Australians would rather publish in English. There is no contradiction to the migrants of the postcolonial Philippines who have found a *bagumbayan* in Australia.

To further my argument, I would like to cite few exchanges during the interviews conducted for this study and also some data as a result of content analysis. *Bayanihan News* from New South Wales published 75% of its articles in English and 25% in Filipino based on content analysis of the monthly issues published between 2003 and 2005.[16] The most important headlines and sections such as immigration news, community news, editorials were all written in English while articles written in Filipino were poems, recipes, vocabulary words, puzzles, entertainment, personals, announcements, and other routine features found in the last quarter of the newspaper. To be more specific, out of the 375 articles/features (including word lists and puzzles) in the seven issues analysed in 2005 of *Bayanihan News,* only 102 are in Filipino. Furthermore, in 2003, out of 321 articles/features (including word lists and puzzles), 78 were in Filipino. Both figures amount to 25.86%; if word lists and puzzles were excluded in the count, this figure would even be lower.

The same tendency, unfortunately without statistics to back it up, was found in Sydney-based *Philippine Community Herald* that has been running since 1993. In an attempt to shed light on this editorial choice, Perdon, writer for *Bayanihan News,* said that he and his brother, the editor and

---

[13] This enumeration of the Filipino-Australian tabloids does not claim to be exhaustive at this time; archival work, interviews and detective work have been done to gather all the titles. It is possible that there are titles I have not yet found such as *The Filipino Immigrant* which was referenced in a box of materials in the National Library of Australia but is neither in the catalogue nor mentioned at all by any of the sources interviewed.

[14] One exception to this is possibly *Philippine Voice* wherein issues (1990-1991) accessed from the State Library of New South Wales all featured articles in English.

[15] Tuan Ngoc Nguyen, paper presentation, "Vietnamese diasporic culture in print advertising in Australia." in Rhizomes V: Diaspora: Language and Place, University of Queensland, 05 February 2010.

[16] In the year 2003, six issues (January, March, April, May, October and November) and in the year 2005, seven issues were considered (January, February, March, May, June, September, December). Although the missing issues do not complete the years in the study, I still believe that the consistency and pattern shown in what was available are enough to demonstrate the use of English and Filipino languages in Filipino ethnic newspapers using this publication.

publisher, initially wanted a paper written mostly in Filipino.[17] However, he felt that the paper was not as well received because most of its content was in Filipino and so they published more articles in English. When asked what he thought the reason was for this preference to read in English, Perdon – with the first-generation migrants in mind – said that Filipinos would rather consume something in English based on the language's imagined superiority that they have brought with them to Australia. Many of the migrants in the past few years were professionals who have learned to privilege English at home, in schools and at work; an unmistakeable sign of middle-class values and lower-middleclass longing practiced "back home". The appeal of English – the language of the powerful –is without a doubt even more attractive to the diasporic community members given the primacy of English in Australia. Indeed, reading *one's own* ethnic newspaper in Filipino/Tagalog can be deemed as alienating, first in the white-dominant surrounding, and second, to someone who has been taught all his life that Filipino (language) is inferior. English has always been something strangely familiar; never natural but nevertheless always present.

While Perdon is concerned with the use of English among first-generation Filipino-Australians, another community journalist deals with the issue of language from the vantage point of the second-generation or the 1.5.[18] *newsPinoy*, the newest publication to be introduced in the community, is a tabloid similar to *mx* given away for free in the train stations in the city. The visually attractive paper is supported only by its advertisers from community businesses and is an all-English paper. According to its editor Titus Filio, the ethnic newspapers today are not for first-generation migrants any more.[19] For him, the function of informing the second-generation – kids whose first language is English – is more useful to the community at large than their parents who are already more or less involved. Filio also feels that by giving the paper a less formal, less rigid look, his tabloid will attract more Filipino-Australians who cannot read in the Filipino language at all; at most these younger members of the community can understand and speak a little of Filipino.

In Melbourne, the publisher of *Philippine Times,* George Gregorio, revealed that his children speak English fluently and some French; they could orally understand Bicolano, a major regional language used in the south of Manila (because both him and his wife speak it at home), but they do not speak or read in Filipino.[20] *Philippine Tribune*, a Sydney newsletter edited by Dino Crescini, like *newsPinoy,* is an all-English publication. For Crescini, reaching out to non-Filipino readers, such as white-husbands of Filipinas, is of utmost importance and is an unmistakeable sign that the community is part of the Australian body. Also, it was intuitive for American Jesuit-educated Crescini to write in English, the language he spoke at home, at work , and in school all his life.[21] Despite differences in the circumstances of their migration, and possibly differences in ages, educational backgrounds, linguistic backgrounds, socio-political persuasions, among other factors, it is clear that the ease by which these Filipino-Australian community journalists have used English in aiding the migrant group to make sense of their evolving identity and position through their publications. The ease by which they articulate in English is reciprocated by the same untroubled reception of the members to consume their news in the language. Whether it is social class, linguistic divisions in the diversity-rich Philippines, educational distinction, colonial subjectification, or other reasons that the entire community have elected English, the choice *affects* the position Filipino-Australians occupy in the Australian society.

Invisible and Liminal

In an anthology entitled *Ethnic press in Australia*, several scholars have predicted the future of ethnic newspapers: "the writing is on the wall, and the writing is in English" (Burke 1989: 245).

---

[17] Renato Perdon, interview with the author, Kensington, Sydney, 17 January 2010.

[18] Generation 1.5 is used to refer to children of immigrants who were born in the Philippines but migrated to Australia at a young age which means their early schooling was completed in Australia. An in-depth look at them is done by Arlene Torres-D'Mello (2003).

[19] Titus Filio, interview with the author, Doonside, Sydney, August 2009.

[20] George Gregorio, interview with the author, Federation Square, Melbourne, 27 January 2010.

[21] Dino Crescini, interview with the author, Blacktown, Sydney, 16 February 2010.

This statement is prompted by the observation that ethnic presses' power over the migrant communities continue to diminish as younger members of the community no longer need to adapt in the way the older ones had to – successfully or not successfully. According to this paradigm, the one significant factor in the eventual obsolescence of the ethnic newspaper is the second and third generations' ability to speak like Australians, thus, they have no need for a newspaper to give "voice" to them; a battle cry of early ethnic newspapers. They have no desire to belong because they already do; at least in a deeper, more integrated way than their migrant-parents. However, as in cases of the Chinese and Vietnamese publications cited above, the flow of immigration does not halt all at once; first-generation migrants do not disappear altogether to be replaced by the second-generation. Newcomers will continue to go to their respective ethnic "ghettoes", snoop around in the stores and pick up a newspaper that calls to them in the name of nostalgia. The writing on the wall may perhaps *not* remain in English at all.

However, as presented here, the Filipino ethnic newspapers in Australia did not follow the common path of the foreign language press that bipassed the stages of national language-use to bilingualism, or not at all. The Philippine-born community, it seems, appears to be safeguarded from the difficulties that many ethnic groupings have experienced due to their non-English speaking members often perceived as communicatively poor. In this manner, Filipinos appear to be the "model minority" for not being too difficult; in fact, they even have a little American English inflection here and there. Despite this, Filipino-Australians' cultural tractability and acculturation to the dominant society consigns them to a space shadowed by another shade of otherness. As in the case of the University of Wollongong's Centre for Multicultural Studies and Office of Government Information and Advertising joint project, the Filipino-Australian community, despite sharing a space defined by class, race and a culture of otherness in Australia, was simply an outsider (again) because they chose to publish in English. In this context, if there was a minority group that did not make the selection as they did, it would be Indian-Australians; both of them are English-speaking, postcolonial developing nations in Asia. For whatever intention this study was designed to serve – "essentially a manual for media planners rather than a sociological study" – Filipino-Australian community (as well as other English-speaking immigrants) remained outside their remit (Pe-Pua and Morrissey, 1996: 3). But what does it *mean* not to belong to such a study? It means, simplistically, that they belong to another category: "English-language ethnic newspaper press in Australia" which sounds like a contradiction.

Although it may be possible for the same government agency to plan a part two of the study – which could include Filipinos, Indians, South Africans – it is not likely to happen any time in the near future. But what does it *mean* not to be considered an urgent case for "media planning"? There is no easy answer right now. The simple case is that the very exclusionary and binary design of the study – English versus non-English – is a good indication that those who use English (even if they are not Australian) are "readable" enough. They can be assimilated into the English-speaking (though non-white immigrants) group. To assume the visibility of the Filipino ethnic group in Australia due to their English, however, emphasizes their even greater invisibility because of (mis)categorisation as already pointed out. This invisibility, a status often established through practices, performances, privileges and rights accorded to the migrant in relation to the natural-born citizen, is known feature of diasporic groups. However, the opacity, the non-presence of the outsider such as the racialised and sexualised Filipino(a) is further subsumed in the liminal space that is neither white and dominant nor coloured and subjugated. What Homi Bhabha (1990) introduced as the "in-between", the interstices of the racial, sexual and class hierarchies, can be used to describe the liminality brought about by the use of English of a group of people not "meant" to benefit from the power that emanates from it.

The twice-invisible Filipino-Australian, as argued in this essay, can further be extended if the "media-planning" objectives of the sponsors of the study are to be executed in the grander scale of social and educational services for the minority of the country. In the Philippines the public education system and civil governance are considered the "benevolent" gift of the American occupation, but the use of English can be a silent injury that bleeds a diasporic group in a multicultural society. It is even more so when the community itself does not perceive it at all.

Indeed, the history of the "love affair" between the English language and the Filipino people can only be adequately described as shadowy and in-between; both injurious and discriminating at the same time. The transportation of the "language question" from Manila to Sydney, the elitism of English over Filipino, and the imperialism of Filipino over other vernacular languages as a result of the country's colonial history are all major influences that add to the complexity of this relationship. The preference to use English among the middle class – the social group editors and professional

migrants come from – is another telling factor in the making of ethnic newspapers among the Filipino community in Australia. This historically determined and conscious decision to use English has – no matter how "natural" it is made to appear – defined the community's position in multicultural Australia in compromising ways. It remains to be seen if the seeming position of leverage brought about by the use of English will manifest itself by increasing the Filipinos' liminal space within the marginal space that migrant communities occupy in Australia.

Bibliography

Anderson, Benedict. Imagined communities: Reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism. London: Verso, 1991.

Atienza, Monico. Kilusang Pambansa-Demokratiko sa Wika. Quezon City: U.P. Sentro ng Wikang Filipino, 1992.

Bagumbayan, January, 1977.

Barbour, Stephen and Cathie Carmichael. Language and nationalism in Europe. New York : Oxford University Press, 2000.

Bello, Walden. Deglobalization: Ideas for a new world economy. London; New York: ZED Books, 2004.

Bello, Walden, Shea Cunningham and Bill Rau. Dark victory: The United States, structural adjustment, and global poverty. London: Pluto, 1994.

Bhabha, Homi, ed. Nation and narration. London; NY; Routledge, 1990.

Birsa-Skofic, Irena. "The Slovene press in Australia." The ethnic press in Australia. Ed. Abe Wade Ata & Colin Ryan. Melbourne: Academia Press & Footprint Publications, 1989.

Braham, Mark. "The Jewish press in Australia." The ethnic press in Australia. Ed. Abe Wade Ata & Colin Ryan. Melbourne: Academia Press & Footprint Publications, 1998.

Burke, John. "Greek newspapers in Australia." The ethnic press in Australia. Ed. Abe Wade Ata & Colin Ryan. Melbourne: Academia Press & Footprint Publications, 1989.

Castles, Stephen. Challenges to national identity and citizenship: A comparative study of immigration and society in Germany, France and Australia. NSW: University of Wollongong, 1999.

Castles, Stephen. The challenge of multiculturalism: Global changes and Australian experiences. NSW: Centre for Multicultural Studies, University of Wollongong, 1992.

Castles, Stephen. The changing character of racism. NSW: Centre for Multicultural Studies, University of Wollongong, 1989.

Contantino, Renato. The Philippines: A past revisited. Quezon City: Tala Publication Services, 1975.

Gilson, M. & J. Zubryzscki. The foreign language press in Australia 1848-1964. Canberra: ANU Press, 1967.

Gonzalez, Andrew B. "Language planning in multilingual countries: The case of the Philippines", 2003 www.sil.org . Downloaded 22 March 2010.

Gonzalez, Andrew B. Language and nationalism: The Philippine experience thus far, Quezon City; Ateneo de Manila, 1980.

Hage, Ghassan, ed. Arab-Australians today: Citizenship and belonging. Victoria: Melbourne University Press, 2002

Hage, Ghassan. White nation: Fantasies of white supremacy in a city multicultural society. Sydney: Pluto Press, 1998.

Hau, Caroline and Victoria Tinio. "Language policy and ethnic relations in the Philippines." Fighting words: Language policy and ethnic relations in Asia. MA: The Massachusetts Institute of Technology Press, 2003.

Ileto, Reynaldo & R. Sullivan. Discovering Australasia: Essays on Philippine-Australian interactions. Townsville: James Cook University, 1993.

Maceda, Teresita. "The Filipino national language: Discourse on power." Downloaded www.sealang.net, 22 March 2010.

May, Stephen. Language and minority rights : ethnicity, nationalism, and the politics of language. Harlow, Essex, England : New York : Longman, 2001.

Pe-Pua, Rogelia & M. Morrissey. Content analysis of Australian non-English language newspapers: Greek, Maltese, Persian, Polish. Canberra: Office of Government Information and Advertising, 1996.

Pe-Pua, Rogelia, and M. Morrissey. Content analysis of Australian non-English language newspapers: Croatian, Italian, Macedonian, Serbian, Turkish. Canberra: Office of Government Information and Advertising, 1995.

Pe-Pua, Rogelia, and M. Morrissey. Content analysis of Australian non-English language newspapers: Arabic, Chinese, Portuguese, Spanish, Vietnamese. NSW: Office of government Information and Advertising, 1994.

Racelis, Mary and Judy Celine Ick. Bearers of benevolence: The Thomasites and public education in the Philippines. Pasig: Anvil, 2001.

Rafael, Vicente. Contracting colonialism: Translation and Christian conversion in Tagalog society under early Spanish rule. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1988.

Tosco, Amedeo. "Features of early ethnic Italo-Australian newspapers: A case study of L'Italo Australiano (1885)." Australian journalism monographs. Vol 7. Queensland: Griffith University Centre for Public Culture and Ideas, 2005.

Torres-D'Mello, Arlene. Brown Outside, White Inside: A Study of Identity Development Among Children of Filipino Immigrants in Australia. Quezon City: Giraffe Books, 2003.

Tupas, T. Ruanni. Language as a problem of development: Ideological debates and comprehensive education in the Philippines. AILA Review 22: 23-35, 2009.

Walden Bello website. http://waldenbello.org/content/blogcategory/16/31/

Shirlita Espinosa
University of Sydney
sesp8361@uni.sydney.edu.au

Institute *of* Advanced Study

Durham University

City Futures: Aspirations and Urban Imaginaries in Delhi

KAVITA RAMAKRISHNAN

Urban Restructuring in Delhi

Aspirations for transforming Delhi into a 'global city' can be traced to the economic liberalization of the early 1990s and to the changing culture of consumption.[1] The 'middle class', though ambiguous in representation, became idealized in dominant political and media discourse for both its expanded purchasing power and link to the globalizing world.[2] Economic restructuring enabled a growing middle class to attain a "new cultural standard", according to Fernandes, which moves beyond notions of consumption to describe a class with the ability to "negotiate India's new relationship with the global economy in both cultural and economic terms"[3]. The emergence of a distinctive, if still diverse, middle-class identity has greatly influenced politics and development, and is critical to understanding socio-spatial trends in Delhi and other urban centres in India. By embracing particular lifestyles and attitudes, members of the new Indian middle class have engaged in the "politics of forgetting", a process identified by Fernandes as one where certain social groups are erased from the political fabric and national vision.[4] The attempted construction of a citizenship on the middle-class identity frequently serves an exclusionary purpose -- to remove marginalized groups from political discourse and usher in a spatial hegemony of the middle classes.[5]

Drawing from Neil Smith's classic text on revanchism, literally the "revenge" or punishing mindset and behaviour towards those considered "unwanted" or "outsiders" to the city, the following section will briefly outline the various spatial politics associated with the growing middle-class involvement in urban restructuring.[6] [7] [8] In tracking Delhi's shift to a revanchist city, Dupont considers the progression to be conventional and highlights the links between neoliberal economic reforms and the emergence of revanchism in other cities; however, she notes that the main difference between post-liberalization Delhi and cities in the West is the large number of people working in the informal sector, leading to high levels of financial insecurity and social vulnerability among many

---

[1] Veronique Dupont, "The Dream of Delhi as a Global City", *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* 35 (2011).

[2] Leela Fernandes, "Restructuring the New Middle Class in Liberalizing India", *Comparative Studies of South Asia, Africa, and the Middle East* 41 (2000).

[3] Ibid., 93.

[4] Leela Fernandes, "The Politics of Forgetting: Class Politics, State Power, and the Restructuring of Urban Space in India", *Urban Studies* 41 (2004).

[5] Ibid.

[6] Phil Hubbard, *City: Key Ideas in Geography* (New York: Routledge, 2006).

[7] Neil Smith, *The New Urban Frontier: Gentrification and the Revanchist City* (London: Routledge, 1996).

[8] Neil Smith, "New Globalism, New Urbanism: Gentrification as Global Urban Strategy", *Antipode* 34 (2002).

urban residents.[9] The economic gap is exacerbated by social groups who have benefited from the formal sector, and are increasingly vocal about their desire for certain urban aesthetics in spite of the poor impact on the livelihoods and living space of the urban . Finally, the re-appropriation of space by middle-class residents has been legitimized by both legal structures and state policies. The transformation of Delhi, identified as one of "bourgeois environmentalism converg[ing] with the disciplining zeal of the state", has strong implications for the future of Delhi and inclusion of the poor in the urban fabric.[10] However, similar to the observations of Truelove and Mawdsley, it is important to insert a cautionary note and make clear the varied composition of the "middle class".[11] Far from homogenous, equal or inclusive, the middle class represents differing levels of consumption abilities, lifestyle practices, mindset regarding contemporary culture, and engagement in urban development, to name a few. Though nebulous in definition, the middle class still holds a strong appeal, as fluid boundaries hold the promise of attaining the privilege and distinction associated with this class.[12] [13]

The removal of poor and working classes from public space is a phenomenon noted by many scholars studying urban transformations in Delhi. Baviskar problematizes the "bourgeois dream of re-making the city" as the primary reason the urban poor are denied their rights to habitation in the city.[14] Often, disciplining attitudes towards the poor are demonstrated in middle-class involvement in formal-action networks and citizens' groups. The frequent success of citizens' groups in making cities more orderly is partially due to changing citizen-government relationships; this has given the middle class more political manoeuvrability and "invited space" in which to assert claims to the city.[15] [16] A prime example of expanded middle-class access to governance mechanisms and opportunity to control and sanitize space is the Bhagidari program. Inaugurated by Delhi Chief Minister Sheila Dixit in 2000, the program institutionalized existing citizens' groups or Resident Welfare Associations (RWAs) within authorized colonies, which then interface with local government structures on a range of local affairs and the delivery of public works. Although the Bhagidari scheme can be seen as an opportunity to introduce participatory democracy and empower citizens, the inclusiveness of this project has been questioned due to the largely middle-class dominated presence and leverage.[17] For instance, residents provide police with a list of all "authorized" workers who are allowed to enter the community, in effect allowing the groups to discuss who "belongs" in residential spaces.[18] According to Baud and Nainan, this activism has served to mainly expand rights for the middle class, while limiting rights of those considered "unwanted".[19]

---

[9] Dupont, "The Dream of Delhi as a Global City".

[10] Amita Baviskar, "Between Violence and Desire: Space, Power, and Identity in the Making of Metropolitan Delhi", *International Social Science Journal* 55 (2003): 93.

[11] Yaffa Truelove and Emma Mawdsley, "Discourses of Citizenship and Criminality in Clean, Green Delhi", in *A Companion to the Anthropology of India*, ed. Isabelle Clark-Deces 407-425 (London: Blackwell Publishers, 2011).

[12] Fernandes and Heller (2006) believe the middle class is crucial to deciding political developments and "a well-formed middle class can coordinate its interest with subordinate classes as in cases of liberal hegemony, or it can side with reaction" (506). Though this binary oversimplifies middle-class political values, especially considering the aforementioned difficulties in even classifying the middle class, the "reaction" has been an identified trend and is worth exploring.

[13] This paper intentionally focuses on the middle class, despite the involvement of the upper class and elites in anti-poor urban restructuring, in order to both demonstrate revanchist trends and explore an emerging class with the power to shape spatial politics.

[14] Baviskar, "Between Violence and Desire: Space, Power, and Identity in the Making of Metropolitan Delhi,": 93.

[15] Jonathan Shapiro Anjaria, "Guardians of the Bourgeois City: Citizenship, Public Space, and Middle-Class Activism in Mumbai", *City & Community* 8 (2009).

[16] Marie-Helene Zerah, "Participatory Governance in Urban Management and the Shifting Geometry of Power in Mumbai", *Development and Change* 40 (2009).

[17] Poulomi Chakrabarti, "Inclusion of Exclusion? Emerging Effects of Middle-Class Citizen Participation on Delhi's Urban Poor", *Institute of Development Studies (IDS) Bulletin*, no. 38 (2008).

[18] Sanjay Srivastava, "Urban Spaces, Disney-Divinity, and Moral Middle Classes in Delhi," *Economic and Political Weekly* 44 (2009).

[19] Isa Baud and Navtej Nainan, "'Negotiated Spaces' for Representation in Mumbai: Ward Committees, Advanced Locality Management and the Politics of Middle-Class Activism", *Environment and Urbanization* 20 (2008).

The actions of the middle class are more than simply measures to ensure security and orderliness in immediate residential spheres; they represent how the middle class is more vocal in restructuring larger urban spaces.[20] [21] [22] Through increasing civic engagement, members of the middle class have often become "agents of urban restructuring", challenging issues such as illegality and urban aesthetics through the legal system.[23] Writing about the criminalization associated with illegal water practices among the poor, Truelove and Mawdsley note that a binary form of citizenship emerges through the legal discourse: the model citizen is depicted as one who engages in practices deemed sustainable and contributes to the progress of the city, while the "criminal" is considered an impediment to realizing the city's future.[24] As the following section will demonstrate, the Commonwealth Games only furthered the trends of anti-poor spatial restructuring.

Commonwealth Games 2010

Preparations for the 2010 Commonwealth Games (CWG) set into motion many of the developments dramatically changing the Delhi landscape. When examining the political discourse used to frame the event, much of the language focused on Delhi's status and visibility on the world stage, as well as the perceived golden opportunity to capitalize on economic benefits from hosting the CWG. Yet, the importance of the Games for the city-visioning process resonated well beyond the duration of the event: as a launching point for world-class city ambitions, the Games led to an implementation of policies with spatial-ordering repercussions for the present and future of the city. In particular, the urban poor suffered the most, as issues of illegality and encroachment came to the forefront of the city makeover process. Alongside the elimination of "unsightly" jobs, over 200,000 people in Delhi experienced forcible eviction between 2004 and the start of the Games through similar beautification measures.[25] The communities living on the River Yamuna banks were especially targeted for clearance due to their proximity to the Commonwealth Games Village. In 2010, residents from 1,000 homes were expelled for "security" reasons, though during the removal process, police were forthright in citing the unsightliness of black plastic covers used on the roofs of the informal dwellings.[26] The removal of these settlements was ultimately a move to present a sanitized version of Delhi and ensure an unmarred view of the city to visitors.[27]

According to Baviskar, even though infrastructure investment and promises of job creation related to the "extraordinary" event had little impact –- and often negatively affected the urban working class -- the compelling vision for the city initiated a general "urban buzz" over the planned changes.[28] She claims the Games introduced a sense of excitement over the future of the city, as shaped by this particular event, binding together citizens across social strata.[29] The internalizing of world-class aesthetics and developments among citizens of Delhi signifies the importance of

---

[20] Arvind Rajagopal, "The Violence of Commodity Aesthetics: Hawkers, Demolition Raids, and a New Regime of Consumption", *Social Text* 19 (2001).

[21] Baviskar, "Between Violence and Desire: Space, Power, and Identity in the Making of Metropolitan Delhi".

[22] Asher Ghertner, "Rule by Aesthetics: World-Class City Making in Delhi," in *Worlding Cities: Asian Experiments and the Art of Being Global,* ed. Ananya Roy and Aihwa Ong (Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, 2011).

[23] Anjaria, "Guardians of the Bourgeois City: Citizenship, Public Space, and Middle-Class Activism in Mumbai",: 392.

[24] Yaffa Truelove and Emma Mawdsley, "Discourses of Citizenship and Criminality in Clean, Green Delhi".

[25] Habitat International Coalition-Housing and Land Rights Network (HIC-HLRN), *Planned Dispossession: Forced Eviction and the 2010 Commonwealth Games, Fact-Finding Mission Report*, 14 (Delhi: HIC-HLRN, 2011).

[26] Habitat International Coalition-Housing and Land Rights Network (HIC-HLRN), *The 2010 Commonwealth Games: Whose Wealth? Whose Commons?*, (Delhi: HIC-HLRN, 2010).

[27] HIC-HLRN, *Planned Dispossession: Forced Eviction and the 2010 Commonwealth Games, Fact-Finding Mission Report*

[28] Amita Baviskar, "Spectacular Events, City Spaces, and Citizenship: the Commonwealth Games in Delhi," in *Urban Navigations: Politics, Space and the City in South Asia*, ed. Jonathan Shapiro Anjaria and Colin McFarlane (London: Routledge, 2011).

[29] Ibid.

government-level visioning processes. Ghertner also observed a similar phenomenon when interviewing urban poor communities displaced in preparation for the CWG.[30] Though the residents expressed their devastation at being evicted, many of them also vocalized the necessity for cleaning up informal settlements in order for a successful CWG. In one account, a woman articulates her vision of a future Delhi as the following: "Delhi will be a beautiful city, totally neat and clean. All the slums will be removed and there will only be rich people".[31] Similar aspirations for an ordered Delhi exist even among inhabitants of informal spaces, in spite of the consequences that such an ordering has for their dwelling and livelihoods. However, the internalization of this future imaginary raises larger questions of individual positionality: it remains unclear at what stage and for which reasons people align personal aspirations with dominant visions of the future.[32] Thus, the CWG created an urgency and platform for realizing a "world-class" city, and much of the emergent legal discourse and attitudes surrounding public space reveal a troubling paradox.

Parameters for *City Futures*

Using the impact of revanchism and the Commonwealth Games on Delhi's urban space as a research launching point, the research proposes to deconstruct *city futures* among selected urbanites. Though the future vision articulated by the Delhi government emphasizes the making of a "world-class city", there is a need to explore how residents outside of state and media discourses articulate their own aspirations for temporal and spatial lived experiences. The interconnectedness of time and space is critical here: as Massey argues, an individual's articulated trajectory is a relational "time-space" embedded with specific power geometries.[33] Understanding that spatiality is continually being (re)-constructed and (re)-negotiated, the research introduces the concept of *city futures*. As used here, *city futures* refer to subjective *claims to urban space*, ideas of *belonging and citizenship*, and *resistance* within the city. This framework is critical to grasping how people *perceive* their own access to space -- on physical, social, and political levels -- and ultimately, how this fits into ideas of their "right to the city", both in terms of the present and future. The three themes are thus significant to theorizing *city futures* and will be elaborated on further in the following section.

The exploration of *city futures* by no means attempts to simplify the complexities in conceptualizing space or those present within the urban experience; indeed, the theorization of *city futures* seeks to move past a limiting definition to highlight the varied networks and relationships occurring in an urban setting. By maintaining flexible boundaries to *city futures*, narratives are more likely to reflect the positionality of Delhi residents in relation to development trends. Similarly, any examination of evicted and redeveloped spaces must acknowledge the complexity of social space in that identities and resistance are not only inscribed onto space, but are also constructed by it. The parameters serve instead to ground *city futures* for purposes of theoretical analysis, while bearing in mind the multiplicity of the spatial experience.

Rather than focusing on individual variation, this research centres on how individuals from specific communities share and collectively situate themselves within (or against) dominant articulations of city futures. By comparing such aspirations to changing city dynamics and top-down articulated visions, the research ultimately seeks to understand the extent to which a *city future* is inclusive or exclusive. Recent literature has pointed to the uneven "capacity to aspire" between groups, where limited capabilities restrict the scale of aspirations, especially among the urban poor.[34] [35] This research acknowledges the differential capacity that education, gender, socio-economic status, etc. has on an individual's ability to conceptualize the future beyond basic needs and short-term imagining; however, it is argued here that Delhi as a forward-looking city has increased residents' consciousness of futures due to state and media attention. Therefore, this is not an explicit discussion on differing groups' ability to express and conceive of aspirations. Instead, this study pursues aspirations differently: the perceptions of and actions within changing spaces *now*, and the correlation to where residents envision themselves *later*.

---

[30] Ghertner, "Rule by Aesthetics: World-Class City Making in Delhi".
[31] Ibid., 15.
[32] Ibid.
[33] Doreen Massey, *For Space* (Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, 2005).
[34] Arjun Appadurai, "Capacity to Aspire: Culture and Terms of Recognition", in *Culture and Public Action*, ed. Vijayendra Rao and Michael Walton, (Stanford: Stanford University Press).
[35] Dev Nathan, "Capabilities and Aspirations", *Economic and Political Weekly* 40 (2005).

Three Themes Informing *City Futures*

The three themes chosen to capture personal aspirations for *city futures* among Delhi residents include *claims to urban space*, *belonging and citizenship*, and *resistance*. These themes are representative and relevant to *city futures* because they speak to larger issues of urban justice and the future of socio-spatial relations in the city. This section will focus on exploring the framework supporting *city futures* and creating logical connections within and between themes.

The first theme, *claims to urban space*, is one means of deconstructing the urban experience, especially in relation to the rapid developments transforming the city. In order to understand how various social groups claim and are afforded space, it is useful to map socio-spatial exclusion and inclusion. More than just separation, Baviskar documents an emotional response to the "other" which refers to deep-seated "bourgeois anxieties" of being in close proximity to the poor, for fear of contamination, criminality, aesthetic appeal, etc.[36] Dickey observes this mentality in employer-servant relationships where the former asserts material and symbolic boundaries to counteract class mixing and "pollution" within private spaces.[37] Even when the class separation is minimal, employers buttress status differences through markers of speech, possessions and clothing. The perceived threat that servants pose to space can also be seen in the employer control of movement inside and through spaces. Though Dickey's study reflects class-derived spatial expectations within the domestic sphere, many of these trends are also prevalent in public spaces, leading to constant negotiation of both class relationships and space utilization.

In order to realize a bourgeois urban vision, the Indian state has also been actively reclaiming public space. Yet, the government has frequently exhibited an ambiguous policy on how to accomplish this, especially in terms of managing public space and beautifying the city. Arabindoo, writing on Chennai, illustrates the municipal authority's intentions to transform the Marina Beach, and the problems it has encountered in satisfying middle-class desires.[38] She notes that there "is not one single interpretation of the bourgeois imaginary, thereby creating a problem of fit with even some bourgeois members of society".[39] Despite a strong middle-class aesthetic and state drive for urban restructuring, the translation into a resonant city-visioning process does not always occur. Though discussing Chennai, Arabindoo's observations illustrate the complex identities of groups claiming space and expressing imaginaries.[40] This context helps frame current trends in major Indian cities and sets the scene for observing spatial processes.

Another component crucial to *claims to urban space* is exploring how people simultaneously perceive and utilize time and space in their urban experience. In the context of 'city futures', exploration of time and space, or the spatio-temporal experience, is important in considering where/how urban residents locate themselves in discourses of city imaginaries. This component is influenced by May and Thrift's idea of "timespace", which conceptualizes the multiplicity of the urban experience through the daily social practice of managing various time and space issues, whether real or imagined.[41] The connection to future trajectories on various scales is also apparent (individual, familial, communal, city), since "timespace" refers to a "particular sense of time [which] comes into being and moves forward to frame…understandings and actions".[42] The security of one's future (time) has implications for how urban residents feel about space and their comfort in utilizing space.

Jeffrey further illustrates the connections between time and space through an anthropological study of educated, unemployed, lower-middle class young men in India, who experience and

---

[36] Baviskar, "Between Violence and Desire: Space, Power, and Identity in the Making of Metropolitan Delhi".

[37] Sara Dickey, "Permeable Homes: Domestic Service, Household Space, and the Vulnerability of Class Boundaries in Urban India", *American Ethnologist* 27 (2000).

[38] Pushpa Arabindoo, "'City of Sand': Stately Re-imagination of Marina Beach in Chennai", *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* 35.2 (2011).

[39] Ibid., 381.

[40] Ibid.

[41] Jon May and Nigel Thrift, "Introduction," in *Timespace: Geographies of Temporality*, ed. Jon May and Nigel Thrift, (London: Routledge, 2001).

[42] Ibid., 42.

engage in "timepass", or the temporal limbo arising from stalled future trajectories.[43] [44] As a result of persistent unemployment and inability to fulfil societal milestones despite the investment in higher education, these men experience a sense of the "in-between" according to Jeffrey. The occupation of this interstitial space has psychological ramifications for the men, as they undergo temporal anxiety, feelings of detachment and social subordination, as well as at times, hope. In a similar way that "timepass" reflects larger economic grievances and exclusion from the perceived benefits of globalization, uncovering the various emotions associated with people's future in the city, resulting from urban aestheticization and "world-class" city developments, can give insight to claims to space.

The second theme, *belonging and citizenship,* seeks to understand citizenship beyond de facto rights, focusing instead on the practice of citizenship in public spaces and through everyday spatial practices. The distinction is emphasized here: without experiencing a sense of belonging in quotidian spaces and actions, citizenship fails to be inclusive. According to Painter and Philo, any discussion of citizenship is incomplete without acknowledging the existence of an informal citizenship, powerful in its own right, which not only influences institutionalized rights but also acts as a separate entity to set symbolic boundaries and limitations on the belonging of others.[45] The authors make the powerful observation that citizenship does not automatically confer belonging:

> If people cannot be present in public spaces…without feeling uncomfortable, victimized and basically 'out of place', then it must be questionable whether or not these people can be recognized as citizens at all; or at least, whether they will regard themselves as full citizens of their host community able to exist on equal footing with other people who seem perfectly 'at home' when moving about in public spaces.[46]

Similarly, Holston presents the idea of a "differentiated citizenship", or a citizenship based on differentiating "others" through socially entrenched reminders that despite their lawful citizenship, a distance remains between their experienced rights and that of a privileged citizen.[47]

In conjunction with symbolic boundaries, actual demarcated spaces in a landscape can strongly convey who belongs and the types of behaviours sanctioned within spatial boundaries. Describing the utilization of land ordinances in Minnesota to prohibit the cultural use of slaughterhouses by Hmong immigrants, Trudeau observes the emergence of a "normative geography", which maps boundaries and determines space based on a hegemonic view of belonging and allowable practices.[48] In Delhi, assertive reactions to perceived transgressions of spatial order occur also, as evidenced by the revanchist city processes; the sanitization of space has clear overtones for inclusive urban citizenship and the right to the city.

Even though symbolic and spatial boundaries enforce belonging, everyday practices can highlight how urban residents negotiate belonging. One such example is walking, and de Certeau credits this corporal activity with creating attachment due to the accumulated effects of knowledge and memory associated with this space.[49] In this same way, Secor suggests that the urban traveller, by enacting the everyday practice of walking, "becomes an active participant in the production of difference, identity and citizenship" and ultimately engages in a type of spatial narrative that is political, whether practicing overt strategies of staking claim or tactics of subversion.[50] Everyday practices thus have powerful implications for how people perceive and negotiate belonging, and the level of citizenship experienced.

---

[43] Craig Jeffrey, "Timepass: Youth, Class, and Time Among Unemployed Young Men in India", *American Ethnologist* 37 (2010).

[44] Craig Jeffrey, *Timepass: Youth, Class and the Politics of Waiting in India* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2010).

[45] Joe Painter and Chris Philo, "Spaces of Citizenship: an Introduction", *Political Geography* 14 (1995).

[46] Ibid., 115.

[47] James Holston, *Insurgent Citizenship: Disjunctions of Democracy and Modernity in Brazil* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2008).

[48] Daniel Trudeau, "Politics of Belonging in the Construction of Landscapes: Place-Making, Boundary-Drawing, and Exclusion," *Cultural Geographies* 13 (2006).

[49] Referenced in Tovi Fenster, "The Right to the Gendered City: Different Formulations of Belonging in Everyday Life," *Journal of Gender Studies* 14 (2005).

[50] Anna Secor, "There is an Istanbul that Belongs to Me": Citizenship, Space and Identity in the City", *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 94 (2004): 358, 363.

The third theme, *resistance*, moves the discussion beyond only physical space relevant to where people live and work, but also to the processes by which people gain greater space for affecting political change in response to their marginalization and exclusion. The distinction at which an everyday practice becomes a symbol of contestation has been debated by authors such as Pile, who notes the tension between romanticizing the mundane and recognizing the variety of ways in which people assert their rights.[51] Pile suggests resolving this issue by understanding the "context in which acts of resistance take place – and significantly, the position of people within networks of power".[52] Using this measure, Pile points to resistance even as "remembering or dreaming of something better", which can underscore the articulation of individual future trajectories and where urban residents envision their space in the city.[53] Along similar lines, Miraftab and Willis advocate examining "situated practices of citizenship" which recognize the capacity of the excluded to frame conditions of injustice -- this process in itself informs both spaces for living and socio-political engagement and resistance.[54]

Bayat suggests the current global restructuring and shift towards a neoliberal state apparatus has introduced a different space for political activism, termed "quiet encroachment".[55] As a result, people engage in non-collective, protracted subversion in order to support their basic needs and livelihoods; some examples illustrated by Bayat include infringement on land or the illegal accessing of water and electricity.[56] It is argued that *city futures*, as conceptualized by the urban poor, is important in identifying the types of strategies undertaken for negotiating political space and access to services.

Yet, it is important to note that people may actually situate themselves within hegemonic futures -- whether it be resignedly, indifferently, reluctantly, fatalistically, or even excitedly -- that negatively impact their livelihoods and residential space. Recent literature has demonstrated trends in Delhi of world-class aesthetics and future city ideals permeating from government structures to various social groups, leading to varying degrees of acceptance of development projects even among urban poor communities.[57] [58] The internalization of city futures by those who stand to lose the most speaks to an interesting urban psychology, that upon further examination can reveal under which circumstances ideas of sanitized and disciplined space are embraced. Thus, this project seeks to avoid the automatic assumption of resistance with the understanding that the opposite could be true, or even a combination where in certain situations subversive tactics are utilized and in others, an acceptance or even a belief in the appropriateness of exclusionary practices exists.

Identifying the hegemonic manipulation of *city futures* to promote a unified vision can help to appreciate at what point (and if at all) contestation occurs on an individual basis, as people internalize or resist such visions. Whether residents act within or against certain futures, a reworking of spatial imaginaries occurs in order to situate oneself in relation to the articulated vision. In a study of land protests among Brazilian rural workers, Wolford demonstrates an instance in which such a reworking held implications for resistance.[59] By reframing space so that it could no longer be viewed without acknowledging the violations of citizenship rights, protestors were able to mobilize around issues of land redistribution. More specifically, workers took the spatial frontier that they were accustomed to, and "used it to create a political frontier…they reframed space that was physically occupied by powerful actors and presented it as morally empty in a conscious political effort to alter the material shape of that space".[60]

---

[51] Steve Pile, "Introduction: Opposition, Political Identities and Spaces of Resistance", in *Geographies of Resistance*, ed. Steve Pile and Michael Keith, (London: Routledge, 1997).

[52] Ibid., 15.

[53] Ibid., 19.

[54] Faranak Miraftab and Shana Willis, "Insurgency and Spaces of Active Citizenship: The Story of the Western Cape Anti-Eviction Campaign in South Africa", *Journal of Planning Education and Research* 25 (2005): 206-207.

[55] Asef Bayat, "From 'Dangerous Classes' to 'Quiet Rebels': Politics of the Urban Subaltern in the Global South", *International Sociology* 15 (2000).

[56] Ibid.

[57] Baviskar, "Spectacular Events, City Spaces, and Citizenship: the Commonwealth Games in Delhi".

[58] Ghertner, "Rule by Aesthetics: World-Class City Making in Delhi".

[59] Wendy Wolford, "This Land is Ours Now: Spatial Imaginaries and the Struggle for Land in Brazil", *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 94 (2004).

[60] Ibid., 415.

In order to carve out both physical and political space, urban residents potentially use everyday practices to challenge the top-down articulated citizenship, which increasingly seeks to impose exclusionary boundaries on space and rights.

Conclusion

This research seeks to theorize *city futures*, or understand future imaginaries of those connected to spaces undergoing bourgeois restructuring, but who experience differing degrees of inclusion with the creation of a "world-class" city. Exploring how different social groups situate themselves within dominant visions and discourses can inform the processes by which people access and reclaim the city.

Bibliography

Anjaria, Jonathan Shapiro. "Guardians of the Bourgeois City: Citizenship, Public Space, and Middle-Class Activism in Mumbai". *City & Community* 8 (2009): 391-406.

Appadurai, Arjun. "Capacity to Aspire: Culture and Terms of Recognition". In *Culture and Public Action*, edited by Vijayendra Rao and Michael Walton, 59-84. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Arabindoo, Pushpa. "'City of Sand': Stately Re-imagination of Marina Beach in Chennai". *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* 35.2 (2011): 379-401.

Baud, Isa, and Navtej Nainan. "'Negotiated Spaces' for Representation in Mumbai: Ward Committees, Advanced Locality Management and the Politics of Middle-Class Activism". *Environment and Urbanization* 20 (2008): 483-499.

Baviskar, Amita. "Between Violence and Desire: Space, Power, and Identity in the Making of Metropolitan Delhi". *International Social Science Journal* 55 (2003): 89-98.

Baviskar, Amita. "Spectacular Events, City Spaces, and Citizenship: the Commonwealth Games in Delhi". In *Urban Navigations: Politics, Space and the City in South Asia*, edited by Jonathan Shapiro Anjaria and Colin McFarlane. London: Routledge, 2011.

Bayat, Asef. "From 'Dangerous Classes' to 'Quiet Rebels': Politics of the Urban Subaltern in the Global South". *International Sociology* 15 (2000): 533-557.

Chakrabarti, Poulomi. "Inclusion of Exclusion? Emerging Effects of Middle-Class Citizen Participation on Delhi's Urban Poor". *Institute of Development Studies (IDS) Bulletin*, 38 (2008): 96-104.

Dickey, Sara. "Permeable Homes: Domestic Service, Household Space, and the Vulnerability of Class Boundaries in Urban India". *American Ethnologist* 27 (2000): 462-489.

Dupont, Veronique. "The Dream of Delhi as a Global City." *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* 35 (2011): 533-534.

Fenster, Tovi. "The Right to the Gendered City: Different Formulations of Belonging in Everyday Life". *Journal of Gender Studies* 14 (2005): 217-231.

Fernandes, Leela. "Restructuring the New Middle Class in Liberalizing India", *Comparative Studies of South Asia, Africa, and the Middle East* 41 (2000): 88-104.

Fernandes, Leela. "The Politics of Forgetting: Class Politics, State Power, and the Restructuring of Urban Space in India". *Urban Studies* 41 (2004): 2415-2430.

Fernandes, Leela, and Patrick Heller. "Hegemonic Aspirations: New Middle Class Politics and India's Democracy in Comparative Politics". *Critical Asian Studies* 38 (2006): 495-522.

Ghertner, Asher. "Rule by Aesthetics: World-Class City Making in Delhi". In *Worlding Cities: Asian Experiments and the Art of Being Global*, edited by Ananya Roy and Aihwa Ong. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, 2011.

Habitat International Coalition-Housing and Land Rights Network (HIC-HLRN), *The 2010 Commonwealth Games: Whose Wealth? Whose Commons?*, Delhi: HIC-HLRN, 2010.

Habitat International Coalition-Housing and Land Rights Network (HIC-HLRN), *Planned Dispossession: Forced Eviction and the 2010 Commonwealth Games, Fact-Finding Mission Report*, 14 Delhi: HIC-HLRN, 2011.

Holston, James. *Insurgent Citizenship: Disjunctions of Democracy and Modernity in Brazil.* Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2008.

Hubbard, Phil. *City: Key Ideas in Geography.* New York: Routledge, 2006.

Jeffrey, Craig. *Timepass: Youth, Class and the Politics of Waiting in India.* Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2010.

Jeffrey, Craig. "Timepass: Youth, Class, and Time Among Unemployed Young Men in India". *American Ethnologist* 37 (2010): 465-481.

Keith, Michael, and Steve Pile. "Introduction: The Politics of Place". In *Place and the Politics of Identity*, edited by Michael Keith and Steve Pile, 1-21. London: Routledge, 1993.

Massey, Doreen. *For Space.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, 2005.

May, Jon, and Nigel Thrift. "Introduction". In *Timespace: Geographies of Temporality*, edited by Jon May and Nigel Thrift, 1-46. London: Routledge, 2001.

Miraftab, Faranak, and Shana Willis. "Insurgency and Spaces of Active Citizenship: The Story of the Western Cape Anti-Eviction Campaign in South Africa". *Journal of Planning Education and Research* 25 (2005): 200-217.

Nathan, Dev. "Capabilities and Aspirations". *Economic and Political Weekly* 40 (2005): 36-40.

Painter, Joe, and Chris Philo, "Spaces of Citizenship: an Introduction". *Political Geography* 14 (1995): 107-120

Pile, Steve. "Introduction: Opposition, Political Identities and Spaces of Resistance". In *Geographies of Resistance*, edited by Steve Pile and Michael Keith, 1-32. London: Routledge, 1997.

Rajagopal, Arvind. "The Violence of Commodity Aesthetics: Hawkers, Demolition Raids, and a New Regime of Consumption". *Social Text* 19 (2001): 91-114.

Secor, Anna. "'There is an Istanbul that Belongs to Me': Citizenship, Space and Identity in the City". *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 94 (2004): 352-368.

Smith, Neil. "New Globalism, New Urbanism: Gentrification as Global Urban Strategy". *Antipode* 34 (2002): 427-450.

Smith, Neil. *The New Urban Frontier: Gentrification and the Revanchist City.* London: Routledge, 1996.

Srivastava, Sanjay. "Urban Spaces, Disney-Divinity, and Moral Middle Classes in Delhi", *Economic and Political Weekly* 44 (2009): 338-357.

Trudeau, Daniel. "Politics of Belonging in the Construction of Landscapes: Place-Making, Boundary-Drawing, and Exclusion". *Cultural Geographies* 13 (2006): 421-433.

Truelove, Yaffa, and Emma Mawdsley. "Discourses of Citizenship and Criminality in Clean, Green Delhi". In *A Companion to the Anthropology of India*, by Isabelle Clark-Deces, 407-425. London: Blackwell Publishers, 2011.

Wolford, Wendy. "This Land is Ours Now: Spatial Imaginaries and the Struggle for Land in Brazil". *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 94 (2004): 409-424.

Zerah, Marie-Helene. "Participatory Governance in Urban Management and the Shifting Geometry of Power in Mumbai". *Development and Change* 40 (2009): 853-877.

Kavita Ramakrishnan
kavitalr@gmail.com

Institute *of* Advanced Study

Durham University

Futurism and Musical Meaning in Synthesized Landscapes

KEVIN MILBURN

This paper assesses the way that notions of futurism were enrolled into electronic music in certain times and places. Naturally, in many respects, all contemporary popular music is now 'electronic'; if not in its instrumentation, then almost certainly in terms of its recording, distribution and consumption. However, my analysis of 'electronic music' refers to music in which electrically powered keyboard instruments, and specifically synthesizers, are to the fore of the mix, and where many of the sounds produced are clearly synthetically generated. In particular, the focus is on a form of electronic music given the genre-label 'synth-pop' for marketing purposes, which was produced by artists who were sometimes referred to as 'futurists'. This music was characterized by simple, spartan arrangements and, unlike much of the 'progressive' synthesizer music that came before it, was largely devoid of rhetorical display. As the moniker 'futurist' implies, an overt engagement with ideas of futurism was a key characteristic that informed such music. The paper situates this embrace of futurism within an inter-textual terrain. Connections with parallel discourses in other art forms, notably film and literature, are highlighted, and special attention is given to the influence of earlier creative works on those musicians who explicitly sought to construct imaginary sonic geographies of the future. An attempt is made to outline ways in which the musicians responsible for such 'new' sounds positioned this output within a broader discourse on modernity and the near future, one which, in the UK in particular, was often linked in to representations of the built environment.

The focus for this paper is the period between 1977 and 1984. Several factors determine this start date. Firstly, by 1977 the initial fervour of the guitar driven punk movement was cooling. However, some key lasting consequences of punk were becoming increasingly discernible. One of these concerned the growing enthusiasm for the catalytic role that punk played in inspiring an increasing number of young people to adopt a DIY (do it yourself), non-virtuoso ethos to music making. By the late 1970s this notion had been extended beyond guitar-based sounds and applied to musical expression centred on the synthesizer, an instrument that had, for the first time, begun to be sold at affordable prices. Andy Fletcher, a founding member of the synth-pop group Depeche Mode, recalled that when models such as the MiniKorg 700s became available, "you could buy a monophonic synthesizer for about £150 quid. I think that was the main reason for the explosion in electronic music at that time. It was basically about affordability."[1] The second reason for choosing the start date of 1977 is that another consequence of the punk movement was that it helped create a basic institutional framework to facilitate the production, distribution and selling of types of records which previously had been poorly or non-served by established music industry networks. This benefited new, and initially experimental, forms of music, such as synth-pop. Thirdly, the end of the 1970s marked a time when conditions were beneficial for musicians who needed free or low rent spaces in which to rehearse and play live. The industrial decline that the UK had experienced for

---

[1]Quote taken from an interview recorded as part of The BBC 6 Music documentary 'The Great Bleep Forward: episode 2'. Produced for 6 Music by Jim Simmons and Sue Clarke. Presented by Andrew Collins. Broadcast on 28 July 2010.

much of the preceding decade had resulted in a surfeit of vacant and derelict properties that young musicians took advantage of, which assisted in the creation of vibrant local music scenes across the country.

Finally, the late 1970s was a period in which science fiction portrayals of the future moved into the mainstream of popular culture. One interpretation that has been put forward attempting to explain this is that people embraced imaginary worlds such as science fiction as a partial reaction to the harshness of the real environment in which they lived. Similar reasons were given, shortly afterwards, for the embrace of the period exotica of the pirate, clown, or Culloden warrior[2] associated with the New Romantic fashion movement. As music writer Jon Savage noted, "the truism about the 1970s was its grimness. Yet for many it marked an explosion of fantasy."[3] Fantasy worlds were depicted in George Lucas' film *Star Wars*, released into cinemas in 1977, and in *Space Invaders*, the first game that tracked and displayed high scores, which was introduced by the Midway Company the following year.[4]

The enthusiastic response that greeted their arrival was symptomatic of the fact that the idea of 'the Future' began to exert a hold on the popular imagination in the late 1970s, which continued until the middle of the next decade. One possible reason for this relates to profound uncertainty about the prospects for the future. Economically, some areas in the UK appeared to be becoming lost causes, a mood later captured in Aztec Camera's 'Killermont Street' (1987). This song was named after the road that houses Glasgow's coach station and detailed the exodus of workers to London and the South. The potential consequences to a city caused by such an exodus were captured by The Specials on their No. 1 single, 'Ghost Town'. The song was interpreted as being about their home town of Coventry, but went on to become an anthem for all post-industrial cities, its bleak message appearing to echo Johnny Rotten's feral refrain of "No Future" in The Sex Pistols' song 'God Save The Queen'.

Such an outlook also resonated with another conversation that was repeatedly played out in the popular media of the early 1980s. This concerned the possibility of Armageddon being brought about by the then seemingly real threat of a nuclear holocaust. On television this was enacted in drama, as in the BBC's 'Threads' (1984), set in post-bomb Sheffield, government information messages, documentaries, and even demonstrated by comedy, as in 'Bomb' (1982), the fourth episode of the sitcom series, *The Young Ones*. The topic was also repeatedly addressed in popular music. Examples here included OMD's 'Enola Gay' (1980), named after the plane which dropped the atomic bomb on Hiroshima, Japan's 'Burning Bridges' (1980), which addressed the same incident, U2's 'Seconds' (1983), about the home assembly of an atomic bomb in a New York apartment, and Frankie Goes to Hollywood's 'Two Tribes' (1984), a satirical response to the USA-USSR arms race, and the only song beginning with the sound of an atomic air raid warning to have topped the UK singles chart.

The choice of an end date of 1984 for the topic examined in this paper has, again, been selected for numerous reasons. Firstly, by this time, the previously revolutionary technology of sampling was becoming widespread. This approach helped to forge novel ways of making music by blending together previously unimaginable sonic inputs. To some the opportunities that the new sampling technology offered appeared limitless, a view held by Hank Shocklee, co-producer of New York hip-hop group Public Enemy:

> We took whatever... threw it into a pot, and that's how we came out with this group ... We
> believed that music is nothing but organized noise. You can take anything – street sounds,
> us talking, whatever you want – and make it music by organizing it.

However, in addition to stimulating such experimentation, sampling also encouraged an element of curatorship to be embedded into the fabric of popular music. Rather than being

---

[2] These three particular guises were adopted at the end of the 1970s and start of the 1980s by, respectively, the pop acts, Adam Ant, David Bowie and Spandau Ballet.

[3] John Savage, *Time Travel. From the Sex Pistols to Nirvana: Pop, Media and Sexuality, 1977-96*. (London: Chatto and Windus, 1996): 121.

[4] Paul Morley, *Words and Music: A History of Pop in the Shape of a City*. (London: Bloomsbury Publishing, 2003): 167.

[5] David Toop, *Ocean of Sound: Aether Talk, Ambient Sound and Imaginary Worlds* (London: Serpent's Tail, 1995), p. 123.

shunned, as had often previously been the case, sounds from pop's own past increasingly came to be excavated, re-visited and re-mixed. Partly as a reaction to fears over 'fakery' associated with synthesizers and sampling, a musical ideology which presented itself as being concerned with issues of supposed authenticity gathered momentum. This essentially conservative movement received a significant boost with the success of the Live Aid concerts held in London and Philadelphia in 1985. These vast shows were orchestrated around traditional modes of live performance and the big screens and zoom lenses of the multi-camera production eulogised bodily toil, visible displays of endeavour and sweat, rather than the static detachment associated with many synth-pop acts. Perhaps the most celebrated performance at Live Aid was provided by Queen, an act who, earlier in their career, had promoted spurious notions of authenticity and supposed musical virtuosity by placing stickers on their albums that proclaimed "no synthesizers!" The fact that in the early 1980s Queen themselves also briefly adopted synthesizers reflected the instrument's increasing ubiquity,[6] which prompted a discernible reaction against it. Acts such as The Eurythmics and Depeche Mode, who had started out as purely electronic acts, began to release records that were increasingly guitar orientated. Even The Human League, once at the vanguard of popularizing machine music – a group whose first name was The Future and who began their career creating synthesizer enabled works such as 'The Dignity of Labour' ep, a "four-part story of Yuri Gagarin's first space flight set to krautrock" (Rogers, 2011: 2) – chose to emulate Queen's example by attaching stickers to their albums that stated "no sequencers!"

And, finally, and perhaps most terminally, by the middle of the 1980s, the theme of futurism in music sounded increasingly hackneyed and was becoming, at times, a parody of itself, a situation later lampooned by the comedy duo, Flight of the Conchords, in their song, 'Robots':

> *The distant future,*
> *The year 2000,*
> *We no longer say "Yes," instead, we say "Affirmative."*
> *Unless we know the other robot really well.*
> *The humans are dead.*
> *Binary solo!*
> *000000111*
> *Once again, without emotion, the humans are dead.*[7]

Synthesizers and Musical Articulations of Place

In the late 1970s, the newly formed Sheffield based trio, Cabaret Voltaire, became interested in the possibilities electronics offered with regard to musically depicting their home city. The harsh, apparently alienating sounds the group produced were interpreted and promoted, along with the early output of The Human League, as being emblematic of the apparently bleak, forbidding post-industrial landscape often associated with the South Yorkshire city in the late 1970s. Elsewhere, the formative work of many other bands whose music was also largely distinguished by synthesizer enabled sounds, such as Liverpool's Orchestral Manoeuvres in the Dark, Glasgow's Simple Minds, Manchester's Joy Division and London based acts, including The Normal, Gary Numan, and John Foxx, all frequently referenced the supposedly disruptive impact of their external surroundings. This music engaged with landscapes of modernity and human relationships experienced within them.

Pet Shop Boys lead singer Neil Tennant recently stated "pop music is a diary of contemporary culture. You can listen to a good pop record and it's rooted in time."[8] Arguments can also be put forward that it may well be rooted in place. The music journalist Paul Morley, in an essay about the evolution of the successful synth-pop group, Yazoo, noted the impact on the group's two members of growing up in an Essex new town amidst the functionalist concrete buildings – a style of

---

[6] Queen even dabbled with futurism by incorporating aspects of Fritz Lang's film *Metropolis* into the promotional video for one of their songs, 'Radio Ga-Ga' (1984) and by recording the theme song to the British sci-fi film, *Flash Gordon* (1980).

[7] Lyrics to Flight of the Conchords 'Robots' (2008) written by J. Clement, B. McKenzie and T. Laing. Publishing administered by Sony/ATV Tunes LLC (ASCAP) and Toby Long.

[8] Quote taken from 'Secrets of the Pop Song: Breakthrough single'. Produced and directed by Linda Brusasco. Renegade Production. Last Broadcast on BBC Two, 9 July 2011.

architecture later labelled 'brutalist'[9] – and highlighted by a Francis Frith photograph taken in c. 1965 of the town's Southernhay shopping centre (http://www.francisfrith.com/basildon,essex/photos/southernhay-c1965_b438305/#utmcsr=google.co.uk&utmcmd=referral&utmccn=google.co.uk), which features in the booklet to Yazoo's CD box set *In Your Room*, released by Mute Records in 2008. Paul Morley stresses the influence of such a setting by contextualising its influence within the colour and excitement of the principal popular culture movements of the time:

> Music was one way of dealing with the 70s realities of life in Basildon for those born in the 60s. Imagine being a certain teenager in 1977 Basildon when all at once there was disco, punk... *Star Wars*, Parliament and Abba: imagine processing all that information – 'Anarchy', 'Stayin' Alive'... robots, bleeps and space ships – all at the same time. You could only do it using machines.[10]

In addition to the built environment and contemporaneous popular culture providing reference points, many of these synth-pop acts also derived inspiration from prior art works that had portrayed depictions of the future. Stanley Kubrick, via films such as *2001: A Space Odyssey* and *A Clockwork Orange*, presented contrasting, though equally bleak, representations of the near future. The impact of the latter on musicians was strengthened by Walter Carlos's soundtrack on which "Purcell, Rossini, Beethoven and Carlos's own music were all given electronic treatment which suited the futuristic vision of the film's creator."[11]

Whilst the work of Carlos, and that of later electronic producers such as Giorgio Moroder and Brian Eno, exerted a notable sonic influence on the new futurists, the novels of JG Ballard, particularly *Crash*, were, thematically, of equal importance. The Human League's Phil Oakey, has continued to acknowledge the author's influence, "We love JG Ballard. Roxy [Music] had a song, '2HB', about Humphrey Bogart and we [The Human League] had a song '4JG', which was about Ballard."[12] The Normal's Daniel Miller[13] was similarly in awe of the Shepperton based novelist, *Crash* providing the major influence on their song, 'Warm Leatherette'. This breakthrough hit for the group, featured lines such as "Hear the crushing steel/Feel the steering wheel... Join the car crash set", was delivered in a monotone, almost robotic style, characteristic of a great deal of synth-pop music.

Other works co-opted by pop futurists in the late 1970s and early 1980s included those associated with the Futurism art movement, led by Filippo Marinetti, in the early years of the twentieth century. The title of Marinetti's 1914 modernist sound poem 'Zang Tumb Tumb' was chosen as the name for one of the 1980s more forward thinking record labels, ZTT. The acts on this company's roster included The Art of Noise, Frankie Goes to Hollywood and Propaganda. Besides the label's name, another instance of ZTT drawing on past manifestations of futurism was provided by Propaganda's hit single 'Dr. Mabuse', the title of which a reference to the 1933 futuristic fantasy, *The Testament of Dr Mabuse,* directed by Fritz Lang.

In addition to drawing on motifs of urban modernity and previous artistic representations, the futurists' vision was also largely driven by significant changes in music technology and their access to it. As already stated, in the late 1970s this new generation of musicians were aided in their quest to create explicitly futuristic work by the availability of newly affordable forms of technology. Most significant in this context was the synthesizer, and, more specifically still, the MiniKorg 700s, a model credited by The Human League's Phil Oakey as being "the first affordable synth"[14] In addition to being cheap this instrument required even less of a musical education to play it than the guitar,

---

[9] The utopian futurism sometimes attributed to such architecture is currently being restated by the likes of artist Laura Oldfield Ford and writer Owen Hatherley (2008).

[10] Sleevenotes to Yazoo's *In Your Room* CD box set (Mute Records, 2008).

[11] Mark Prendergast, *The Ambient Century: From Mahler to Trance – The Evolution of Sound in the Electronic Age.* (London: Bloomsbury; 2000), p. 71.

[12] Quote taken from the documentary Synth Britannia. BBC Productions, 2009. Produced and Directed by Ben Whalley. Last broadcast on BBC Four. 2.8.2010. http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/b00n93c4

[13] Arguably Miller's greatest contribution to this movement was not as an artist but as a producer and record company boss. He formed Mute Records to release his own records and went on to sign and record influential synthesizer based acts including Depeche Mode and Yazoo and later compiled the work of Cabaret Voltaire.

[14] Quote taken from Synth Britannia. BBC Productions 2009.

which had been central to punk's ethos of simplicity. As one of the pioneers of British electronic music, Gary Numan, has stated, the new music culture was not about "chord structures and so on. It was much more to do with arranging noise and sound. We became shapers of sound."[15] The MiniKorg 700s, and other models such as the Yamaha DX7, provided a mimetic means with which to evoke the industrial and urban sounds that many of these 'non-musician' musicians heard on a daily basis. They brought to fruition the wish that Robert Moog expressed in 1973 when he patented his synthesizer as being a machine "intended to make any sound available through electronic synthesis"[16]

However, it is worth noting that the 1970s generation of musicians were not the first to promote the idea that equated sounds associated with modernity with a desirable element of mystery. Well before the invention of the synthesizer, rapid changes in the auditory landscapes of cities were captured **onomatopoeically** in symphonic works such as 'Ameriques', written by the French composer Edgard Varese, in response to feeling captivated by his new surroundings in 1920s Manhattan. Furthermore, significant experiments in the electronic manipulation of sound were undertaken in the late 1940s and 1950s by the Paris based *musique concrete* pioneers Pierre Schaeffer and Pierre Henry. Some of their ideas were then developed in the 1960s by, among others, the New York composers John Cage, Terry Riley and Steve Reich; the BBC's Radiophonic Workshop, best known for the futuristic sounding theme to *Dr. Who*; the London based producer Joe Meek, especially on the space-age sounding hit, 'Telstar', recorded under the name Tornados; and, finally, The Beatles, in tandem with their producer, George Martin, on tracks such as the futuristically titled, 'Tomorrow Never Knows'.

A consequence of such varied approaches was that by the late 1970s more and more popular music produced was reliant on National Grids to achieve its effects. Increasingly, musicians were using machines to comment upon society's increasing reliance on machines. This theme was addressed, for example, in the album *Man-Machine* (1978), recorded by Kraftwerk, a group made up of four synthesizer players. This Düsseldorf based act first came to the attention of the majority of the British public, and many of the musicians mentioned in this paper, in 1975, when they had their first hit single, 'Autobahn', and also appeared on an episode of BBC1's long running weekly instalment of futurity, 'Tomorrow's World'.

Despite the new electronic music technologies being promoted on television and their increasing availability on High Streets in the late 1970s, many creators, including John Foxx and members of The Human League and Soft Cell, first sampled these new sonic possibilities by enrolling in art colleges. These institutional spaces were well known for facilitating and encouraging experimentation and, from the late 1960s to the late 1970s, in particular, provided a place for the fermentation of ideas and a site in which practical skills could be taught and passed on.[17] It was also in such spaces that individuals who would go on to form glam rock acts such as Roxy Music, Be Bob Deluxe, David Bowie, first developed their interest in 'retro-futurism'. Such thinking was driven by nostalgia for outer-space themes prevalent in popular culture and in discourses surrounding design in the 1950s and which informed the content, dress and imagery associated with these art-school educated glam rock acts, as demonstrated by the sleeve to Be Bop Deluxe's second album, *Futurama*. (http://www.discogs.com/viewimages?release=2603376)

Non-European Approaches to Futurism in Popular Music

The lead singer of Be Bop Deluxe, Bill Nelson, later continued to immerse himself in such retro-futurist nostalgia in his solo career. However, he also engaged in a more contemporaneous take on futurism via his involvement as a part-time guitarist with the Tokyo based trio, Yellow Magic Orchestra (YMO). YMO's music was labelled 'techno-pop', a term used almost exclusively in relation to electronic music produced in Japan in the late 1970s. The 'techno' part of the compound was a reference to the fact that a number of Japanese artists believed that depictions of their country at the time were being exoticised through a new form of Orientalism that assumed an alignment between

---

[15] *Ibid.*
[16] Paul Morley (2003), 163.
[17] For a detailed critique on the importance of art colleges and art departments in the evolution of British popular music, see Simon Frith & Alan Horne, *Art into Pop* (London: Methuen, 1987).

Japan, its people, and technology.[18] Meanwhile, the 'pop' aspect spoke to the genre's stronger emphasis on melody and song structure than had previously been discernible in most electronic music. Yellow Magic Orchestra spoofed Western representations of Japan via their music, as demonstrated by the Space Invader sounds throughout 'Computer Game', their 1980 UK top 20 hit, and by the visual imagery they adopted, as highlighted by the cover to that release which featured a geisha-cyborg with electrical wiring sprouting from its skull: http://www.discogs.com/viewimages?release=1070914

A baffled *Washington Post* critic reviewing a Yellow Magic Orchestra concert in 1979 described it as follows: "Transistorized Tchaikovsky, Diode Disco, Robot Rock ... [YMO] preferred to let their gadgets do their work for them ... at times, it wasn't clear whether the men were playing the machines or vice versa."[19] Both the tone of the comments and the choice of words, such as 'transistorized' and 'robot', allude to what Morley and Robbins[20] referred to as a 'Japan Panic' in the USA in the late 1970s and 1980s. However, they also provide a reminder that, "throughout this century of rapid technological change, the drive of modernism has been harnessed to the dances and songs of machines."[21] This was a drive that accelerated in the second half of the twentieth century when the dance became more frenetic due to the increasing number of machines and their enhanced capabilities.

In the early 1980s, the futuristic sounds produced by artists such as Kraftwerk and the Yellow Magic Orchestra mutated in new settings and cultural contexts when they were incorporated by the Bronx based artist Afrika Bambaataa, and his producer Arthur Baker on the releases 'Planet Rock' (1982) and 'the Death Mix ep' (1983) respectively. The former was hailed as

> […] the first electro record: Euro-based electronic beats incorporating New York rapping. As such it was the forerunner to both hip hop and House... As it [electro] went overground in 1984, hip-hop replaced it as the dominant underground force. [22]

In addition to being credited with helping to create a new genre of music, Bambaataa is also a significant figure in the context of this paper due to his influence in resurrecting sci-fi and futuristic motifs. This a theme which has run through many varieties of African-American music during the last fifty years, in work made by, among others, Sun Ra, George Clinton, Herbie Hancock, and most recently, Janelle Monáe.[23]

Lyrically, Monáe's debut album, *Archandroid* (2010), looks forward in that it casts "Monáe as Cindi Mayweather, a robot messiah sent back from the future to liberate us from the oppressive machine."[24] However, it is also informed by the past, comprised, as it is, of the "two central suites of a four-part conceptual piece inspired by Fritz Lang's silent-era classic, *Metropolis*",[25] an influence referenced on the album's cover artwork: file://localhost/(http//::www.soulculture.co.uk:blogs:janelle-monae-the-archandroid-album-artwork-tracklisting: - axzz1yzwipMTf)

The presence of the past on the record is further heightened by its clear incorporation of several earlier musical styles, which include sci-fi inspired funk and British progressive rock music from the early 1970s, as well as sounds associated with disco from the end of that decade and electro-pop from the start of the next, genres which all owed much to the deployment of synthesizers and electronic keyboards in their overall sound. Monáe's record thus continues a discernible trend

---

[18] Kevin Milburn, *Exotica, Self-Reflexive Orientalism and Hybridity: A case study of Yellow Magic Orchestra.* (MA Japanese Cultural Studies dissertation. Birkbeck, University of London, 2006).

[19] Mark Schilling, *The Encyclopedia of Japanese Pop Culture.* (Trumball, CT: Weatherhill, 1997): 301.

[20] David Morley and Kevin Robbins, 'Japan Panic', *Spaces of identity: global media, electronic landscapes and cultural boundaries.* 147-173. (London and New York: Routledge, (1995).

[21] David Toop, *Ocean of Sound: Aether Talk, Ambient Sound and Imaginary Worlds.* (London: Serpent's Tail, 1995): 73.

[22] 'The A to Z of the Eighties', *Melody Maker*, (Author Anon), 23rd December 1989, p. 38.

[23] For further analysis of this tradition see M. Derry, 'Black to the future', *The South Atlantic Quarterly*, 1993, 92 (4), pp. 735-78 and K. McLeod, 'Space Oddities: Aliens, Futurism and Meaning in Popular Music', *Popular Music*, 2003, 22 (3), pp. 337-355.

[24] S. Yates. 'We're Not in Kansas Any More' *The Word*, August 2010, p. 84-85. 85.

[25] *Ibid.* p. 84.

concerning music that incorporates references to futurism, namely it reflects a tendency for it to be made by artists who embrace the creative possibilities offered by synthesizers, samplers and electronic keyboards.[26]

Conclusion

The music writer Simon Reynolds recently suggested that the idea explored by many of the artists mentioned in this paper, of pop as a modernist celebration of the fleeting ambiguity of music's emotional power, is an outlook perhaps best viewed as historically situated. He contends that

[…] what seems to have happened is that the place that The Future once occupied in the imagination of young music-makers has been displaced by The Past: that's where the romance now lies, with the idea of things that have been lost. The accent, today, is not on discovery but on recovery.[27]

The journalist Steve Yates, reviewing Reynolds' latest book, *Retromania*, noted that the author "came of age in the post-punk era... and has never lost his attachment to futurism, the idea that art should be one long forward march, any which way but backwards."[28] But even in post-punk times, the chronology was never so straightforward, and during that most future-facing period, musicians instinctively looked back to go forward. As this paper has sought to demonstrate, despite professing to be about issues of futurity, the post-punk Futurists drew considerable inspiration from prior artistic representations of the rise of machine culture.

To summarise, an attempt has been made here to outline how futurism in music can be explored in relation to the manner of its production and its thematic content.[29] This paper commented on ways in which a futuristic urban ethos was made explicit in much of the electronic music produced in the UK, and elsewhere, between 1977 and 1984. During this period there was a growing mainstream interest in science-fiction and futurism, an optimistic response to the potential of technology that found expression via the medium of popular music. The paper then moved on to outline how 1970s synthesizer based music informed aspects of black American music that also engaged with futurism, such as 1980s electro and more recent funk and soul acts. These contemporary examples, like much of the preceding synth-pop, were noted as being at least as concerned with celebrating and re-imagining earlier depictions of the future as with creating wholly original new conceptions of it.

In conclusion, this paper has stressed the opportunities that an engagement with music can offer researchers who seek fresh perspectives on issues of representation, modernity and futurism. It also stressed the temporal, spatial and socio-technical specificity related to the environment in which a commercially successful type of music was produced and consumed, one that explicitly imagined how music might sound in the future and should sound now.

Bibliography

Bull, M. (2007) Sound moves: ipod Culture and urban experience. London: Routledge.
Derry, M. (1993) 'Black to the future' The South Atlantic Quarterly, 92/4, pp. 735-78.
Frith, S. & Horne, A. (1987) Art into Pop. London: Methuen.
Hatherley, O. (2008) Militant Modernism. Winchester: Zero Books.

---

[26] The most obvious way such acts have aligned their work to themes of the future has been via by their titling strategies, whether applied to individual tracks: Pop Will Eat Itself's 'Urban Futuristic' and Cut Copy's 'Strange Nostalgia for the Future'; themed albums, Soma Sonic's *Future* and Klaxons' *Myths of the Near Future*; group names, The Future Sound of London, or even entire genre-labels such as the axiomatic 'Futurist' and 'Techno'.

[27] Simon Reynolds, 'Total Recall', *The Guardian, G2*, 2.2.2011, pp. 4-7: 7.

[28] Steve Yates, 'Pop Has Eaten Itself', *The Word*, June 2011. p. 94.

[29] Alternative music futurism and landscape perspectives that one could adopt include those that focus more on the distribution of music (Leyshon, 2003), or on the increasingly mobile nature of its consumption (Bull, 2007).

Leyshon, A. (2003) Scary monsters? Software formats, peer-to-peer networks, and the spectre of the gift. *Environment and Planning D: Society & Space*, 21(5), 533-558.

McLeod, K. (2003) 'Space Oddities: Aliens, Futurism and Meaning in Popular Music.' Popular Music, Vol. 22 (3) 337-355.

Milburn, K. (2006) Exotica, Self-Reflexive Orientalism and Hybridity: A case study of Yellow Magic Orchestra. MA Japanese Cultural Studies dissertation. Birkbeck, University of London.

Morley, P. (2008) Sleevenotes to Yazoo's In Your Room CD box set. Mute Records.

Morley, P. (2003) Words and Music: A History of Pop in the Shape of a City. London: Bloomsbury Publishing.

Morley, D. and Robbins, K. (1995) Spaces of identity: global media, electronic landscapes and cultural boundaries. London: Routledge.

Prendergast, M. (2000) The Ambient Century: From Mahler to Trance – The Evolution of Sound in the Electronic Age. London: Bloomsbury.

Reynolds, S. (2011), 'Total Recall', The Guardian, G2, 02.06.11, pp. 4-7.

Rogers, J. (2011) Review of The Human League's 'The Dignity of Labour' in 'The F&M playlist', Film and Music supplement, p. 2, The Guardian, 14.10.2011.

Savage, J. (1996) Time Travel. From the Sex Pistols to Nirvana: Pop, Media and Sexuality, 1977-96. London: Chatto and Windus.

Schilling, M. (1997) The Encyclopedia of Japanese Pop Culture. Trumball, CT: Weatherhill.

Toop, D. (1995) Ocean of Sound: Aether Talk, Ambient Sound and Imaginary Worlds. London: Serpent's Tail.

Yates, S. (2011) 'Pop Has Eaten Itself'. Review of Simon Reynolds' 'Retromania'. The Word, June 2011. p. 94.

Yates, S. (2010) 'We're Not in Kansas Any More' The Word, August 2010, p. 84-85.

Kevin Milburn
Department of Geography
Nottingham University
Lgxkm7@nottingham.ac.uk

Institute *of* Advanced Study

Durham University

The Quality of Being Interested (or Interesting) in Research

RACHEL GORDON

Questioning Interest

> "So, why are you interested in studying us? I mean, it's just work to us, it's what we do, day in, day out," Rob asked me during my first week in the control room. Lawrence added, "You could say it's mixed though. Some days we're really busy, I mean we're rushed off our feet, say when we have a big incident, or there's incident after incident after incident to deal with. That would be interesting to watch. But then there are other days, when you can go for days in here and nothing really happens." Rob retorted "Yeah when there's nothing to do. You'll get bored though, just wait and see."

This exchange - and there were many others like it - took place during my first week of visits to the Highways Agency's motorway control centre in the West Midlands. It followed a conversation regarding how long I planned to stay there to gather my research findings. It was exactly the point at which I revealed my plan to spend six months observing their work as incident responders that I receive these exclamations of surprise. Never did I anticipate that I would receive this kind of reaction, or such an ominous warning of the boredom awaiting me, from the control room operators. They insisted on convincing me of the 'uninterestingness' of their work, which for Rob and Lawrence, was broadly based on two noteworthy qualities. The first was a matter of 'busyness' and the second 'eventfulness.' Their point was that these qualities are often absent from their work, during those 'quieter times', which made the prospect of undertaking a sustained research project appear to be a particularly daunting one.

Lawrence specifically refers to busyness in terms of its capacity to enliven the control room, to occupy and sustain interest, and to create a setting which is potentially "interesting to watch" for the researcher. The implication of this is that if there is nothing happening, if there are no incidents, then there is nothing to watch. This is echoed by Lawrence's reference to the clustering of work activities in the form of "incident after incident after incident", which intends to provide a continual stream of activity for the researcher to observe. "Big incidents", furthermore, such as multi-vehicle road traffic collisions, are deemed 'eventful' and thus of interest to the researcher given that they occur relatively infrequently. This relies on a comparison to the more familiar and routinised work of clearing vehicle breakdowns or debris from the carriageway, which is in some way less interesting. It is then the directly observable work of *dealing with incidents* (detecting an incident, allocating resources to the incident, resolving the incident), which is valued by the operators over any other kind of activity taking place in the control room (monitoring, investigating, coordinating, talking with colleagues) without acknowledging the consequentiality of those activities for actually getting the job done. I could not help but reflect on their insistence on the uninterestingness of incident response work: Why did I assume that my presence in this environment would go unquestioned? What if I eventually found their work uninteresting? How would I sustain my interest?

Emerging Interest

Writing on the work of Silvan Tompkins, Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick notes that interest is considered to be the single most important quality that drives daily human existence.[1] To be interested in, or to have a concern for, eating, caring, loving and so on enables us to sustain the most fundamental needs of everyday life. Despite its apparent centrality in our lives, interest is often overlooked in academic discussion when thinking about how we do research and how it shapes the future of research. In the quality of interest, and the associated expressions of excitement and enjoyment, there is the opportunity to explore why we choose the course we do in research and how it comes to reward us and sustain our attention. As Tomkins has said, "To think, as to engage in any other human activity, one must care, one must be excited, one must be continually rewarded. There is no human competence which can be achieved in the absence of sustaining interest."[2]

Interest can be possessed and harnessed by a range of agents with wide-ranging effects. Firstly, interest can create an orientation to an idea, a subject matter, or a task in hand. It can encourage us to follow one path rather than another as we take off in pursuit of answers to questions that have been ignited by intrigue and curiosity. Interest in this sense is close to Tomkins' notion of "sustained interest;" there has to be an investment of effort, and some kind of reward resulting from it. Furthermore, interest lends us an orientation to originality in research, if we are lucky enough to have the opportunity to follow our curiosities; a quality we all strive for in research. This is not to suggest, however, that interest is a matter of personal privilege or a case of unrestricted entitlement to access the world. This is because, secondly, interest in research is often institutionalised. It is much more likely that research must adhere to the requirements of funding and academic convention, rather than it being left to pontificate on its own terms. The ethical considerations and practicalities of actually doing research can lay a lot of those quests of discovery to rest. In turn, academic institutions and funding bodies express their own interests through the announcements of current research agendas and calls for papers and the spectacles of conferences and presentations. They reflect current disciplinary norms that work to legitimise and rationalise research interests. Interest can then find itself translated by researchers into the pages of research proposals and funding bids; its expression intended as a justification of the work, made recognisable and reasonable in those familiar terms of interest.

Interest does not only matter as a general orientation or an expression of value. It also matters as a strategy to enliven research. In a broad fashion, I turn to Isabelle Stengers who writes in the field of science and technology studies. Stengers encourages us to consider how the quality of interest can provide an alternative way of conducting research and voicing critique.[3] She argues that there exists a predisposition towards aggressive or judgemental critiques in the sciences that strives to condemn scientific accounts outright on the basis of what counts as objective science or not. Instead of replicating the form of argument that they seek to critique, Stengers implores fellow scientists and technologists to adopt a sensibility of interest in their research since it provides the possibility of finding alternative ways of sustaining critique in science. There is a richness in science, she argues, albeit most likely to be found obscured behind models, statistics and equations that work to normalise and reduce phenomena: "There's an incessant reinvention of the world at work here. I don't want to be called on to see it as the simple, monotonous, and hopeless effects of the force of purely social relations."[4] It is about embracing an interest in how things appear as they are and a curiosity for doing things differently, while maintaining a commitment to critique, rather than assuming a default position that denounces existing accounts of science without giving them a chance to enlighten us about their ways of thinking about the world. Stengers asks us to take another look.

---

[1] Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick and Adam Frank, *Shame and its Sisters: a Silvan Tomkins Reader* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1995)
[2] Elizabeth A. Wilson, "Scientific Interest: Introduction to Isabelle Stengers, "Another Look, Relearning to Laugh,"" *Hypatia* 15 (2000): 38
[3] Isabelle Stengers, "Another Look: Relearning to Laugh," *Hypatia* 15 (2000)
[4] Isabelle Stengers, "Another Look: Relearning to Laugh," *Hypatia* 15 (2000): 43

Legitimising Interest

I came to research motorway incident response through a general interest in transport networks; the stuff of traditional transport geography. My main concern was that the role of the traffic operator had long been under-researched or forgotten about in existing accounts of transport networks in transport geography research. Transport geography, as a sub-discipline of geography, has historically maintained an interest in the empirically measurable and mappable phenomena and the spatial outcomes of transportation processes. The traditional focus on normative modelling and technical descriptions of how they work has obscured what "really counts" as transport research to the detriment of our understanding of how transport networks are operated and managed in practice. Acknowledging Stengers, it is about taking another look. It is this interest that has led me into the spaces of the Highways Agency's Traffic Officer Service and, more specifically, its network of seven Regional Control Centres in England. It is within these spaces that operators are responsible for incident detection and response and real-time traffic management.

This research is heavily indebted to ethnomethodology and its study of sensemaking in workplace settings. This is why, to put it simply, I am not interested in just the "big incidents", contrary to what the control room operators might assume. Ethnomethodology is the study of the *actual work* carried out by members of a particular setting, which encompasses the methods, practices and competencies (also referred to as "ethnomethods") that members use to produce recognisable and accountable orders in local organisational settings.[5] In other words, it investigates the resources with and through which members make sense of what is currently going on, who is doing what, what to do next, and how they project this understanding through observable and collectively recognised practices. Work, in an ethnomethodological context, refers to the accomplishment of *whatever* is done in the setting under study, which in turn can be applied to any situated action *wherever* it takes place.[6] Consequently, there is value in an ethnomethodological approach for attending to those features of everyday settings that are more often than not dismissed as being uninteresting or simply inarticulable given their mundanity.

It is simply not a case of "adding in" traffic operators to those traditional descriptions. It is a call to take seriously the situated and locally produced nature of incident response that fosters an understanding of transport networks as something other than an entirely automated process or a straightforwardly technological triumph. It should not be assumed that incident response work takes place in any necessarily obvious or readily apparent way; it is an ongoing and continually negotiated accomplishment. It offers the possibility of researching how a version of reality, as mediated between the motorway network 'out-there' and the performance of incident response work 'in-the-control-room,' is actually created, made relevant and plausible throughout its course.

The Practicalities of Being Interested

No matter how emphatic my justifications for research interest were, the operators, like Rob and Lawrence, repeatedly refuted my claims. In response, I turned to the writings of ethnomethodology for a possible explanation. Notably, Harold Garfinkel warns us that individuals will always find the practicalities and competencies on which they habitually depend, quite frankly, uninteresting.[7] This is because ethnomethodology is interested in the "tacit and 'seen but unnoticed' resources"[8] of everyday life; the most familiar and routine work, including the talk, embodied gesture and computer interaction that operators rely on to get their work done. As Alain Coulon notes, members of a setting have no interest in theorising about what they are doing, and in fact they

---

[5] Harold Garfinkel, *Studies in Ethnomethodology* (Cambridge, Polity, 1967)

[6] Andrew Crabtree et al., "Ethnography considered harmful," *Proceedings of the 2009 CHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems* April 4-9 (2009)

[7] Harold Garfinkel, *Studies in Ethnomethodology* (Cambridge, Polity, 1967)

[8] Luff, Hindmarsh and Heath, "Introduction," in *Workplace Studies: Recovering Work Practice and Informing System Design,* ed. Luff, Hindmarsh and Heath (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2000): xiii

have little or no awareness of the contextualising character of their actions anyway.[9] They are actions that are effortlessly yet deeply embedded in the accomplishment of everyday settings, so much so that they are taken for granted as constituent features of that setting. Garfinkel argues that this is not to suggest that individuals are at fault here because they cannot recognise the practical nature of their actions. "To say they are 'not interested' in the study of practical actions is not to complain, nor to point to an opportunity they miss, nor is it a disclosure of error, nor is it an ironic comment."[10] Rather they take for granted that anyone participating in that setting has a basic competency to recognise for themselves what is going on and make recognisable account for what they are doing in the setting. It is a necessary feature of their setting and as such it is seldom, if ever, notable.

Respecting this ethnomethodological insight, I had to at least ensure that the operators recognised that I was serious in my interest, for two significant reasons. Firstly, the operators were uncertain about my interest in *whatever* gets done in the control room setting and consequently they often opted to fill observational moments with gossip, assuming that it was what I wanted to hear. Richard Harper, a practised ethnographer in organisational settings, reflects on the reluctance of individuals to accept his genuine interest in their work. He comments, " […] some individuals cannot believe that the ethnographer really wants to know. Sometimes one has to go through certain routines or tricks, if you like, to get the interviewees to believe in that interest."[11] It is a matter of proving your interest in whatever way you can. As such, I spent long hours in the control room, often mirroring the operators' shift patterns. I hoped my sustained presence at all times of the day would reinforce my commitment to the research project and build rapport with the operators. Similarly, Harper comments, it is

> […] when one does the work that one gets treated as genuinely interested in that work. It is then that those who ordinarily undertake it will start explaining what one needs to know to do it. From their perspective, their work is still boring and unremarkable, but 'since you really want to know', they will share the details of how it is done.[12]

Such patience has the potential to open doors rather than close them.

Secondly, operators confused my interest in *how they get the work done* with me making judgement on *how best they get the work done*. Operators are familiar with the presence of engineers, contractors, technicians, policy analysts and health and safety assessors in the control room who carry out consultative work on behalf of the Highways Agency. They produce 'objective' accounts, 'accurate' statistics and 'immutable' policies and procedures. My presence, on the contrary, was as a visiting social scientist conducting a research project that was in no way formally affiliated with the Highways Agency. There was a concern that I would judge practices, find flaws, or reveal secrets that would in some way harm the organisation. I was not interested in such sensational work anyway, but it was necessary to reassure operators of my genuine interest. I drew on my commitment to "ethnomethodological indifference." It is simply not the mission of ethnomethodology to engage in acts of counselling or performance review. This is because it does not judge members' accounts for their adequacy, importance, practicality or success since it is specifically interested in how a social order, or a reality, is created and continually maintained. This would involve privileging one understanding of a setting over another and risk missing the richness of detail and subtle complexity of a setting as members actively organise and order a version of it.

---

[9] Alain Coulon, *Ethnomethodology* (London, Sage, 1995)

[10] Harold Garfinkel, *Studies in Ethnomethodology* (Cambridge, Polity, 1967), 8

[11] Richard Harper, "The Organisation in Ethnography," *Computer Support Cooperative Work* 9 (2000): 256

[12] Richard Harper, "The Organisation in Ethnography," *Computer Support Cooperative Work* 9 (2000): 253

Finding Interest Again

In time, the operators' predictions of my impending boredom were, I admit, eventually realised. As I worked long shifts in the control room, their work became increasingly familiar to me. I was confident in the practices and resources of incident response work and I became somewhat proficient in understanding their use. It was at this point that it became difficult to sustain my attention in what was occurring. I had to find a way to recapture the interest that had influenced the research so far. Again, I turned to ethnomethodology for support.

Harvey Sacks famously said on the topic of researching the minutiae of everyday life that:

> […] omnipresence and ready observability need not imply banality, and, therefore, silence. Nor should they only set off a search for exceptions or variation. Rather, we need to see that with some such mundane occurrences we are picking up things which are so overwhelmingly true that if we are to understand that sector of the world, they are something we will have to come to terms with.[13]

Harvey Sacks became best known for his pioneering work on conversation analysis in the 1960s and 1970s and it is within this context that he uttered the provocative comments on finding interest in the very basic matters that constitute everyday settings. Conversation analysis, and the work of Sacks more broadly, sits within the study of ethnomethodology. Sacks was driven by a disapproval of his contemporaries in sociology, who he argued consistently overlooked the observably obvious, and downright familiar as a topic worthy of research in its own right.[14] He held that sociology had allowed an obsession with big problems and big sociological concepts dictate where, when and how research was conducted. Consequently the basic matter that constitutes everyday settings, including the accomplishment of talk and mutual intelligibility, was treated exclusively as a resource with which to answer those big sociological questions rather than being recognised themselves as interesting topics of study. Sacks suggested that the answers sociologists gave to their big questions may well turn out to depend on the deeply mundane practices and competencies that make up everyday settings, yet they are disappointingly and systematically missing from their analyses. In his response, Sacks championed an alternative approach that attends to observable, practical actions seriously.

For Sacks, the quality of empirical data as interesting is not necessary for study. He offers us some practical advice: "The first rule is to learn to be interested in what it is you've got."[15] Interest can emerge from the downright uninteresting. On describing his approach to the selection of data to present and analyse, he says:

> I'm specifically picking utterly uninteresting data. Things which do not have for us any special lay interest. That means that in order to find its interestingness we have to find that whatever it is that's interesting about it is what we can say about it. And we can then develop a criteria of interestingness where we're not exploiting kinds of things we 'want to know about' – scandalous topics, gossip, etc.[16]

---

[13] Harvey Sacks, "On the Preferences for Agreement and Contiguity in Sequences in Conversation," in *Talk and Social Organisation,* eds. Button and Lee (Clevedon: Multilingual Matters, 1987): 56

[14] He was not alone in this view – other sociologists were keen to break away from entrenched ways of theorising and conducting empirical research, including the eminent ethnomethodologist Harold Garfinkel, who was a major influence on Sacks' writings. In ethnomethodology more generally, this project is referred to as the 'respecification' of key theories and concepts whereby there is a concerted effort to readdress them as they exist in actual occasions of their use, rather than simply being imposed as social settings as explanatory resources.

[15] Harvey Sacks, *Lectures of Conversation* (Oxford, Blackwell, 1992): 471

[16] Harvey Sacks, *Lectures of Conversation* (Oxford, Blackwell, 1992): 293

Interest then is not inherent in this or that data. Nor is it inherent in the content of data, which becomes irrelevant for Sacks, due to its ability to tempt the researcher away from the practical attributes and accomplishments of everyday settings with its lure of hearsay. Rather interest is conceptualised as something that emerges through processes of analysis, discussion and writing up. He goes on to say: "I mean that not merely in the sense of 'pick any data and you'll find something,' but 'pick any data without any problems in mind and you may find something.' And how interesting what you may come up with will be, is something you cannot in the first instance say."[17]

Since Sacks took it upon himself to find interest in the most observably evident matter of everyday settings, his work provided me with a resource for thinking about interest in the study of practical phenomena. Sacks is specifically talking about his work in the context of traditional conversation analysis, which entails the painstaking transcription of a conversation to mark every intake of breath, every pause, every turn taken, every utterance, to reveal how orderliness is achieved within a setting. Where appropriate, some conversation analyses interweave the use and patterning of talk with non-verbal visual cues drawn from the participants' actions, commonly with the support of audio-visual recording techniques. Although the audio-visual recording of activity in the control room was prohibited, I was able to translate the advice of Sacks in other forms of note taking. An audio-visual recording provides the luxury of pausing, fast-forwarding, rewinding and slowing down action, so I experimented with the technique of 'pausing' moments to help pick out a mundane detail of the setting and then to follow it in-action. For example, a telephone ringing, a finger hovering at the touch screen, an operator shouting across the control room, were all observed in terms of how they were made relevant (or made meaningful) to members of the setting and how they became consequential for shaping the future activity of the setting. This was repeated, varying in focus each time, to assemble a detailed account of practical activity and its relevance for getting incident response work done. Whenever I found my attention waning in the control room, a reminder of the rich reward of following any observable action, whatever it may be, helped to sustain my interest for that little bit longer.

The provocative act of selecting uninteresting data, so it goes, serves to legitimate practical action as a topic in its own right since interest emerges through the intersubjective work between the researcher and participants and the subsequent analysis of the empirical setting. Sacks exudes a certain confidence in taking the apparently unremarkable and letting it speak for itself. The appraisal of mundane settings that is offered relinquishes the obsession in exciting events, like the "big incidents" of interest to the operators, in order to devote attention to finding the unremarkable, well, remarkable, or in other words, the uninteresting, interesting. If at first there appears to be nothing of interest, apparently inconsequential to the reason of our being there, Sacks implores us to look for the detail in things. His work encourages a tolerance and patience for the everyday world, by displaying a rigour that chips away at the hidden details of the most mundane of daily encounters.

Interest matters to research, whether it is expressed as a general orientation to something we find interest in or an intentional strategy to find interest and sustain interest, however interesting our topic of research may at first appear or otherwise turn out to be in the future. The value of thinking about the role of interest in research lies in its offer to help us acknowledge and appreciate how it comes to shape and legitimise research with various effects. A general orientation to an idea, a concept, or a question can help us to look again at a familiar research topic. It can help us justify our research in accepted and recognisable terms, or convince others of its worth in the quest for knowledge. For Isabelle Stengers, it is a commitment to "being interested" that encourages a sustained attention to something we perhaps would not otherwise attend to, which in turn helps us to avoid repeating the same old critiques. The intellectual insights of the ethnomethodological project, and of Harold Garfinkel and Harvey Sacks in particular, make available a range of resources that helps us "find interest" in our research, promoting as such a tolerance and patience for the everyday world, and reminding us to take our time in order to appreciate the meaning and significance of the seemingly familiar or uninteresting. Interest has significance in and for the future of research, especially if we take another look and pause to take our time.

---

[17] Harvey Sacks, *Lectures of Conversation* (Oxford, Blackwell, 1992): 293

Bibliography

Coulon, Alain. *Ethnomethodology.* London: Sage, 1995.

Crabtree, Andy, Rodden, Tom. Tolmie, Peter and Button, Graham. "Ethnography Considered Harmful." *Proceedings of the 2009 CHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems* April 4-9 (2009) unpaginated

Garfinkel, Harold. *Studies in Ethnomethodology.* Cambridge: Polity, 1967.

Harper, Richard H.R. "The Organisation in Ethnography." *Computer Support Cooperative Work* 9 (2000) 239-264

Luff, Paul, Hindmarsh, Jon, and Heath, Christian. "Introduction". In *Workplace Studies: Recovering Work Practice and Informing System Design,* edited by Paul Luff, Jon Hindmarsh and Christian Heath, xii-xvi. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000.

Sacks, Harvey. "On the Preferences for Agreement and Contiguity in Sequences in Conversation." In *Talk and Social Organisation,* edited by Graham Button and John R.E. Lee, 54-69. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters, 1987.

Sacks, Harvey. *Lectures of Conversation.* Oxford: Blackwell, 1992.

Sedgwick, Eve Kosofsky, and Frank, A. *Shame and its Sisters: a Silvan Tomkins Reader.* Durham: Duke University Press, 1995.

Stengers, Isabelle. "Another Look: Relearning to Laugh." *Hypatia* 15 (2000) 41-54

Wilson, Elizabeth. A. "Scientific Interest: Introduction to Isabelle Stengers, "Another Look, Relearning to Laugh."" *Hypatia* 15 (2000) 38-40

Rachel Gordon
Department of Geography
Durham University
r.j.gordon@durham.ac.uk

Using Performance in Human Geography: Conditions and Possibilities

ELIZABETH RICHARDSON

Introduction

Performance and performativity have regularly appeared as both a theoretical framework and an object of empirical investigation in the discipline of human geography over the past two decades. Although the interest in performance can be traced through work in the sub-discipline of cultural geography that was concerned with processes of identity formation, the broad function of the term as both theoretical tool and empirical object has seen its wider take-up across the discipline. For human geography, the concept of performance contributes to the wider disciplinary concern with the ways in which space is produced and enacted. This position challenges the notion that the spatial is significant primarily because it contains the spatial; it can "hold the world still"[1].

Space is not simply considered a measurable quantity to be represented and mapped, but rather it must be thought of together with time in order to actively configure the world. By understanding the spatial and the temporal as entwined, it becomes possible to avoid the "reduction of space to the a-political sphere of causal closure"[2]. Within this context, the vocabulary and action of performance offers one means of exploring how space creates, conditions and is experienced at a variety of sites and scales. Whilst not attempting to do justice to the breadth and depth of work on performance, this article will try to elucidate some of the key areas where the term has been taken up, and examine the purposes of this use.

Through this review discussion, the intention is to articulate the vocabulary of the *future* in two ways. Firstly, the article will offer a temporal trajectory of the term *performance* in human geography that will tentatively signpost some directions to come. Secondly, through surveying work on performance events, it will touch on how the experience of performance can be considered one of uncertain potential, which is always bound up with a sense of what lies ahead. The article will proceed by delineating two broadly separate uses of performance in human geography: the first metaphorical and the second more literal, focusing on the action of specific performance (arts) events. After an exploration of the possibilities and limitations of these two terms, the article will conclude by arguing for a more explicit thinking across the two; focusing on the aesthetics of performance. Initially though, it is necessary to offer some further context on the delineations of human geography by turning to some of the 'disciplinary' conditions that set the stage for the term to be put into practice.

---

[1] Doreen Massey, *For Space* (London: Sage, 2005), 36.

[2] *Ibid.* 18.

Cultural Geography and Performance

The appearance of performance in human geography can be traced to the permeability of the boundaries of the discipline in the 1990s. In particular, this was influenced by transformations in the sub-discipline of cultural geography, which from the 1980s saw a broad critique of previous approaches associated with Carl Sauer and the 'Berkeley School'. This body of 'traditional' cultural geography scholarship positioned itself against environmental determinism by drawing out the role of different human groups in transforming the natural landscape. Such a focus on the historical impact of humans in shaping their environment was underpinned by notions of tradition and 'folk', which emphasised the material and physical as central to notions of culture.

In response to this, the 'new' cultural geography of the latter decades of the twentieth century argued for a rethinking of the understandings of both 'landscape' and 'culture'. Instead of being equated solely to the (once) natural environment, landscape became the simultaneous product and producer of signs and symbols. Culture in human geography was no longer concerned with static ideas of the customs of particular groups, but instead began to consider how forms of collective meaning emerged and were negotiated through representation, often in popular culture and everyday life. This shift reflected the influence of theories of the 'postmodern era' posited by those such as Lyotard and Baudrillard [3]. Here, the aesthetic of postmodernity gives rise to a number of broad strands of thought, each of which contributed to the interest in performance.

In particular, the central critique of the meta-narrative forwarded by Lyotard's prognosis of postmodernity fed into two associated shifts in cultural (and human) geography. As totalising explanations of knowledge and experience were undermined, an emphasis on difference and plurality emerged, particularly in work on identity. Rather than considering identities as overarching defining categories, an interest arose in the work of differences or intersections between the boundaries of race, gender, and sexuality[4]. This was combined with a second move that highlighted the importance of local narratives, and therefore individual and everyday experience as a means of exploring identities. Consequently, 'culture' became a realm in which 'power' was produced, spatialised and resisted, and work in human geography sort to uncover these processes of marginalisation and protest[5].

A third element is in the influences of post-structural analyses of the text and language that aimed to destabilise meaning. This became highly significant in exposing the power relations through which both landscapes and subjectivities were produced[6]. Drawing on the post-structural critique of intended meaning, cultural geography began to explore how notions of stability and origin associated with place were constructed. Through its potential to be simultaneously in and beyond the 'real', performance provided both an empirical and theoretical space for approaching these three shifts towards uncertainty. By emphasising the role of 'acts' of repetition and deviation, place and identity were shown to be sedimentations of particular movements, empty of any essential solidity.

Using Performance as a Metaphor

Early notions of the use of performance employed these qualities through a primarily metaphorical register. This involved the application of the term figuratively to numerous social settings in order to make sense of situations that deviate from the 'real' in certain ways. Thus, it is

---

[3] Jean Baudrillard, "Simulations," (New York: Semiotext, 1983); Jean-Francois Lyotard, *The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge*, trans. George Bennington and Brian Massumi (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1984).

[4] Jon Binnie and Gill Valentine, "Geographies of Sexuality: A Review of Progress," *Progress in Human Geography* 23, no. 2 (1999); Alastair Bonnett, "Geography, 'Race' and Whiteness: Invisible Traditions and Current Challenges," *Area* 29, no. 3 (1997).

[5] Joanne Sharp, "A Topology of Post Nationality: (Re)Mapping Identity in the Satanic Verses," *Ecumene* 1, no. 1 (1994); Gerry Pratt and Susan Hansen, "Geography and the Construction of Difference," *Gender Place and Culture* 1, no. 1 (1994); Audrey Kobayashi and Linda Peake, "Unnatural Discouse: 'Race' and Gender in Geography," *Gender Place and Culture* 1, no. 2 (1994).

[6] James S. Duncan, *The City as Text: The Politics of Landscape Interpretation in the Kandayan Kingdom* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990); David Matless, "An Occasion for Geography - Landscape, Representation and Foucault Corpus," *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 10, no. 1 (1992).

possible to define this 'metaphorical' form of performance as one in which the individuals involved would not primarily consider themselves as performers (or often as audience members). To expand on this use of performance, the below sections split the metaphorical application of the term into two forms, the first employing aspects of dramaturgy, and the second drawing upon theories of performativity.

Dramaturgy

One strand of this figurative use derives from Goffman7, and explores how certain forms of social interaction are site-specific. Manners of relating and positioning are understood to occur through the influencing activity of participants in particular scenes. The language of performance becomes a means of explaining how social interaction results in the adoption and delineation of roles that deviate from the 'backstage' reality of the situation; Crang's8 exploration of the different forms of display enacted by the waiter in the restaurant verses the kitchen being a key example. Whilst the use of performance here enables an examination of how any sense of self might arise from the immediateness of a given situation, it does not adequately explain the delineation of the bounds of performance. In Goffman's invocation of performance, the self retains a stability located at the backstage, but the question of where and why the limits of this essence are drawn is not properly considered. This can be demonstrated by returning to Crang's example: what makes the waiter in the kitchen more 'real' than the waiter in the restaurant? In addition, a second dramaturgical use of performance as metaphor can be discerned and like Goffman, applies dramaturgical metaphor, but in neither such a site-specific nor structured manner. Instead, the explanatory potential of the metaphor shifts from pinpointing confined localities of interaction to performance as a means of elucidating the experiential aspects of an activity that plays on the senses in a way that may exaggerate or undermine the reality of events. This use of the term has tended to be applied to forms of cultural display, particularly tourism9 and museums10 where performance is employed as a means of making sense of the realities of certain practices of showing. So rather than setting up certain situated actions as performances, specific forms of enhanced visibility are sharpened through the vocabulary of performance (such as staging, embodiment and encounter).

Permativity

Performativity draws upon but differs from the meaning of performance, often increasingly blurring the boundaries of reality. It incorporates the idea of situated 'acts' from performance, but suggests that these are constitutors rather than reflectors of reality. Numerous explorations of the processes of performativity in relation to space and identity[11] emerged in human geography in the 1990s, primarily deriving from Judith Butler's[12] argument for the social construction of sexuality and gender through a reworking of Austin's speech act theory. Butler's work can be understood as part of a broader post-structural movement (often driven by feminist and post-colonial scholars) that conceived of identity as non-essentialist, and thereby attempted to undermine the normative social placing and coherence of categories such as gender and race[13]. Contributing to this, Butler invoked

---

[7] Erving Goffman, *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life* (London: Penguin, 1990).

[8] Philip Crang, "It's Showtime: On the Workplace Geographies of Display in Southeast England," *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 12(1994).

[9] Simon Coleman and Mike Crang, eds., *Tourism: Between Place and Performance* (Oxford: Berghahn,2002); Jane Desmond, *Staging Tourism : Bodies on Display from Waikiki to Sea World* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999); Eric Wiley, "Wilderness Theatre - Environmental Tourism and Cajun Swamp Tours," *The Drama Review: TDR* 46, no. 3 (2002).

[10] Barbara Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, *Destination Culture : Tourism, Museums, and Heritage* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998).

[11] David Bell et al., "All Hyped up and No Place to Go," *Gender, Place & Culture* 1, no. 1 (1994).

[12] Judith Butler, *Bodies That Matter : On the Discursive Limits Of "Sex"* (New York ; London: Routledge, 1993).

[13] For example P. Gilroy, *The Black Atlantic : Modernity and Double Consciousness* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1993); Elizabeth Grosz, *Volatile Bodies: Towards a Corporeal Feminism* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1994).

the *performative* as a means of undermining the stability of the subject, as well as the certainty of self. Integrally, the meaning of an act was only given through the referential nature of its execution, which always connected it to previous acts. Through this individual and collective citation of previous meanings, normative conceptualisations of gender and sexuality are both produced and reproduced.

Although a crucial goal of Butler's project was to expose the operations of 'power' in the construction of identities, she also highlighted the importance of resistance. She argued that the force of the performative came not only through repetition, but also through deviation from this path[14]. Here, performance appears primarily as a scripting and constraining, a way of thinking about the conditions and conditioning of reality. Yet, consequently a sense of the art of performance is lost; particularly its creativity and possibility. Butler catches performance in a binary net of citation and resistance that relies on the repetition of that which already exists, avoiding the potential for experiment and improvisation. Equally, as a figurative invocation, her use of performativity and its particular genealogy in linguistics, means that (especially in scholarship that builds upon this theorisation) a gap has tended to open up between the discursivity of societal norms and the materiality of embodied acts of resistance and citation[15].

However, the ability of both performance and performativity to highlight such interactions between matter and form continues to be central to the utility of the term. In particular, a more nuanced understanding of the operations of performativity is emerging, one that attempts to move beyond the simplicity of a material/discursive binary. Performativity (and performance) is increasingly being employed to emphasise the complex registers through which the constitution and negotiation of human subjects takes place. Such explorations demonstrate how the conditions and conditioning of subjectivity cannot be limited to an isolated (and often textual) social construction, but involve everyday practices of embodiment and emotion[16].

Equally, there has also been a shift in focus onto the ethico-political implications of the performative process[17], emphasising how this may operate beyond the constitution of an autonomous human subject. Thus, Bialasiewicz *et al* [18] argue for an engagement with performativity in political geography on the grounds that the notion can enhance understanding of foreign and security policies by demonstrating that such activities of the state are both enabled by and productive of specific geographical imaginations. For them, the central role of the discursive in performativity neither denies nor separates the reality of the world; rather the focus is on how certain 'ontological effects', including the material, are stabilised over time. Therefore, discourse is not understood as a solely linguistic realm; instead its ideational effects may function through a variety of forms, many of which emphasise people and practices operating beyond the normative conception of an 'official' state. This concern with how performance might be used to deal with and negotiate the (invisibility of the) everyday feeds into the second broad invocation of performance in the discipline.

Using Performance as Action

In part emerging as a critique of performativity, a second more 'literal' appearance of performance can be discerned in human geography. Here, the term is invoked in relation to the action of specific performing arts events. Where the above metaphorical use stresses the boundaries

---

[14] Judith Butler, *Excitable Speech: A Politics of the Performative* (London: Routledge, 1997).

[15] For critiques of performativity see Seyla Benhabib, "Sexual Difference and Collective Identities: The New Global Constellation," *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 24(1999); Moya Lloyd, "Performativity, Parody and Politics," *Theory, Culture & Society* 16, no. 2 (1999); Lise Nelson, "Bodies (and Spaces) Do Matter: The Limits of Performativity," *Gender Place and Culture* 6, no. 4 (1999).

[16] Paul Cloke, Jon May, and Sarah Johnsen, "Performativity and Affect in the Homeless City," *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 26, no. 2 (2008); Craig Jeffrey and Colin McFarlane, "Performing Cosmopolitanism," *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 26, no. 3 (2008).

[17] Vikki Bell, *Culture and Performance: The Challenge of Ethics, Politics and Feminist Theory* (Oxford: Berg, 2007); Judith Butler, *Precarious Life: The Powers of Mourning and Violence* (London: Verso, 2004).

[18] Luiza Bialasiewicz et al., "Performing Security: The Imaginative Geographies of Current Us Strategy," *Political Geography* 26, no. 4 (2007).

of performance in certain ways by working with and through its definition, this second application draws more heavily on its constituting content or experience in relation to forms of politics. These more overt political applications are discussed in two parts below, the first exploring non-representational aspects of performance events and the second examining their role as acts of intervention in the everyday.

Non-representational politica

One element of non-representational politics seeks to outline and explore theories of non-representation[19], or the manner in which the bodily acts of performance illustrate ways of being that elude capture[20]. With a particular focus on non-linguistic forms of performance such as dance and music[21], this work set itself against the prevailing location of knowledge in 'textual' forms in order to draw out how embodied practices might make up the explanation and content of experience. The motivation for this work has been to examine how the experiential aspects of these occasions might fit into a wider politics of the event[22]. Empirical vignettes become a means of elucidating the 'going on' of such performances, in which forms of liberation and control unfold politically in moments of potential and uncertainty. However, such a reworking of the notion of power through performance was accused of being celebratory and neglecting to engage with the conditions that might constrain the potential of acts of habituation[23]. In this vein, both Revill's and Cresswell's[24] explorations of dance demonstrate the necessity to take into account wider normative structures that must be negotiated in order to open up the liberating possibilities of practice (in performance).

Despite these criticisms, the novelty of this exploration of performance events lies in the central emphasis on momentary experience as a means of understanding subjectivity. Here, there is a very separate understanding of difference from that offered in Butler's conception of performativity. As Bell[25] outlines, Butler's subject retains a certain stability through its constituting definition against that which lies outside of it. So, 'difference' is understood as outside or beyond the subject, even if it is constitutively bound up with it. In contrast to this, much of the work on performance events alluded to above has drawn on a more 'radical' location of difference, one that situates it *within* any process of subjectification. For this, difference is no longer a mode of relation through which being is given, but rather it is *being itself*. Consequently, as an ongoing "expression of this heterogeneity"[26], subjectivity becomes bound up with creativity.

A number of geographers have sort to engage with this through the experience of performance. Whilst some such as Morton[27] have used performance to focus on how this understanding subjectivity can (or cannot) be accessed or captured empirically, others have emphasised the micro-dynamics of the unfolding of experience in performance. Of particular

---

[19] Ben Anderson and Paul Harrison, eds., *Taking-Place: Non-Representational Theories and Geography* (Farnham: Ashgate,2010).

[20] Nigel Thrift, "The Stillpoint: Resistance, Expressive Embodiment and Dance," in *Geographies of Resistance*, ed. S. Pile and M. Keith (London: Routledge, 1997).

[21] Ben Anderson, Frances Morton, and George Revill, "Practices of Music and Sound," *Social and Cultural Geography* 6(2005); Paul Simpson, "Chronic Everyday Life: Rhythmanalysing Street Performance," *Social & Cultural Geography* 9, no. 7 (2008); Nichola Wood, Michelle Duffy, and Susan J. Smith, "The Art of Doing (Geographies of) Music," *Environment and Planning D-Society & Space* 25, no. 5 (2007).

[22] Derek McCormack, "Thinking in Transition: The Affirmative Refrain of Experience/Experiment," in *Taking-Place: Non-Representational Theories and Geography*, ed. B. Anderson and P. Harrison (Farnham: Ashgate, 2010).

[23] Catherine Nash, "Performativity in Practice: Some Recent Work in Cultural Geography," *Progress in Human Geography* 24, no. 4 (2000).

[24] George. Revill, "Cultural Geographies in Practice: Performing French Folk Music: Dance, Authenticity and Nonrepresentational Theory," *Cultural Geographies* 11(2004); Tim Cresswell, "'You Cannot Shake That Shimmie Here': Producing Mobility on the Dance Floor," *Cultural Geographies* 13, no. 1 (2006).

[25] Bell, *Culture and Performance: The Challenge of Ethics, Politics and Feminist Theory*.

[26] *Ibid*. 104.

[27] Frances. Morton, "Performing Ethnography: Irish Traditional Music Sessions and New Methodological Spaces," *Social & Cultural Geography* 6, no. 5 (2005).

significance here is McCormack's work[28] that draws on Guattari's[29] understanding of "processual creativity" in order to consider how being in performance engenders an attunement to the unpredictable potential of experience. By attending to the experience of performance through the lens of the generative 'thinking spaces' of experiment, McCormack explores how "moods of responsiveness"[30] temper the event through a series of minor interventions that produce differing degrees of control. This use of the performance event emphasises a subjectivity that is orientated towards the future, balancing intention and accident through the lens of not fully controlled experimentation.

Politics of Intervention

In contrast to this investigation of the action of performance to explore the politics of the event through processes of subjectification, another application in geography understands the event itself as a vehicle for change. Here performance operates as an intervention of a social and/or artistic nature. In some cases this intervention is one primarily aimed at disturbance, disrupting existing spatio-temporal orders through their occurrence in public space[31]. This rendering of the political potential of performance derives in part from the situationist desire to intervene in the 'spectacle' so as to gain immediate experience of the world and therefore transform the everyday. The politics here lie in the questions posed through exposure, particularly in why these happenings are often deemed out of place despite being within 'public' space. Such art tends to be acutely tuned to the dynamics of its particular site, picking up and reworking ordinary elements in a way that estranges them, thereby drawing attention to the processes of viewing[32]. In other cases, these forms of intervention are explored with a more creative (rather than disruptive) emphasis that sees performance as providing an arena for imagining alternative presents and futures. Within human geography, these ideas have often been elaborated through an engagement with forms of community theatre[33]. Whilst the politics of such performance is in part based around notions of reclaiming theatre for the 'people'[34], geographers have tended to approach such notions critically, questioning both the ideas of community evoked[35] and the manner in which enacted changes may extend beyond the performance space[36].

---

[28] Derek McCormack, "Diagramming Practice and Performance," *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 23, no. 1 (2005); ———, "Geographies for Moving Bodies: Thinking, Dancing, Spaces," *Geography Compass* 2, no. 6 (2008); McCormack, "Thinking in Transition: The Affirmative Refrain of Experience/Experiment."

[29] Felix Guattari, *Chaosmosis: An Ethico-Aesthetic Paradigm* (Indiana University Press, 1992), 13.

[30] McCormack, "Thinking in Transition: The Affirmative Refrain of Experience/Experiment." 210.

[31] David Pinder, "Urban Interventions: Art, Politics and Pedagogy," *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* 32, no. 3 (2008).

[32] Judith Rugg, *Exploring Site-Specific Art : Issues of Space and Internationalism* (London: I. B. Tauris, 2010).

[33] Donna Houston and Laura Pulido, "The Work of Performativity: Staging Social Justice at the University of Southern California," *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 20, no. 4 (2002); Erene Kaptani and Nira Yuval-Davis, "Participatory Theatre as a Research Methodology: Identity, Performance and Social Action among Refugees," *Sociological Research Online* 13, no. 5 (2008); Richa Nagar, "Women's Theater and the Redefinitions of Public, Private, and Politics in North India," *ACME: An International E-Journal for Critical Geographies* 1(2002).

[34] Augusto Boal, *Theatre of the Oppressed* (London: Pluto Press, 1979); Alan Read, "Theatre and Everyday Life," in *The Routledge Reader in Politics and Performance*, ed. Lizbeth Goodman and Jane De Gay (London: Routledge, 2000).

[35] Yvonne Natalie Robinson, "The Cultural Geographies of Community Theatre" (Unpublished PhD thesis, UCL, 2004).

[36] Gerry Pratt and Caleb Johnston, "Turning Theatre into Law, and Other Spaces of Politics," *Cultural Geographies* 14, no. 1 (2007).

One potentially fruitful direction for this interest in specific political interventions of performance may be what Pratt and Kirby[37] call the 'interspatiality' of performance. Although the forms of community theatre outlined above retain a strong element of stability through their performance in a specific location (e.g. community centres, pubs etc.), Pratt and Kirby argue that the multiple spaces that inform performance are integral to its potential as an object of study. Rather than placing all the emphasis on experience of/in the event, this is considered the practices and processes that enable and are enabled by performance.

Central to this is the composition of performance, or an exploration of the Brechtian interest in exposing the production of the production. For example, in forms of 'community theatre' the practices and conversations that precede the performance entirely shape experience and understanding of the event, particularly in terms of framing how questions of ownership and representation are played out[38]. Equally, this interspatiality is also about the potential ways for performance to linger or impact after the 'event' has taken place. As Pratt and Johnston's foray into legislative theatre demonstrates, the potential of performance to bring about political and, specifically in their case, policy change must not be overestimated, particularly given the apparent incongruities between creative practice and bureaucratic operation. However, the notion of performance as social forum or laboratory for conducting practical experiments of everyday life[39] is an attractive one that begs certain questions, notably in terms of the forms and registers through which the 'results' of these experiments may be played out.

Conclusion

This article has offered an overview of the ways in which the term *performance* has been invoked in human geography. Although only a brief and inherently partial account of the term in the discipline, this attempt has been to situate the trajectory of performance within the shift in focus of cultural geography over the last two decades. I have demonstrated that from its early appearances in this sub-discipline, the use of performance has both broadened and deepened as its theoretical and empirical scope has been further explored across human geography as a whole. With the aim of synthesising these many invocations of performance, the article split the use of the term into the figurative and the literal. The purpose of this was to draw out the nuances in the application and function of the term, each of which has its own benefits and problems. In its metaphorical form, the use of performance has tended to focus on the delineation and operation of boundaries, such that it can highlight the processes through which subjects are given but may often overly constraint such subjectivities. With performance as event, the interest has resided in the ethico-political implications of the action of performance, either in terms of the unfolding of subjectivity or in the ways it might engender 'community' change, but generally with little discussion of the limits of these actions themselves. Although these two uses certainly overlap, the point that I wish to make in this conclusion is that an explicit thinking can enhance productivity of any theoretical or empirical engagement with performance across these metaphorical and literal dimensions. As the more recent scholarship cited above begins to show, the potential of the action of performance is always bound up with its figurative possibilities.

One-way of attending to these expressive movements might be to explore the aesthetics of performance. However, the work of aesthetics here would not be to contain performance for the purposes of critical judgement, reinforcing a distinction between representation and the world. Rather, this conceptualisation of the aesthetic derives from Ranciere[40] whose notion of a "distribution of the sensible" firmly defines the modes of engagement engendered by art as political and by arguing that they pertain simultaneously to forms of inclusion and exclusion. So, in outlining

---

[37] Gerry Pratt and Elia Kirby, "Performing Nursing: Bc Nurses' Union Theatre Project," *ACME* 2, no. 1 (2003).

[38] Shulamith Lev-Aladgem, "Whose Play Is It?: The Issue of Authorship/Ownership in Israeli Community-Based Theatre," *The Drama Review: TDR* 48, no. 3 (2004); Celina McEwen, "An Empowering Practice?: Urban Theatre Projects' Recent Work in Residence, Community Cultural Development and International Arts Festivals," *Australasian Drama Studies* (2007).

[39] Dan Friedman, "A Performance Community Onstage and on the Street: Castillo Theatre and Heiner Müller's "Germania 3"," *The Drama Review: TDR* 47, no. 3 (2003).

[40] Jacques Ranciere, *The Politics of Aesthetics*, trans. Gabriel Rockhill (London: Continuum, 2004), 12.

the "aesthetic regime of art", Ranciere[41] focuses neither on the content nor on the question of what defines a particular artistic form. Instead, the suggestion is that the aesthetic should combine the theoretical and the practical through an elucidation of "the conditions that produce both appearances and the reality they either conceal or disclose"[42]. The possibility of art as political force is not of the order of disruption wrought through the creative act. Rather, the politics of art lie in the assimilative operations of perception at work in both performance and the world that produces the possibility for rupture. Such an understanding of the aesthetic – as a process that both establishes the manner in which something is common and simultaneously the individual and exclusive parts of that commonality - opens a means of thinking through forms of subjectivity. In attending to the conditions of perception that are at work in performance and beyond, we might be able to explore how certain boundaries of visibility occur to delineate particular groups or 'objects', and equally importantly, the ways in which these divisions might be breeched. This would be to interrogate the notion of subjectivity that Phelan[43] outlines through her theorisation of performance as disappearance, by asking how it is that both presence and absence coexist in the event.

Practically, such an aesthetic approach would attempt to identify how performance can be productive in the midst of the two different notions of subjectivity as outlined above. This might involve considering how the sensibilities produced in the numerous registers of a performance continue after the event in certain ways. Here, the notion of subjectivity as irreducible difference given through creative process would meet with the constraints beyond the 'romantic' possibilities of the performance space. Equally, when exploring actions that are both constitutive of and constituted by the subject, it might be fruitful to consider how and through which mediums these acts occur and may be perceived. Such an investigation might highlight the instability and mutability of acts as definers of constraint and resistance. Thus, through this aesthetic approach, the numerous stabilisations and destabilisations of the individual that are evoked by performance – the simultaneous being what you are but also not what you are, the being more or less than what you are, the potential to be something else – must be considered to be expressed across any apparent boundaries between the conceptual and the material. Instead of trying to locate the limits of performance in order to define its articulation, the project becomes one of working with and through these inseparable bounding/boundary activities so as to give shape to their expressive movements. In this way the simultaneously figurative and literal nature of performance becomes a means of exploring how and for what purpose subjects become visible both individually and collectively, thereby moving beyond some of the early attempts to destabilise normative coherence and location of identities. Consequently, whilst the purpose and position of performance in human geography continues as a theoretical and empirical contribution to post-structural debates aimed at undermining the subject, the utility of terms is being expanded in order to think through the various 'material returns' to the discipline.

Bibliography

Anderson, Ben, and Paul Harrison, eds. *Taking-Place: Non-Representational Theories and Geography*. Farnham: Ashgate, 2010.

Anderson, Ben, Frances Morton, and George Revill. "Practices of Music and Sound." *Social and Cultural Geography* 6 2005: 639-44.

Baudrillard, Jean. "Simulations." New York: Semiotext, 1983.

Bell, David, Jon Binnie, Julia Cream, and Gill Valentine. "All Hyped up and No Place to Go." *Gender, Place & Culture* 1, no. 1 1994: 31 - 47.

Bell, Vikki. *Culture and Performance: The Challenge of Ethics, Politics and Feminist Theory*. Oxford: Berg, 2007.

Benhabib, Seyla. "Sexual Difference and Collective Identities: The New Global Constellation." *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 24 1999: 335-61.

---

[41] *Ibid.* 22.

[42] G. Rockhill, "The Silent Revolution," *SubStance* 33, no. 1 (2004): 56.

[43] Peggy Phelan, *Unmarked : The Politics of Performance* (London ; New York: Routledge, 1993).

Bialasiewicz, Luiza, David Campbell, Stuart Elden, Stephen Graham, Alex Jeffrey, and Alison J. Williams. "Performing Security: The Imaginative Geographies of Current Us Strategy." *Political Geography* 26, no. 4 2007: 405-22.

Binnie, Jon, and Gill Valentine. "Geographies of Sexuality: A Review of Progress." *Progress in Human Geography* 23, no. 2 1999: 175-87.

Boal, Augusto. *Theatre of the Oppressed*. London: Pluto Press, 1979.

Bonnett, Alastair. "Geography, 'Race' and Whiteness: Invisible Traditions and Current Challenges." *Area* 29, no. 3 1997: 193-99.

Butler, Judith. *Bodies That Matter : On the Discursive Limits Of "Sex"*. New York ; London: Routledge, 1993.

———. *Excitable Speech: A Politics of the Performative*. London: Routledge, 1997.

———. *Precarious Life: The Powers of Mourning and Violence*. London: Verso, 2004.

Cloke, Paul, Jon May, and Sarah Johnsen. "Performativity and Affect in the Homeless City." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 26, no. 2 2008: 241-63.

Coleman, Simon, and Mike Crang, eds. *Tourism: Between Place and Performance*. Oxford: Berghahn, 2002.

Crang, Philip. "It's Showtime: On the Workplace Geographies of Display in Southeast England." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 12 1994: 675-704.

Cresswell, Tim. "'You Cannot Shake That Shimmie Here': Producing Mobility on the Dance Floor." *Cultural Geographies* 13, no. 1 2006: 55-77.

Desmond, Jane. *Staging Tourism : Bodies on Display from Waikiki to Sea World*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999.

Duncan, James S. *The City as Text: The Politics of Landscape Interpretation in the Kandayan Kingdom*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990.

Friedman, Dan. "A Performance Community Onstage and on the Street: Castillo Theatre and Heiner Müller's "Germania 3"." *The Drama Review: TDR* 47, no. 3 2003: 99-112.

Gilroy, P. *The Black Atlantic : Modernity and Double Consciousness*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1993.

Goffman, Erving. *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life*. London: Penguin, 1990.

Grosz, Elizabeth. *Volatile Bodies: Towards a Corporeal Feminism*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1994.

Guattari, Felix. *Chaosmosis: An Ethico-Aesthetic Paradigm*: Indiana University Press, 1992.

Houston, Donna, and Laura Pulido. "The Work of Performativity: Staging Social Justice at the University of Southern California." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 20, no. 4 2002: 401-24.

Jeffrey, Craig, and Colin McFarlane. "Performing Cosmopolitanism." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 26, no. 3 2008: 420-27.

Kaptani, Erene, and Nira Yuval-Davis. "Participatory Theatre as a Research Methodology: Identity, Performance and Social Action among Refugees." *Sociological Research Online* 13, no. 5 2008: 2.

Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, Barbara. *Destination Culture : Tourism, Museums, and Heritage*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998.

Kobayashi, Audrey, and Linda Peake. "Unnatural Discouse: 'Race' and Gender in Geography." *Gender Place and Culture* 1, no. 2 1994: 225-43.

Lev-Aladgem, Shulamith. "Whose Play Is It?: The Issue of Authorship/Ownership in Israeli Community-Based Theatre." *The Drama Review: TDR* 48, no. 3 2004: 117-34.

Lloyd, Moya. "Performativity, Parody and Politics." *Theory, Culture & Society* 16, no. 2 1999: 195-213.

Lyotard, Jean-Francois. *The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge*. Translated by George Bennington and Brian Massumi. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1984.

Massey, Doreen. *For Space*. London: Sage, 2005.

Matless, David. "An Occasion for Geography - Landscape, Representation and Foucault Corpus." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 10, no. 1 1992: 41-56.

McCormack, Derek. "Diagramming Practice and Performance." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 23, no. 1 2005: 119-47.

———. "Geographies for Moving Bodies: Thinking, Dancing, Spaces." *Geography Compass* 2, no. 6 2008: 1822-36.

———. "Thinking in Transition: The Affirmative Refrain of Experience/Experiment." In *Taking-Place: Non-Representational Theories and Geography*, edited by B. Anderson and P. Harrison. Farnham: Ashgate, 2010.

McEwen, Celina. "An Empowering Practice?: Urban Theatre Projects' Recent Work in Residence, Community Cultural Development and International Arts Festivals." *Australasian Drama Studies* 2007: 123.

Morton, Frances. "Performing Ethnography: Irish Traditional Music Sessions and New Methodological Spaces." *Social & Cultural Geography* 6, no. 5 2005: 661-76.

Nagar, Richa. "Women's Theater and the Redefinitions of Public, Private, and Politics in North India." *ACME: An International E-Journal for Critical Geographies* 1 2002: 55-72.

Nash, Catherine. "Performativity in Practice: Some Recent Work in Cultural Geography." *Progress in Human Geography* 24, no. 4 2000: 653-64.

Nelson, Lise. "Bodies (and Spaces) Do Matter: The Limits of Performativity." *Gender Place and Culture* 6, no. 4 1999: 331-53.

Phelan, Peggy. *Unmarked : The Politics of Performance*. London ; New York: Routledge, 1993.

Pinder, David. "Urban Interventions: Art, Politics and Pedagogy." *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* 32, no. 3 2008: 730-36.

Pratt, Gerry, and Susan Hansen. "Geography and the Construction of Difference." *Gender Place and Culture* 1, no. 1 1994: 5-29.

Pratt, Gerry, and Caleb Johnston. "Turning Theatre into Law, and Other Spaces of Politics." *Cultural Geographies* 14, no. 1 2007: 92-113.

Pratt, Gerry, and Elia Kirby. "Performing Nursing: Bc Nurses' Union Theatre Project." *ACME* 2, no. 1 2003: 14-32.

Ranciere, Jacques. *The Politics of Aesthetics*. Translated by Gabriel Rockhill. London: Continuum, 2004.

Read, Alan. "Theatre and Everyday Life." In *The Routledge Reader in Politics and Performance*, edited by Lizbeth Goodman and Jane De Gay. London: Routledge, 2000.

Revill, George. "Cultural Geographies in Practice: Performing French Folk Music: Dance, Authenticity and Nonrepresentational Theory." *Cultural Geographies* 11 2004: 199-209.

Robinson, Yvonne Natalie. "The Cultural Geographies of Community Theatre." Unpublished PhD thesis, UCL, 2004.

Rockhill, G. "The Silent Revolution." *SubStance* 33, no. 1 2004: 54-76.

Rugg, Judith. *Exploring Site-Specific Art : Issues of Space and Internationalism*. London: I. B. Tauris, 2010.

Sharp, Joanne. "A Topology of Post Nationality: (Re)Mapping Identity in the Satanic Verses." *Ecumene* 1, no. 1 1994: 65-76.

Simpson, Paul. "Chronic Everyday Life: Rhythmanalysing Street Performance." *Social & Cultural Geography* 9, no. 7 2008: 807-29.

Thrift, Nigel. "The Stillpoint: Resistance, Expressive Embodiment and Dance." In *Geographies of Resistance*, edited by S. Pile and M. Keith. London: Routledge, 1997.

Wiley, Eric. "Wilderness Theatre - Environmental Tourism and Cajun Swamp Tours." *The Drama Review: TDR* 46, no. 3 2002: 118-31.

Wood, Nichola, Michelle Duffy, and Susan J. Smith. "The Art of Doing (Geographies of) Music." *Environment and Planning D-Society & Space* 25, no. 5 2007: 867-89.

Elizabeth Richardson
Geography, Durham University
e.c.i.richardson@dur.ac.uk

Institute *of* Advanced Study

Durham University