



**Universitat de les
Illes Balears**

Facultat de Turisme

Memòria del Treball de Fi de Grau

The development of static cultural attraction of
urban tourism under the background of
homogenization
——A Comparative Study of Bilbao and Ningbo

Yuetong Liu

Grau de Turisme

Any acadèmic 2018-19

DNI de l'alumne: Y6451793-P

José María Carretero Gómez

Departament de Economía de la Empresa

S'autoritza la Universitat a incloure aquest treball en el Repositori Institucional per a la seva consulta en accés obert i difusió en línia, amb finalitats exclusivament acadèmiques i d'investigació	Autor		Tutor	
	Sí	No	Sí	No
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Paraules clau del treball:

Homogenization; Urban tourism; Cultural attractions; Urban brand; Differentiation

The development of static cultural attraction of urban tourism under the background of homogenization

——A Comparative Study of Bilbao and Ningbo

【ABSTRACT】

Urban homogenization is the inevitable result of urbanization and globalization. Modernization has strongly occupied the traditional cultural space, or has forced the elements of the city to be integrated with the elements of globalization, resulting in a phenomenon of “global urbanization”, no matter the the urban layout, the social functions of architectures, or people's consumption habits, they all gradually become the same in the subtle. In this context, the development of urban cultural attractions is particularly important. How to develop a competitive tourism industry and how to implement the positive significance while avoiding the negative impact of homogenization are all issues that deserve to be explored in depth. This paper starts with the development of tourism in the context of urban homogenization, comprehensively analyzes the current development of urban cultural attractions and the impact of homogenization on cultural attractions. Through the comparison between the case city of Bilbao in Spain and Ningbo in China, their cultural elements and main static cultural attractions will be studied. That is to say, the performance of static cultural attractions (the Guggenheim Museum and Ningbo Tianyi Pavilion) under the above-mentioned urban phenomenon. Finally, the article will provide suggestions for the city to shape the brand image and achieve differentiated competition.

【KEYWORDS】 Homogenization; Urban tourism; Cultural attractions; Urban brand; Differentiation

Content

1 Introduction.....	1
2 Literature review.....	3
3 Tourism Development under the Background of Urban Homogenization.....	5
3.1 The formation and development of urban homogenization	5
3.1.1 The root of homogenization - globalization and cultural homogenization.....	5
3.1.2 Standardization of urban form.....	6
3.2 Modern urban tourism under the trend of homogenization.....	6
3.2.1 Tourism product homogenization	6
3.2.2 Urban image dilemma under the trend of homogenization.....	7
4 Urban cultural Attractions	7
4.1 Cultural Attractions and their Performance in Tourism.....	7
4.1.1 Analysis of Tourism Culture Resources	7
4.1.2 Introduction of static cultural attractions	8
4.2 Homogenization of Cultural Attractions	9
4.2.1 The Influence of Urban Homogenization on Cultural Attractions	9
4.2.2 Homogenization of Cultural Attractions themselves	11
5 The development of urban cultural attraction in the post-homogeneous era	12
5.1 Comparative analysis of urban development and tourism status	12
5.1.1 Comparison of urban historical evolution and industrial development	12
5.1.2 Comparison of cultural attraction factors.....	13
5.2 Comparative analysis of urban homogenization.....	14
5.2.1 Urban development in the context of homogenization	14
5.2.2 Urban tourism development dilemma.....	16
5.3 Static Cultural Attraction and Urban Differentiation Strategy.....	17
5.3.1 The shaping of urban brand image in the post-homogeneous era	17
5.3.2 Analysis of differentiated competition strategy at the level of urban tourism	18
6 Conclusion.....	21
6.1 Research conclusions	21
6.2 Insufficient and prospect	21
Reference.....	23

1 Introduction

In the current development process of urbanization and modernization, the functions and landscapes of cities have begun to show wide-ranging convergence. Calvino once wrote in his book *Invisible City*, "You will arrive at another Trude, absolutely the same; the world is covered by the only Trude, she has no beginning and no end, only the name of the airport is changing".^[20] The absurdity of "every city seems to have met before" reveals the high similarity of the city in the modern context. The boundaries between cities and people's perception of the city are gradually blurred. The acceleration of globalization and the process of cultural homogenization has directly led to the homogenization of cities. Both urban layout, social functions of architecture and people's consumption habits have gradually tended to converge in the subtle.

The birth of this phenomenon has its advantages and disadvantages for the development of the city. The impact on the development of urban tourism needs further research and discussion. Under this trend, how should cities develop competitive tourism? How to practice the positive significance, such as improving infrastructure construction while avoiding the negative effects of homogenization is an issue that deserves to be discussed in depth. At present, there are many research literature on the process of urban homogenization in the world, and the research object of urban differentiation as the main tourism competition strategy has also received a lot of attention (Such as the study of destination culture, urban tourism capital and homogenization in the context of urbanization.). The similarity of cities is difficult to avoid in the process of rapid urbanization. On the one hand, homogenization can quickly realize urban modernization, solve infrastructure problems, and provide comprehensive services for tourists and residents. On the other hand, the trend of homogenization also poses a threat to tourism competitiveness. How to explore the specific impact of homogenization on tourism in the current urban development context has always been a part of the need to study.

The existing literature research shows us that the root cause of urban homogenization is globalization and cultural homogenization.^[5] On the one hand, this cultural homogenization refers to the convergence of people's consumption culture, and on the other hand, it shows that traditional or unique culture is disappearing and losing. Modernization has strongly occupied the traditional cultural space, or forced the city's own elements to integrate with the elements of globalization, resulting in a phenomenon of "global urbanization." In this context, the development of urban cultural attractions is particularly important.

Munster distinguishes cultural tourism attractions into static attractions and dynamic attractions.^[13] Static cultural tourism attractions include cultural relics, museums, tourism special routes, theme parks and other tourist attractions with urban buildings as the main attraction, meanwhile dynamic cultural tourism attractions include historical and cultural events and artistic activities. As a component of urban landscape and a carrier of urban culture, static cultural attraction is of great significance to the study of urban homogenization. The cultural attraction mentioned in the following article mainly refers to this kind of static cultural attraction.

In order to make the project more convincing, this article will select Ningbo (China) and Bilbao (Spain) as examples of case analysis, Bilbao and Ningbo have many things in common. First of all, They are all regional economic centers, famous port cities, and famous for their business and industry. At the same time, tourism is not their pillar industry, but from this century, the two places are all looking forward to transforming into a tourist city. Culturally, as an important external communication bridge in the history of the two countries, the two countries have a high degree of modernization and a high degree of cultural tolerance. Humanistic attractions in both cities are more eye-catching than natural attractions. Therefore, the two places are typical representatives of tourism resources and the homogenization of urban tourism development model. Both China and Spain are important destination countries in the world, and the above two representative cities are important for research. I will first study the degree of homogenization and the possible future development direction through analysis of urban landscape similarity, tourism attractions, tourism patterns, and tourist resources. What is the tourism development status of the two places and the level of tourists' consumption? How to create and attract consumption to a greater extent? What is the role of the cultural industry in it? How to achieve differentiated competition according to local conditions? These will be the focus of my analysis.

Secondly, the Guggenheim Museum in Bilbao is largely a decisive factor in attracting tourists. This modern art museum plays an important role in the development of its tourism industry and is also a symbol of its urban culture. Similarly, Ningbo Tianyi Pavilion is also an important cultural attraction in the area. Ningbo's urban tourism propaganda slogan is "Books collected from all the periods and the port leading to the world", which shows that Tianyi Pavilion played a vital role in local tourism. However, Tianyi Pavilion is an important cultural tourism attraction in Ningbo, but its popularity is still low. In the propaganda of Ningbo urban culture, its role has not been well played. The similarities and differences between the two cities are interesting comparative analysis objects. In the shaping of the city image, the positioning of urban

tourism and the development of related industries, what is the reference and value of the Guggenheim Museum to Tianyi Pavilion? Can Tianyi Pavilion in Ningbo integrate its geographical and temporal advantages and give full play to its unique cultural characteristics, and become a “Chinese version of the Guggenheim Museum” with a more historical atmosphere? I am looking forward to the results from the comparative analysis.

2 Literature review

According to the 2017 World Tourism Economic Trend Report, despite the weak global economic recovery, the growth rate of the tourism economy is still significantly higher than that of the world economy and has become the main driving force for the recovery of the world economy. City has become the center of the world tourism economy, the core bearing place and birthplace of the tourism economy. ^[1] The consumption of the world tourism economy mainly comes from the urban population, and city is the main source of tourists for world tourism. At the same time, the city is also the source of world tourism innovation. Cities have nurtured new business models, marketing models, management models and tourism products. City is also a model for exploring the integration of tourism and modern life. Tourism has become the main support for urban organic renewal and economic rejuvenation. The interaction between cities and tourism is the best representation of a healthy and sustainable modern lifestyle. Dennis R. Judd summed up the measures taken by the United States to develop urban tourism, such as shaping new regional image, rebuilding declining areas, attracting business travel, building large shopping centers and entertainment areas to enhance the attractiveness of urban tourism.^[2]

However, in the process of rapid urbanization in the world, urban landscape homogenization is rampant, and the existence of local differences is seriously neglected. The urban construction and transformation led by economic benefits have caused the urban environmental characteristics to disappear and the ecological environment gradually degraded. The face is blurred and converging. ^[3] The development of tourism in a certain sense assimilate the functional areas of the city, bringing a commercial atmosphere that caters to high consumption, and may simplify or completely obliterate the cultural significance of the city. ^[4] Sharon Zukin has clearly pointed out that the reasons for the homogenization of contemporary cities can be attributed to globalization and the homogenization

of culture. For tourists who traveling around the world, most cities have been inadvertently “standardized”.^[5] Aspa Gospodini gives a concrete explanation of this standardization in his article , He believes that the development of modern science and technology blurs the boundaries of social activities. Work, creativity, entertainment and leisure happen in spaces where there is no clear functional identity – people start doing the same things in different spatial environments.^[6] From this we can see that the development of economy and new technology blurs the boundaries between daily social places, making the functions of each place begin to be homogenized, and there is no clear boundary for all the places where daily activities take place. In urban tourism, people have a "anti-structure" pursuit of the formal dimension of the city,^[6] that is, tourists are eager to focus on another center's activities different from their daily lives. Therefore, in the process of urban homogenization, the pursuit of a kind of tourism structure and form of "anti-convergence" has become the primary consideration of current government and tourism enterprise decision-makers.

The study of urban homogenization and spatial layout planning will eventually return to the essence of urban tourism competitiveness. In the study of the specific influencing factors of urban tourism competitiveness, the core attraction factors and brand image factors of urban tourism should be clarified. The core attraction refers to the tourism attraction, unique brand attraction, brand project and first-class attraction of the characteristic tourist city. It can form the core ability that competitors can hardly imitate and replace, and is the basis of regional tourism competition.^[7] The unique brand image of the city is finally formed on the basis of location factors, tourism environmental factors, core attraction factors and urban image factors.^[8] Among the two cities I am comparing, Bilbao has the Guggenheim Museum of Modern Art, and Ningbo Tianyi Pavilion is the earliest private collection in China. It is one of the oldest libraries in Asia and one of the world's first three family libraries. It is also a must-see for tourists visiting Ningbo. Although the two museums were different in their initial construction, their status in the local tourism industry has gradually tended to converge in the long-term urbanization process. Coincidentally, Ningbo and Bilbao are both important port cities in the country and the focus of their regional economy. They are all famous for their business and industry. Although tourism is not the mainstay of economic development in these two cities, since the beginning of the 21st century, both of them have begun to make efforts to transform tourism cities.

In the comparison of the two museums, the first thing to be identified is the type of attraction. In his work, Greg Richards introduces the concept of “static cultural attractions” and incorporates museums, which are distinguished from dynamic tourist attractions such as exhibitions and performances. At the same

time, the article shows that culture, as an important tourism resource, has always been favored by European tourists and has contributed greatly to the European tourism industry. Its status cannot be underestimated. At the same time, the author also believes that for repeat visitors and “general cultural tourists”, the demand for a real cultural experience will be less urgent. For these visitors, learning and entertainment, advanced and pop culture, the combination of tradition and innovation may be the most appealing things.^[9] Therefore, how to combine static cultural attractions with dynamic urban development to highlight the unique differences of urban tourism will become an important research topic.

3 Tourism Development under the Background of Urban Homogenization

3.1 The formation and development of urban homogenization

3.1.1 The root of homogenization - globalization and cultural homogenization

As an important living and activity space for human beings, cities bear the development of the global economy and culture. As the degree of urbanization continues to deepen, the urban population continues to rise, and the level of economy and technology continues to increase. Since the 1980s, the phenomenon of "globalization" has begun to enter people's attention, and the all-round urbanization and modernization in the context of globalization. On the one hand, urban life is more convenient, and the links between industries are closer. On the other hand, the pace of urban development is accelerating, and the development strategy dominated by economic benefits has become a competitive strategy accepted by more business decision makers. Under this trend, office buildings, business districts, and real estate projects have emerged in an endless stream, and a number of eye-catching corporate logos appear in every corner of every city. The operation and accumulation of such land capital has spawned a large number of large “chain” business districts, gradually marginalize the city's uniqueness and lifestyle diversity.

At the same time, cultural development in the context of globalization has also been homogenized. Cultural products from all over the world have traveled through time and space, and have crossed countless national borders, affecting the cultural development process of every global participant. Foreign culture and local culture interact and integrate each other. This cultural globalization

has caused some degree of the homogenization of culture. As the globalization process continues to accelerate and cultural homogenization becomes more severe, cities seem to be “chained” in this process.

3.1.2 Standardization of urban form

The homogenization of cities solves many infrastructure problems. The “standardized” urban landscapes provide more diverse urban services and urban functions to a certain extent, making the life of urban residents more convenient and efficient. But behind this high efficiency, it hides the blurring of the boundaries between various social activity spaces. Work, creation, entertainment and leisure will take place in a space without a clear functional identity, and all places where daily activities take place are no longer clearly defined. For example, the functions of shopping malls are not limited to shopping and consumption. Shopping malls have become a collection of restaurants, cinemas, exhibition halls, gymnasiums, etc., and office buildings not only provide workplaces. In order to attract more enterprises, office buildings have become a combination of office space and recreational space. The form of daily life space has become the same, which makes people have different requirements for the spatial structure and design of tourism destinations during the tourism process. People cannot accept to travel from one Shanghai to another.

3.2 Modern urban tourism under the trend of homogenization

3.2.1 Tourism product homogenization

This homogenization is mainly reflected in tourism products and tourist attractions. When the design and construction of tourism products are mainly oriented to the economy, it seems that the “opportunity cost” of spending resources and financial resources to create a new and unique tourism product is quite high. At this time, the choice that can bring economic benefits quickly is copying successful tourism development models and similar products. ^[10] It is difficult to have outstanding independent tourism products in this economic value-oriented atmosphere. On the other hand, this simple plagiarism is also due to the lack of understanding of urban characteristics by urban decision makers. It is a commonplace to develop tourism in accordance with local conditions, but most urban policy makers are only trying to take a slice of this industry that has a multiplier effect on economic development, but are not willing to invest in tourism product development. Many cities that do not have the conditions and resources for tourism development try to improve their tourism industry by copying the development model of tourism cities. These are very unwise. In China, a typical urban phenomenon is that each city has a commercial pedestrian street specially dedicated to tourists. This type of

pedestrian street sells local food and tourist souvenirs. There are many chain shops, but with no special memory points. Most of them cannot display the unique cultural features of the city. Most of the tourist flows are made up of tourists who are visiting for the first time. This kind of commercial attractions built specifically for tourists is actually a microcosm of high homogenization. Ningbo Nantang Old Street and Nanjing Confucius Temple are typical representatives of this phenomenon.

3.2.2 Urban image dilemma under the trend of homogenization

An important result of the homogenization of tourism products is the problem of unclear positioning of urban tourism images. The lack of featured tourism products can lead to difficult urban image positioning and vague public perception. In the positioning of urban tourism image, it is necessary to consider not only the geographical and cultural background, economic development status, and main source groups, ^[11]but also the analysis of how to integrate these objective elements with tourism resources and tourism attraction elements to highlight urban personality. On the basis of infrastructure construction, urban landscape construction should also be integrated with urban positioning to create a unique urban atmosphere.

When tourism becomes an independent discipline, tourism behavior is defined as an art of “escape”, which aims to let people escape from the familiar environment and rhythm of daily life. Tourism as a high-level human needs, from this level “feeling” is much more important than “experience”. If “feeling” is also homogenized, then the recreational significance of urban tourism will be greatly reduced. Therefore, how to create a unique city brand and bring unique feelings to tourists has become a question worth considering.

4 Urban cultural Attractions

4.1 Cultural Attractions and their Performance in Tourism

Michael Porter, the father of competitive strategy, once mentioned: “The culturally based advantage is the most fundamental, most difficult to replace and imitation, and it is also the most enduring and core competitive advantage.”^[7] It can be seen that when the problem of urban homogeneity is serious and the decision-making of tourism development encounters bottlenecks, the organic combination of cultural industry and tourism has become a feasible channel. Urban cultural tourism is an important strategy to realize urban differentiation.

4.1.1 Analysis of Tourism Culture Resources

Cultural resources refer to the resource elements created by human beings and of a cultural nature, are the creations of human society. Zhenchun Song mentions that cultural resources can be “capitalized” and transformed into a kind of cultural capital, thus bringing economic value to human society^[12]. In the context of urban tourism development, cultural capital is not only a static cultural attraction or cultural product, but also a dynamic expression of emotion and material. With the continuous development of social economy and the iteration of culture, cultural capital is also constantly evolving. Thence in the process of dynamic change, correspondingly, when studying urban cultural capital, the first issue should be to clarify the historical remains of the city, location factors, macro policies, and infrastructure. In cities such as Rome, Athens, and Xi'an in China, where historical preservation is the main cultural resource, the focus should be on how to apply historical advantages and develop tourism on the basis of protecting historic resources. In contrast, in cities such as Shanghai and New York, where modernization is high and capital advantages are obvious but historical resources are lacking, the focus of developing cultural tourism should be how to use regional cultural tolerance and economic advantages to multi-dimensionally innovative cultural resources. In another category of cities with both capital and historical advantages, such as Barcelona and Beijing, how to combine existing cultural foundations with material conditions and acquire new cultural capital on this basis is the key to improving the competitiveness of urban tourism.^[12] The acquisition and guarantee of cultural capital is closely related to the city's own economic development capability. Cities should integrate their own resource advantages and clarify the ability and barriers of tourism development in order to gain the proliferation of “cultural value” without falling into the trap of urban homogenization. Due to the particularity of the cultural attractions of the cases I selected, I will focus on static cultural attractions below.

4.1.2 Introduction of static cultural attractions

Tourist attraction refers to various things and elements that can attract tourists in nature and human society, and is the object and core element of tourism activities. In general, tourism attractions refer to “tangible” tourism resources, including natural tourism resources and humanistic tourism resources; generalized tourism attractions also include some “intangible” tourism resources such as tourism services, social and cultural atmosphere, institutional regulations, the lifestyle of local residents, etc.^[13] The definition of the concept of tourism attraction itself has certain cultural significance. The construction of the meaning of attraction includes the process of cultural production, which refers to the transfer of certain social and cultural values to the tourist attraction during the development of cultural products and cultural attractions, so that the tourist attraction has a certain symbol value and consumption value. From the

point of view of the meaning conversion model, that is, compared with the consumption of physical products, tourists are more inclined to consume on a spiritual level, the consumption process of tourists' tourism products is more like a consumption process of symbolic meanings. ^[14] This requires a systematic development of tourism in the process of tourism product development, matching the image, values and cultural atmosphere of the city. On the other hand, Munster^[9] distinguishes cultural tourism attractions into static attractions and dynamic attractions. Static cultural tourism attractions include cultural relics, museums, theme parks and other tourist attractions with urban buildings as the main attraction. Dynamic cultural tourism attractions include historical and cultural events, art events and exhibitions. Static cultural attractions as an important part of urban landscape and the carrier and material basis of urban culture are of great significance to the study of urban homogenization. The cultural attractions in the following texts mainly refer to such static cultural attractions.

4.2 Homogenization of Cultural Attractions

When we relate homogenization problems to cultural attractions, it mainly refers to the role of urban homogenization in cultural attractions and the series of results of homogenization of cultural attractions as tourism products.

4.2.1 The Influence of Urban Homogenization on Cultural Attractions

As I mentioned above, people's consumption process of tourism products is actually a consumption process of symbolic meanings. As an abstract concept, culture must rely on its material carrier to be transformed into cultural capital. At the same time, the symbolic meaning of culture cannot exist independently from its unique maternal body. Therefore, some scholars have pointed out that tourism is the most direct way to inject culture into the mainstream commercial market and to achieve profit. ^[12] As an important means for tourists to understand the history of urban culture and enrich their own knowledge, cultural attraction is the most intuitive and effective way to connect tourists with urban connotation.

In this context, the homogenization of cities will have a profound impact on the development of cultural attractions. On the positive side, the homogenization of infrastructure can effectively improve the accessibility and reception level of cultural attractions. Standardized tourism services can optimize the visitor experience, provide a culturally immersive experience, and resonate between culture and audience. A complete tourism facility can improve the image of the destination to a certain extent, strengthen the interaction between the tourism industry and its surrounding industries, and create a cultural industry chain to help shape the image of the city.

At the same time, however, if we only pursue one-sided pursuit of rapid changes in cultural values and rapid appreciation of the tourism industry, all of them are guided by short-term interests. Without clarifying the positioning of urban tourism development, we will rush to copy successful experiences without localizing them. It is easy for the city to fall into the “homogeneous trap”. The homogenization of cities will make the tourist attractions that have been built and have historical and cultural values unable to exert their cultural values properly, and the influence will be weakened under the influence of market competition mechanism. The loss of the value of such attractions will, to a certain extent, lead to the disappearance of unique memories of the city and the blurring of the image of the city. In this commercial atmosphere, some cultural attractions with important cultural and historical connotations but not with commercial development conditions may be marginalized, and many cultural attractions that can create commercial benefits in a short period of time do not have profound cultural and representative connotations..The construction of cities is like the operation of assembly lines. Cultural products are produced quickly and in large quantities, and they are widely converged from the main body of cultural architecture to various consumption links. In this process, the regional characteristics of urban culture are far from being able to withstand the more universal power. Especially in the modern background of consumer culture, this kind of culture has strongly classified many other cultures into the logic of it, thus weakening the diversification of urban culture. [15] The basic elements of tourism can be summarized as "food, accommodation, transportation, sightseeing, shopping, entertainment", but with the change of consumerism and tourism patterns, the weight of sightseeing tourism in travel has declined, tourism for the purpose of leisure vacation has prevailed. Cultural attraction has become a kind of “additional value” of tourism behavior and has become a “related industry” of tourism. Many travel agencies and property owners only focus on “food, accommodation and transportation” and the development of shopping and entertainment products during project design. The development of these projects does not require strong cultural background support. All cities with economic ability to meet the conditions can develop such leisure tourism,[10] this has resulted in similar tourism products between cities, and the urban landscape is almost the same, which undoubtedly poses a challenge to the differentiation strategy.

At the same time, it is necessary to be wary that not only the culture that pursues “standardization” in the industrial era is easily imitated, but also the “diversified innovation” pursued in the post-industrial era. Especially in the absence of unified urban planning, “creative” is also prone to homogenization.

4.2.2 Homogenization of Cultural Attractions themselves

Under the influence of external effects, cultural attractions themselves as tourism products are also easily affected by homogenization in the process of development and design.

Cultural attractions based on cultural relics and historic sites will face “management homogenization”. In the development process, such tourism attractions need to focus on protection and development in parallel, and how to mediate conflicts between people and land without disturbing the tourist experience, as well as the protection of historical relics, require decision makers to “internalize” external experience and consider local resources and environmental conditions. Blindly developing or protecting cannot exert the true value of cultural attractions.

And cultural attractions based on emerging cultural and creative industries are easily affected by “creative homogenization” in the early design stage. During the prosperous period of modernism, a large number of art parks with cultural and creative industries were built. The typical successful representative was Beijing 798 Art Park. As China's first-generation art creative park, it successfully completed the transformation of geo-spatial space, transforming the dilapidated factory area into the most modern and creative cultural space in Beijing, and making the diverse designs, ideas and trends coexist. This is also a typical example of the integration of business and culture. It retains the Bauhaus architectural style while incorporating new and unique design concepts. The business district and the cultural district, the main body of the building and the overall style of the park echo each other. Static and dynamic cultural attractions work together to combine art with popular life, giving the park a high level of visibility and recognition. The Guggenheim Museum in Bilbao, which will be highlighted later, is also a successful case. In China, the success of Beijing 798 has led to the construction of a large number of cultural and art parks, but the chances of success in these creative parks are minimal. On the one hand, the art architecture is out of touch with the people, and the art park does not drive the economic development of the surrounding areas. On the other hand, art is a kind of “gentry” activity to a certain extent. There are no continuous introduction and renewal of high-quality talents which will make them lack the vitality of long-term development. This kind of formal imitation rather than substantive imitation makes the transformation of urban space into nothing, wasted a lot of resource costs and time costs. Who is responsible for the consequence of "trial" consequences?

5 The development of urban cultural attraction in the post-homogeneous era

After analyzing the urban homogenization and its impact in tourism, it is clear that cultural attractions play an important role in achieving urban differentiation strategies. In the two cities to be compared (Ningbo, China and Bilbao, Spain), I will mainly analyze two types of urban cultural attractions, that is, the cultural attraction that modernity creates for the transformation of the city, and the historical heritage-type cultural attraction that plays an important role in modern urban tourism. By studying the evolution of the two cities, the trend of homogenization and the degree of development of their respective tourism industry, combined with the status and role of their static cultural attractions, the following project will summarize the experiences, weaknesses and deficiencies of the two cities in the current tourism industry, and propose feasible suggestions for their next development.

5.1 Comparative analysis of urban development and tourism status

5.1.1 Comparison of urban historical evolution and industrial development

Ningbo is one of the economic centers in the eastern part of China. It is the third-ranking port city in the world. Meanwhile this city has a long history and rich cultural heritage, was famous in the history of industry and commerce. At the same time, Ningbo's manufacturing industry is clearly superior to the tertiary industry. The city is highly dependent on manufacturing and import and export trade. Although the port has obvious advantages, the linkage between the port and the hinterland city is not ideal. Ningbo's current industrial clusters are mainly traditional manufacturing, port industries and high-tech industries. ^[16] As far as the current situation is concerned, Ningbo's overall economy is improving, but there is still much vacancy for development in various industries, especially the tertiary industry. Bilbao is the third largest port in the country after Barcelona and Valencia, and was once famous for exporting iron ore and making iron, the "Bilbao sword" written by Shakespeare came from this. After the fall of the 17th century, the iron ore was revitalized in the 19th century, but it declined again after the mid-20th century. To add insult to injury, the 1983 flood caused the city to be almost destroyed. But since the 1990s, after experiencing devastating natural and man-made disasters, Bilbao has painstakingly begun to reform a series of neighbors, including widening the streets, demolishing old factories of some steel companies, and building new hotels and modern office buildings, or directly transform some old factories into new projects. At the same time, with the completion of the Guggenheim Museum, this devastated industrial city has successfully transformed into a city with tourism as its pillar industry.

In summary, Ningbo and Bilbao have many similarities. First of all, they are both important port cities and traditional regional economic center cities. Their ports had long history and have played an important role in the import and export trade of the country since ancient times, but the port economy and the hinterland economy are not well connected. Second, the industry development is very simple. From the ancient industry and commerce to the later traditional manufacturing, they are highly dependent on one single factor to develop the economy, and there is a lack of interaction between industries. Third, the two port cities have experienced or are experiencing human-land conflicts. At the beginning of the 20th century, Bilbao faced problems such as chaotic land use and environmental pollution. The function of the terminal and waterfront in the city declined and the power of economic recovery was weak. And now, Ningbo is facing the "human-port" conflict. The port economy has not effectively promoted regional economic development, port supporting services lag, and simple logistics transfer is difficult to form industrial clusters. At the same time, a large number of docks and yards occupy the urban land and coastline, so that the local residents have almost no living coastline. The increase of freight volume also increases the pressure of urban freight transportation, which intensifies the inconsistent functional contradiction between the port and the city. Land use utilization is low, distribution difficulties and environmental pollution problems are intensifying, and there is still a need for balance between ports and cities, industrial development and living environment. In addition, the natural tourism resources of the two places are relatively scarce. As large coastal cities, marine tourism resources are not strong, and seas and hinterland environments are difficult to develop mass tourism. The tourism resources of the two places are mainly humanistic. The difference is that Ningbo relies on ancient Chinese traditional culture and human resources, while Bilbao relies on modern art and its industrial clusters. Finally, both these two cities are facing the problem of insufficient talent. Contacting the location analysis above, we can know that Ningbo is very close to other cities with stronger competitiveness, coupled with the lack of urban talent attraction strategy and the small number of colleges and universities, the problem of insufficient talent inflow has become a shortcoming of development. On the other hand, Bilbao faces the problem of not working closely with local artists^[18].

5.1.2 Comparison of cultural attraction factors

The success of Bilbao not only made it a touristic city, but also became a typical example of urban entrepreneurship, strategic planning and urban transformation with cultural tourism. The art scene in Bilbao has some complexity and heterogeneity. After the construction of the Guggenheim Museum, the authorities renovated several cultural museums around Guggenheim to meet all kind of tourists' needs, at the same time, various art galleries, auction houses,

antique shops and art-related higher education institutions and art production centers have also landed. The local art entities have formed a complex and intertwined network of modern art markets. As a historical industrial city, Bilbao's cultural attractions are mainly concentrated on such static attractions dominated by modern art.

There are two main types of cultural tourism attractions in Ningbo, one is religious-related culture such as Buddhist holy land, and the other is ancient historical relics and historic sites. The following focuses on the second category. Ningbo is located in the middle and lower reaches of the Yangtze River, with a superior geographical environment. The Hemudu Site Museum, which is related to human origin, is an important historical and cultural attraction. In addition, Ningbo has been a commercial city that has flourished in port trade since ancient times, so its urban spirit has always been a business spirit that emphasizes business practice, "Ningbo Gang" is a group of non-governmental merchants composed of Ningbo businessmen which is also deeply influenced by this spirit. Ningbo Gang is the largest commercial group in China, to a certain extent, it has promoted the modernization of China's industry and commerce. The Ningbo Gang Museum, built on this background, is also an important cultural attraction. Tianyi Pavilion, as the earliest private library building in China, is also the oldest existing Asian library and one of the world's first three family libraries. Since ancient times, many famous poets and writers in China have made poems for Tianyi Pavilion, and its book culture is also a city sign that people are proud of. In the city slogan of Ningbo "Books collected from all the periods and the port leading to the world" refers to Tianyi Pavilion. This is enough to see the important role of Tianyi Pavilion in the development of urban history and modern urban culture.

Based on the above analysis, compared with Bilbao, Ningbo has more cultural attraction elements, but there is no clear urban cultural orientation, the focus of urban development does not depend on cultural attraction factors. It is also influenced by the spiritual culture of "industrial prosperity". It pays more attention to the real economy rather than the cultural economy. The cultural development of the city is relatively weak. And the Guggenheim Museum, as a static cultural attraction that drives the transformation and upgrading of the city, plays an incomparable role in the development of Bilbao.

5.2 Comparative analysis of urban homogenization

5.2.1 Urban development in the context of homogenization

As a traditional industrial and commercial city, Ningbo's urban homogenization problem is similar to many others Chinese cities. Urban landscapes such as municipal construction and commercial districts are not fully integrated with regional humanities. Ningbo is a city with abundant water resources. The

construction of waterfront urban functional areas does not reflect the urban differentiation strategy. Secondly, the positioning of the city image is not clear. As the other major economic center in this region, Hangzhou has a higher reputation. It is because Hangzhou is a provincial capital, with leading economic development and a longer history of development. Its cultural atmosphere is heavy, at the same time, Hangzhou is rich in higher education resources and has a large number of well-known universities; secondly, Hangzhou, as the headquarters of the famous e-commerce company Alibaba, has formed a more pioneering and more dynamic innovative urban atmosphere in recent years. On the one hand, these factors have enabled Hangzhou's urban brands to be successfully shaped, that is, a city that combines traditional humanities with modern humanities. On the other hand, it has effectively introduced a large number of high-end talents, which has injected vitality into urban development. At the same time, Shanghai, which faces Ningbo from the Hangzhou Bay, is ahead of Ningbo in terms of its modern human resources and economic development. Driven by these factors, coupled with the ambiguity of the leading industries, Ningbo's urban positioning is easily affected by the surrounding successful cities, which makes it difficult to stand out.

Another homogenization problem is the “cognitive homogenization” of the target customer group for this destination in Ningbo. Ningbo is one of the famous cities in the Yangtze River Delta region of China, this region includes Jiangsu Province, Zhejiang Province and Shanghai. In 2009, its total GDP exceeded US\$1 trillion for the first time, making it the eleventh largest economy in the world. This area is very similar in geography, culture, character and language. The traditional Jinling culture, Shanghai culture and Wuyue culture have also made this area the center of Chinese science and technology since the Tang and Song Dynasties, in recent years, with the rapid development of e-commerce, the internal relations in this region have become closer. This kind of regional cluster phenomenon will make the outside world's cognition of a single city vague, especially for a city whose image brand is not yet clear, it is more difficult to stand out from the area. Moreover, Ningbo and its neighbors, Shaoxing and Hangzhou, are both historical and cultural cities. There are certain similarities in tourism resources. Tourism products are highly substitutable, and these three cities have great overlaps due to their geographical proximity.^[17] This has intensified competition to a certain extent. Therefore, whether tourism industry can be combined with regional advantageous industries to build a tourism industry chain will become the focus of the next development of these cities.

For Bilbao, troubles may come from success. As a social and economic center in the northern Basque Country, and a major achievement in the modernization

of the Bay of Biscay, large-scale construction projects and infrastructure construction directly led to the revival, expansion and economic leap of the city. Under the influence of the “Guggenheim effect”, Bilbao successfully transformed from a declining industrial old city to one of the best cities in Europe for living, tourism and investment. This powerful and successful butterfly effect has become a positive signal that has attracted many cities to follow. The exact same vision has formed strategies in many other cities. From Melbourne to Manchester, the culture-led willingness to rebuild the city has spawned countless waterfront cultural centers, cultural festivals and cultural competitions. The Guggenheim Museum, based in New York, has created a chain of business models for this world-class museum. The French Louvre and the Pompidou Centre have also joined the museum's global expansion, and critics have linked this phenomenon to McDonald's, Starbucks and other global chain business models are linked,^[18] Modern art culture and creative products are more susceptible to imitation and plagiarism than history and culture, especially in today's manufacturing and global economy, if the “cultural symbol” cannot be updated along with the urban development process, the homogenization of creativity will directly affect the development of this type of modern art city.

5.2.2 Urban tourism development dilemma

Despite the long and rich historical and cultural resources, the traditional industrial cluster is still an important economic pillar of Ningbo. As a result, the urban tourism is mainly based on business tourism, followed by sightseeing and holiday tourism. Due to the geographical location and historical origin, Ningbo's main domestic customer source area has always been the economically developed Yangtze River Delta urban agglomeration. In addition, as an important import and export trade city, East Asia, Hong Kong, Macao and Taiwan are also very strong entry sources for Ningbo. Whether for sightseeing tourists, business tourists or religious tourists, they all regard cultural relics and culture and art as their main tourist attractions. However, the overall consumption expenditure of tourists is low, and accommodation, catering, shopping and transportation basically occupy the tourists' expenditure. It is also a pain point that the overall tourist consumption level is not high even the tourist source areas are economically developed^[17]. This may be attributed to the travel mode based on business travel. The expenditure of business travelers on sightseeing tours may be affected by the budget, so the consumption level is not ideal. Moreover, there may be problems in the development of Ningbo's own tourism industry, which cannot attract consumption well.

Unlike Ningbo, Bilbao, which successfully established a modern art business system based on the Guggenheim Museum, has now entered the “post-Guggenheim era”. On the one hand, modern art tries to seek cultural identity. It

is relatively non-mainstream and difficult to understand, and requires a high level of education for the audience. Secondly, due to geographical location, Bilbao's cultural industry development is limited to the main urban centers with dense crowds to support its cultural activities. And it ignores the goal of integrating new culture with local artists. Relatively, the museum receives far more visitors than local residents, ticket prices for Bilbao citizens are high, but the youth unemployment rate in this region is 60%. In terms of tourist spending, compared to the Spanish average, there are more "cultural products" (books, operas, art galleries, etc.) consumed in Biscay, however, the high cultural consumption rate embodied in Bilbao does not extend linearly to the consumption of contemporary art, the demand for art by locals is still traditional and folk, and the local art market is growing slowly. Contemporary art commercial galleries can only survive with regional policy support (such as government investment, private institutions and bank investment support). Although the direct economic benefits of the museum are relatively optimistic, from the perspective of political economy, the museum has not been able to reorganize the region's economy and solve unemployment issues.^[19]

5.3 Static Cultural Attraction and Urban Differentiation Strategy

5.3.1 The shaping of urban brand image in the post-homogeneous era

Before formulating a city's differentiated competition strategy, the first thing that should be clarified is the positioning of the city image. I will comprehensively analyze the actual economic development of the city, the future development direction, cultural background, cultural atmosphere, etc., and study how to build a city brand image based on static cultural attractions.

For Bilbao, the shaping of the city's brand image has been completed. For visitors, Bilbao, as a perfect example of urban transformation in the post-industrial era, has transformed successfully from a declining century-end city, relying on modern art, into a tourist city. But even so, Bilbao still has a dilemma in shaping urban culture. First, the cultural identity mentioned above, modern art is still a niche art, it has higher requirements for the audience, although the existing source of tourists has brought considerable tourism flow and tourism income to the city, for a large number of tourists, the lack of synaesthesia in extraordinary contemporary art, coupled with the lack of education in destinations for tourists, has led to limited understanding of artistic content. Coupled with the high prices of hotels, visitors often come once, stay for a night or two, and then choose to leave directly without looking at other parts of the city, which will make customer loyalty difficult to establish and maintain. Another problem is that more and more cultural competing products have emerged, making cities which use modern culture as the main attraction more substitutable. If both cities offer modern architecture and modern art exhibitions,

and the level of infrastructure construction is equal, then tourists will be more inclined to choose the city with lower tourism consumption or closer distance. From these levels, Bilbao should shape the city brand in multiple dimensions in the future development process, and should pay more attention to the shaping of the perceived value of tourists, combining static and dynamic cultural attractions, it is best to develop cultural events with unique urban characteristics, integrate cultural resources, and create unique urban memory points.

As for Ningbo, the problem of not having a clear and unique urban brand positioning has always existed. Despite being a cultural city with a thousand-year history, Ningbo is still a commercial and modern city based on import and export trade in the eyes of most tourists. On the one hand, this "cultural prejudice" wastes historical and cultural resources and the humanistic environment, on the other hand, it also weakens the competitiveness and uniqueness of urban tourism. When we talk about Tianyi Pavilion, we are actually not talking about this static tourist attraction itself, but how to use this special, symbolic and representative cultural subject to create a city business card, to create a city tourism image with certain humanistic and historical atmosphere. Unlike Bilbao, which relies on the development of modern art, historical sites cannot be "created" and can only be "developed", this kind of human development can draw on the experience of Bilbao, that is, combined with cultural education, several universities in Bilbao offer majors related to art and creative design and encourage international students to apply for. The synchronization of higher education with urban brands can shape the image of the city and create an urban atmosphere in an all-round way, it also provides reliable human resources for the city. However, in the process of urban positioning, Ningbo should also pay attention to the misplaced development of several surrounding cities to fill the market gap of surrounding tourist destinations.

5.3.2 Analysis of differentiated competition strategy at the level of urban tourism

Following the concept of "dislocation development" mentioned above, Ningbo should integrate and utilize the unique cultural resources such as human history to realize differentiated urban cultural tourism.

In recent years, the prosperity of internet technology and the development of science and technology have brought new possibilities for urban differentiation. The concept of "Digital Museum" has been promoted in many countries and regions. As a city with a high level of economy, complete infrastructure and rich museum resources, Ningbo can fully attract tourists with this concept. At present, the display of most museum collections in China is relatively

monotonous, often with simple labels to reproduce the names and times of cultural relics, some tourists who are not familiar with history can only watch the surface, but unable to experience the cultural and historical atmosphere. The digital collection exhibition has become possible today with the development of science and technology. Using three-dimensional, holographic projection and virtual reality technologies, it can enhance the interaction between tourists and cultural relics while fully excavating the connotation of cultural relics. The “Digital Tianyi Pavilion”, a cultural exhibition that blends with modern social science and technology, can dynamically and stereoscopically display the creation, excavation and circulation of collections, therefore, visitors can fully experience the historical accumulation and humanistic spirit behind the collection of cultural relics, and realize the cultural sharing in the true sense. On the other hand, the role of cultural and creative products in the process of achieving tourism differentiation should not be underestimated. Cultural goods are a typical tourist product of a museum. They are also a continuation of a journey for tourists. Good tourism products can benefit museums and become a tool of publicity and promotion.^[19] However, the cultural goods of museums around the world still have a large homogenization phenomenon. Photos, postcards, cultural shirts and refrigerator magnets are standard equipment in every museum store. To stand out in the dazzling cultural and creative products, it is the wisdom of the designer. The designer is not only the designer but also the storyteller. How to combine the collection with the urban humanities to make it practical and story-like, to convey the cultural value while demonstrating the creative vitality? Each museum has its own answer. For Tianyi Pavilion, the role of social media is important. In recent years, the concept of museum-related products popular in China has made the scenic spot not only a scenic spot, but also radiates a strong industrial chain, High-quality cultural goods not only have high consumption value, but for example, the Forbidden City, the cosmetics produced by the Palace Museum have brought huge economic benefits to the scenic spot, although some critics believe that this over-modernization is wrong, but such cultural products do make the museum itself more attractive and competitive.

At the same time, as a popular business travel destination, Ningbo has a large proportion of business travelers. How to use this special target source to maximize tourism revenue is also a question that is worth to consider. Business travelers have several characteristics, limited time, no budget, and high revisiting rates. For this type of visitor, efficient city tours are necessary. On the one hand, this efficiency requires the efficiency of the infrastructure, and the accessibility and reception capacity of the scenic spot must meet certain standards. On the other hand, the tourist attraction itself must have a high touristic value and can deliver more information in the certain period of time.

From this perspective, Tianyi Pavilion has great potential for development. First of all, it is located in the center of Ningbo. It has convenient transportation facilities, relaxed and comfortable atmosphere, beautiful surrounding environment and certain historical and cultural value. It can be said that it is the first choice for business travelers. However, Tianyi Pavilion and Ningbo's overall tourism propaganda are still lacking. The unique book culture and port history are not only the focus of Ningbo's differentiated development, but also the information that public policy makers want to transmit to the market, at present, due to the influence of many factors, Ningbo's urban tourism marketing is not ideal, the marketization of resources is not yet fully mature, and cultural tourism is still in its infancy. While practicing the differentiation of urban brands, the creation of market mechanisms and the promotion of urban brands are also crucial.

In Bilbao, there are several problems in the development of modern art architecture clusters based on the Guggenheim Museum. First, modern art and traditional art are not well compatible, local residents seem to be shut out of this art, and the museum's policies are not tilted to the locals. The heterogeneity of modern art is rooted in the artist's heterogeneity. All in all, we can draw conclusions on the analysis of the importance of "people", Art is a way of expression. Its greatest function is to stimulate human imagination and creativity, and to explore the potential of "human being", therefore, attracting and retaining more artistic talents is the focus of urban development, the introduction of higher education institutions and the development of city-marked exhibitions mentioned above are also ways to effectively introduce talents. In addition, we must pay attention to cooperation with local artists and traditional art, and explore the cultural value of urban connotation in the current era of modernization, to achieve the integration of traditional culture, modern culture and mainstream culture, on the one hand, it can solve the problem of small audience, and on the other hand, it is conducive to the long-term sustainable development of urban culture. Secondly, tourism consumption is a problem. Although the art architecture in Bilbao is increasing, the funding problem still exists. The operation of this system relies on the support of banks and local financial institutions, and it is also not ideal for the community economy.^[19] At this level, Bilbao can also solve problems by introducing emerging technologies. On the one hand, tourists are increasingly able and willing to challenge and extend the meaning of cultural products, which requires an increase in the diversity of cultural attractions. One way to achieve this is to use new technologies to explain the connotation of cultural products to specific user groups. In Europe, one application of this technology may include providing commentary on the various languages in a variety of languages, making it easier for a global audience to acquire the culture of this particular region. On

the other hand, the introduction of new technologies and new media can turn tourism destinations into active, which is conducive to the promotion of urban culture in all directions and attract more potential customers. In addition, technology can replace a part of the labor, to some extent the introduction of new technologies can also solve the problem of high labor costs in European countries.

6 Conclusion

6.1 Research conclusions

In summary of the analysis of urban homogenization and cultural attractions, we can conclude that:

- 1) The root of urban homogenization is the homogenization of globalization and culture. Its impact on tourism is mainly reflected in the homogenization of tourism products and the difficulty in positioning urban tourism images.
- 2) Urban homogenization can make urban reception facilities more standardized on the one hand, and weaken the city's diversification and competitiveness on the other hand, and also make the attraction itself face a homogenization crisis. Including homogenization of related tourism products and internal homogenization of attractions
- 3) Ningbo and Bilbao are cities with many similarities historically and geographically, but their tourism and major cultural attractions are completely different. Ningbo's cultural attractions are more diverse, and Bilbao's is relatively simple.
- 4) The phenomenon of urban homogenization makes it difficult for Ningbo to differentiate itself from neighboring cities, the image of urban tourism is difficult to locate and there is no effective linkage with local characteristics. For Bilbao, the homogenization of creativity and the rejection of traditional culture are the main problems, and the unique cultural connotation of the city has not been fully explored.
- 5) In the post-homogeneous era, Ningbo's static cultural attractions can be differentiated by introducing digital technology, re-creation of cultural and creative products, cooperation between local culture and higher education institutions, and integration with dynamic cultural attractions; Bilbao should strengthen the value of 'people' and find a balance between traditional art, modern art and mainstream art in the world, and expand the connotation of cultural products.
- 6) New media technology is an opportunity for both two cities. Ningbo should use its new media to complete its brand renewal and promotion, while Bilbao can use the Internet to expand its target audience and solve cost problems.

6.2 Insufficient and prospect

With the deepening of the creation of the thesis, there will be a logical difficulty that the exploration and foresight of homogenization were easily fall into some kind of homogenization. The anticipation of the case cities development strategy could be influenced by the existing strategies of other urban cases. Moreover, due to the author's own scholastic ability, insufficient research ability, limited research time and other factors, there are many shortcomings in the research process, which makes the research not deep enough, and some problems with industrial upgrading and urban transformation cannot be carried out more.

In addition, since the author has not been to Bilbao, one of the case cities, there is no intuitive feeling about the cultural atmosphere and construction of the city. Most of the relevant content is compiled from existing literature and network materials, and may not be convincing in some aspects.

The impact of urban homogenization on tourism is a grand proposition. In this paper, the suggestions for realizing the urban tourism differentiation strategy are not deep enough. How to realize the sustainable development of culture at the higher and more sustainable level while realizing the differential development of tourism and shaping the image of the city brand is still worthy of further research.

Reference

- [1] UNWTO Annual Report 2017. Retrieved 2018, from <http://publications.unwto.org/publication/unwto-annual-report-2017>
- [2] Judd,D.R.(1995). Promoting tourism in US cities. *Tourism Management*,16(3), 175-187
- [3] Xuemei,M., Jian,L., & Wei,Z.(2015). Interpretation of Landscape Homogeneity in China's Urbanization Process. *Journal of Shenyang Jianzhu University (Social Science)*, 17(1), 8.
- [4] Tanting,Z., Lin,L., Jinhe,Z., & Zhao,Y. (2006). Progress in Foreign Urban Tourism Research in Recent Ten Years.*Economic geography*, 26(4), 686-692.
- [5] Zukin, S. (2009). Destination culture: how globalization makes all cities look the same.*Center for Urban and Global Studies Working Paper Series*, 1, 1-26.
- [6] Gospodini, A. (2001).Urban design, urban space morphology, urban tourism: an emerging new paradigm concerning their relationship. *European Planning Studies*, 9(7), 925-934.
- [7] Rong,Z. (2007). Analysis on the Marketing Strategy of Improving the Competitiveness of Urban Tourism. *Contemporary Economy*, 9(5),33-35.
- [8] Mingquan,W. (2008). Development Strategy for Enhancing the Competitiveness of Urban Characteristic Tourism. *Special economic zone*, 136-137.
- [9] Richards, G. (Ed.). (1996). Cultural tourism in Europe. Cab International,267-281.
- [10] Lili,H. (2013). Homogenization in current tourism aesthetic activities. *Journal of Guizhou University for Nationalities (Philosophy and Social Sciences Edition)*(3), 180-183.
- [11] Ning,S. (2007). Research on Key Factors of Reorientation of Urban Tourism Image. (Doctoral dissertation, Zhejiang University),51-53.
- [12] Zhenchun,S. (2011). Research on Urban Cultural Capital and Cultural Tourism Development. *Tourism science*, 25(4), 1-9.
- [13] Xiaoguo,H., & Run,S. (2013). "Container, representation, Taoism" of cultural tourism attraction. *Journal of Subtropical Resources and Environment*, 8(2), 89-94.
- [14] Shuwen,C. (2010). Tourism Attraction. *Contemporary Tourism: Academic Edition*(5), 98-100.
- [15] Linsheng,W. (2017). The Internal Mechanism of Urban Cultural Homogenization from the Perspective of the Principle of Alignment. *Shanghai City Management*(3),24-25.
- [16] Jian,C. & Mao,X. (2007).The status quo and development of Ningbo's three major industrial clusters. *Modern enterprises* (3), 38-38.
- [17] Shufen,L. (2013).The current situation and countermeasures of Ningbo tourism market. *Journal of Jinzhou Normal University: Philosophy and Social Science*,, 25(1), 104-106.
- [18] Nhaarich, S. (2012). Creative Bilbao:the Guggenheim Effect. *Urban Planning International*,25-28.
- [19] Jinding,W. (2017). Museum, how to make your artifacts live. *Museum* (5),13-15.
- [20] Calvino, I. (1978). *Invisible cities*. Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, 217-218